

Place Name SUMMARY (PNS) 5.03/04

?WATARA-PARRINGGA

(last edited: 15/3/2016)

See also the background document 'BACKGROUND4_TjilbrukiCavesHills.pdf'

Abstract

Watara-parringga is probably the correct spelling of the original Kurna name of a place in southern Fleurieu Peninsula. It was near Mt Hayfield, on or near Waterfall Creek, probably on the Hay Flat plains.

The process by which we arrived at that conclusion was complicated, relating to parts of the Tjilbruki story and a large number of source references. See the brief Outline below (pp.2-3), the calendar of main sources (pp.4-11), and the full Discussion following ('Strange Noises In the Scrub', pp.11-25). There are also four short postscripts examining other details related to the *place* (pp.26-9).

The name was recorded in several adapted Ngarrindjeri forms from Tindale's Ngarrindjeri informants Milerum and Karlowan in the 1930s. There is no known firm evidence of it in any language from early settlement times; but information obtained from Milerum shows that a form of it was known to Southern Kurna people in the 1880s.

Watara-parringga is probably the correct Kurna form of 'Watara-beringgi' or 'Wata-baringgi', and likewise *Wara-parri* of 'Warabari': both being versions given by Milerum. Here *Wara* is a condensed form of *Watara*.

Although Tindale said that Milerum believed 'beringgi / baringgi' to be a locative suffix of the Yankalilla people (i.e. southern Kurna) and analogous to Ngarrindjeri *-angk*, it is clear in the light of the '-bari' variant that these forms are Ngarrindjeri adaptations of Kurna *parri* 'river', with and without the locative *-ngga*.

'Watara-beringgi / Wata-baringgi' is therefore *Wata[ra]-parringga*, 'place of the *wata[ra]* river'.

The meaning of *wara / watara* is unknown.

NOTE: *Wara-parri* must not be confused with the quite separate name *Warri-parri*, 'wind river = Sturt River', which has often been mispronounced and misspelt as 'Warra-'.

Coordinates	-35.516649° Latitude, 138.352118° Longitude. [identical with 'Wongurilla', & very close to Hay Flat Locality Bounded]
--------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Language Information

<i>Meaning</i>	'place of the <i>watara</i> river'
<i>Etymology</i>	<i>Watara</i> [unknown] + <i>parri</i> 'river' + <i>-ngga</i> 'at'
<i>Notes</i>	A compound word, possibly a hybrid: ' <i>Watara</i> ' (Tangani or Ramindjeri adaptation of 'Watayari / Watiari', which were variants from a Tanganian speaker: language Yaraldic: 'Ngarrindjeri') + 'beringgi / baringgi' (Tangani or Ramindjeri adaptation of <i>parri-ngga</i> 'at the river': language Thura-Yura: 'Kurna'). Milerum sometimes pronounced it in the abridged forms <i>Wara-parri</i> and <i>Wata-parri</i> , which condense the ancestor name and omit the optional suffix <i>-ngga</i> 'at'.
<i>Language Family</i>	Possibly mixed: Thura-Yura: 'Kurna', and Yaraldic: 'Ngarrindjeri'
<i>KWP Former Spelling</i>	Watara-parringga
<i>KWP New Spelling 2010</i>	Watara-paringga
<i>Phonemic Spelling</i>	/waTVRaparینگka/
<i>Pronunciation</i>	"Watara-paringga":
<i>Pronunciation tips</i>	Stress the 1 st syllable; secondary stress on the 4 th ; every 'a' as in Maori 'haka'; soften the 't' and 'p' towards 'd' and 'b' (unvoiced).

OUTLINE OF SOURCES: (for full quotations see pp.4-11)

According to Tindale's journal of Milerum in 1934, '**Warabari**' was the name of a place near Sellicks Hill,¹ and also of two places in the central Fleurieu ranges: one where Tjilbruki **entered a cave** to bury his nephew, and another where he **'came out' from his final underground cave journey**.

Milerum said later that '**Watara-beringg**' or '**Wata-baringgi**' was the form of this name used by the people of "*Cape Jervis near Yankalilla*" (i.e. southern Kurna); that it was near Mount Hayfield; and that he had this information from another Ngarrindjeri man Kaltanganuru who had lived with Southern Kurna people near Yankalilla for a long time in the 1880s and had learned to speak the local language.

The place was also known to Tindale's other Ngarrindjeri informant Karlowan. According to him (only), **Watira-ngenggul** was the place where the ancestral being Tjirbuki **'was born (started)'**. For Karlowan, Tjirbuki's cave exit was at Blowhole Creek.²

The location of *Watara-parringga* is not known exactly. According to Milerum and Karlowan, all the variants (see below) applied to

- somewhere near Mount Hayfield (which is in the central Fleurieu hills overlooking Hay Flat);
- and a nearby campsite whose location is not precisely known, possibly on or near Waterfall Creek, and (according to Karlowan) *'on the scrub plain'*;

¹ See PNS 5.01/06 'Warabari'.

² See PNS 7.01/06 'Konggaratingga'.

- and (by extension) a *pair* of hills, one being Mt Hayfield.

It is not known how it relates to nearby *Inggalilla*, the Kurna name recorded by the first surveyors in 1839-42 for a stretch of Waterfall Creek, and applied later to the Ingalalla Falls on the same creek at Mt Hayfield.³

Variants:

‘Watara-beringg’ or ‘Wata-baringgi’ was the Southern Kurna name, according to Milerum.

‘Watara-ngalang’ was the equivalent but Dual form in the Tangani dialect of Ngarrindjeri, according to Milerum.

‘Wateira-ngenggul’ (Tindale, = *Watira-ungenggul*) or ‘Watieri-anggal’ (Berndt, = *Watieri-enggul*) were equivalent but Dual forms in an unspecified dialect (?late-19th-century Ramindjeri) of Ngarrindjeri, according to Karlowan.

The Dual forms refer to two ancestral beings ‘Watiari / Watayari / Watieri’ and ‘Lepidawi / Lepuldawi / Lepuldali’ who are embodied in the two hills.

The versions all use variants of the name of a Dreaming ancestor who lived there: the bird-man: ‘**Watara / Watiari / Watayari**’, a swallow, according to Milerum; or ‘Wati-eri’, ‘jaybird’ (probably Grey currawong), according to Karlowan.

The second hill also had a separate name derived from its ancestor, the ‘flying possum’ or ‘ring tail mouse’. The identity of this hill and its location are uncertain.⁴

While Milerum does seem to have said that Tjilbruki’s cave exit was at Watara-parringga, I have not found any record that Milerum ever gave a site for Tjilbruki’s burial **cave entrance** other than the same ambiguous ‘Warabari’ from Tindale’s rough notes of 1934. This entrance also seems to be “*way inland, a big hill there called Warabari (highest part of hill towards Cape Jervis)*”. Milerum knew of the cave ‘Yanarwing’ at the fishing beach north of Cape Jervis, but it was Tindale who had immediately equated this with Karlowan’s account of Tjirbuki’s burial cave on the coast (quite probably correctly).⁵ It appears that Tindale never asked Milerum to clarify this detail of his account, preferring instead to pursue ‘one correct’ version of everything. It is unlikely that the mystery of what Milerum actually thought and said about these details can be resolved now.

³ See PNS 5.03/02 Inggalilla.

⁴ See PNS 5.03/05 ‘Lepuldawi’.

⁵ See PNS 5.04.02/01 ‘Yanawing’; 5.04.02/04 ‘Nangarang’.

Main source evidence

Date	1932
Original source text	“ Wata`beringg ”; “ Wata`weding ”. “ wati`-[y]erul ”; “ wata`yerul ”. [<i>pronunciations as heard by C Schultz 23/9/10</i>]
Reference	Milerum ‘Song 3: Song of the Swallow’, Tindale Cylinder 3, Milerum Series 1932, AA 338/11/5/3.
Informants credited	Milerum
Informants uncredited	Kaltanganuru

Date	1934
Original source text	[<i>on Tjelbruke’s last journey south</i>] “He (Tjel.) started from there [<i>Kingston Park</i>] walked... got round past Sellicks Hill 1 st hill point past there place called Warabari past Myponga round coast (big point, cliff). Made a smoke... Came down almost to Normanville near Second Valley, big cliff there carried his nephew way inland, a big hill there called Warabari [<i>inserted: Witawali</i>] (highest part of hill towards Cape Jervis) and got good place there and put in cave. Instead of going back he made it wide enough for him to go on inside until he got right up on top of range at Warabari [<i>inserted: Witawali</i>]. He came out onto main range there looked down Shut air hole where he came out.... End of story. [<i>circled</i>] Change name Warabari [<i>sic</i>] to Witawali within story.”
Reference	Milerum 15/2/1934, ‘Story of Tjelbruke’, Tindale SE of SA journal 2, AA 338/1/33/2: 48-50, 52.
Informants credited	Milerum
Informants uncredited	

Date	1934
Original source text	“Story of Ken`gori A bird in hills. RaminZeri story. Was man. Had two wives ring tail mouse (dapulatawi) and flying possum (watajari) down towards Cape Jervis. See detailed story obtained 13.5.36”.
Reference	Tindale SE of SA 2, AA 338/1/33/2: 52.
Informants credited	Milerum 1934
Informants uncredited	



Date	1935-6
Original source text	“The story of Tji:rbuki’ (Tjilbruke, Tjelbruke, Tj`erbruke) from Karlowan and notes from Milerum, published in 1936: ... [Wa`ti:ranengul] ... which is near Mt Robinson Hayfield and about 3 five miles south ^{west} of Bald Hills”.
Reference	Tindale ‘Notes on the Kurna’, AA 338/1/35: 79.
Informants credited	Karlowan
Informants uncredited	Milerum

Date	May 1936
Original source text	“Kengori / `Ken`gori (K/a?]nguri) was like a person whom they had to ask if they wanted possums (they were the climbers). Well he tell certain tribes want opossum He told Watajari and Lepuldawi. They (the two hills then which are the camps of the people in history) used to go out and get just enough of possums.... Watajari ... Le/Ḍapuldawi went round... This Watajari was wonderful chap; had strong teeth, shining fur. Watajari and Ḍ took some wonderful stones there at his hill, they shone. “Karloan thinks they must be gold, he is going to have a look for them”. “There are two hills, Mt Hayfield, 116 H of Yank = Wataranalan i.e. flying opossum (called Wati:ranengul by Karlowan) hill. The southern one is smaller (S of Mt Hayfield. SW of Section 234 H of Yank. It is the hill of Lepuldawi the ringtail opossum and is called `Lepul`daw ^a lan. `Lep:uldawi and `Wat:eirion a small animal a black bird like magpie, warns kangaroo and people of your approach Now two hills at Wati:rə`nengul = Mt Hayfield / From Karlowan ”.
Reference	Tindale ‘13 May 1936 Tanganekald Notes from Milerum’, SE of SA 2, AA 338/1/33/2: 229-231.
Informants credited	Milerum, Karlowan
Informants uncredited	

Date	1936
Original source text	“Tji:rbuki was born (started) at [Wa`ti:ranengul] , also known as [Wataranalan] , which is near Mt Hayfield and about 5 miles south-west of Bald Hills, on Sections 1100-116, Hundred of Yankalilla. In winter time he lived in the scrub land at [Wa`ti:ranengul] (literally this means the ‘Two Hills’, and is derived from the story of two men, Lepuldawi and Watirion , whose camp it was)...” - “[Tjirbuki] did not emerge from the cave but went on into the depths of the hill for a long way. He eventually came out on the top of the hills near a swamp lagoon. He could see the sun shining through a high crevice.”
Reference	Tindale 1936, ‘Story of [Tji:rbuki]’, in Tindale and Mountford, ‘Results of the Excavation of Kongarati Cave’, <i>Records of SA Museum</i> 5(4): 500-1.
Informants credited	Karlowan
Informants uncredited	Milerum



<i>Date</i>	Dec 21st 1937
<i>Original source text</i>	“ Wata`beringg ”; “ Wat[rə]`beringg ”; “ wati-`[y]erul ”; “ wat`yerul ”; “ wata`yerul ”. [pronunciations as heard by C Schultz 23/9/10]
<i>Reference</i>	Milerum ‘Song of the Swallow’, Tindale Disc 5, Clarence Long Series 1937-8, AA 338/11/12/5.
<i>Informants credited</i>	Milerum
<i>Informants uncredited</i>	Kaltanganuru

<i>Date</i>	Dec 1937 (edited ?1980s)
<i>Original source text</i>	“Song of the swallow grey currawong [Wati`ari] and the ring-tailed mouse opossum [Lepidawi]. watieri ... {the spelling ‘watieri’ added here might be from Karlowan: cp. Berndt} [song text] Watarā`beringgi ... Place name Mt Hayfield / (hill whence Tjilbruke emerged). wata`jarul ... the two “... It is to the mischievous Wati`ari and Lepi`dawi that invisible noises in the scrub are attributed; it was in their totemic country (Watarə`beringg) that he was wandering....” “Notes:... The lepidawi and watiari are together known as wata`jarul a word in the dual form meaning ‘the two’.”
<i>Reference</i>	Tindale typescript, ‘Songs by Milerum recorded... 1937’, SE of SA 2, AA 338/1/33/2: 252-4. *
<i>Informants credited</i>	Milerum
<i>Informants uncredited</i>	Kaltanganuru

<i>Date</i>	c.1940
<i>Original source text</i>	“ The wate-eri-on (or wati-eri , the Ramindjeri term for this bird; the Yaraldi called it <i>kiling-kildi</i> , and Karloan called it black magpie) was taboo to the Ramindjeri Watilindjera clan, as it was to all the Kukabrak; its name meant ‘one who follows in another’s tracks’. This bird was said to be able to see people coming from a great distance and to warn other birds in its vicinity of approaching humans. if a hunter killed one, the other wate-eri-on would have their revenge and make it very difficult for him to catch other birds.” - [Marsupial Possum and Jaybird] “In Ramindjeri territory, within the same area associated with Tjirbuki, lived two Dreaming men on the scrub plain at



	<p>Wati-erilanggal, near Mt Hayfield, a few miles southwest of the Bald Hills. The name Wati-erilanggal referred to two hills, with the other being Lepuldalingul (Mt Robinson). One man was Lepuldali... a marsupial smaller than a possum... Wati-eri, a Ramindjeri word that meant generally 'sneaking or tracking' and referred to the jaybird which was said to be like a black magpie...."</p> <p>- [Ramindjeri clans] "Wati-erilindjera; from the place Wati-erilanggal near Mt Hayfield. The name came from the <i>ngatji...</i> wati-eri (jaybird)... Lepuldalindjera; from the place Lepuldalingul (Mt Robinson), located out in the scrub near Mt Hayfield where there are two hills: one hill belonged to the Wati-erilindjera clan, the other to the Lepuldalindjera. <i>Ngatji: lepuldali</i> (marsupial possum)."</p>
Reference	Berndt and Berndt 1993, <i>A World That Was</i> : 124, 234, 311, 448.
Informants credited	Karlowan
Informants uncredited	

Date	1941
Original source text	<p>"Song of the Swallow, Watiari and the Ring-tailed Mouse, Lepidawi:...</p> <p>[song text] "... Watarə`bering, Mt Hayfield (whence the ancestral being Tjirbuki emerged)...</p> <p>[song 'free translation'] ... 'to high Watarabering...'</p> <p>[commentary] "... [The song] belonged to an old man named [Kaltanganuru] who originally came from the Coorong... a mother's brother of Milerum (classificatory)... He married a woman from 'Cape Jervis near Yankalilla', and lived with her at [ˈLat:arŋg] (Section 19, Hd of Goolwa). His... father-in-law... asked his son-in-law to go with him to [ˈJankalja`wa:ŋk] (Yankalilla), where he lived for so many years that he learned to talk their language better than his own... When he was an old man he sang this song in his own language (Tanganekald).... from [ˈLatarngg] to [ˈNibielarngk] (Crozier's Hill), thence to [ˈTowara:ngk] (a hill 3 miles N of Inman Post Office), passing [Wata`bareinggi] or [Watarəberinggi], Mt Hayfield... The Lepidawi and Watiari are together known as [Watajarul], a word in the dual form meaning 'the two'. The Jarildekald know them as [ˈLepuldawi] and [ˈWatiriorn]."</p>
Reference	Tindale 1941, 'Native Songs of the SE of SA, Part 2', <i>Transactions and Proceedings of the Royal Society of SA</i> 65(2): 242-3.
Informants credited	Milerum, Kaltanganuru
Informants uncredited	



Date	1934-41
Original source text	<p>“Wati:ra`nengl Karl. / 2 Hills” [marked by trig triangle ‘S of Mt Hayfield’].</p> <p>- “Waṭaraberingi of local people t. Milerum. their place names end in beringi ours end in anḵ”.</p> <p>- “Ḑ `Lepul`dawa`lanḵ hill of dapuldawi / southern is smaller / Tindale has legend” [with arrow to trig ‘S of Mt Hayfield’].</p>
Reference	Tindale annotated map Hd of Yankalilla, AA 338/24/101.
Informants credited	Milerum 1934 / 1941, Karlowan 1935
Informants uncredited	

Date	n.d. [after 1941; ?1980s]
Original source text	<p>“Wataranalan Ramindjeri Tr Waitpinga SA Mt Hayfield Section 114 H of Yankalilla. The Watarabering of the Kurna tribe; on their border in heavily wooded country, as described in a song recalled by Milerum...”</p>
Reference	Tindale Ramindjeri vocabulary card in AA 338/7/1/17.
Informants credited	Milerum
Informants uncredited	

Date	n.d. [after 1941; ?1980s]
Original source text	<p>“Watiriorn Ramindjeri Tr. Ancestral man of the country around Mt Hayfield Section 114 H of Yankalilla; he became the Welcome Swallow (<i>Hirundo neoxena</i>). He was initiated together with Lepuldawi another being whose country was at South of Mt Hayfield, a somewhat lesser hill. He was transmuted to the ringtailed opossum [added: and/or flying phalanger]. These two men were together known as Watajarul lit. ‘the two’. Tindale 1941 TrRoySocSA 65(2): 241 from Karammi through Karlowan.”</p>
Reference	Tindale Ramindjeri vocabulary card in AA 338/7/1/17.
Informants credited	Karlowan
Informants uncredited	Milerum

Date	n.d. [after 1968; ?1980s]
Original source text	<p>“Birthplace of Tji:rbuki / Wa`ti:rangenggul (Watarangalang)” [arrow to Section 1100 in Yankalilla River gorge, just south of Yankalilla Hill].</p>
Reference	Tindale annotated map County Hindmarsh, AA 338/24/121.
Informants credited	Karlowan, Milerum
Informants uncredited	

<i>Date</i>	n.d. [?1980s]
<i>Original source text</i>	<p>“Wateirə-`ngenggəl Kurna Tr. Rapid Bay S.Aust. Camping place between Mt Hayfield and South of Hayfield, not closely identified but is between Sections 114 and 233 H of Yankalilla – perhaps the spring at section 115. Lit. Between the two hills. Deriv. [wate] middle + ngenggəl dual. This name was supplied by Karlowan who learned it from Karammi. Tindale ms from Karlowan, spelling revised.”</p>
<i>Reference</i>	Tindale Kurna place-name card 642.
<i>Informants credited</i>	
<i>Informants uncredited</i>	

<i>Date</i>	n.d. [?1980s]
<i>Original source text</i>	<p>“-beringgi Kurna Tr. Adelaide S.Aust. <u>suffix</u> used with proper names of places comparable to-angk of Tanganekald and Ramindjeri Tindale ms from Milerum who commented on difference note on H. of Yankalilla map”.</p>
<i>Reference</i>	Tindale Kurna vocabulary card.
<i>Informants credited</i>	
<i>Informants uncredited</i>	

<i>Date</i>	n.d. [?1980s]
<i>Original source text</i>	<p>“Warabari - Highest part of hill close to Cape Jervis where Tjirbruke found a cave for the body of his nephew. In Ephraim Tripp’s version the place is named Witawali and is attributed to Ngurunduri and not Tjirbruke. Tindale ms SESA J 2:50. Tindale from E.Tripp Sept 1940.”</p>
<i>Reference</i>	Tindale Kurna place-name card 633.
<i>Informants credited</i>	Tripp 1940
<i>Informants uncredited</i>	Milerum

Date	n.d. [?1980s]
Original source text	<p>“Wati:ra`ngenggul Peramangk Tr. Adelaide Hills S.Aust. place name near Mt Hayfield also known as Watarangalang Lookout Hills (dual) (in 1936 publication stress is wrongly shown NBT) Tindale ms from Karlowan and Milerum. Tindale in Tindale and Mountford 1936 RecSAMus 5(4): 500-501.”</p>
Reference	Tindale Kurna place-name card 641/2.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

Date	n.d. [?1980s]
Original source text	<p>“Watiari [...?...] being, a male of the Grey currawong totem, associated with Lepidawi another male being of the ring-tailed opossum totem Tindale SESAJ 2:252 Watiari wrongly interpreted as swallow now correctly Currawong NBT.”</p>
Reference	Tindale Kurna vocabulary card ‘Watiari’ (2).
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

Date	n.d. [after Feb 1985]
Original source text	<p>“According to Milerum the southern Kurna of Rapid Bay used their <u>at</u> pronoun suffix with their place names with –[beringgi] where the Tanganekald wd be [-anj] or [ɲalan] hence Mt Hayfield at Sec 113 Hd of Yankalilla was Wataraberinggi in their terms whereas he would think of it as Watarangalang or as Wataraangk [<i>sic</i>]. In telling me of this he told of a further complication associated with the Wataraberinggi locality. The spring of water so important to the southern Kurna was situated on a creek (Waterfall Creek) between two hills and thus bore the name Watirangengəl using the dual suffix.”</p>
Reference	Tindale unpublished MS, ‘Place Names: Drafts For Text’, AA 338/10/2: 29.
Informants credited	
Informants uncredited	

<i>Date</i>	1987
<i>Original source text</i>	<p>“[Tjirbruki travels south from Sellick’s Beach] Instead of continuing along the beach he turned inland and climbed over Sellick’s Hill. He kept Maitpanga on his left and climbed another high hill (it may have been Mt Jeffcott or Black Hill). There he made a smoke signal. White smoke went straight up. People who were camped at a place called [Warabari] saw the smoke and began to interpret its meaning:.. From Parewarangk [<i>Cape Jervis</i>] he returned northwards along the foreshore below the cliffs and came to another <i>perki</i> (called [Ja`narwin] by another informant)... [He] carried the body in... and left it. He did not emerge from the cave but went on into the depths of the hill for a long way. He made the way wide enough for him to continue inside right up on top of the range at [Waṯeira`nenggal] (now Mt Hayfield). Emerging there he shut the airhole where he came out...”</p> <p>“Tjirbruki... was born at [Watira`nenggul], also known to more eastern people, the Tangane, as [Wataranalan]. It was an important living area in the vicinity of Mt Hayfield, close to a spring on Sec 115... From ancient times it has been one of the southernmost living places of the Kurna tribespeople; their local clan was called the Patpangga and their summer living area was around Rapid Bay.”</p>
<i>Reference</i>	Tindale 1987, ‘The Wanderings of Tjirbruki’, <i>Records of SA Museum</i> 20: 7-9, 11a.
<i>Informants credited</i>	
<i>Informants uncredited</i>	

Discussion: STRANGE NOISES IN THE SCRUB:

HOW THE NAMES WERE OBTAINED:

As far as I know, nobody has yet identified Tjilbruki’s cave exit on the ground, and we have no clear picture where it was in relation to the campsites or Mt Hayfield except that it was nearby. It is not visible, according to Milerum’s 1934 account of ‘Tjelbruke’: the hero emerged from his underground journey and “*came out onto main range there looked down Shut air hole where he came out*”.⁶ Tindale in 1987 paraphrased this as “*right up on top of the range*”, and continued: “*Emerging there he shut the ‘airhole’ where he came out. He ‘fixed it up with gravel’ to appear he had ‘never come out there’*”.⁷

⁶ Milerum 1934, in Tindale SE of SA 2: 50.

⁷ Tindale 1987, ‘Wanderings of Tji:rbruki’, *Records of SA Museum* 20: 9b.

The high area from Mount Hayfield on the southwest margin of Hay Flat plains to the top of the range around Parawa, was originally scrub country. It is at the southern intersection of Kurna, Ramindjeri and Peramangk territory as defined by Tindale. Several Aboriginal place-names have been recorded there. *Inggalilla*, 'Wongurilla' and *Wanwalilla* were obtained by the first surveyors and are clearly Kurna in form,⁸ but the names given 90 years later by Milerum and Karlowan have mixed provenance with several versions and (with one exception, 'Tjutjugawi') no early witness.

Both of these Ngarrindjeri men attached a set of interrelated names to the vicinity of Mt Hayfield. They appear on Tindale's cards for all three of the above tribal groups. They were first heard by Tindale in December 1932 when he made an audio cylinder recording of Milerum singing "*Song of the Swallow and Ring-tailed Mouse*", without obtaining details about it. In 1937 they recorded the song again, this time electrically to disc. It contains a name which recurred in several of Tindale's publications, *Wata`beringgi*, and a related word *wati`[y]jerul*, sometimes *wata`yerul*.⁹ The complete song text was published with commentary four years later, and here Tindale wrote that '*Watiari*' is the Swallow; '*watajarul*' means '*the two*' ancestral beings Watiari and Lepidawi; and "*Wata`bareinggi*" or "*Watare`beringg*" is "*Mt Hayfield (whence the ancestral being Tjirbuki emerged)*".¹⁰

Tindale's maps and journals trace a little of the previous history of this information.

On his Yankalilla map three versions of the name occur, and for once are specifically credited.¹¹

The earliest version was "*Wati:ra`njengl Karl. / 2 Hills*", given by Karlowan in December 1935.¹² Tindale mapped this at the trig station called 'South of Mt Hayfield', probably mistaking the trig for a hill because it was marked with the same kind of icon as Mt Hayfield. Karlowan may not yet have told him exactly where the two hills were. Tindale wrote later, "*This name was supplied by Karlowan who learned it from Karammi*".¹³ It is probably not a Yaraldi version as we would normally expect from Karlowan's clan. We are not certain which dialect of Ngarrindjeri Karammi spoke, but evidence below suggests Ramindjeri, and this is what Tindale thought.¹⁴

Two versions on the same map are from Milerum.

⁸ See PNS 5.03/02, 5.02.01/03 and 5.03/03.

⁹ *Wati`[y]jerul* and *wata`yerul* as heard by me from the recordings.

¹⁰ Tindale 1941, 'Native Songs 2', *Trans.Proc.Roy.Soc.SA* 65(2): 242-3. He uses 'j' for a consonantal 'y'.

¹¹ Tindale annotated map, Hd of Yankalilla, AA 338/24/101.

¹² cp. SE of SA journal 2: 285.

¹³ Tindale Kurna place-name card 642 '*Wateire-`ngenggəl*'.

¹⁴ See also Gale 2009, *Ngarrindjeri Dictionary*: xiii, and JM Black 1917, 'Vocabularies of Three SA Native Languages...' *Transactions and Proceedings of Royal Society of SA* 41: 8-9.

One, attached to Mt Hayfield and connected back to Karlowan's version at the trig station, is the name in Milerum's dialect of Ngarrindjeri: "*Watara`ngalang of Tanganekald (Milerum)*". He had given this in May 1936.¹⁵

The other, alongside the previous one, says, "*Waṭaraberinggi of local people t. Milerum*", and adds a piece of Ngarrindjeri folk linguistics: "*their place names end in beringi ours end in anḱ*". Milerum probably gave this intriguing view during sessions around the Swallow song in 1937.

THE WORD: A KAURNA VERSION PROCESSED BY A NGARRINDJERI MAN:

Who were these 'local people', and how did Milerum learn this word from their language? For once the story is explicitly told, in his account of the 'Swallow' song. He had learned it, along with his version of the names and the associated story, from "*an old man named [Kaltanganuru] who originally came from the Coorong... [and was] a mother's brother... (classificatory)*". Kaltanganuru made the song in the 19th century using his own Tangani dialect of Ngarrindjeri; but by that time he also knew the foreign language of western Fleurieu:

He married a woman from 'Cape Jervis near Yankalilla'... His... father-in-law... asked his son-in-law to go with him to [Jankalja`wa:ŋk] (Yankalilla), where he lived for so many years that he learned to talk their language better than his own... When he was an old man he sang this song in his own language (Tanganekald). Men who heard him sing it were surprised because they had thought he only spoke Merildekald... he made it because he was frightened by his experiences in a strange country... His companions took him out to hunt in the wooded mountain gullies; he was a 'sandhill-man', lost in the forest. It seemed that he kept on walking in the same place. He moved in circles; then he heard strange noises and became frightened... His companions found him. 'Ah! Next time you had better make a smoke-fire. The swallows and the ring-tailed mice have fooled you with their noises'.¹⁶

The entire package about the two hills and the two ancestors Watiari and Lepidawi, as known to Milerum, presumably came from Kaltanganuru.

Very likely it was the same man who gave Milerum his version of the 'Ramindjeri story' of Kengori and his two wives or companions, 'Watajari' and 'Lepidawi' (or 'Dapuldawi': there are some alternative names in Tindale's journal).¹⁷

It is therefore worth examining Milerum's material closely for signs of the 'Yankalilla' language.

¹⁵ Tindale '13 May 1936 Tanganekald Notes from Milerum', SE of SA 2, AA 338/1/33/2: 231.

¹⁶ Milerum / Tindale 1941, 'Native Songs 2', *Trans.Proc.Roy.Soc.SA* 65(2): 242-3. Even to me as a Victor Harbor boy of the 1950s, this wet country of yakkas and gnarled scrub can still seem weird. The alleged 'Merildekald' language of Yankalilla (as perceived by Milerum) was "*somewhat like Jarildekald but hard to understand*" (Tindale annotated map, Hundred of Encounter Bay, AA 338/24/28). Most likely it was a mixture of Kaurna and Ngarrindjeri.

¹⁷ Tindale, SESA 2: 52, 229-231. For more details see my document 'BACKGROUND4_TjilbrukiCavesHills.pdf'.

It is interesting to see that even though the song is in Tangani it does not use the Tangani form of the name – ‘Watara-ngalang’, as identified by Milerum – but ‘Wata[ra]-beringgi’, the form he identified as that of the ‘local people’.¹⁸ These locals had their living area at “Cape Jervis near Yankalilla”. This meant ‘on Fleurieu Peninsula in the general vicinity of the Yankalilla plains’, since “to Milerum ‘Cape Jervis’ seems to be synonymous with our ‘Fleurieu Peninsula’”,¹⁹ as it had been for settlers through most of the 19th century. Their hunting territory in the 1880s obviously included these hills near Mt Hayfield, which they could reach via the Yankalilla River and Hay Flat. Tindale classified them as the ‘southern Kurna of Rapid Bay’²⁰ (though Milerum did not use the term ‘Kurna’), and the details support this if we grant the well-attested close relationship between the groups at Rapid Bay and Yankalilla Plains: they were separated by a journey of only 15 km, and were probably all regarded as *patpangga*, ‘southern’.

Milerum was unusually analytic about ‘Watara-beringg’. Tindale wrote the following expansion of his early note on the Yankalilla map:

According to Milerum the southern Kurna of Rapid Bay used their at pronoun suffix with their place names with [-beringgi] where the Tanganekald wd be [-anj] or [ɲalan] hence Mt Hayfield at Sec 113 Hd of Yankalilla was Wataraberinggi in their terms whereas he wd think of it as Watarangalang or as Wataraangk [sic].²¹

Milerum’s general idea here is clear, even though it does not seem that he used the form ‘Wataraangk’ – no doubt this was Tindale’s guess. It eliminates other analyses. For instance, if ‘Watara-beringg’ was a Ngarrindjeri Dual form *Watara-ber-engk* (‘two *wataraberV*’), Milerum would certainly have known this and not interpreted it as a locative.

The most common locative suffix in Kurna is *-ngga*, which does correspond with Ngarrindjeri locative *-angk*. But what is ‘-beringg’ or ‘-bareinggi’?

In Kurna language the sound *e* is not linguistically significant, but it can be a variant pronunciation of either *a* or *i*, which are. In the Ngarrindjeri language system words very rarely end in *a*, but often with *i* and sometimes with consonants like *ngg*. *P* and *b* are phonemically equivalent in both languages.

¹⁸ map Hd Yankalilla, AA 338/24/101.

¹⁹ Tindale 1937, ‘Songs by Milerum’, SESA2: 254.

²⁰ Tindale MS, ‘Place Names: Drafts For Text’, AA338/10/2: 29, 125.

²¹ Tindale MS, ‘Place Names: Drafts For Text’, AA338/10/2: 29.

Thus it is fairly certain that the original ‘suffix’ that Milerum was remembering and adapting was actually *parri-ngga*, ‘at the river’. Even as a Coorong man he would have heard some other place-names on his side of Kurna country which end with this word: ‘Kondoparinga’ on the Finnis, *Murtaparringga* at Hindmarsh Valley, ‘Bullaparinga’, *Ngangkiparringga* (Onkaparinga), and probably *Warriparringga* (Sturt River). This would have been enough for him and his clan to guess (loosely) at its function by analogy with their own system of place-naming, which was similar at least in the use of a locative suffix.

It is also revealing that Milerum apparently did not recognize nor know the meaning of a Kurna word as common as *parri-[ngga]*.²² This reminds us to be very cautious whenever his and Karlowan’s information touches upon anything to do with Kurna language.

It seems fairly certain, then, that ‘Wata[ra]-beringgi’ is a Ngarrindjeri perception of a Kurna form *Watara-parringga*, ‘place of the *Watara* river’; but as we shall see, we remain unsure of any meaning for *watara* in Kurna.

OTHER VERSIONS OF THE PLACE-NAME FROM KARLOWAN:

When Tindale published Karlowan’s ‘Story of Tji:rbuki’ in 1936 he subtitled it “*a legend of the people of Rapid Bay*”²³ – which would have been more appropriate for Milerum’s version incorporating ‘Rapid Bay talk’, than for Karlowan’s with no such connection. In ‘Wanderings’ 1987 Tindale emphasized the Kurna connections of the story, subtitled it “*a tale of the Kurna people of Adelaide*”.²⁴ But, strangely, when discussing Tjirbruki’s exit site he omitted Milerum’s ‘local’ versions “*Wata`bareinggi*” and “*Watara`beringg*” – even though he had re-published them in 1974²⁵ – but included the two non-Kurna versions which he had published in 1936, “*Watara`ngalang*” and “*Watira`ngenggul*”.²⁶

‘Watira-ngenggul’ came via Karlowan from a man called Karammi (pronounced K’rammi) whose dialect is unknown, possibly Ramindjeri.²⁷ It was published in 1936 as “*Wa`ti:raŋenggul*”, with a second-syllable stress which Tindale acknowledged to be misplaced; he corrected it in ‘Wanderings’ 1987, at the same time unaccountably introducing an interdental ‘t’,

²² It is possible that Tindale had partly misinterpreted what Milerum said about locatives. ‘Warabari’ (= *Wara-parri*) is probably Milerum’s other version of the name in remembered ‘Rapid Bay talk’ (see ‘Warabari’ section below), and this omits the locative correctly; so perhaps he was aware that the Kurna locative was something like *-ngg[a]* alone, and that ‘bari / beri’ was not part of it. However, I have seen no evidence that he knew what *parri* means.

²³ My emphasis.

²⁴ My emphasis.

²⁵ Tindale 1974, *Aboriginal Tribes*: 73.

²⁶ Tindale 1987: 9b, 11a; Tindale 1936: 500.

²⁷ Tindale place-name card 642; cp. Black 1917: 8-12; and below.

“*Waṯeira`nengal*”.²⁸ This kind of thing shows why we need to go back to Tindale’s sources rather than accept his published versions too readily.

Around 1940 Karlowan, in his Yaraldi text of ‘Marsupial Possum and Jaybird’, gave the name to Ronald Berndt as “*Wati-erianggel*”;²⁹ but Berndt’s gloss there says “*to Wati-erilanggel*”, introducing an ‘l’ which is quite unaccountable. He retains the mistake (if it is one, his or Karlowan’s) throughout his own text in the rest of the book. No credible linguistics explain this ‘l’. I take it that what Karlowan meant (and perhaps said normally when using this name in Berndt’s hearing) was *-anggal* (= *-enggul* ‘upon two’), one of the standard Locative Dual suffixes.

However, the suffix he gave when speaking to Tindale was *ngenggul*, probably a contraction of *ungenggul* ‘at two’, another standard Locative Dual.³⁰ Perhaps he spoke it so rapidly that Tindale missed some of the syllables.

Tindale’s ambiguous notes show that with this traditionally coupled pair of hills and Beings with separate names, you could refer implicitly to both by using the name of one of them, as in ‘the place of the *Watieri* two’.³¹ In Berndt, Karlowan’s locative Dual place-name *Lepuldalinggul*, applied to the second hill of this pair, shows that you could also imply the pair by referring to ‘the place of the *Lepuldali* two’.³²

WATAYARUL, ‘THE TWO’:

According to Tindale, Milerum said that “*the lepidawi and watiari are together known as `wata`jarul a word in the dual form meaning ‘the two’*”.³³

‘Watayarul’ uses no Dual form known in Ngarrindjeri grammars elsewhere: all the Duals depend on variants of *-engk* which are clearly absent here, while the suffixes *-ul* and *-al* are quite unrelated.³⁴ But if the name *Watiari* / *Watayari* was used by the southern Kurna (whether or not it was their own word originally), its Dual form for them would have been *Watayari-lla* or perhaps *Watayar-urla* ‘two *watayari*’. If this were then adopted by Kaltanganuru or Milerum – speakers of Ngarrindjeri in which no suffixes end with *a* but many end with *-al* or *-ul* – they would either change the final ‘a’ to *i*, or omit it giving *watayar-al* or *watayar-ul* as we have it from Milerum. Thus we have a strong

²⁸ Tindale 1987: 11a, 9b; cp. Tindale 1936: 500 and Tindale place-name card 641/2.

²⁹ Berndt and Berndt 1993: 448.

³⁰ For Ngarrindjeri Locative Duals see Meyer 1843: 14, 18; and M Gale and D French 2007, *Ngarrindjeri Learners’ Guide*, Raukkan Community Council: 165.

³¹ This is an unusual use of the suffix, which would normally imply ‘two *Watieri*’.

³² Berndt and Berndt 1993: 233, 311, 330-1.

³³ Milerum 1937 / Tindale SESA 2, AA338/1/33/2: 254. Tindale’s ‘j’ represents a consonantal y.

³⁴ See Gale and French 2007, *Ngarrindjeri Learners’ Guide*.

likelihood that Milerum is right: the word is (hybrid) Kurna for ‘the two *Watiari*’, with one ancestor standing in collectively for both. As we have seen, this also happened in the dual-form place-names ‘Watirangnggal’ / ‘Watieri-anggal’, ‘Watarangalang’ and ‘Lepuldalinggal’.

WHAT WAS ‘WATIARI’ (OR ‘WATARA’?):³⁵

Although *watara* / *watira* and the four-syllable variants *watiari* / *watieri* / *watayari* are unknown outside Tindale in either Kurna or Ngarrindjeri, they are all probably versions of the name of the Mt Hayfield ancestor. He was recorded by Tindale from Milerum variously as ‘*the Swallow [watiari]*’,³⁶ and ‘*watajer:i a bird close relative of `nunkun`jeiri*’.³⁷

Milerum spoke too of a ‘*flying possum (watajari)*’ who was an associate of the bird-man Kengori and a ‘ringtail mouse’ called ‘Dapulatawi’ or ‘Dapuldawi’;³⁸ but there is some doubt about the relationship between this ‘watajari’ and Milerum’s Watiari Swallow.³⁹

Tindale could not have known, but Karlowan had given another identification and an explicit derivation of this word to Berndt around 1940:

The wate-eri-on (or wati-eri, the Ramindjeri term for this bird; the Yaraldi called it kiling-kildi, and Karloan called it black magpie);

and

*Wati-eri, a Ramindjeri word that meant generally ‘sneaking or tracking’ and referred to the jaybird which was said to be like a black magpie.*⁴⁰

The ‘-on’ suffix is short for *korni* ‘man’, referring to the ancestor in human shape during his adventures as a man. Berndt’s spelling of the root word is ‘watieri’, reflecting a slight difference in pronunciation.

³⁵ Lewis O’Brien (p.c. 5/5/11) remembers *watara* as a Point Pearce word (probably Narungga) which meant ‘one who envies another because the other has something which the envier lacks, e.g. food’; the other has an obligation to give some of it to the envier. It is unknown whether this use of the word is related to the name of the Mt Hayfield site.

³⁶ 1937, SESA 2: 252.

³⁷ 1938, SESA 2: 256. The ‘nunkunjeiri’ was probably the same bird as ‘minmin’ which Milerum said was the Welcome Swallow; so the Watiari was therefore not that, but some other swallow-like bird (for details see my document ‘BACKGROUND4_TjilbrukiCavesHills.pdf’).

³⁸ Tindale 1934, SE of SA 2: 52, 231.

³⁹ For more details see my document ‘BACKGROUND4_TjilbrukiCavesHills.pdf’.

⁴⁰ Berndt and Berndt 1993, *A World That Was*: 124, 234.

No Ngarrindjeri variant of this whole word is known elsewhere. The verb *wartin* 'tracking' is found in Taplin 1879, but does not account for the syllables '-eri'. Is 'watieri' perhaps an abridgment of *wart-inyeri* '[thing] pertaining to tracking', with the very common Ngarrindjeri suffix? Perhaps not. *Wartin* is not found in Meyer's Ramindjeri wordlist, but only in that of Taplin whose extra words are mainly Yaraldi and Potawolin. It therefore may have been Yaraldi and therefore well-known to Karlowan, but not used in the Ramindjeri dialect to which 'Watieri' is supposed to belong.

Like Milerum with 'beringgi', Karlowan's interpretations of place-names on Kurna land show him repeatedly indulging in 'folk etymology': using words from his own Yaraldi dialect to interpret unknown words and morphemes in the completely foreign tongue of which he knew very little; many of them are demonstrably wrong.⁴¹ One must suspect the same thing here. When any ethnographer asked Karlowan or Milerum for *derivations*, the answer was reliable only if *all* the words concerned were in the informant's own dialect of Ngarrindjeri, where they knew and understood the linguistic repertoire, useages and processes. Karlowan may be reliable in telling us that a name is Ramindjeri; his identification of the word as Ramindjeri may tell us that this (in a late-19th-century form) was the dialect spoken by his source, Karammi. But his interpretation of it – especially when he says that the Yaraldi word is completely different, *kiling-kildi* – may be no more reliable than his Kurna interpretations.

Tindale's final identification, 'grey currawong (*Strepera versicular*)',⁴² was based belatedly on what Karlowan had told him in 1935-6: '*Wat:eiriorn, a black bird like magpie, warns kangaroo and people of your approach*'.⁴³ No doubt it was a currawong that Karlowan knew in English as 'jaybird'.

But for Milerum the *watiari* was not a currawong. He gave the name of 'grey currawong' as *keleidi*, a Tangani equivalent of Yaraldi *kiling-kildi* given by Karlowan for the 'Watieri' bird,⁴⁴ and I am not aware of any record that he ever withdrew his identification of *watiari* as a swallow.⁴⁵

Tindale as usual was looking for the 'one true version', and left some confusion behind him as a result.

Milerum's three-syllable Kurna and Tangani version 'Watara' appears to be condensed from the four-syllable 'Watieri' (= 'Watiari / Watayari') attested by both Milerum and Karlowan, which may hark back more closely to its Ramindjeri sources through Karammi.

⁴¹ See e.g. his 'Turtotjalangga' in PNS 4.03.03/04 'Tartatyilla'.

⁴² Kurna vocabulary card 'watiari' (1); 'versicular' is an error for 'versicolor'. Cp. card 'Watiari' (2).

⁴³ SESA 2: 231.

⁴⁴ Tindale Tangani cards; Berndt and Berndt 1993: 124, 234.

⁴⁵ For more on the birds, see my document 'BACKGROUND4_TjilbrukiCavesHills.pdf'.

There is a strong case that the word and its associated place-name were sometimes condensed even more.

'WARABARI':

We noted in passing that Tindale in 1941 identified 'Wataraberinggi' as the place where Tjilbruki 'emerged': that is, came out of his long underground journey after burying his nephew's body near the seaward end of the cave. This had been attested by Milerum during the song recordings in December 1937: "*Watara`beringi: Place name Mt Hayfield (hill whence Tjilbruke emerged)*".⁴⁶

But by this time Tindale knew at least two other names which Milerum had also attached to this exit site.

Milerum's original narration of 'Tjelbruke' had told how he

*came down almost to Normanville near Second Valley, big cliff there, carried his nephew way inland, a big hill there called Warabari [inserted: Witawali] (highest part of hill towards Cape Jervis) and got good place there and put in cave. Instead of going back he made it wide enough for him to go on inside until he got right up on top of range at Warabari [inserted: Witawali] He came out onto main range there looked down Shut air hole where he came out...*⁴⁷

A circled note after the end of the story says, "*Change name Waraberi [sic] to Witawali within story*". However, Tindale never followed up this decision.

Two years after that, in May 1936, Milerum told Tindale of the bird-man Kenguri or Kengori:

*Kenguri lived on a big hill `Witə: `walaŋ inland right in centre of Fleurieu ½ way betw. Encounter Bay and Yankalilli [sic]. The south side of highest part of land (where Tjelbruke came out) was Kenguri's camp.*⁴⁸

⁴⁶ Tindale typescript, SESA 2: 252.

⁴⁷ Milerum 1934, 'Story of Tjelbruke', Tindale SESA 2: 49-50.

⁴⁸ Milerum 1936, 'Kengori', in Tindale SESA 2: 229.

The history of 'Warabari' and its geographical relationship with 'Witawali' and 'Witawalang' in Tindale's records is dealt with more completely in PNS 5.01/06 'Warabari' and 7.01/01 'Witawalang'.

A linguistic relationship between 'Warabari' and 'Watara-beringg' begins to reveal itself when we consider the two available audio recordings of Milerum singing the 'Song of the Swallow'. From the 1932 cylinder and the 1937 acetate disc, one can hear how he pronounces the first morpheme which Tindale transcribed as 'Watara'. He sings it always rapidly: six times the *ra* is inaudible and it is one syllable shorter as `Wata`beringg; once there is a barely audible *rə* in `Wat[rə]`beringg; and once it is `Wata`wedingg. The final *i* is never heard, and must have arisen in spoken conversation with Tindale.⁴⁹

Thus a rapid pronunciation of the two unstressed syllables in *watara* easily renders the syllable *ra* inaudible while the *ta* remains clearly heard.

Probably the reverse could also happen: on a particular occasion the *ta* might be skimped in favour of the *ra*.

While giving Tindale his 'Story of Tjelbruke' in 1934, Milerum was telling "a long story which he had heard at Yankalilla when he was quite young in the early 1880s. The narrators then were using Rapid Bay talk and Milerum attempted to use terms he had heard at that time".⁵⁰ He was trying to reproduce the sound of a foreign or hybrid language in the heat of a live narration 50 years later. He may well have been speaking quickly and slurring or abridging some of the words. 'Warabari' was probably one of these 'Rapid Bay' words adapted from Kurna. Especially he might have left off the last syllable *-nggi*. 'Watara-beringgi' might easily have come out as 'Wara-bari' or 'Wara-beri', the spellings given in Tindale's notes. Or Tindale, hearing it for the first time, may have missed some sounds.

As there are no other known explanations of Milerum's 'Warabari... 'towards Cape Jervis' and 'right up on top of the range', and the cave exit location applies to it as well as to 'Wataraberingg', it is almost certain that the names are variants of each other.

Tindale noted Milerum's narrative thus in 1934:

Carried his nephew way inland, way inland, a big hill there called Warabari (highest part of hill towards Cape Jervis) and got good place there and put in cave. Instead of going back he made it wide enough for him to go on inside until he got right up on top of range at Warabari. He came out onto main range there looked down: -

⁴⁹ Tindale Cylinder 3, Milerum Series 1932, AA338/11/5/3; Tindale Disc 5, Clarence Long Series 1937-8, AA338/11/12/5.

⁵⁰ Tindale 1987: 5.

This paragraph implies that the entrance and exit were not very far from each other and both up in the hills. But the location of the entrance and burial site here remains as a glaring discrepancy with all other recorded versions of the story.

Milerum was sitting in his own country far away on the Coorong, not inside the country of the tale where directions and distances could be made instantly clear with hand gestures. 'Tjelbruke' country was at the unfamiliar western margin of the lands he knew, straddling a major linguistic barrier between the Yaraldic tongues of his Coorong-Lakes country and the Thura-Yura languages across the range to the northwest. His geographical references may not have been clearly spelled out, and Tindale may easily have confused some of them without time to realize all the discrepancies.

As far as I know Milerum never gave any other location for Tjilbruki's cave entrance. He did tell Tindale about "a special cave called *Ja`narwing*" on the coast, and – in the context of Tjirbuki's burial cave as recounted by *Karlowan* in 1935 – Tindale thought this was "probably the same one referred to in this legend".⁵¹ I do not know any record of Milerum either endorsing or disputing this idea.

Tindale never alluded again to the Warabari version of the entrance at the 'highest part of hill'.

Was this 'Warabari' a confusion with the exit site, which answered the same geographical description and had the same name? and did Milerum correct the error later in '*supplementary discussions*'? If so, I am not aware that Tindale has told us.

Or was there no confusion, but Milerum actually believed that Tjelbruke entered a cave, and left his nephew's body, there at a site in the hills close enough to the exit to be called by the same name? Was this another case of Tindale ignoring the discrepancies between different versions?

The answer may be somewhere in the 'Milerum Manuscripts' which I have not seen.

LOCATION: WHERE IS WATARA-PARRINGGA?

In order to discuss this question we need a small digression to ask 'where is Hay Flat?'

At the junction of Waterfall Creek with the Yankalilla River there is now a hamlet called Hay Flat, though this name applied earlier to various parts of the Creek. Goyder in 1855 called the creek '*Hay Flat ck.*' on Section

⁵¹ Tindale MS, 'The story of Tji:rbuki from Karlowan and notes from Milerum, published in 1936', Notes on the Kurna, AA 338/1/35: 84.

1133, 1½ km northward towards the junction;⁵² but it is not clear whether it was used there by earlier surveyors. I shall call this 'Hay Flat plains'.

On 20th-century maps 'Hay Flat' was still marked as a locality in the upper valley specifically on Section 1130, on the east with Mt Robinson behind it, facing Mt Hayfield and the old site of Field's 'Hillside' below it across the creek; and this is where the name is still gazetted.⁵³ I shall call this 'Hay Flat valley'.

The name 'Hay Flat' is now also applied sometimes to the vicinity of the Hay Flat Road north of the Yankalilla River, but this is irrelevant to our discussion.

The hill which (for Milerum) was associated with the cave exit through the name 'Watara-beringgi', was Mount Hayfield. This is an elevation on an almost separated spur of the range, 4 km north of the watershed in the vicinity of Parawa, about 25 km from Cape Jervis.

MILERUM AND 'SOUTH':

Sometimes Tindale wrote or implied that this site name referred specifically to Mt Hayfield,⁵⁴ but in other unpublished records that it was *near* it.⁵⁵ As we will see later, 'near' may have come from Karlowan.⁵⁶

Milerum and Karlowan agreed in general terms that the name Watara-ngalang or Watira-ngenggul belonged in the vicinity of Mt Hayfield. But in spite of Tindale's assertions, it is doubtful that either informant applied the name to the individual hill itself.

Both of them identified the name as a Dual, which is linguistically clearest in Karlowan's *-enggul* and *-ngenggul* suffixes; and they both said that it applied to *two* hills and their embodied Beings which were seen as a pair, or to their vicinity.⁵⁷

They may also have meant a campsite which was identified and found by its relationship to these landmarks nearby. Milerum said that the two hills 'are' (presumably he meant 'have associated with them') two historical campsites: "*the two hills then which are the camps of the people in history*".⁵⁸ Possible locations for these campsites might perhaps be found in archaeological or settler records.

⁵² Field Book 265, GNU: 117.

⁵³ See e.g. the 1929 Hundred of Yankalilla map used by Tindale, AA 338/24/101; and mapsheet 1:50,000 'Torrens Vale' N. 6526, 2nd ed. This location is still gazetted as the Hay Flat 'locality bounded' and 'flat', while the hamlet is not listed separately (GNU at <http://www.placenames.sa.gov.au/pno/> [17/4/13]). It is also now a 'suburb' incorporating all of the above.

⁵⁴ Tindale 1941, 'Native songs 2': 242; 1987 'Wanderings': 9b; Kurna cards 639, 641/1.

⁵⁵ Peramangk cards 364 and 641/2, AA338/7/1/43; Kurna card 642.

⁵⁶ – beginning from Tindale 1936: 500.

⁵⁷ 'Tanganekald Notes from Milerum [and Karlowan]', SESA 2: 229, 231; Berndt and Berndt 1993, *A World That Was*: 234.

⁵⁸ SESA2: 229.

Karlowan elaborated: “one hill belonged to the Wati-erilindjera clan, the other to the Lepuldalindjera”.⁵⁹

In one of Tindale’s earliest records about the Two, Milerum had said that one of them was ‘south’ of the other, and ‘smaller’ than it.⁶⁰ Even if we leave aside Tindale’s hasty identification of this with the trig station ‘South of Mt Hayfield’, it is very hard to clarify what Milerum meant by this ‘southern’ hill.⁶¹

Because Milerum gave no other more precise location for his ‘Watara-beringgi’, Tindale was content for a long time to identify it by its approximation, Mt Hayfield: not knowing that Karlowan in about 1940 had given Berndt a much clearer version (see below). But late in his career, probably after he had reiterated publicly that ‘Wateira-ngenggel’ was Mt Hayfield in ‘Wanderings’ 1987,⁶² he came to this conclusion: “The spring of water so important to the southern Kurna was situated on a creek (Waterfall Creek) between two hills and thus bore the name Watirangengəl using the dual suffix”.⁶³

As far as we know without combing through all of the Milerum papers, Milerum never said that the name applied ‘between two hills’, nor to a ‘spring’ or any other water site. Tindale mentioned neither of these interpretations in any known record until the 1980s,⁶⁴ and the speculation must be judged only on its own merits.

Most likely Tindale was referring to a spring he had noted on his reference map⁶⁵ on section 115, on the uppermost reaches of Waterfall Creek in the hilly country south of Mt Hayfield towards the watershed. This guess might theoretically be correct for Milerum’s version of the site. But the Kurna version of the name identifies a *parri* ‘creek’, rather than a general *kauwe* ‘water site’.⁶⁶ The well-watered picnic area on the creek, in the shadow of Mt Hayfield immediately below the first falls, would be more like a *parri* and may therefore be a better guess for the place Milerum had in

⁵⁹ Berndt and Berndt 1993: 311.

⁶⁰ Tindale ‘13 May 1936 TanganeKald Notes from Milerum’, SE of SA 2, AA 338/1/33/2: 231.

⁶¹ See above. For a full discussion of this ‘southern’ mystery, see ‘BACKGROUND4_TjilbrukiCavesHills.pdf’ and PNS 5.03/05 Lepuldawi.

⁶² Tindale 1987: 9a.

⁶³ Tindale MS, ‘Place Names: Drafts For Text’, AA338/10/2: 29.

⁶⁴ Tindale Kurna place-name cards 641/1 ‘Wateira-ngenggal’ and 642 ‘Wateira-’ngenggal’; 1987 ‘Wanderings’: 11a; ‘Place Names: Drafts For Text’, AA338/10/2: 29, 125.

⁶⁵ Kurna place-name card 642 ‘Wateirangenggal’.

⁶⁶ Tindale identified this distinction: “... only permanently flowing streams had names. For all others the place names were linked to specific places where any pools which remained during the hot dry summer season when the streams were dry”. (‘Place Names: Drafts For Text’, AA338/10/2: 18; cp. 49, 136).

mind, unless in Ngarrindjeri storytelling it had become a different place from the original Kurna site.

There were many springs in and around Hay Flat valley itself; they were one of the reasons for its early settlement.⁶⁷ One of them is marked on Tindale's reference map at Section 247 immediately east of the printed 'Hay Flat'; but it is in very small print, and his attention had been directed southward.

Unless archaeology comes to our aid with evidence of a well-used campsite, these will remain guesses.

South of the hill there are still patches of scrub, but these are certainly not on the 'scrub *plain*' as in Karlowan's account (see below).

KARLOWAN'S HAY FLAT VALLEY:

For Karlowan, 'Watieri-anggal' or 'Watira-ngenggul' had nothing to do with Tjirbuki's exit from his underground journey; it was the place where "*Tji:rbuki was born (started)*", and his cave exit was at Blowhole Beach.⁶⁸

In speaking thus about Watirangenggul, he could have been referring to a mythical emergence from the earth (which could be anywhere in the area), or merely where the hero was born as a human (probably near one of the campsites discussed below).

Tindale was not able to follow up Karlowan for a longer account of Tjirbuki, and did not receive his version of the two ancestors in any detail.

But when Karlowan gave Berndt the story of Watieri and Lepuldali, 'Marsupial Possum and Jaybird', he included a fairly specific location for 'Watierilanggal',⁶⁹ clarifying that it was not itself a hill:

*In Ramindjeri territory, within the same area associated with Tjirbuki, lived two Dreaming men [Lepuldali and Wati-eri] on the scrub plain at Wati-erilanggal, near Mt Hayfield, a few miles southwest of the Bald Hills. The name Wati-erilanggal referred to two hills.*⁷⁰

⁶⁷ Light had written of it in 1836, "*I never saw a more beautiful little valley than this... it is full of fresh water springs and covered with very fine grass*" (Light hand-coloured map 3/11/1836, published as Arrowsmith 26/1/1838 'A survey on the coast on the east side of St Vincents Gulf', *BPP: Colonies: Australia* 5: 196).

⁶⁸ Tindale 1936: 500; and see PNS 7.01/06 'Konggaratingga (Blowhole Creek)'.

⁶⁹ Berndt spells it '-langgel' throughout his own text, but it also occurs as '-anggal' in Karlowan's Yaraldi text, : 448.

Wati-erilanggal was not Mt Hayfield itself, nor *at* it, but *near* it on a ‘scrub plain’. The only plains in the vicinity of Mt Hayfield are around Waterfall Creek immediately north (Hay Flat plains) and east (Hay Flat valley) of the hill. A ‘scrub plain’ would perhaps be the latter, where there would once have been more scrub than on the tall-grass parts recorded lower down on the ‘open plain’ in first settlement times.⁷¹

This site – further downstream than the hill sites in the high gully of the Mt Hayfield spur – is the best fit of all for a permanently-flowing *parri*. But Hay Flat valley is *east* of Mt Hayfield. It seems hardly compatible with Milerum’s site as interpreted ‘south’ by Tindale; though possibly not with what Milerum may actually have said or meant, which I suspect was merely something general like ‘near Mt Hayfield’.

Compared with the steep hill gullies, a site on a flat and well-watered valley is much more likely to be what Tindale wrote in 1987 of Watirangenggul: that it was “*an important living area... From ancient times it has been one of the southernmost living places of the Kurna tribespeople*”.⁷² The nearby hills and gullies would be a bonus, with useful features such as lookouts and hiding places. A similar locality was *Ngangki-parringga* at Old Noarlunga, with a steep gorge next to a lush valley.

.....

⁷⁰ Berndt and Berndt 1993: 234.

⁷¹ Dr Richard Schomburgk 1874, *Grasses and Fodder Plants*, quoted in Cockburn 1990, *SA: What’s in a Name?:* 98. The name ‘Hay Flat’ is now applied also to a hamlet at the junction of Yankalilla River and Waterfall Creek, but its older application was in the valley of the latter.

⁷² Tindale 1987, ‘Wanderings’: 11a.

POSTSCRIPT 1: 'NEAR MT ROBINSON'.

Strangely, it seems likely that Karlowan originally told Tindale that the first place 'Watira-ngenggul' was also 'near Mt Robinson', rather than associating it with Mt Hayfield as Tindale did (following Milerum); though both can only be taken as approximations.

In the published form of his 1936 essay on Karlowan's Tjirbuki story, Tindale wrote, "*Tji:rbuki was born (started) at [Wa`ti:ranengul]... which is near Mt Hayfield and about five miles south-west of Bald Hills*".⁷³ But in a late MS draft he had previously written, "*which is near Mt Robinson and about 3 miles south of Bald Hills*"; and then corrected the place and distance to the published version.⁷⁴

Tindale included a few titbits from Milerum in this essay, but 'Mt Robinson' here is unlikely to have been one of them, since Milerum seems never to have mentioned it. The alteration to 'near Mt Hayfield' could have arisen from either of the informants. Karlowan told Berndt it was 'near Mt Hayfield' and may have told the same to Tindale as well at another time. Being already mentally aligned to Milerum's 'south' version from sessions in the same year, Tindale presumably saw 'Mt Robinson' as a simple mistake. Missing the opportunity as early as this in his search for a single correct version, he filtered this hill out of his interpretations, opted for Mt Hayfield alone, and never revisited the issue.

This side-track highlights once again the need to analyse the geographical context before assuming too much from a single landmark reference.⁷⁵

.....

POSTSCRIPT 2: 'MT MAYFIELD'.

Another map annotation by Tindale is puzzling. Attached to Mt Hayfield is the note "*Wat:eiringengl [sic] Mt Mayfield not Hayfield*".⁷⁶

Thomas Mayfield was an early settler in the area around Bald Hills (known then as 'Tootocowinga'); one his properties there was next to Robinson's,⁷⁷ where today's Mayfield Road

⁷³ Tindale and Mountford 1936, *Records of SA Museum* 5(4): 500.

⁷⁴ 'The story of Tji:rbuki... from Karlowan and notes from Milerum, published in 1936', in 'Notes on the Kurna', AA 338/1/35: 79; cp. Tindale 1936: 500.

⁷⁵ See PNS 5.03/05 Lepuldawi, and 'BACKGROUND4_TjilbrukiCavesHills.pdf'.

⁷⁶ Tindale 'S Map: Summary of Kurna area', AA 338/16/8.

is named after him. Was there a Mt Mayfield in the vicinity once? The map is titled 'Summary of Kurna Area', probably a relatively early attempt (up to 1941) to summarize data from the larger-scale Hundreds maps.

It is impossible to know what Tindale had in mind when he wrote this note. Was it a very late correction by Milerum? – this is unlikely because Karlowan confirmed Mt Hayfield as the relevant landmark. Was Tindale doubting his records of what both of his informants had originally said about the several hills and their several names in Ngarrindjeri and English? Was Mayfield an earlier and obsolete name for the hill?⁷⁸ Tindale did not pursue it.

.....

POSTSCRIPT 3: THE RELATIONSHIP OF WATARA-PARRINGGA SITE TO OTHER LOCAL PLACE-NAME SITES:

From 1839 to 1842 the name “Ingullilla”⁷⁹ (probably *Inggalilla*) was attached to an area north and northeast of Mt Hayfield, around the Hay Flat plains on the lowest reach of Waterfall Creek. We cannot be very certain of the original referent because the surveyors applied the name to slightly variable districts.⁸⁰

By September 1840 three sections had been ‘set apart for the use of Aborigines’ in an unspecified area “near Yanky-lilla”, known as “Wongurilla” (probably *Wonggarilla* or *Wanggarilla*).⁸¹ These sections are almost certainly 1130 and 1131,⁸² most likely together with one of the neighbouring small sections 246-8.⁸³ This is the heart of the valley where the name Hay Flat is now gazetted, at the junction of the main creek with a tributary from the southeast. On the opposite side of the valley was the homestead of Captain William Field who, ‘enchanted with this spot’ in 1836 like Colonel Light, came back to buy some of it.⁸⁴

⁷⁷ GNU plan 6/15, 1844.

⁷⁸ Neither Manning nor the GNU website throw any light on this (2013).

⁷⁹ Also spelled ‘Inggellella’ and ‘Ingalilla’. See PNS 5.03/02.

⁸⁰ See PNS 5.03/02 Inggalilla.

⁸¹ *Southern Australian* 29 Sep 1840: 3b.

⁸² The surveys of District F by Kentish, Poole & Bryant included “1130-1 Aboriginal reserve” in the Hundred of Yankalilla (GNU History Books v16 f30: [18]). See also PNS 5.02.01/03 ‘Wongurilla’.

⁸³ It is very likely that ‘Wongurilla’ was somewhere in the Hay Flat valley, because the GNU History Book records sections 1130-1 as Aboriginal Reserves in the first surveys. We know that these first reserves in the Yankalilla district were ‘at Wongurilla’, but we are not at all sure that they were ‘Wongurilla’.

⁸⁴ Elder, *William Light’s Brief Journal*: 64; Arrowsmith map 26/1/1838, ‘A survey on the coast...’ by Col. Light’, *BPP*: *Aust.* 5: 196; Roy Williams 1986/1991, *To Find A Way: Yankalilla and District 1836-1986*, Yankalilla and District Historical Society: 96.

Both 'Wongurilla' and *Inggalilla* may have originated somewhere other than their recorded locations, though probably not far away. No doubt each was originally the name of a very specific site but was being used by the surveyors to represent a larger area.⁸⁵

Probably 'Wongurilla' and *Watara-parringga* were the names of two favoured campsites in or near Hay Flat valley (probably not the same one). There are doubtless more than two places which fit the conditions for a well-used camp, or once did; but we do not know exactly where they were.

As we have seen, it is also very likely that *Watara-parringga* was somewhere in the Hay Flat valley, assuming that Milerum's 'Wataraberinggi' from which it is deduced was the same place as Karlowan's 'Watierianggel' on a 'scrub plain'.

Thus we have the same general area for both *Watara-parringga* and 'Wongurilla', and must map them identically even though it is certain that they would have referred to different parts of the area.

Likely parts of the valley include:

firstly, the gazetted site of Hay Flat itself on section 1130 together with its immediate vicinity around the junction on 1137 of Waterfall Creek and its eastern tributary⁸⁶; and

secondly, some favourable sites 2 km further south. Here, at the end of the valley under the Putland's Hill ascent, we find

(a) the picnic ground at the bottom of the gully of Ingalalla Falls on Waterfall Creek in section 1120; and

(b) a site less than a kilometre east, at the first rising ground on the boundary of 1126-7, where two creeks from the hills join to become the single eastern tributary of Waterfall Creek in the valley.

Both spots are sheltered by high hills from all but north or northeast winds.

The picnic site might even satisfy Milerum's viewpoint by being 'between' Mt Hayfield and Putland's 'southern' Hill. Karlowan's 'scrub plain' might possibly cover a campsite close to this area, but certainly not the Ingalalla picnic ground, and possibly not the 1127 site itself.

Needless to say, we cannot be sure about any of this. Archaeology, detailed local knowledge and Aboriginal insights on the ground might lead to different conclusions.

.....

⁸⁵ Certainly 'Ingullilla' / 'Inggelella' was shown on two maps extending for more than 4½ km across country which is largely not Hay Flat at all but the rolling country slightly east and north of it, on the western margins of Dairy Flat and Torrens Vale, and north of the Yankalilla River (two versions of Kentish and Poole 1840, 'Plan of Yankalyilla', C 243, SLSA, and Plan 6/16B, GNU); cp. PNS 5.03/02 Inggalilla.

⁸⁶ The junction is just over the boundary from section 1130, on the track to 'Longridge' homestead.

POSTSCRIPT 4: DID A HIGH ROUTE OVER THE PARAWA RANGE PASS THROUGH HAY FLAT?

Such a track would have been less frequented than the well-attested and much lower route through Inman Valley.

Tindale wrote that a route ‘*passing... Mt Hayfield*’ was used to bring Kaltanganuru from Encounter Bay to Yankalilla:⁸⁷

He travels with his new kinsfolk from [ˈLatarnɟ] to [ˈNibiElarnɟk] (Crozier’s Hill), thence to [ˈTowara:ŋk] (a hill 3 miles N of Inman Post Office), passing [ˈWata`bareiŋgi] or [WatarEbering], Mt Hayfield. ‘How much further will they take me?’ he cries, and looks back over his shoulder at the high hill which is his last known landmark.

This statement is part of a free interpretation of the song, and he may have added the idea of the route himself, simply in order to include some of the other place-names he had collected. (He certainly did this extensively in his 1987 essay on Tjilbruki).

The route through Inman Valley to Yankalilla plain does not go anywhere near Mt Hayfield, probably not in sight of it even at the Bald Hills pass unless one detours up the hills on either side.

If Milerum really told a story in which Kaltanganuru ‘looked back’ at Mt Hayfield after passing it, they must have come over the range near Parawa, then down or near the Hay Flat valley. They would have gone nowhere near Crozier’s Hill, Inman Valley or Towarangk.

Such a route may have gone up Willow Creek, over to the headwaters of the Yankalilla River, then down its valley, seeing Mt Hayfield as an obvious feature of the landscape from 2½ km away at their closest point.

Or they may have taken a rather longer and more strenuous route over the range south of the Mt Robinson summit, down the gully of Parawa Rd and then perhaps northwest to Hay Flat valley right under Mt Hayfield.

In either case they would reach the Big Gorge of the Yankalilla, the common early route which was used and remembered by settlers,⁸⁸ and included a spring which had supplied a favourite Aboriginal campsite at Lady Bay.⁸⁹

.....

⁸⁷ Tindale 1941, ‘Native Songs Part 2’: 243.

⁸⁸ Roy Williams 1986, *To Find A Way: Yankalilla and District 1836-1986*, Yankalilla and District Historical Society: 19, 51.

⁸⁹ Angas 1847, *SA Illustrated*, Pl. XXIX, ‘The Gorge at Yankalillah’.

The password-protected 'Complete' version of this essay includes five more Postscripts, containing some other uncertain possibilities for the interpretation of the 'Watara', and other doubtful matters relating to the place and the name.

References to background documents

For complete data and background analysis of related place-names, see the background document 'BACKGROUND4_TjilbrukiCavesHills.pdf'.

.....

End of Summary