

Regulating Market Manipulation in Australia

Honours Dissertation

Monique England



University of Adelaide

October 1992

To the best of my knowledge and belief, this
this dissertation contains no material
previously published or written by another
person except when due reference is made
in the text of the dissertation.

12/10/92.

Monique Susan England

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author's sincere thanks are due to Dr Suzanne Corcoran and Ms Vicki Waye, supervisors of this thesis : and also to Mr Jim Hambrook for his helpful comments.

The assistance of the Adelaide Office of the Commonwealth Director of Public Prosecutions (Corporations) was greatly appreciated. In particular, Mr Stephen Vorreiter and Mr David Chapman provided valuable information and advice, and their interest and assistance is gratefully acknowledged. Indeed this thesis has been largely motivated by the DPP's prosecution of Graham Tuckwell earlier this year, providing valuable insight into the regulatory difficulties facing this area of the law.

Thanks are also due to Mr Jim Berry, Manager of the Australian Stock Exchange Market Surveillance for supplying useful case information.

The author expresses sincere gratitude to all persons who assisted in any way; however, sole responsibility for any opinions expressed is accepted by the author.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
INTRODUCTION	1
PART I MARKET MANIPULATION AND ITS REGULATION	2
BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE	
<u>Chapter 1: Market Manipulation</u>	2
1.1. Differentiating between manipulative and non-manipulative market conduct	2
1.2. Manipulative practices	4
1.2.1. Artificial trades	4
1.2.2. Actual trades	5
<u>Chapter 2: Should Market Manipulation be Regulated?</u>	7
2.1. Market regulation: the dual goals of efficiency and fairness	7
2.2. Anti-regulation: an efficiency view	8
2.3. Conclusion	9
<u>Chapter 3: An Historical Perspective</u>	10
3.1. Introduction	10
3.2. The common law	10
3.3. The development of a statutory offence	11
3.3.1. The United States	11
3.3.2. Australia	12
PART II: THE OFFENCE OF MARKET MANIPULATION	14
<u>Chapter 4: The Australian Statutory Position</u>	14
4.1. Introduction	14
4.2. Section 997: Market manipulation	14
4.3. Section 998: False trading and market rigging	15
4.4. The complexity of the legislation - is it self defeating?	18
<u>Chapter 5: Proving the Requisite Manipulative Intent</u>	20
5.1. Introduction	20
5.2. Inferring manipulative intent	21
5.3. Proving manipulative intent	22
5.4. Case study: <i>Tuckwell</i>	22
5.4.1. The charge	23
5.4.2. The circumstantial case	23
5.4.3. The verdict	25
5.5. Conclusion	27
<u>Chapter 6: The Jury Trial in the Commercial Context</u>	28
6.1. Introduction	28
6.2. The jury - lacking the requisite business knowledge?	28
6.3. The jury as the cornerstone of criminal justice	31
6.4. Taking the jury question further - the morality of market crime	32

<u>Chapter 7: The Criminality of Market Crime</u>	34
7.1. Introduction	34
7.2. The morality of market crime	34
7.3. Distinguishing economic crime	36
PART III: OVERCOMING REGULATORY FAILURE	38
<u>Chapter 8: The Regulatory Objectives - Why Aren't They Being Met?</u>	38
8.1. Golden promise and harsh reality	38
8.2. Recent regulatory improvements - are they sufficient?	39
8.2.1. Introduction	39
8.2.2. Improvements in Market Surveillance	40
8.2.3. The new improved ASC	42
8.3. Beyond the improvements	44
<u>Chapter 9: Reassessing the Criminal/Civil Balance</u>	46
9.1. Introduction	46
9.2. The criminal law - deterrent value	46
9.3. The role of the civil sanction	48
9.3.1. Background	48
9.3.2. The US experience	48
9.3.3. Civil sanctions in Australia	50
9.4. The ASC's civil emphasis	54
9.4.1. ASC - regulatory philosophy	54
9.4.2. ASC/DPP tension	56
9.4.3. Perceptions of Australian regulatory timidity	61
<u>Chapter 10: Putting 'Teeth' into the Criminal Law</u>	62
10.1. Introduction	62
10.2. The current offence: 'all or nothing'	63
10.3. Creating a middleground offence	65
10.3.1. An objective prohibition	66
10.3.2. Section 995	68
10.3.3. Sanctioning	70
10.4. Redressing shortfalls in the existing provisions	75
CONCLUSION	76
BIBLIOGRAPHY	77