

WORKPLACE CHANGE AND AWARD RESTRUCTURING

GRADUATE STUDIES
AND
SCHOLARSHIPS BRANCH
RECEIVED

Glenn Giles

- 4 JUN 1998

Department of Social Inquiry (Labour Studies) The University of Adelaide April 1998

Thesis Submitted for the Degree of Master of Arts

Table of Contents

	Page
Abstract	iv
Statement	vi
Acknowledgments	vii
List of Tables and Figures	viii
Abbreviations	ix
Chapter One: Introduction	1
1.1 The Study's Background	2
1.2 Study Methodology	6
1.3 Study Outline	8
PART ONE: THEORY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS CHANGE	
Chapter Two: Post-Fordist Theory in Australia	11
2.1 Introduction	11
2.2 Varieties of Post-Fordism	12
2.2.1 Influences on Post-Fordism	12
2.2.2 Post-Fordism in Australia	15
2.2.3 Neo-Fordism and Post-Fordism	18
2.3 Criticisms of Post-Fordist Theory	21
2.3.1 Problems with Fordist Theory	21
2.3.2 Post-Fordism and Production Model Choices	23
2.3.3 Taylorism Intensified	26
2.3.4 'Peripheral Employment'	26
2.3.5 Post-Fordism - Manufacturing Bias	27
2.4 Conclusion	28
Chapter Three: 1980s Australian Industrial Relations Change	30
3.1 Introduction	30
3.2 Changing Australian Industrial Relations	31
3.2.1 Business Views	31
3.2.2 Union Strategy Changes	33
3.3 National Wages System Changes Focus	34
3.3.1 Two Tiered Wages System	35
3.3.2 Responses to Two Tier Decision	35
3.4 Award Restructuring	36
3.4.1 Second Structural Efficiency Decision	37
3.5 Approaches to Award Restructuring	39

3.5.1 Employer Responses to Award Restructuring	40
3.5.2 Union Approaches to Award Restructuring	41
3.6 Award Restructuring: Early Progress	43
3.61 Feminist Criticism of Restructuring	45
3.7 Conclusion	47
PART TWO: AUSTRALIAN CASE STUDIES	49
Chapter Four: Australian Taxation Office: Consultation and Job Redesign	49
4.1 Introduction	49
4.2 Research Method	51
4.3 Industrial Relations Background	52
4.3.1 The Australian Taxation Office in the mid 1980s	53
4.3.2 Work Classification Change	54
4.3.3 Classification Structure and APS/ATO Unions	55
4.4 Australian Public Service Award Restructuring: Second Tier Wage	
Agreement	56
4.4.1 Pay Increases	56
4.4.2 Broad-banding and Multi-skilling: Cost Benefits	57
4.4.3 Training Commitment	57
4.4.4 Job Redesign: 'Whole Job Concept'	58
4.4.5 Consultation	58
4.5 Office Structures Implementation	59
4.5.1 Office Structures Implementation in the Australian Taxation (Office
	59
4.5.2 Creation of Returns Processing	60
4.5.3 Teams	61
4.6 Employee Responses	62
4.6.1 Training	63
4.6.2 Value of Work	63
4.6.3 Multi-skilling or Multi-tasking	65
4.6.4 Simplifying Work	66
4.6.5 Career Opportunities	67
4.6.6 Stress	68
4.7 Other Australian Public Service Organisations in the 1980s	69
4.7.1 Profile Change	72
4.8 Conclusion	73
Chapter Five: Timber Industry Workplace Change	76
5.1 Introduction	76

5.2 Research Method	77
5.3 Australian Timber Industry	79
5.4 Approaches to Timber Industry Award Restructuring	81
5.4.1 The Timber Workers' Union Work Change Aims	82
5.4.2 Award Restructuring and Employers	84
5.5 Award Restructuring in the Timber Industry	85
5.5.1 The Timber Mission	85
5.5.2 Continuing Structural Efficiency	86
5.5.3 Increased Functional Flexibility	86
5.5.4 Enterprise Flexibility Provision	87
5.5.5 Consultative Committees	87
5.5.6 Employer Association Support For Consultation	88
5.5.7 Aims of Consultative Committees	89
5.5.8 Consultation and Management Prerogative	90
5.5.9 Classification Structure Change	90
5.6 Workplace Change and Award Restructuring	92
5.6.1 Individual Companies	92
5.6.2 Small Timber Operations	97
5.6.3 Summary	98
5.7 Conclusion	101
Chapter Six: Conclusion	103
6.1 Post-Fordism in Australia	103
6.2 The Case Studies	106
6.2.1 The Australian Taxation Office	106
6.2.2 The Timber Industry Case	108
6.3 Conclusion	109
Ribliography	113

Abstract

This thesis examines aspects of paid work in the late 1980s and early 1990s. By the later 1980s a version of post-Fordist theory, which I call 'optimistic', influenced Australian policy makers, especially in the Australian Labor Party, several unions and the ACTU. The Australian proponents of 'optimistic' post-Fordism argued that new technologies and changing market conditions demanded more skilled, independent and flexible workers with more democratic workplace industrial relations than had been customary. This view of changing work demands is the central proposition tested in this study, examined firstly in a general way, by looking at Australian industrial relations from the late 1980s into the early 1990s, and secondly, more specifically, in two case studies.

'Optimistic post-Fordist' theory has several flaws, such as hypothesising an evolutionary development of production methods, understating the variety in work methods and not adequately addressing the growth in 'marginal' jobs. In addition, 'optimistic post-Fordism' is equivocal about whether its post-Fordist vision will or will not be achieved. At some points technology is posited as the primary factor impelling changes to work, while at others social and political forces are instrumental. Nonetheless, work has been subject to growing pressures to change. From the mid 1980s, Australia's industrial relations system felt, and responded to, these pressures. Workplace and enterprise focus increased. Award restructuring became central in the late 1980s, but different parties had competing aims. The central concern of this thesis is how work changed during award restructuring, and did these changes correspond with an 'optimistic post-Fordist' view of industrial change.

The case studies are of award restructuring in the Adelaide Branch Office of the Australian Taxation Office (ATO) and the timber industry. In the ATO, employees gained increased career opportunities and greater participation in shaping work organisation. However, job redesign meant task expansion and increased work intensity. Supervisory practice became less domineering, but effectively some keyboard data entry was 'displaced' to the private sector, where work would be less regulated. Timber industry employers preferred limited union involvement in workplaces, implementing quality and participation schemes that avoided unions, while the union sought formalised consultation processes. The union's 'post-Fordist' objective of a more skilled workforce met employers' more limited aims of enterprise specific worker competencies and cost minimising. Worker input into improving production efficiency increased, suggesting relaxation of Taylorist/Fordist hierarchical production organisation, although management continued striving for maximum productivity and tension continued between consent and control in management-

employee relations.

In both cases, significant, although different work changes accompanied award restructuring. In the ATO there was more notable job redesign than in the timber industry. Industrial relations became more co-operative in both areas, although in the timber industry it appeared that post-Fordism, as pictured by Australian labour movement leaders, was not a strong influence on management. Higher union density in the ATO than in the timber industry, and more ATO management support for job redesign (and other initiatives) that reduced low level jobs, influenced the different outcomes in the case studies. Changes in the ATO during award restructuring benefited low classification women workers, suggesting modification of the critique of award restructuring that it was, and is, relevant for male manufacturing workers and less pertinent for women employees in service industries. However, the ATO has very different characteristics to other service employment areas, likely making it somewhat exceptional.

Statement

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university and that, to the best of the candidate's knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis being made available for photocopying and loan if accepted for the award of the degree.

Signed

Date

20.4.98

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank Barbara Pocock and Greg O'Leary for their assistance, encouragment and supervision in this project - to Greg especially for earlier stages of the work and to Barbara for encouraging guidance through the whole of the project's length. Their perseverance and patience have been much appreciated.

I am also grateful for the help from, and thoughts offered by, other members of the Centre for Labour Studies at the University of Adelaide (now part of the Department of Social Inquiry, a result of a 'merger' with the Department of Women's Studies at Adelaide university), including the office staff who kindly helped me in the use of office technologies - particularly Sharon Lewis and Judy Barlow.

I express much appreciation to friends and family who also persevered with me through this work, gave considered advice and helped in numerous ways. Special appreciation to Belinda Fazekas, Merion Giles and Bob Giles, Rosa Duigan-Giles, Bernadette Duigan, Louise Fazekas-Giles and Alex Fazekas-Giles.

To the people who gave me their opinions on developments in their workplaces I extend my gratitude for what might have seemed to them a touch obvious. I am thankful to workers and union officials, particularly Quentin Cook and other staff at the Timber Workers' Union, and Greg Franks and the union delegates of the PSU at the Adelaide Taxation Office during 1992-93, who gave very generously of their time and thoughts in the 'fieldwork' research for this thesis.

Without all of the above (and others), this work would not have been possible. The author remains responsible for the final product.

List of Tables and Figures

Figure 4.1 Australian Taxation Office Interviews (May - September 1992)	52
Table 5.1 Employment in forestry and forest products: 1987-8 to 1991-2	79
Table 5.2 Employees ('000) - selected forestry and forest products industries	
1982-3 to 1988-9	80
Table 5.3 Company workplace change initiatives	99
Table 5.4 Company approaches to award restructuring	99
Table 5.5 Issues at consultative committees	100

Abbreviations

ABARE Australian Bureau of Agricultural and Resource Economics

ABS Australian Bureau of Statistics

ACAC Australian Conciliation and Arbitration Commission

ACF Australian Conservation Foundation

ACOA Administrative and Clerical Officers' Association (formed the PSU)

ACTU Australian Council of Trade Unions

AIRC Australian Industrial Relations Commission

ANM Australian Newsprint Mills

APPM Associated Pulp and Paper Mills

APS Australian Public Service

APSA Australian Public Service Association

ASC Australian Securities Commission

ASO Administrative Service Officer

ATO Australian Taxation Office

ATWU Australian Timber Worker Union, (became Australian Timber and

Allied Industries Union (ATAIU) in 1991)

AWIRS The Australian Workplace Industrial Relations Survey

BCA Business Council of Australia

CAI Confederation of Australian Industry (now Australian Chamber of

Commerce and Industry ACCI)

ECC Enterprise Consultative Committee

ELS Electronic Lodgement Service

FAFPIC Forestry and Forest Product Industry Council

FCU(TOB) Federated Clerks Union (Tax Officers Branch) (joined the PSU, 1990)

FTIA Federation of Timber Industrial Associations

JIT Just In Time

NAFI National Association of Forest Industries

OSI Office Structures Implementation

PSB Public Service Board (disbanded 1987)

PSC Public Service Commission (created 1987)

PSU Australian Public Sector and Broadcasting Union

RAC Resource Assessment Commission

RDO Rostered Day Off

RSI Repetitive Strain Injury

SEP Structural Efficiency Principle

TQM Total Quality Management

TTIA Timber Trade Industrial Association