

1 COMMISSIONER STEVENS
2
3 HINDMARSH ISLAND BRIDGE ROYAL COMMISSION
4
5 WEDNESDAY, 15 NOVEMBER 1995
6
7 RESUMING 10.13 A.M.
8 MRS SIMPSON CALLS
9 VERONICA PATRICIA BRODIE SWORN
10 EXAMINATION BY MRS SIMPSON
11 Q. I think you have given a statement to the Commission; is
12 that correct.
13 A. That's correct.
14 Q. Would you look at this document produced. Is that the
15 statement that you have prepared as the evidence that
16 you would like to give before this Commission.
17 A. It is.
18 MRS SIMPSON: I tender the statement.
19 MR ABBOTT: I object to at least parts of it. Part
20 of the statement refers to a letter from Betty Fisher,
21 and I ask that that part, which is p.10 - my copy of the
22 statement doesn't include a copy of the letter - I ask
23 that you make immediate inquiry of this witness as to
24 the whereabouts of the letter, otherwise this part of
25 her statement should not be admitted.
26 COMSR
27 Q. Are you able to assist us with the whereabouts of the
28 letter.
29 A. No, I'm not able to assist you with that letter because
30 it just cannot be found. It is somewhere in my home,
31 but where I don't know. I have hunted through many
32 papers and cannot find it.
33 MR ABBOTT: I understood she was claiming that she
34 had burnt it.
35 WITNESS: In answer to that, Mr Abbott, I did burn
36 one letter that Betty Fisher wrote to me, but this one
37 was in relation to the stuff that I wrote in here in the
38 report or the statement.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 MR ABBOTT: Well, I mean it's a change, at least it
2 hasn't gone to Aboriginal ALRM without the letter being
3 produced. How can this evidence go in?
- 4 WITNESS: In answer to that, it is a copy -
- 5 COMSR: You are not being asked that question,
6 I'm being asked that question as to whether or not that
7 portion of your statement is admissible.
- 8 MR ABBOTT: Perhaps it could be received subject to
9 the ruling later on after the examination. There are -
10 indeed, this could be an interesting expedition. It
11 could be received de bene esse subject to objection and
12 I will elaborate on it after examination.
- 13 COMSR: That is p.10.
- 14 MRS SIMPSON: It is my suggestion that you receive the
15 statement, noting Mr Abbott's objection in regard to the
16 reference to the letter. It is my submission that Mrs
17 Brodie can give evidence about the letter, regardless of
18 whether the letter is produced, and Mr Abbott can
19 explore that topic with her. If the topic is not in the
20 statement, then it's difficult for any counsel at the
21 bar table to know what topic to cross-examine on. It's
22 my suggestion that the statement go in subject to the
23 reservation and the objection that Mr Abbott has.
- 24 COMSR: I suppose there will be an objection to
25 you leading on that portion.
- 26 MRS SIMPSON: That would be unobjectionable. Mrs
27 Brodie can give evidence about a number of matters.
28 What weight you put on them in the light of
29 cross-examination is another matter, but it's not
30 objectionable that she lead evidence or evidence led on
31 that topic. Has it been marked as an exhibit?
- 32 COMSR: No.
- 33 EXHIBIT 292 Statement of Veronica Brodie tendered by
34 Mrs Simpson. Admitted.
- 35 XN
- 36 Q. I think you were born on January 15, 1941, at Point
37 McLeay.
- 38 A. Yes, I was.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. How long did you live at Point McLeay.
2 A. I lived on Point McLeay until I was about 14 years old.
3 Q. When you were 14, what did you do then.
4 A. I was then brought into Adelaide under the Aborigines
5 Protection Board to attend high school here in Adelaide
6 in the city.
7 Q. What high school did you attend.
8 A. I attended Unley Girls Technical High School.
9 Q. How long were you there.
10 A. For as far as we could go in education in those days,
11 that was third year high school, the intermediate.
12 Q. While in Adelaide, where did you live.
13 A. At the Tanderra Girls Home run by Matron Rutter and
14 Matron Hyde.
15 Q. Your father was Daniel Wilson.
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. Your mother Rebecca Wilson.
18 A. Yes.
19 Q. Who was Rebecca Harris, is that right.
20 A. That's correct.
21 Q. Your mother was born on what is now the Colley Reserve.
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. That's at Glenelg.
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. That was on 31 January 1897.
26 A. 31 January, which I think it was 1897. I'm not quite
27 sure of that year, but.
28 Q. Did your mother go to live at Point McLeay.
29 A. Yes, she did go to live there.
30 Q. How old was she when she went there.
31 A. A report says that she was 12 years old. I believe she
32 may have been younger than that, because she spoke of
33 her head master at the Point McLeay school, Brian
34 Francis.
35 Q. Why does that make you believe she might have been
36 younger than 12.
37 A. Because she said it was her head master, so she would
38 have attended school there.

- 1 Q. Is there some reason that she would not have been 12
2 when she was attending school.
- 3 A. Well, they didn't go over the age of 12 to school in
4 Point McLeay in those years. I think they barely went
5 to third or fourth grade in school.
- 6 Q. So, you draw an inference from the fact that your mother
7 discussed the head master at Point McLeay.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And the inference you draw is that she must have been
10 younger than 12 when she went to Point McLeay.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. You mentioned a report stating that she was 12 years old
13 when she went there. What report is that.
- 14 A. That report was done by Sherida Melvin. The Black Swan
15 Dreaming report, that was done as she did research and
16 some of the stuff she got from Marjorie Angus, who was
17 one time an officer with the Aborigines Protection
18 Board, and that's where the information came from. It's
19 some of that could have been incorrect.
- 20 Q. Pausing there for a moment. Who is Sherida Melvin.
- 21 A. Is the social anthropologist that worked on doing that.
22 Did research on a site where my grandmother Laura
23 Spender was born at Glanville.
- 24 Q. Did you ask her to prepare that report.
- 25 A. Yes, I did.
- 26 Q. Did you give her information to go in that report.
- 27 A. I gave her information.
- 28 Q. Looking at a copy of the statement produced, looking at
29 that copy document in front of you, is that a copy of
30 the report called Black Swan Dreaming prepared by
31 Sherida Melvin.
- 32 A. Looks very much like it.
- 33 EXHIBIT 293 Report entitled Black Swan Dreaming
34 tendered by Mrs Simpson. Admitted.
- 35 Q. Do you have a copy of that report with you.
- 36 A. No, I haven't.
- 37 Q. Looking at a copy of the report produced, looking at
38 that report which is now Exhibit 293, s.1 is titled

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 `Introduction to the Oral Tradition Veronica Brodie and
2 Continuity of Kurna History at Glanville and Le Fevre
3 Peninsula.' Is that correct.
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 Q. In the second paragraph on that front page Sherida
6 Melvin says: `Mrs Brodie's great grandmother Lartelare,
7 known also as Rebecca Spender, was a Kurna woman of full
8 descent born in a wurley on the Glanville waterfront at
9 the site of the future CSR factory'. That is
10 information that you gave to Sherida Melvin.
- 11 A. That is information I gave to her.
- 12 Q. That's correct, is it.
- 13 A. Pardon?
- 14 Q. That is correct.
- 15 A. That's correct. Well, I mean, from what grandmother
16 told me.
- 17 Q. Would you mind just turning to p.39 of the report,
18 Exhibit 293 - p.38. This is s.9.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. That section is headed `Final Dispossession of Lartelare
21 1890' and sets out a history of the final departure of
22 Lartelare and her family from the Glanville area; is
23 that right.
- 24 A. That's correct.
- 25 Q. And it also mentions a return to Glanville by your
26 grandmother and your mother together with yourselves in
27 1951.
- 28 A. That's correct.
- 29 Q. At that time, you were 11.
- 30 A. Yes.
- 31 Q. It's on p.39, I think. That statement says: `Records
32 obtained from the South Australian Museum shows that
33 Veronica's mother was 12 before her parents settled more
34 permanently at the Raukkan Mission in 1907'. It is that
35 statement that you now believe to be incorrect.
- 36 A. It's not the statement, it's the age, mum's age.
- 37 Q. The statement that says that she's 12.
- 38 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. At the bottom of p.39, there is a statement beginning:
2 `Even though their destiny was tied to Raukkan and much
3 loved Ngarrindjeri people, Laura' - that is your
4 grandmother.
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. `Reminded them' - that is you and your mother she is
7 reminding, is that right.
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. `That they were people of the Port River tribe at
10 Glanville and this was a very important line of
11 ancestors who were different to other Aboriginal people
12 they now knew.' Do you remember her reminding you of
13 that.
14 A. Yes, I do.
15 Q. The statement `different to other Aboriginal people',
16 that was to include Ngarrindjeri people.
17 A. That's correct.
18 Q. Part of the way down the page of p.40, in the third
19 paragraph down, there's a description of your mother
20 describing the people at the Taperoo Primary School and
21 others, the way her mother Lartelare and Laura, her
22 mother and grandmother, had made a fire and cooked meat,
23 and she told stories of her families life in the area.
24 And it states in the last sentence of that paragraph
25 `Before she died' - that is your mother died - `she said
26 to Veronica and Leila Rankine that she was the last old
27 member of the Port River tribe to die and reminded her
28 daughters of their matrilineal history.' See that
29 statement there.
30 A. Yes.
31 Q. What did your mother say to you about that.
32 A. Well, the matrilineal history is that it runs from
33 mother, or from daughter to mother to grandmother to
34 great-grandmother to the land. And in that respect that
35 was how we go back to the Kurna heritage.
36 Q. From your mother -
37 A. From my mother, her mother and her grandmother.
38 Q. Laura Rankine mentioned that there was your sister.

- 1 A. Leila was my sister.
2 Q. Looking at Exhibit 275 produced, that is the
3 genealogies, you have mentioned that your father Daniel
4 Wilson - your father was Daniel Wilson.
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. He was born at Point McLeay.
7 A. Yes - I believe he was.
8 Q. His father was Daniel Wilson senior.
9 A. That's correct.
10 Q. Would you know where he was born.
11 A. I believe he was born on the Coorong.
12 Q. How do you come to that understanding.
13 A. His people came from the Coorong from the Ngarlung side,
14 the dunes.
15 Q. While we are waiting for that exhibit, can you tell the
16 Commissioner when your mother and father married.
17 A. I do not know when they married. I don't have that
18 date.
19 Q. Your mother and father had a number of children.
20 A. I believe so.
21 Q. Would it help you to look at the genealogies prepared by
22 Dr Doreen Kartinyeri to help you.
23 A. Well, it might, yes.
24 Q. Looking at vol.1 of the Wilson genealogies produced.
25 Have you seen that book before.
26 A. Yes, I have.
27 Q. If you look at pp.28 and 29, I think there is there a
28 photograph of both your father and your grandfather.
29 A. There is, yes.
30 Q. That is plate five.
31 A. Yes.
32 Q. The source of that photograph appears to have been your
33 sister Leila Rankine.
34 A. Yes.
35 Q. Plate five is your father; that's the bottom one.
36 A. Yes.
37 Q. As a young boy.
38 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. And plate six is your father, your grandfather and -
2 A. Grandmother and uncle and also two aunts.
3 Q. If you look now at pp.30 and 31, I think there is a
4 photograph there of your grandfather which is plate
5 seven at the bottom of the page.
6 A. Yes. Opposite page, yes.
7 Q. A photograph of your grandfather and grandmother; is
8 that right.
9 A. I believe it to be my grandfather and my grandmother,
10 Bessy Gibson, yes.
11 Q. I think if we look at pp.32 and 33 again, there's a
12 photograph plate nine showing your grandfather and his
13 brother Mark Wilson outside church at Point McLeay.
14 A. That is correct.
15 Q. Turning now to pp.40 and p.41. I think the top
16 photograph is a photograph of your mother.
17 A. That's correct.
18 Q. Another lady. Do you recognise the other lady.
19 A. I do remember seeing her on Point McLeay when she came
20 to visit mum, but I can't rightly say that I know her
21 personally or really know her.
22 Q. That lady is described in the photograph as Mary Jane
23 Hughes.
24 A. That's correct.
25 Q. Turning to p.63 of that genealogy, that is the first
26 generation of the Wilson family from which both your
27 grandfather and father came.
28 A. I believe so.
29 Q. The first Wilson is described there by Dr Kartinyeri as
30 a white whaler or a French seaman; is that right.
31 A. Yes.
32 Q. If you turn now to p.68, the descendants of Daniel
33 Wilson senior who was a child, I think, of Long Billy
34 and Emily - I'm not sure how to pronounce the next word.
35 Is it Lewinne.
36 A. Yes.
37 Q. That was your grandfather.
38 A. That's correct.

6226

CJ 66A

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. On p.68 it shows your father Daniel Wilson junior born
- 2 on 6 February 1890 at Point McLeay.
- 3 A. I believe that's a misprint, this date, it's 5 February.
- 4 CONTINUED

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. Your mother, Rebecca Harris, was born on 30 January
2 1897, and it states there that she was born at Point
3 McLeay.
- 4 A. 31 January, and she was born at Colley Reserve. We only
5 go on information received from Marjorie Angas as to the
6 Colley Reserve birth and her move to Point McLeay.
- 7 Q. Who is Marjorie Angas.
- 8 A. I said before, she was a previous officer with the
9 Aborigines Protection Board.
- 10 Q. But was she an historian, did she collect records.
- 11 A. I believe her father or grandfather was, Angas, and
12 while she was in the Protection Board, she collated a
13 lot of photographs and information, history and stuff,
14 and I gather that from there that she gave some of the
15 information that was recorded.
- 16 Q. So Dr Kartinyeri's genealogy, where it states that your
17 mother was born on 30 January and at Point McLeay, is
18 incorrect.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. On p.68, there is a list there of your brothers and
21 sisters.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Including Dorothy Leila Wilson, born on 31 December 1932
24 at Point McLeay.
- 25 A. Correct.
- 26 Q. That was your sister Leila.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 Q. And you also there, Veronica Patricia Wilson, and it
29 records you as being born on 15 June 1941. Is that
30 correct.
- 31 A. That's not correct.
- 32 Q. It should be 15 January.
- 33 A. The 15th of the first, 1941.
- 34 Q. Just to complete that topic, your grandmother was, I
35 think, Laura Glanville Spender.
- 36 A. Correct.
- 37 Q. She was born in 1876 at Glanville.
- 38 A. Yes.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. Her mother was Latalare.
2 A. Correct.
3 Q. Or Rebecca Spender.
4 A. That's right.
5 Q. Sometimes I think Rebecca Spender was referred to as Mrs
6 Glanville.
7 A. Correct.
8 Q. Looking at Exhibit 4, 'A World That Was' by Berndt and
9 Berndt, would you just mind looking at plate 18 which is
10 opposite p.33.
11 A. Can you repeat that page number again?
12 Q. Page 33. I'm asking you to look at the photograph,
13 plate 18 opposite p.33. Can you find p.33 of the text.
14 A. Got it.
15 Q. The bottom photograph, plate 18, I think shows Latalare,
16 or Mrs Glanville, in company with a number of other
17 people, including Pinkie Mack's mother, Louisa Karpany.
18 A. That's correct.
19 Q. Mrs Glanville is the lady sitting down, the fourth from
20 the right, is she.
21 A. That's right.
22 Q. Of your mother's nine children, I think you and Leila
23 were the only girls who survived.
24 A. That's right.
25 Q. We have seen that Leila was about nine years older than
26 you.
27 A. Yes.
28 Q. Leila married.
29 A. She did.
30 Q. She had five children, one boy and four girls.
31 A. Yes.
32 Q. You married.
33 A. Yes.
34 Q. You have four daughters and one son deceased.
35 A. That's correct.
36 Q. When did you marry.
37 A. 1960.
38 Q. When you were still living at Point McLeay, I think you

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 used to go for day trips to Hindmarsh Island on the
2 steamer 'The Renmark'.
- 3 A. Yes. We used to go with the school once a month if it
4 was in the warmer weather. We would go down to Goolwa,
5 'The Renmark' would berth there opposite Hindmarsh
6 Island, and we'd go across on the ferry, the kids, and
7 we'd sit down have a talk about the island, or have
8 lunch there and walk around and play.
- 9 Q. Who went with you.
- 10 A. There was a number of kids from the school.
- 11 Q. And a school teacher.
- 12 A. A school teacher.
- 13 Q. Who was that.
- 14 A. Whatever teacher was there on the mission at that time.
15 It could have been Miss Weller or - it's hard to
16 remember the teachers' names now, it's so many years
17 ago.
- 18 Q. Were they all white.
- 19 A. They were white teachers.
- 20 Q. Did anyone else go with you, any other adults.
- 21 A. Sometimes a couple of mums used to come along to give a
22 hand and help the teachers.
- 23 Q. Can you remember who they were.
- 24 A. Well, one used to be my mother, one was auntie, we used
25 to call her Auntie Bella, she was Annie Dodd, the other
26 one that I could remember is Elva Milera.
- 27 Q. You said in your statement that you were told that men's
28 business and women's business used to take place on
29 Hindmarsh Island.
- 30 A. Yes. One of the older women, a very old lady,
31 grandmother - we called her as Mootha - Bessie Rigney,
32 she just touched on that while we were on the island,
33 said that used to happen there, but no more was ever
34 said.
- 35 Q. 'Mootha' or Bessie Rigney, did she go with you sometimes
36 on these trips.
- 37 A. I went with her a couple of times down to Hindmarsh
38 Island as a kid when she took her grand daughter and

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 grandson, and she told us, you know, just mentioned
2 again about the men and women's business there.
- 3 Q. Were there boys and girls in the school group.
- 4 A. There was, there was a mixture.
- 5 Q. There was no problem, then, of telling the group of
6 children that men's business and women's business used
7 to take place on Hindmarsh Island.
- 8 A. Well, whether - it wasn't said to the group, if we sat
9 around in a little group with Mootha she would tell us
10 all.
- 11 Q. Whoever was there, both boys and girls.
- 12 A. Yes. Other kids might have been told too by another
13 parent who was there, but we had separate groups.
- 14 Q. The groups that you were in, there were both boys and
15 girls from time to time.
- 16 A. Yes, there was.
- 17 Q. You were told about the island belonging to Ngarrindjeri
18 people.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Were you told about Ngarrindjeri people living on the
21 island.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. When you visited the island, were there Ngarrindjeri
24 people living there at that time.
- 25 A. No.
- 26 Q. So when did you understand these stories related to.
- 27 A. Long before my time.
- 28 Q. Your mother's time.
- 29 A. Long before my mother's time. I mean she may have been
30 a little girl when there was still people living there.
- 31 Q. So the stories about men's business and women's business
32 were stories which related to events that used to happen
33 as a matter of history.
- 34 A. Exactly.
- 35 Q. I think you were also told that there were many people
36 buried on the island.
- 37 A. Yes.
- 38 Q. And you were told that as a child.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. Not only as a child, but as an adult.
2 Q. Yes, but as a child.
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. Casting your mind back now to when you were on your
5 school trips, you knew that then.
6 A. Yes. There were many buried there.
7 Q. There's nothing in your statement, I think, that relates
8 to any information which it would be contrary to
9 Aboriginal tradition to divulge, is that correct.
10 A. That is correct.
11 Q. Everything that is in your statement, the topics you've
12 covered, are not secret information.
13 A. No.
14 Q. I think you've come to learn that your mother told your
15 sister Leila about the women's business on Hindmarsh
16 Island.
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. Up until the time that you came to learn of that fact,
19 had you ever heard anyone who spoke of women's business
20 in detail.
21 A. No.
22 Q. Had you ever heard of anybody who had any knowledge of
23 women's business in detail.
24 A. No.
25 Q. Not at all.
26 A. No.
27 Q. Your sister, I think, died almost four years ago, on 15
28 January 1992.
29 A. Yes.
30 Q. Can you tell the Commissioner the circumstances in which
31 you came to learn of women's business from your sister.
32 A. I went to visit my sister in Flinders Medical Centre.
33 She was very sick, she was an amputee and, whilst there,
34 I had an asthma attack, and so I was put into hospital
35 as well, so we were both in Flinders together. While I
36 was there, they decided to bring me down do her ward
37 where I would be in a bed alongside of her, because they
38 knew that things were really not well for her at all,

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 and that she was in a lot of pain and she needed
2 somebody there, so me being in Flinders at that time and
3 being put in a bed next to her made her feel a lot
4 happier. It was during one of the doctors' visits she
5 had asked me would I release her, and I asked her what
6 she meant by it. She said 'I want to die'.
7 Q. I think she told you about a number of things she wanted
8 you to do before she died, is that right.
9 A. She did - and I agreed with her, I said 'If you want to
10 go, and I have to make that release, I'll do it'.
11 Q. Was it at this time that she mentioned women's business
12 to you.
13 A. It was when I went to sit by her bed to write down the
14 things that she wanted me to do when she was gone that
15 we started talking about living back on Raukkan, going
16 down the Coorong for camps, and generally growing up
17 together as sisters.
18 Q. Just before we come to that, when she told you about the
19 women's business, did she say to you that it was
20 information only for Ngarrindjeri women.
21 A. She did.
22 Q. Did she tell you that it was information that could be
23 told to your daughters.
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. Did you understand that you could speak of it to any
26 Ngarrindjeri women then.
27 A. I understood that I could speak of it to other
28 Ngarrindjeri women if this person or that woman was the
29 right person to tell.
30 Q. How were you going to tell that.
31 A. On advice given to me from my late sister, it was to be
32 given to women who were wise, who could keep a secret
33 and not divulge it.
34 Q. Was that a matter for you to determine for yourself.
35 A. Yes.
36 Q. Was there any restriction otherwise. For instance was
37 it to be told to women who were born on Raukkan or grew
38 up on Raukkan.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. It mainly belonged to women, the Ngarrindjeri women, who
2 came from that area. If you were born away from that
3 area, then the older women saw no significance in giving
4 it to someone like that, who didn't have an interest in
5 Hindmarsh Island or what happened down that way, so you
6 coming, or a person coming from another area, it
7 wouldn't have meant as much to as someone coming from
8 down that way, the Coorong area or Hindmarsh.
- 9 Q. When you say 'another area', what do you mean by that.
- 10 A. Outside of Raukkan, outside of the Coorong area from
11 Ngarlung down, Pelican Point down around the islands.
- 12 Q. Is this something that Leila told you.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. So that when you spoke to her about it, she told you
15 that you were not to tell women who came from outside
16 the Raukkan or Coorong area, is that right.
- 17 A. No, she didn't tell me that, she just said, you know,
18 about the areas, and it was for me to understand that
19 and to know that that information couldn't be given
20 outside of the area.
- 21 Q. Did she tell you why the information was to be
22 restricted to certain women.
- 23 A. Well, it was restricted to certain women who could keep
24 the secret.
- 25 Q. Why was it to be kept a secret.
- 26 A. Well, because it belonged to the Ngarrindjeri women,
27 their part of culture, it was their personal culture,
28 things that only women do and look after.
- 29 Q. You understood, I think you've already told the
30 Commissioner, that what Leila told you concerned matters
31 which had taken place on Hindmarsh Island, or practices
32 that had occurred there but no longer occurred there, is
33 that right.
- 34 A. That's correct.
- 35 Q. I interrupted you a moment ago about what your sister
36 told you, other than about the women's business. That
37 is about growing up on the Coorong.
- 38 A. Yes. We just talked about growing up on the Coorong

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 ther at Ngarlung, which was belonging to - and she
2 always felt that it belonged to - her people, her dad's
3 people, our father's people, the Wilsons, where they
4 came to the Coorong from Ngarlung and finally gave up
5 land there to come into Raukkan to live when
6 Christianity went there, and she - and we talked about
7 the life that we lived there, the fun we had, going over
8 to the Great Southern Ocean, going to Hindmarsh Island,
9 about our dad, how he often went to Hindmarsh Island to
10 collect swan eggs and just general stuff, and going up
11 as a family and camping there and the knowledge that she
12 had of the Coorong.
- 13 Q. You say that Leila associated the Coorong and that area
14 with your father's people.
- 15 A. She did.
- 16 Q. I think Mootha that you mentioned before, or Bessie
17 Rigney, told you some other stories about Hindmarsh
18 Island, about strong women.
- 19 A. Yes. Mootha mentioned that when we went there, that
20 there were strong women there. At one time there used
21 to be strong women there. When we asked, we just got
22 told to be quiet, not to ask any more questions, and
23 that's the way that it was with our older people.
- 24 Q. Did you ever come to understand what she meant by strong
25 women being on Hindmarsh Island.
- 26 A. No, well, it just went over the top of our heads. Of
27 course we weren't allowed to ask any more questions, we
28 didn't ask.
- 29 Q. Did your sister Leila say anything to you about why you
30 didn't know about the women's business.
- 31 A. Yes, because I wasn't interested as Leila would have
32 been back in those days, and mum saw that I wasn't the
33 right one to tell out of the two of us. I probably
34 would have blurted it out back in those days; I was a
35 younger person and I liked to talk about things, and so
36 she thought it best not to tell me.
- 37 Q. Was Leila interested in Aboriginal culture.
- 38 A. Very much.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. Did she, on occasions, go with groups down to the
2 Coorong.
3 A. She did.
4 Q. And she sometimes went down, I think, with George and
5 Tom Trevor and Auntie Maggie Jacobs.
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Uncle Lindsay Wilson.
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. Auntie Marje Koolmatrie.
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. You say at the bottom of p.2 of your statement that
12 Leila talked to you about the things that used to happen
13 at that place, and what it would have meant to live in
14 that culture at that time. Again, you are referring to
15 matters which took place amongst the old people.
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. Did Leila mention anything to you about practices that
18 occurred in the current time, that is, in 1991.
19 A. No.
20 Q. You say that your northern sisters - you mean Aboriginal
21 women from the north of South Australia, is that what
22 you mean.
23 A. Yes.
24 Q. You say that you know that they have women's business.
25 A. Yes.
26 Q. You wouldn't ask details of that because they would be
27 angry and offended.
28 A. That's correct.
29 Q. I think you have been on a visit to a place in the north
30 of South Australia - is it Indulka.
31 A. Indulkana.
32 Q. Can you tell the commissioner what you noticed on that
33 visit.
34 A. I went up with some university people, and it was there
35 that I witnessed the men asking an older woman about the
36 hills surrounding Indulkana, and the tribal men got very
37 upset, very angry, and told them they were not to ask
38 about men's - women's business - ask the women about

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 men's business, and men don't ask - or women don't ask
2 men about women's business, and so I learned from that
3 their respect for their land and their culture.

4 Q. That was something new to you at the time that you saw
5 that.

6 A. It was new to me, but also going down and joining in
7 with the women when they had their dancing, that I was
8 brought away at a certain time because they had things
9 that they wanted to do and discuss, so I couldn't join
10 in but I had to go back to where I was staying on the
11 reserve.

12 Q. When was that visit.

13 A. It would have been about 80 - it would have been, yes,
14 in 1980.

15 Q. You say that you can't give the commission any details
16 of the women's business because you promised Leila that
17 you would not, is that right.

18 A. That's correct.

19 Q. You didn't promise her that you wouldn't tell the
20 commission, but you promised her that you wouldn't tell
21 anybody except your own daughters, is that right.

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. You can, however, say that it touched on preparation of
24 young women for womanhood.

25 A. It did.

26 Q. And the things that went with it.

27 A. That's correct.

28 Q. Can you say what sort of things they are.

29 A. Just preparing them for womanhood, for marriage, for
30 when they have children.

31 Q. Can we describe it in modern language as sex education.

32 A. Well, I think if you are talking about today's language
33 you would say sex education. Back in those days sex
34 education was never heard of.

35 Q. It was just a natural function.

36 A. Yes.

37 COMSR

38 Q. Which days are we talking about.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. We are talking about back before ever I was born, ever
2 before. I would say 200 years ago that it wouldn't have
3 been sex education to them. It would have been -
4 XN
5 Q. It would form part of the women's business.
6 A. Yes, part of the women's business.
7 Q. You say that you know, and that Leila told you, about
8 grandfathers and grandmothers and so on being buried on
9 Hindmarsh Island. Is that right.
10 A. That's right.
11 Q. By 'so on', I think you mean to refer to babies who had
12 died naturally.
13 A. Natural deaths.
14 Q. Or aborted foetuses.
15 A. Some aborted foetuses from the rape of white men, and
16 that's part of the history of Hindmarsh Island.
17 Q. Did Leila give you any details concerning that matter.
18 For instance, did she tell you was it all babies of
19 white men that were aborted.
20 A. No, she didn't have that information.
21 Q. Did she tell you how the Aboriginal women who aborted
22 the foetuses knew that they were babies of white men.
23 A. No, she didn't.
24 Q. You also mention the island next to Hindmarsh Island
25 being Mundoo Island, was death island. Is that
26 something that Leila told you.
27 A. Well, we knew from history that that was death island,
28 that they used to smoke the dead there.
29 Q. How did you know that.
30 A. From history.
31 Q. Is that something you learned at Raukkan.
32 A. From grandmother, and also at the museum.
33 Q. You say also that men's business happened on the other
34 side of Hindmarsh Island. What do you mean by 'the
35 other side'.
36 A. Well, have you been to Hindmarsh Island?
37 Q. Do you mean the other side of Hindmarsh Island.
38 A. It is quite a big island. I mean, it is - you know, you

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 got four sides to the island, and I guess on any side of
2 the island where women's business took place, men was
3 further away on the other side. I mean, you got the
4 side facing the Murray Mouth, you got the side facing
5 Goolwa, you got the side facing Mundoo, and the other
6 part.

7 COMSR

8 Q. So that I am clear, that is something you have worked
9 out for yourself, is it, when you say you guess that's
10 the case.

11 A. Well, I wouldn't know exactly what side of the island
12 men's business took place because it was never stated,
13 but, I mean, there are four sides to the island so
14 either one the men would have had their business on, the
15 other side the women.

16 XN

17 Q. So that is not something that Leila told you. That is
18 something you have worked out yourself.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You worked that out because you knew from her that
21 women's business and men's business took place on
22 Hindmarsh Island.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You have assumed that the men's business and the women's
25 business was separate, separate in place.

26 A. Well, I think my mother states that.

27 Q. You are referring there to her interview with Betty
28 Fisher.

29 A. Yes.

30 Q. You say also that, apart from the men's business and
31 women's business being separate in terms of place, they
32 were also separate in terms of time. That is, men
33 wouldn't go to Hindmarsh Island to do their business at
34 the same time as women. Is that right.

35 A. That's right.

36 Q. Is that what Leila told you.

37 A. Well, we know that from being Aboriginal and growing up
38 and studying our culture that men's and women's business

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 don't take place at the same time. Even in the north
2 they don't do this, or anywhere else in Australia. I
3 mean, if that happened it wouldn't be sacred to men, it
4 wouldn't be sacred to women.
- 5 Q. I think you said when you were growing up, and in fact
6 until I suppose around about the time that Leila died,
7 you didn't have the interest in Aboriginal culture that
8 she had, is that right.
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 Q. So what you have learnt about men's business and women's
11 business being separate has come as a result of your
12 doing studies more recently, is that right.
- 13 A. For the last ten years I've always had an interest in
14 Aboriginal culture, and mainly took up a lot of the
15 stuff with the Coorong. When Leila was alive I often
16 travelled with her down there, and when this stuff came
17 about with the men and women's business, well, it was
18 only natural for me to accept that men's and women's
19 business took place at different times and not together.
20 And looking at the culture on the whole, I did take up a
21 bigger interest, particularly with the women's business.
- 22 Q. When you say 'looking at the culture as a whole', do you
23 mean Aboriginal culture in Australia generally.
- 24 A. No, just in my area.
- 25 Q. Which area is that.
- 26 A. In the Coorong area and the Glanville area.
- 27 Q. Did Leila tell you that men and women knew about the
28 fact that each other had business.
- 29 A. No, Leila didn't say that.
- 30 Q. Is that something that you've assumed.
- 31 A. No. I mean, I've heard men get up and say they knew of
32 - they have mentioned they have heard of women's
33 business, but have never spoken about it, because they
34 know that it's not for them to speak of.
- 35 Q. By hearing them mention it, do you mean in particular
36 hearing Mr Tom Trevorrow give his evidence in the
37 commission.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. Well, I have spoken to Tom before, and when Leila died
2 it was something that I said to him 'Do you know' or
3 'Did you know that women's business at one time existed
4 on Hindmarsh?' He said 'I heard of that', but he said
5 'Cannot yunnin about it', but he couldn't talk about it,
6 so we just left it at that.
- 7 Q. I think when your sister died, just a few days before
8 she died, she went down to Camp Coorong.
- 9 A. It was about two weeks or three weeks before she died.
10 Her wish was to be taken back so that she could see the
11 Coorong for the last time and say goodbye to people on
12 Point McLeay and the Coorong that she'd grown up with,
13 aunts and uncles and relatives. So we did that, we took
14 her back.
- 15 Q. I think Mrs Dulcie Wilson gave a speech at her funeral,
16 is that right.
- 17 A. Dulcie conducted her funeral service.
- 18 Q. I think, in accordance with your sister Leila's wishes,
19 you scattered her ashes at the Coorong.
- 20 A. Her ashes were to be taken back and scattered up on a
21 hill where she used to sit and look out, where she could
22 see down the Coorong, up the Coorong and across the lake
23 to Raukkan.
- 24 Q. You remember, do you, mentioning to Mr Tom Trevorrow the
25 fact of women's business back in 1992.
- 26 A. Yes, I do recall speaking to Tom about that.
- 27 Q. You have also mentioned amongst the topics that women's
28 business relates to, apart from those that we've already
29 mentioned, include the spiritual and sacred waters of
30 Hindmarsh Island. What did that mean.
- 31 A. When Leila spoke to me and I - well, I say you would
32 have heard it on the tape on that - on my mother's - of
33 my mother's voice, where mum mentioned the waters around
34 Hindmarsh Island are the - were the life force of the
35 Ngarrindjeri women.
- 36 Q. That's something that you read from the transcript of
37 the notebook of Betty Fisher.
- 38 A. I did and - not the notebook. The transcript that I

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 read on the 7.30 Report, it was in there, and it was
2 also on the tape, and -
- 3 Q. You mean on the tape of the interview with Betty Fisher.
4 A. Mum's voice, the one that Betty Fisher taped mum.
5 Q. You remember hearing it on that tape.
6 A. No, sorry, hang on, I'm getting mixed up. It was
7 mentioned in the transcript. When I read it out on the
8 7.30 Report I mentioned that.
- 9 COMSR
- 10 Q. I am still not clear where you got it from.
11 A. That came from Alison Caldwell from Channel 2, the
12 transcript.
- 13 Q. I don't mean that. Where you got the knowledge of this
14 spiritual and sacred waters of Hindmarsh Island, you say
15 you think it was on the tape that your mother -
- 16 A. Yes. If I could be allowed to just go back a little
17 bit. When I did the statement, I said in there that the
18 stuff that was given to Betty Fisher from my mother was
19 - I had my doubts when I heard of Betty, because I
20 didn't know this woman, but when I spoke to Betty and
21 then I heard the stuff that mum had told her, I knew
22 that Betty hadn't lied because -
- 23 OBJECTION Mr Abbott objects.
24 MR ABBOTT: It contains an incorrect statement that
25 she heard this stuff. I have no objection to her saying
26 what may be her belief, that when she read it she
27 believed it, but she didn't hear her mother saying
28 what's in the transcript. That's the whole point. We
29 haven't got any tape of her mother saying what's in the
30 transcripts from the book. I object to this witness
31 embroidering her tale.
- 32 MRS SIMPSON: My friend can cross-examine on that.
33 COMSR
- 34 Q. I don't think you can say what someone else's state of
35 mind is, that is, as to whether or not they are lying.
36 You cannot give evidence of what someone else's state of
37 mind was in that respect. In any event, you still
38 haven't clarified this matter. Are you saying that it

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 is your belief that on the tapes there is some reference
2 to this matter.
- 3 A. Yes. When I read the transcript on the 7.30 Report, it
4 was the interview that was done at my niece's house at
5 Paralowie, on the transcript was the stuff about the
6 waters around Hindmarsh Island, if you can recall that,
7 and relating to the fires that were lit, men's business
8 on one side, women's on the other.
- 9 XN
- 10 Q. None of that is a secret.
- 11 A. Well, can't be if I read it on the 7.30 Report, hey. I
12 mean, you know.
- 13 Q. When you spoke to Leila just before she died, you told
14 her - promised her that you wouldn't reveal anything
15 that was a secret.
- 16 A. Exactly.
- 17 Q. And you have not done so.
- 18 A. And I won't.
- 19 Q. Can you tell the commissioner then what is meant by the
20 spiritual and sacred waters of Hindmarsh Island. Is it
21 that the waters are a life force. Is that what is meant
22 by that.
- 23 A. Yes. The waters are a life force to the Ngarrindjeri
24 women, whether past or present, and should anything
25 cover those waters, then the spiritual - the strength
26 there will be taken from the Ngarrindjeri women and they
27 can become very ill.
- 28 Q. Is that something that Leila told you.
- 29 A. Yes.
- 30 Q. Is that something that you believe was referred to in
31 the transcript that you read out on the 7.30 Report.
- 32 A. Yes.
- 33 COMSR
- 34 Q. What did you understand that to be a transcript of.
- 35 A. At that time I believed it to be the transcript of the
36 interview that Betty Fisher had with my mother back in
37 1967.
- 38 Q. The transcript from what though.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. Well, from whatever Betty had, the information. I
2 believe Betty mentioned a notebook.
- 3 XN
- 4 Q. We will come to that in a minute. You say that when you
5 speak of Dreamtime, Dreamtime is how people lived in the
6 past before white man's coming. Do you mean by that
7 what we sometimes refer to as the Dreaming.
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 Q. The Dreamtime stories, as you've described them, relate
10 to Hindmarsh Island. Is that what you understand.
- 11 A. Yes, some of it.
- 12 Q. Is that what your sister Leila told you.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And it relates though, not to present practices, but to
15 things that used to happen 200 years ago.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Did Leila tell you, when you spoke to her before she
18 died, that it would be up to you to see that no harm
19 came to the island and to Ngarrindjeri people.
- 20 A. No, she didn't tell me that.
- 21 Q. What was it then that you were to do with this
22 information that she gave you, other than pass it onto
23 your daughters.
- 24 A. Well, she didn't, you know - she didn't tell me
25 specifically to do anything with it, but it was my
26 decision when the time came to use some of the
27 information that I had.
- 28 CONTINUED

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. In the typed transcript you read out on the 7.30 Report
2 is a reference to the fact that young women should not
3 go on their own to Hindmarsh Island if they hadn't had
4 children. Had you ever heard that before.
- 5 A. Yes. Betty mentioned it, but I didn't know anything
6 about that.
- 7 Q. You had ever heard that from your sister Leila.
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. You had never heard anybody else amongst the Aboriginal
10 community talk about such a thing that women should not
11 go to Hindmarsh Island on their own if they hadn't had
12 children.
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. By 'on their own', did you understand it to mean without
15 an old person with them.
- 16 A. Well, I mean I wouldn't go on my own.
- 17 COMSR: I don't know that the witness can answer
18 that because she said she'd never heard of it.
- 19 MRS SIMPSON: She'd heard of it once she read the
20 transcript.
- 21 XN
- 22 Q. Having heard it, did you think about it whether the
23 women should or shouldn't go there.
- 24 A. No, because to me it didn't have any relevance to the
25 secret women's business.
- 26 Q. That was not part of it -
- 27 A. That is why, yes.
- 28 Q. That was not part of the secret women's business -
- 29 A. No.
- 30 Q. You'd heard from Leila.
- 31 A. No.
- 32 Q. From what you know of Betty Fisher, having met her quite
33 recently I think, would you agree that she appears to be
34 quite meticulous about keeping confidences and secrets.
- 35 A. Yes.
- 36 Q. She had promised, of course, your mother Koomi never to
37 speak of what your mother had told her.
- 38 A. Well, I mean, Betty proved this from 1967 down to when

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 this came out. Neither Rebecca Wilson's daughters knew
2 of that interview with Betty Fisher and Betty kept it a
3 very well kept secret. She promised my mother she would
4 do.

5 COMSR

6 Q. In 1967, how many daughters of Rebecca Wilson were
7 alive.

8 A. Two: Leila and myself.

9 Q. How old were you both at that time. You were married in
10 1960.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. So you were not living with your mother.

13 A. I had my son in '68, so.

14 MR ABBOTT: 25.

15 A. I would have been about 25.

16 COMSR

17 Q. And your sister Leila.

18 A. Nine years on. She would have been 34.

19 XN

20 Q. I think when you met Betty Fisher recently, she told you
21 that she hadn't known that your mother had daughters.

22 A. That's right.

23 Q. I would like to come to the transcript that you read out
24 on the 7.30 Report - and it may help if you are shown
25 Exhibit 22B which is a transcript of the television
26 interview, the raw footage. Have you seen the programme
27 7.30 Report go to air.

28 A. Yes, I have. Yes, watched it on TV.

29 Q. Would you mind turning to p.5 of that document. I
30 understand that you weren't there when Betty Fisher was
31 speaking to Alison Caldwell at this time.

32 A. Beg your pardon? Where are you referring to this took
33 place with Betty Fisher?

34 Q. This was her interview, initial interview with Betty
35 Fisher before she came to see you at your niece's house.
36 You weren't there.

37 A. No.

38 Q. Would you mind looking at p.5. Mrs Fisher says at the

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 bottom part of the first answer that your mother spoke
2 about the tremendous importance of Hindmarsh Island and
3 all the islands surrounding it, but especially of the
4 waters in the Commission. I assume she means around the
5 Hindmarsh Island area. `She spoke about the absolute
6 necessity for nothing to lie between the waters and the
7 sky. Nothing must lie between the waters and the sky'.

8 A. Correct.

9 Q. You read something similar in the transcript.

10 A. In the transcript, yes.

11 Q. That wasn't a secret.

12 A. No.

13 Q. So, as far as you know, that didn't break with any
14 Aboriginal tradition to divulge that information.

15 A. No.

16 Q. Coming down the page, Mrs Fisher mentioned that your
17 mother didn't tell her any dreaming stories or creation
18 stories; in other words, she did not refer to Aboriginal
19 women's law. `But she did emphasise the importance of
20 those islands and the waters surrounding them. When I
21 asked her about the barrage, she said "We, yes, very sad
22 at that time, that but the waters still flow", and the
23 emphasis on the waters still flowing was great'. Have
24 you read something similar to that in the transcript of
25 the interview with your mother.

26 A. Yes, similar.

27 Q. Similar. That wasn't a secret.

28 A. No, nothing to do with the barrage at the Coorong is
29 secret.

30 Q. What about the waters still flowing.

31 A. No, that's not secret.

32 Q. At p.12 of the transcript - and I ask you to assume that
33 this is a transcript taken off the television camera
34 shots, some of which went to air and some didn't of the
35 Betty Fisher interview with Alison Caldwell. On p.12,
36 Betty Fisher says in answer to a question from Alison
37 Caldwell `Do they want to see the transcript?' and Betty
38 Fisher answered `Yes. They are not getting it'. And

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 then she says `No, no, it was recorded by Silver Moon'.
2 Who was that. Have you ever heard Betty Fisher talk
3 about `Silver Moon'.
4 A. I did ask Betty where the transcript came from and she
5 said that it was recorded by Silver Moon and that it was
6 - no more was said, because I didn't - there were my
7 nieces was there and I was talking to her and Auntie
8 Maggie and I didn't go on about this person Silver Moon,
9 whoever she was. It was of no interest to me, the
10 Silver Moon. I thought that Betty is the one with the
11 information, so I didn't.
12 COMSR
13 Q. What was the transcript that was being referred to.
14 A. The one that was on the 7.30 Report.
15 Q. So, it's the transcript of the 7.30 Report.
16 A. Yes.
17 MR ABBOTT: The transcript of the notebook, not the
18 transcript of the 7.30 Report.
19 COMSR: I am asking this witness what she
20 understood.
21 MR ABBOTT: You said it was the transcript of the
22 7.30 Report.
23 COMSR: No, I didn't say that, Mrs Brodie said
24 that.
25 XN
26 Q. You are referring to the transcript that Betty Fisher
27 gave you to read from.
28 A. Betty Fisher didn't give me any transcript, Alison
29 Caldwell gave it to me.
30 Q. The transcript that you got to read out while Betty
31 Fisher and Auntie Maggie were there at your niece's
32 house.
33 A. Yes.
34 Q. That was the transcript that you understood had been
35 recorded by Silver Moon.
36 A. Yes.
37 Q. You didn't feel curious as to who Silver Moon was who
38 had seen that material.

- 1 A. Betty Fisher was the only person that was, I was
2 interested in.
- 3 Q. Were you told that the information was in any way
4 confidential.
- 5 A. Well, Betty said it was confidential to her. She - it
6 was stuff that she had recorded, so I gather at that
7 time, her being the amateur historian, it would have
8 meant just that.
- 9 Q. She couldn't tell anyone about it.
- 10 A. Well, with the transcript, I mean that was read out, so
11 that wasn't secret. If Betty had anything else, then
12 Betty, she didn't tell me.
- 13 Q. Looking at p.15 of that transcript - and the transcript
14 here is the 7.30 Report transcript, Exhibit 22B, p.15.
15 You see that Betty Fisher says that your mother
16 permitted her to write as she spoke, but she was quite
17 upset that what was happening at some place on the
18 mainland. `And then she told me about the sacredness of
19 areas in that Ngarrindjeri area and she said that all of
20 those islands, Hindmarsh Island, and she refers to it as
21 Kumarangk, and all those islands and the waters
22 especially are extremely significant, are sacred and
23 important women's sites which she couldn't talk about'.
24 Did she tell you something similar.
- 25 A. Who? You meaning Betty?
- 26 Q. Yes, Betty Fisher.
- 27 A. No, she didn't tell me anything.
- 28 Q. Had you ever heard your mother refer to the island, that
29 is Hindmarsh Island, as Kumarangk.
- 30 A. Not that I can recall. She always referred to it as
31 Hindmarsh Island.
- 32 Q. I think you didn't learn of any sacred and important
33 women's sites from your sister Leila.
- 34 A. Beg your pardon?
- 35 Q. You didn't learn of any sacred and important women's
36 sites from Leila.
- 37 A. Not of any important women's sites.
- 38 Q. Or sacred women's sites.

1 A. No sacred women's sites except Hindmarsh Island.

2 Q. As the island itself.

3 A. As the island itself being a sacred island to the
4 Ngarrindjeri women.

5 Q. That was for the reasons that you outlined earlier.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. The fact of those sacred and important women's sites
8 which Betty Fisher says there that your mother couldn't
9 talk about, that fact was not a secret.

10 A. Can you repeat that?

11 Q. The fact that there were secret and important women's
12 sites was not a secret.

13 A. You keep referring back to the women's sites.

14 Q. That is just the term that Betty Fisher has used that
15 your mother said there were sacred and important women's
16 sites that your mother cannot talk about.

17 A. I mean, Betty hadn't said that to me. I don't know what
18 mum would have meant by 'secret sites'.

19 Q. You, yourself, now giving evidence today can see that
20 there is nothing secret in mentioning the fact that
21 there are women's sites without saying any more.

22 A. No, that's correct.

23 COMSR: I understood the witness to say that she
24 had never heard the suggestion that there were sites,
25 that the whole island was a site.

26 A. The Hindmarsh Island was a sacred site and for the
27 Ngarrindjeri women back over 200 years ago before white
28 men ever settled there.

29 XN

30 Q. The fact that it was a sacred site was not a secret.

31 A. No.

32 Q. It was something then presumably that men must have
33 known about as a matter of fact that there was something
34 sacred about Hindmarsh Island to women.

35 A. Of course.

36 Q. They must have known where on Hindmarsh Island there
37 were specific places that women went to do their
38 business.

1 A. That I can't answer because I was never told that, which
2 site they went to.

3 Q. All you were told is they had to avoid going there at
4 the time that the women's business was on.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And presumably they could not go to that place.

7 A. That's right. Well, I think most historians and
8 Aboriginal people know that.

9 Q. You mean Aboriginal culture, Australia-wide.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Coming now to where you read from the transcript taken
12 from the notebook of Betty Fisher at p.20.

13 MR ABBOTT: You said `notebook', but, in fact, it's
14 a transcript by Alison Caldwell.

15 XN

16 Q. The transcript provided by Alison Caldwell to you. What
17 did you understand that to be.

18 A. Well, that transcript I believe to be information, or on
19 the women's business at Hindmarsh Island given to Betty
20 from mum, my mother.

21 Q. Did you hear Betty refer to that notebook at any time.

22 A. Betty did refer to a notebook.

23 Q. Did Betty tell you any more about the typed pages that
24 were given to you for the 7.30 Report which she told you
25 they were recorded by Silver Moon; for instance, did she
26 tell you where the information came from, apart from
27 your mother.

28 A. No.

29 Q. Coming to p.20, that section where it's got `VB' meaning
30 Veronica Brodie, reading from typed notes. About how
31 many pages of typed notes did you have.

32 A. Just the one.

33 Q. Just the one to read from.

34 A. Yes.

35 Q. You had more than that in your hand, I think, when you
36 were reading out.

37 A. Just let me think back. There was one that was, that
38 came up on the screen as I was reading it, was just

- 1 showing the words in bits and pieces as I was going
2 through the transcript, if I can recall correctly.
- 3 Q. You were reading, I think, from a page which appeared to
4 be in a bundle of pages; is that right.
- 5 A. No, no - it wasn't a bundle of pages.
- 6 Q. At p.20, you are reading from typed notes and I know
7 that these notes were apparently in a shorthand form.
8 Is that right, they were not in full sentences.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. You read out: 'One we lose. That it's all gone down
11 there at Hindmarsh Island. That place, our sacred
12 place.' And we've covered that. That is not a secret
13 that Hindmarsh Island was sacred.
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. 'We go there. Fires there very important'. It wasn't a
16 secret that fires were there.
- 17 A. No.
- 18 Q. That fires were lit.
- 19 A. No.
- 20 Q. 'Women's story in that place all secret. All other
21 things men know about it's same for us.' That seems to
22 indicate, doesn't it, that there are some secret things
23 to be shared between men and women and some that are
24 not; is that what you took that to mean.
- 25 A. No.
- 26 Q. What did you take it to mean.
- 27 A. I take it to mean that it was just women's business.
- 28 COMSR
- 29 Q. Some women's business.
- 30 A. Nothing to do with men - they said 'Men's place on the
31 other side'. But as far as the women are concerned
32 going there on their own, I don't know if that would
33 have been a part of the men's concern. It would have
34 been all to do with the women.
- 35 XN
- 36 Q. You are coming now to the next part: 'Don't you go there
37 if you're still having children. We take you, okay.' Is
38 that what you are coming to.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. You take that whole section to mean that some things are
3 private to women and have nothing to do with men.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Including having children.

6 A. Yes.

7 COMSR

8 Q. There are some things that are women's things that men
9 know about, is that what you are saying.

10 A. Well, if you go back in Aboriginal culture, men had very
11 little to do with women. Maybe different to white men
12 today. Or, you know, when they're Aboriginal, had their
13 babies, it was all done by women, for women without the
14 men being present. But today, you have men who now can
15 be present at births. So it was very much a woman's
16 world back in the old days having children.

17 XN

18 Q. How do you know that.

19 A. We had many midwives that delivered many of us that are
20 here today.

21 Q. You are talking about during your own lifetime.

22 A. During my own lifetime.

23 Q. It wasn't the custom to have men present at birth.

24 A. Definitely not.

25 Q. You are not talking about 200 years ago now.

26 A. We are talking about, I suppose, up to when they allowed
27 men to see women give birth to babies.

28 CONTINUED

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. Where does your information come about the way in which
2 birth practices occurred say 200 years ago.
- 3 A. Well, the information comes with the women's business,
4 that men was never present at women's business.
- 5 Q. You see there that you go on to read out 'Glad, you know
6 that place, women go there around where the water comes
7 in around the coast on the island, men's place on the
8 other side'. Now Glad was a reference to Gladys
9 Elphick, you believe.
- 10 A. I believe that.
- 11 Q. Mrs Elphick wasn't a Ngarrindjeri woman, was she.
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. She was a Nurrunga.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. So it was apparently known to her that women went to
16 Hindmarsh Island 'Where the water comes in around the
17 coast to on the island', and that men's place was on the
18 other side.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. That wasn't in any contravention of any Aboriginal
21 tradition that Mrs Elphick should know those details.
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. Your mother, I think, was a very Christian woman.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. I think also on p.21 - I won't go into it in detail -
26 but would you like to have a look at p.21. At the top
27 of p.21 is a male voice recorded 'Let's just hold it
28 there. Let's go back and do it from the same spot'.
29 There was a male cameraman filming you reading this out.
- 30 A. Yes.
- 31 Q. That was no problem.
- 32 A. No.
- 33 Q. You say there, reading again 'We go to the island, we
34 feel it here, we know where all Australia gets life down
35 there. It's important to life where the river goes.
36 All life and end of life comes and goes', and that was a
37 reference to the importance of the waters so far as you
38 understood.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. And that wasn't a secret.
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. And the graves that were there, they are not a secret.
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. I think on p.22, if we come to that, there is a mention
7 in the middle of the page about some matters to do with
8 marriage, about women's dances, do you see that, about
9 in the middle of the page.
- 10 A. Page 22?
- 11 Q. Page 22.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. The transcript appears to read `You make more, you marry
14 this one, that one, not marry here, not there, how you
15 have strong babies, do the women thing, dance and make
16 things, learn, fires for being' something, do you see
17 that.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. None of that is secret in any way.
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Does that in general, though, relate to the sacredness
22 of Hindmarsh Island to Ngarrindjeri women.
- 23 A. It's a part of the culture.
- 24 Q. Part of the culture.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. It relates perhaps to the significance of the island,
27 but not secret.
- 28 A. The significance of the island, but not secret.
- 29 Q. Just coming to p.23 is a correction that I should make.
30 At the top of the page there, you say you handed it
31 down, the women's business, or the stories that they had
32 down there, then you would be told. Is that something
33 that you were reading from the transcript, or can't you
34 remember now.
- 35 A. No, I don't recall reading that. I recall saying it.
- 36 Q. You go on to say `My sister, Leila, knew before me, and
37 I didn't query it. I heard', and the transcript reads
38 `But she didn't tell me', but I tell you that on closer

1 listening it should be 'But she did tell me', 'Of the
2 business, the stories that mum had told her'. Is that
3 what you recall saying.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. When you said that, that she did tell you of the
6 business, 'The stories that mum had told her', were you
7 referring to some of the matters that were in that
8 transcript.

9 A. Some of the matters to do with the water.

10 Q. What else.

11 A. I'm just trying to take my mind back to the transcript -
12 to the fires, to the women's business being there, the
13 men's business, that stuff, that mum had said that
14 wasn't secret.

15 Q. Just going down the bottom of p.23, you say 'The
16 barrages should never have been there, shouldn't have
17 been built'. You say you know it stops the water
18 altogether. What were you referring to there.

19 A. Well, the barrages, I mean when they were built, they
20 were built by Pelican Point where the Coorong, many of
21 the Ngarrindjeri people camped along there, and for the
22 barrages to be built in those days, it would have
23 destroyed a lot of their environment, and it was of
24 importance to them as they watched those barrages being
25 built, because in those days there was no legal help for
26 Aboriginal people, and their concerns for their
27 environment and what would happen to it, whether it
28 would destroy it or make it better, but I think, as we
29 came down through the years, we see the end result is
30 that the flow of the Coorong is not what it used to be,
31 the flow of Lake Alexandrina isn't what it used to be,
32 and the opening to the Murray Mouth isn't what it was
33 years ago.

34 Q. That is to do with the strong feeling that Aboriginal
35 people and, in particular, Ngarrindjeri people, have to
36 preserve the environment in that area, is that right.

37 A. That's right.

38 Q. In particular, you're now referring to the fact that,

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 before the barrages, the salt water used to flow right
2 up past the island, Hindmarsh Island, further up river
3 and into the lakes.
- 4 A. Well, that I don't know. I mean all I could recall as a
5 kid growing up there, when they talk about the barrage
6 and, you know, how it destroyed the water, the flow of
7 the water, and it was to do with white men building up
8 different things around there and it was, as I said, it
9 was important to them because it was their environment,
10 it was where the Ngarrindjeri were born, where they
11 bred, where they lived, ate and died.
- 12 Q. You learned this information that you've described from
13 Leila, just going back now to 1991 or 1992 when Leila
14 told you about these stories. When did you first hear
15 about a bridge being built at Hindmarsh Island.
- 16 A. It would have been about a year before. I just can't
17 recall how long, but -
- 18 Q. A year before Leila died, do you mean.
- 19 A. Yes, and it was with reference something to do with the
20 bridge across, with the Bannon Government, and I
21 happened to mention it, and Leila said `Well, look at
22 what they are doing now. It's terrible if this bridge
23 goes'.
- 24 Q. At that time you remember something to do with the
25 Bannon Government and something to do with some
26 Aboriginal people who were going along with the idea of
27 the bridge.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. Can you recall any more about those Aboriginal people
30 and what they were doing.
- 31 A. I don't know who those Aboriginal people were but, as I
32 say, just on hearing about it, I referred it to Leila,
33 and Leila and I sort of discussed it.
- 34 Q. What did you hear about.
- 35 A. Well, that these Aboriginal people had given the okay to
36 the Bannon Government to let the bridge go.
- 37 Q. Leila, you say, said to you `It's terrible what they are
38 doing'.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Did she say to you at any time during that conversation,
3 or any others about the bridge and what they were doing,
4 that there were secret women's stories attached to
5 Hindmarsh Island.

6 A. We were talking about this bridge business with the
7 Bannon Government, and she said 'It's terrible what they
8 are doing, Vonnie'. She said 'Has mum ever told you
9 about Hindmarsh Island', and I said 'No', I said 'Is
10 there something I should be told'. She said 'Well,
11 about the women's business there'.

12 Q. This was about two years before she died, was it.

13 A. About - I can't recall the space of time before Leila
14 died and when this came up with the Bannon Government,
15 but it was during the Bannon time that this bridge, I
16 don't know, to have made some deal or something with
17 some Aboriginal people.

18 Q. I gather from what you said that Leila didn't mention
19 the fact that men and women had business on Hindmarsh
20 Island at that time, it wasn't until just before she
21 died she mentioned that to you.

22 A. It was during our conversation about the women's
23 business that she mentioned about men and women's
24 business on Hindmarsh.

25 Q. That was just before she died, was it.

26 A. Yes.

27 Q. Not on this earlier occasion.

28 A. It was about three or four weeks before she died.

29 Q. Three or four weeks before she died.

30 A. Yes.

31 Q. I'm asking you now to come back to this earlier
32 conversation when she said 'It's terrible what they're
33 doing down there'. In that conversation to you, did she
34 mention to you anything then about Hindmarsh Island.

35 A. Yes, she did, she mentioned about the women's business.

36 Q. What did she say.

37 A. Had mum told me, and I said 'No', and she looked at me
38 and I said 'Why, what happened there', and she said

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 `Well, I guess mum couldn't tell you', as I said before,
2 because I probably would have blabbered it around or
3 told someone, being young and, you know, you tell
4 something like that to a young Aboriginal woman it would
5 have been a bit of gossip, I suppose, and I would have
6 told someone else, but mum knew deep down that she
7 couldn't tell me. She said `I can see you're much wiser
8 now'.
9 Q. You've come to the time just before the time she died,
10 three or four weeks before she died.
11 A. Leila told me, it would have been a month before she
12 died, because they had to stop all treatment, and it
13 took time to take her back to the Coorong and then bring
14 her back to the hospital, and then it was that week that
15 she died, so given a month it would have been before
16 Leila died that we sat down and talked, because she knew
17 she had made the decision to go.
18 Q. You say that that was all about the same time, was it,
19 that you heard about the problem with the bridge with
20 the Bannon Government and the Aboriginal people, or was
21 that earlier again.
22 A. We heard about the bridge before, but I mentioned it to
23 Leila, and things we were talking about when we talked
24 about Hindmarsh Island, things we used to do growing up
25 on the Coorong, and we spoke about Hindmarsh, and that's
26 when she said - I said to her `That bridge, you know,
27 they're still on about this bridge. You hear what some
28 fellows have done about it' and in general conversation
29 `Black fellows have done about this bridge with the
30 Bannon Government?', and she said `It's terrible what
31 they're doing, Vonnie'.
32 Q. It was then that she told you about women's business.
33 A. Then she asked me if I knew of it and I said `No'.
34 Q. You had spoken to Leila about that, about the bridge
35 proposed at Hindmarsh Island.
36 A. No.
37 Q. You say that after Leila died, you decided to lend
38 support to the Ngarrindjeri Action Group Committee. Who

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 were they.
- 2 A. They were Val Power, Muriel Van Der Byl, Auntie Maggie
3 Jacobs.
- 4 Q. Connie Roberts.
- 5 A. Auntie Connie Roberts, Sarah Milera.
- 6 Q. You say they were the key women.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. What do you mean by that.
- 9 A. Well, they were the key women that were chosen from the
10 Ngarrindjeri group to speak on behalf of us, or to do
11 any interviews or whatever to do with the women's
12 business at Hindmarsh Island.
- 13 Q. Who chose them.
- 14 A. Who chose them? They were chosen from a meeting.
- 15 Q. When was that meeting.
- 16 A. That meeting would have taken place at Goolwa at
17 Graham's Castle.
- 18 Q. When was that.
- 19 A. Would have been back in about June 1994.
- 20 Q. I think Val Power and Maggie Jacobs had been doing some
21 studies on the women's business, is that right.
- 22 A. I don't know.
- 23 Q. Well -
- 24 A. They would have been involved with it.
- 25 Q. Just looking, if you've got that transcript of the
26 television interviews, at p.25. Do you see down there.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 Q. You say you feel grateful that you're able to learn
29 about it with Doreen Kartinyeri and others like Auntie
30 Maggie and Val Power and others who have been doing some
31 studies on the Hindmarsh Island women's business.
- 32 A. What was said there was that Auntie Maggie and Val Power
33 and others had been looking the issues of the women's
34 business on Hindmarsh Island, and this was in relation
35 to the graves that are there, the sites and stuff like
36 that, and the women's business.
- 37 Q. What had the graves and the sites got to do with women's
38 business. They are part of that, are they.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. It's a part of Hindmarsh Island. A lot of babies are
2 buried there, many foetuses, many mothers are buried
3 there.
- 4 Q. Why was it that those particular women were chosen at
5 the meeting.
- 6 A. They were chosen because many of us were involved with
7 our own things that we were doing, and they were women
8 who could lend time to doing things.
- 9 Q. Did you tell any of those women that you knew about
10 women's business on Hindmarsh Island.
- 11 A. Yes, I did.
- 12 Q. When did you tell them.
- 13 A. I told them at that meeting.
- 14 Q. This is at the meeting just before -
- 15 A. At Graham's Castle.
- 16 Q. Is that the meeting just before Cheryl Saunders came.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. I think in 1994, and for two years prior to that, you'd
19 been pursuing a claim as part of the Lartalare heritage
20 at Glanville, is that right.
- 21 A. That's right.
- 22 Q. You spoke to Colin James about that.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Looking at Exhibit 105, and the article is 19 August
25 1994, looking at the article which is headed 'Sacred
26 Site Bid Threatens Port Revamp.'
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 CONTINUED

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. There is a picture of you, together with your
3 grandchildren.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. At the site of the old CSR factory.

6 A. Yes, that's correct.

7 Q. In that article, Colin James has described the claim
8 that you are making in relation to that area and he says
9 in the second column 'She has been battling for two
10 years to have the site registered under the State
11 Aboriginal Heritage Act, but has been frustrated by
12 bureaucratic delays. Mrs Brodie said yesterday that
13 every time she tried to raise her claim with the
14 Department of State Aboriginal Affairs, she was told its
15 officers were too busy with the Hindmarsh Island Bridge
16 controversy'. Is that what you told Colin James.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. So, had you had contact both with the Department of
19 State Aboriginal Affairs and Aboriginal Legal Rights
20 Movement about Glanville.

21 A. Yes, I did.

22 Q. Was that in the years 1992 to 1994.

23 A. It would have been 93, 94.

24 Q. 93, 94.

25 A. Yes.

26 Q. I think, in the end, your activities came too late to be
27 able to do anything about that site, is that right.

28 A. Yes. Well, I did apply - well, we had a submission
29 filled out for land acquisition fund. Because it
30 couldn't be a Mabo style claim or a native title, I
31 applied - I was going to apply for land acquisition, but
32 the day that we spoke to - my niece and I, Rebecca
33 Tonkin - the solicitor from ALRM, he had just got back
34 from Point Pearce and it was quite late, around quarter
35 to 6, 6 o'clock, and he said that that day that was the
36 time limit for the acquisition fund and it was too late
37 to put our submission in, so I just didn't worry about it.

1 Q. It was to do with that claim in relation to Glanville
2 that the Black Swan Dreaming report was prepared, which
3 is now Exhibit 293.

4 A. Yes.

5 ADJOURNED 11.57 A.M.

6 RESUMING 12.10 A.M.

7 Q. In 1993, 1994, when you were pursuing your Glanville
8 claim, I think -

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You have said that you were told by members of staff at
11 the Department of State Aboriginal Affairs and people at
12 Aboriginal Legal Rights Movement that they were engaged
13 in the Hindmarsh Island Bridge affair. Is that right.

14 A. That's correct.

15 Q. When you spoke to people at either the department or at
16 Aboriginal Legal Rights -

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Did you mention to them anything about what Leila had
19 told you.

20 A. No, I didn't.

21 Q. Was there a reason for that.

22 A. Well, it wasn't of any relevance to tell them of what
23 Leila and I had discussed. This was a different area.

24 Q. Was it of concern to you though that the bridge issue
25 had erupted again.

26 A. It was of concern what was happening there with this -
27 with the bridge issue.

28 Q. Did you think at the time to mention that, for instance,
29 there should be nothing lying between the waters and the
30 sky to protect Ngarrindjeri culture.

31 A. Can you repeat that?

32 Q. Yes. When you spoke to people at the Department of
33 State Aboriginal Affairs and at Aboriginal Legal Rights
34 Movement, did you think to mention to anyone that it was
35 important to Ngarrindjeri culture that nothing lie
36 between the waters and the sky.

37 A. No.

38 Q. Was there a reason for that.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 A. Well, it was nothing to do with my claim at Glanville.
2 I mean, that was Hindmarsh Island, this was Glanville.
3 So, you know, I just feel that that we are getting right
4 away from the issue of Hindmarsh Island with the
5 Glanville stuff.

6 Q. Can it be inferred then that at the time you were
7 pursuing the Glanville claim, you were not giving any
8 consideration then to the Hindmarsh Island Bridge at
9 all.

10 A. I wouldn't say that I wasn't giving any consideration,
11 but I believe that they were very busy at that time and
12 there weren't the staff available to deal with my issues
13 as well as the Hindmarsh Island issues.

14 Q. Did you mention anything to do with Hindmarsh Island to
15 any members, for instance, of the Lower Murray
16 Aboriginal Heritage Committee.

17 A. We were at a meeting there.

18 Q. When was that.

19 A. That was at the time when Doug and Sarah Milera had
20 their interview, when the TV cameras were out there.

21 Q. That was in June of 1994, was it.

22 A. I cannot recall the month. I know it was -

23 Q. Was it around the time that you saw Professor Cheryl
24 Saunders at Graham's Castle or shortly after.

25 A. No, it wasn't around that time.

26 Q. Was it before that.

27 A. It was after that.

28 Q. After that.

29 A. Yes.

30 Q. In the year before that, that is, in 1993, did you
31 mention anything to do with women's business on
32 Hindmarsh Island to any member of the Lower Murray
33 Aboriginal Heritage Committee.

34 A. No.

35 Q. Did you know of the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage
36 Committee.

37 A. Yes.

38 Q. What did you understand their function was.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. Their function was to look after the issues relating to
2 the southern areas of the Coorong and Victor Harbor, et
3 cetera.
- 4 Q. And including Hindmarsh Island.
- 5 A. Well, I would of -
- 6 Q. You would expect so.
- 7 A. I would think so.
- 8 Q. Coming back now to the NAG meetings, you have said that
9 that committee included Val Power, Maggie Jacobs, Connie
10 Roberts. I think the NAG committee also involved the
11 friends of Goolwa and Kumarangk, is that right.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. So it wasn't just Aboriginal people.
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. You say that you went to a meeting of the NAG Committee
16 and that you missed some others. You didn't go to every
17 meeting of the NAG Committee.
- 18 A. No, I didn't.
- 19 Q. Looking at Exhibit 35, does that appear to be a
20 Ngarrindjeri Action Group (NAG) meeting minutes.
- 21 A. Yes, it looks like that.
- 22 Q. It appears to be.
- 23 A. Yes, it looks to be that.
- 24 Q. It appears to be from a meeting of 6 June 1994. Would
25 you cast your eye over those who are listed as being
26 present.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 Q. I note that you are not listed at that meeting.
- 29 A. That's right.
- 30 Q. But do those people that are listed as being present, to
31 your knowledge, form the Ngarrindjeri Action Group, or
32 some of them.
- 33 A. Well, some of them.
- 34 Q. Can you tell the commissioner then which of those people
35 who are present at that meeting are Aboriginal people.
- 36 A. Is it relevant?
- 37 Q. Yes.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. Vi Deuschle, Margaret Sinclair, Denise Karpany, Val
2 Power, Wayne Rigney, Cathy Carter - sorry, no, she's
3 white - Ken Sumner, Greg Sinclair, Shirley Peasley,
4 Kingsley Ahang.
- 5 Q. Of the ones that sent in apologies, is Muriel Van Der
6 Byl the only Aboriginal person there.
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. Who are the others.
- 9 A. John Hartley, Don Aziz.
- 10 Q. Taking the 6 June meeting as a marker, can you tell the
11 commissioner, did you attend a meeting of the NAG
12 Committee prior to that day.
- 13 A. As I said before, I can't recall whether it was before
14 this meeting - it would have been after this meeting
15 because those people were involved long before me. So
16 it would have been after.
- 17 Q. I think you say that you missed the protest.
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 Q. In respect to the bridge.
- 20 A. Yes, I did.
- 21 Q. Would that have been around about 11 May 1994. You
22 can't recall.
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. I think you say also that you missed the rally, is that
25 right. You didn't attend a rally at Amelia Park.
- 26 A. No, I didn't attend the rally.
- 27 Q. Looking at Exhibit 178, document 57, have you seen that
28 flyer before. It is an advertisement for a picnic at
29 Amelia Park on 1 May 1994.
- 30 A. No, I don't recall seeing this.
- 31 Q. Can you recall whether you attended a barbecue at the
32 Goolwa wharf on 5 June 1994.
- 33 A. No, I didn't, no.
- 34 Q. You didn't.
- 35 A. No.
- 36 Q. You know of that, but you didn't go.
- 37 A. No, that's right.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. I think the first Ngarrindjeri Action Group Committee
2 meeting that you attended was one at Rocky Marshall's
3 house.
4 A. That's correct.
5 Q. He was a Friend of Goolwa and Kumarangk.
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. And the meeting was a meeting, was it, of the Friends of
8 Goolwa and Kumarangk.
9 A. Yes.
10 Q. At that meeting, Maggie Jacobs was there.
11 A. Yes.
12 Q. And Kathy Burgemeister.
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. Was she there as someone who came with you.
15 A. Kathy is my cousin.
16 Q. Did you take her to the meeting.
17 A. She took me.
18 Q. She took you to the meeting.
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. Sue Elliott, who is she.
21 A. Sue is a Friend.
22 Q. A Friend of Goolwa and Kumarangk.
23 A. Yes.
24 Q. Doreen Kartinyeri was there.
25 A. Yes.
26 Q. Amelia and Merva Campbell.
27 A. Yes.
28 Q. Sarah Milera.
29 A. Yes.
30 Q. Shirley Peasley.
31 A. Yes.
32 Q. Vi Deuschle.
33 A. Yes.
34 Q. And Edith Rigney.
35 A. Yes.
36 Q. You have described an event which happened there
37 concerning Amelia Campbell.
38 A. Yes.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 Q. What happened.

2 A. Amelia became abusive because she said no-one invited
3 her down to the meeting, and she started to abuse the
4 women that were there, saying - and Doreen, asked her
5 not to speak like that, and Doreen walked out. She said
6 she couldn't stay there while Amelia was being abusive.
7 I then said - and Amelia got really abusive about some -
8 the women, so I said `Amelia, don't air your dirty linen
9 here. This is not the place or the time. This is a
10 meeting about Hindmarsh Island', and left it at that.

11 Q. Who organised the meeting.

12 A. I don't know. I'm not involved with the organiser, but
13 I know Shirley and Vi - Shirley Peasley and Vi Deuschle
14 - were there and were up front with Rocky, so I gather
15 that, on the NAG Committee side, they would have let
16 people know about it. But the Friends of Kumarangk
17 probably arranged the meeting there.

18 Q. Who arranged for you to go to the meeting.

19 A. I arranged for myself. I rang Kath Burgemeister and
20 made arrangements myself to go down.

21 Q. Who told you about the meeting.

22 A. Auntie Maggie told me and she said `If you could get
23 along it would be good to go', so -

24 Q. Did she tell you what the meeting was for.

25 A. Well, I gathered what the meeting must have been for.

26 Q. What did you gather.

27 A. The support of Hindmarsh Island, no bridge. So I went
28 along to have a listen.

29 Q. In support, I suppose, of the Friends of Goolwa and
30 Kumarangk.

31 A. Well, in support of the Ngarrindjeri Action Group.
32 Being a Ngarrindjeri, I would lend support to them.

33 Q. Had you told Maggie Jacobs at that time that you knew
34 about women's business on the island.

35 A. I mentioned to Auntie Maggie before that.

36 Q. What did you say to her.

37 A. I just said `I know, my sister Leila told me'.

38 Q. What did she say.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. She was pleased to know.
- 2 Q. Did she mention to you whether she knew anything about
3 it.
- 4 A. She said she was told of it.
- 5 Q. Did she say what she was told of.
- 6 A. No. She just mentioned that she was told of the women's
7 business there.
- 8 Q. What was she told.
- 9 A. She didn't say.
- 10 Q. Did you mention to her what you'd been told.
- 11 A. No, I haven't.
- 12 Q. Were you not curious.
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Did she tell you who had told her.
- 15 A. No. She just said that she heard as a young girl
16 growing up, and her grandmother told her things. So I
17 didn't question it any further, and I didn't give any
18 information of what I had.
- 19 Q. The second meeting that you went to at Rocky Marshall's
20 house of the Friends of Goolwa and Kumarangk was a
21 meeting at which some people spoke, is that right.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. I think at that second meeting a white man told people
24 who were there about bones being taken from the island.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. What did he tell you.
- 27 A. He said that a white man from Goolwa had been across to
28 the island, taken some bones into the hotel, and was
29 laughing and joking about the bones that he had, and, I
30 mean, we felt that was really terrible.
- 31 Q. Who was at that meeting.
- 32 A. The Friends of Kumarangk.
- 33 Q. Are you able to say now, first of all, when that meeting
34 was.
- 35 A. No.
- 36 Q. Was it before you saw Professor Cheryl Saunders.
- 37 A. Yes.
- 38 Q. At that time, did he mention a taxi driver.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. He mentioned taxi driver that had the box with the bones
2 in the boot.
- 3 Q. Did he tell you anything about what was said at the pub
4 about those bones.
- 5 A. They were laughing and talking about the bones, and they
6 were going to raffle them or do something with them.
- 7 Q. Can you recall who was at that meeting.
- 8 A. Well, there was those names that I mentioned before that
9 went to the second or the first meeting. I think -
- 10 Q. And various members of the Friends of Goolwa and
11 Kumarangk.
- 12 A. Kumarangk, yes.
- 13 Q. Was it one of those people, one of the Friends, who got
14 up and spoke to the meeting.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. As well as talking about the bones, was the person who
17 spoke also talking about a bridge going across to the
18 Coorong.
- 19 A. Not that I could recall, the same person.
- 20 Q. You have heard about that though, haven't you.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. When did you hear about the prospect of a bridge going
23 to the Coorong.
- 24 A. When all this stuff came about with the Hindmarsh Island
25 Bridge, it was just talk that a bridge would go across
26 to the Coorong and down the Coorong to catch up with the
27 main freeway. That was of a great concern because it
28 was going through Ngarrindjeri lands.
- 29 Q. Was it of concern to you personally because of Leila's
30 attachment to the Coorong.
- 31 A. Well, my personal input into that I don't think has any
32 relevance, but the Coorong itself is of heritage to me
33 and many other Ngarrindjeri people. If that is
34 destroyed we've got nothing left of our culture.
- 35 Q. So it is important to you, and from what you know, to
36 other Ngarrindjeri people, that the environment around
37 Hindmarsh Island and the lakes and the Coorong is not
38 disturbed by too many people. Is that right.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. Yes, and that's how we look at Hindmarsh Island, that if
2 the bridge goes, tourism goes, things get built on
3 Hindmarsh Island, there'll be nothing left of the
4 Ngarrindjeri culture.
- 5 Q. Just going back for a moment to the first meeting at
6 Rocky Marshall's house, did anybody speak there.
- 7 A. In relation to?
- 8 Q. To anything at all. Did anybody get up and address the
9 group apart from when Amelia spoke.
- 10 A. I think that that was the meeting that Rocky apologized
11 for the piece that he'd put in the 'Advertiser'
12 regarding what his mother had told him, and he
13 apologized to Doreen and to us women that were there.
14 He said he had made a press statement.
- 15 Q. What was he apologizing for.
- 16 A. For what he put into the letter to the editor about what
17 his mother told him, about the women's business or the
18 waters and stuff.
- 19 Q. Why was he apologizing.
- 20 A. Well, he didn't realise the importance to the
21 Ngarrindjeri women that those issues had until they
22 started to kick up about it.
- 23 Q. What was said to him about him putting that in the
24 paper.
- 25 A. Well, that was just said that he shouldn't have put it
26 into the paper, that he should have approached
27 Ngarrindjeri people. From what I can gather, he said
28 that he was sorry for doing it and would the
29 Ngarrindjeri people accept his apology.
- 30 CONTINUED

- 1 Q. Was his apology then for the fact that he had put that
2 in the paper without speaking to somebody first.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. There is nothing secret in what he put in the paper.
- 5 A. No, but I think the way that it came out was the way
6 that it came out in the newspaper before anyone had
7 known about it.
- 8 Q. By 'anyone who had known about it', what do you mean by
9 that.
- 10 A. I'm saying it came out in the 'Letters to the Editor',
11 which is something - or in the Advertiser, I believe,
12 which is a bit of a shock if you pick up the paper and
13 read it and all of a sudden there's a white man putting
14 an issue in.
- 15 Q. Looking at Exhibit 37 produced, the letter to the editor
16 from Rocky Marshall on 18 June 1994. Looking at that
17 Exhibit 37, that is the letter to which you refer.
- 18 A. That's the letter that Rocky referred to.
- 19 Q. That's the letter that caused some complaint to be made
20 to him; is that right.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And the complaint was more; that he had given this story
23 to the paper before any Aboriginal people had had a
24 chance to speak to him.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. So, it wasn't that what he was divulging was any secret
27 material at all.
- 28 A. Not that I can read from there.
- 29 Q. I would like to come now to the meeting at Graham's
30 Castle which I think was the day after the Rocky
31 Marshall house meeting that you attended.
- 32 A. Yes.
- 33 Q. Looking at Exhibit 36 produced. Looking at that flyer,
34 Exhibit 36, did you receive something like that.
- 35 A. No, I didn't, but I knew that my name was on the list.
- 36 Q. How did you know that.
- 37 A. Because I rang up about it.
- 38 Q. Whom did you ring.

- 1 A. I rang the Konanda Centre.
2 Q. Why did you ring the Konanda Centre.
3 A. To speak to Shirley Piesley who had - I knew she was
4 organising it.
5 Q. Did you know why Shirley Piesley was organising it.
6 A. To discuss the women's issues and Cheryl Saunders, what
7 we would be saying.
8 Q. Did Shirley Piesley or anybody else from either the NAG
9 Committee ever ask you specifically to be present at
10 that time, that meeting at Graham's Castle.
11 A. When I rang, I said I'd heard about that and she said
12 'Your name is on the list, would you like to go?', and I
13 said 'Yes, I would'.
14 Q. Maggie Jacobs, for instance, did not approach you to say
15 that you should come to this meeting. That was
16 something you heard about and just went down there.
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. On the first day before -
19 A. In fact, if I take you back a bit. It was me who rang
20 Maggie Jacobs.
21 Q. You who rang Maggie Jacobs.
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. You told us, I think, before that you had already spoken
24 to Maggie Jacobs about the women's business and that you
25 knew about it prior to this meeting; is that right.
26 A. Beg your pardon?
27 Q. Prior to the Graham's Castle meeting, you had already
28 spoken to Maggie Jacobs about the fact that you knew of
29 women's business from your sister Leila.
30 A. Yes.
31 Q. The day after the Rocky Marshall meeting, 19 June, you
32 were staying at Graham's Castle.
33 A. Yes.
34 Q. There were a group of other women there.
35 A. Yes.
36 Q. Not all of those women, I think, were Ngarrindjeri
37 women.
38 A. Staying at Graham's Castle?

- 1 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. I believe there to be all Ngarrindjeri women. If they
- 3 weren't, then I don't know what they were doing there.
- 4 Q. Did Doreen Kartinyeri speak to you on that day before
- 5 you saw Cheryl Saunders.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. To whom did she speak.
- 8 A. To everyone that was in the room.
- 9 Q. What did she say.
- 10 A. She just discussed the issues why Cheryl Saunders was
- 11 coming and we discussed the women's business.
- 12 Q. Pausing there for a moment. Did she tell you why Cheryl
- 13 Saunders was coming.
- 14 A. Well, it was to do, to take information from us in
- 15 reference to saving the island so the stuff would go
- 16 back to Robert Tickner.
- 17 Q. Would you mind going on then about what Doreen told you
- 18 and the other women.
- 19 A. She told us about the women's - about the island, about
- 20 the bridge. We were concerned about it. We were there
- 21 because we wanted to know what issues would be brought
- 22 up about the women's business. She had a map and there
- 23 was an aerial map and she put it up and she said `Take a
- 24 look at it'.
- 25 Q. Was it anything like the map on the wall, Exhibit 80.
- 26 Is it anything like that map.
- 27 A. It was a map that showed Hindmarsh Island into the
- 28 Coorong and Lake Alexandrina and the Murray Mouth.
- 29 COMSR
- 30 Q. Was it a map or a photo.
- 31 A. That just doesn't look the same as the one that Doreen
- 32 had.
- 33 XN
- 34 Q. Do you recall now whether it was an aerial photograph.
- 35 A. It was an aerial -
- 36 Q. Photograph.
- 37 A. Looking down on it.
- 38 Q. Looking at Exhibit 29 produced, does that seem -

- 1 A. I've seen this one before, but it wasn't the one that
2 Doreen had up. Doreen's was a black and white one that
3 she showed us first.
- 4 Q. Was it similar to the one that is Exhibit 29.
- 5 A. But - yes, I have seen this one.
- 6 Q. Was Doreen's photograph similar to that.
- 7 A. No, it showed more of Lake Alexandrina.
- 8 Q. But it showed Lake Alexandrina. It showed Hindmarsh
9 Island.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And it showed the Murray Mouth.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. It showed the other islands like Mundoo Island.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And Ewe Island.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. What did she say about it.
- 18 A. She said `Do we understand what the issues of Hindmarsh
19 Island are about, and the women have come down so that
20 we want to talk to you in regards to this women's
21 business'. And she said `I know about it'. She said
22 she was told by her elders of the women's business and
23 that -
- 24 Q. Pausing there for a moment. Whom did she say had told
25 her.
- 26 A. She said her Granny Rosy.
- 27 Q. Anybody else.
- 28 A. Grandmother Sally.
- 29 Q. Anyone else.
- 30 A. Nanna Laura - and that was, I think, the three main
31 ones.
- 32 Q. Did you know those women.
- 33 A. Yes, I knew, yes.
- 34 Q. Some better than others.
- 35 A. Yes.
- 36 Q. Which ones did you know the best.
- 37 A. I know Nanna Laura fairly well and I knew grandmother
38 Sally when I was growing up on Raukkan.

- 1 Q. What about Auntie Rosy.
2 A. I know Granny Rosy. She lived at Point Pearce.
3 Q. Coming back now to the map or the photograph that you
4 saw, what was said by any of the women when Doreen held
5 that map up or asked you to look at it.
6 A. Well, the women didn't say anything. They listened to
7 what Doreen had to say about the map and, you know,
8 `What can you see?'. Well, I knew by looking at it what
9 I could see, what it meant to me.
10 Q. What did it mean to you.
11 A. To me, it looked, as it was stated in previous
12 statements, that it was the reproductive organs of a
13 female.
14 Q. Had you ever heard that mentioned in connection with
15 Hindmarsh Island before that day.
16 A. Yes, I had.
17 Q. Was that something that Leila had told you.
18 A. Yes.
19 Q. That is not a secret.
20 A. That's not a secret, not that.
21 Q. Did anybody else, apart from Doreen, say anything about
22 the map; did you understand from what the other women
23 said that they knew that it looked like the reproductive
24 organs of a female.
25 A. I said that Leila had told me about the women's
26 business.
27 Q. Did you tell the group that.
28 A. Tell them what?
29 Q. Tell the women who were looking at the photograph what
30 Leila had told you.
31 A. No, I didn't.
32 Q. When you said that a minute ago, you were talking about
33 when you spoke to Doreen, were you.
34 A. When I spoke to Doreen about it. Doreen said `Do you
35 know?' - she asked the group what it looked like and I,
36 you know, in my mind I knew what it was: The
37 reproduction of the female.
38 Q. Did anybody say at that time `That looks like the

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 reproductive organs of a female', or any words similar
2 to that.
- 3 A. I mean, we all mumbled amongst ourselves and gave little
4 bits here and there and that was it.
- 5 Q. I think Doreen also had a picture of Mundoo Island,
6 something on it which related to the treatment of the
7 dead.
- 8 A. She had a little postcard size from the South Australian
9 Museum.
- 10 Q. What did she say about that.
- 11 A. She just says that Mundoo was known as death island.
- 12 Q. That wasn't a secret.
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. You had known of that before.
- 15 A. I knew of it before.
- 16 Q. You spoke to Doreen about the fact that you knew about
17 women's business.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. What did you say.
- 20 A. I spoke to Doreen. I said 'I know what you're speaking
21 of. Leila told me'. And Doreen looked at me and
22 smiled. But that was just a conversation between Doreen
23 and I.
- 24 Q. Did she say anything to you.
- 25 A. She just said she was pleased to know that I knew.
- 26 COMSR
- 27 Q. I'm not quite clear of what you had been talking about
28 prior to that when you said Leila had told you.
- 29 A. Of the women's business, the secret women's business.
- 30 Q. There's something gone on between the showing of the map
31 and the showing of the photo.
- 32 A. Yes. I said to Doreen, I said 'I know of the secret
33 women's business', and Doreen smiled at me, and I said
34 'Leila told me', and she said she was glad.
- 35 XN
- 36 Q. I think Doreen also mentioned about aborted fetuses
37 from white men and babies.
- 38 A. That was, she mentioned that was the part of the history

1 of the Hindmarsh Island.

2 Q. There was nothing secret or sacred about that.

3 A. Nothing secret about that, but it's a sacred issue in
4 itself.

5 Q. It's of significance to you all as Ngarrindjeri women.

6 A. That's right, yes.

7 Q. Did you tell Doreen that you couldn't divulge any of the
8 secret women's business because you promised Leila.

9 A. Yes. I said to Doreen 'I cannot talk about it because
10 my sister told me, and when the time is right I will
11 know when to tell it'.

12 Q. Did Doreen mention anything else to the women who were
13 assembled, apart from the babies buried on the island
14 and the reproductive organs of the woman relating to the
15 landscape.

16 A. Yes. That there were grandmothers there buried,
17 grandfathers - I knew that from before - and that the
18 women's business, when the time came, we would or she
19 would discuss it with the Ngarrindjeri women.

20 Q. She mentioned Mundoo island.

21 A. In passing, yes.

22 Q. Did you discuss, for instance, the environment;
23 generally speaking, the need to preserve the area.

24 A. Well, we spoke of Hindmarsh as being culturally -

25 Q. Significant.

26 A. Well, significant to us as well as what happened there
27 200 years ago. I mean, it was belonging to - we felt it
28 belonged to the Ngarrindjeri people years before that,
29 so we felt at that time it still belonged to the
30 Ngarrindjeri nation.

31 Q. That related really to the things that you knew had
32 happened 200 years ago.

33 A. Yes.

34 Q. But, from what you have said, nothing about any secret
35 women's business was mentioned by Doreen to the
36 assembled women at that time.

37 A. No.

38 Q. You say at the bottom of p.5 of your statement that you

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 told the women that women's business had existed, that
2 it did take place and that the sacredness of the island
3 is true, that all that did happen. What did you mean by
4 that.

5 A. That Leila - this was told to me by my late sister.

6 Q. You say `All the things that were connected with the
7 women's business, the preparation for womanhood, did
8 take place because this was told to me by my late
9 sister'. You have included there `the preparation for
10 womanhood'. That is one of the topics she addressed.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. That is one of the things that, to you, makes the island
13 sacred.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. I think you had a conversation with Dr Deane Fergie, the
16 anthropologist, that was there.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. What did you say to her.

19 A. I told Dr Fergie that women's business did exist and
20 that it was handed down to me before my sister died.

21 Q. Did Dr Fergie ask you anything further about it.

22 A. No, she didn't.

23 Q. She didn't ask you when you had found this out.

24 A. She didn't ask me because I told her I couldn't divulge
25 that, as I said before, because my sister told told me
26 on her death bed and there would be a time and a place
27 if I told a white person the things that I was told.

28 Q. So, you say that you thought that Doreen knew about the
29 women's business.

30 A. Yes.

31 Q. And you thought that because of what she had said to
32 you; that is, she smiled and said she was pleased that
33 you knew of it.

34 A. Yes.

35 Q. Without giving you any detail at all.

36 A. That's right.

37 Q. It was left to Doreen whether or not she told Dr Fergie
38 and Professor Saunders; is that right.

- 1 A. That's right.
- 2 Q. Apart from you, did any other women who were there when
- 3 Doreen spoke to them know of the women's business to
- 4 your knowledge.
- 5 A. The older ones.
- 6 Q. Did they say that they knew of it.
- 7 A. They said they had been told of it.
- 8 Q. Who were `they'.
- 9 A. Auntie Maggie, Auntie Connie, Sarah Milera.
- 10 Q. Edith Rigney.
- 11 A. Edith - I can't recall them all.
- 12 Q. What did they say about what they knew.
- 13 A. They just said that they had been told of the women's
- 14 business without saying.
- 15 Q. What they had be told.
- 16 A. What they had been told.
- 17 Q. Are they the only other ones that you can recall that
- 18 said they had been told about women's business.
- 19 A. They're the only ones that I could recall.
- 20 Q. I think there was a meeting with the women at which
- 21 Doreen was made the spokesperson for the group.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. At the time that she was elected as the spokesperson
- 24 then, there were some women who knew about the women's
- 25 business and some who did not.
- 26 A. That's correct.
- 27 Q. In fact, the majority did not.
- 28 A. That's correct.
- 29 Q. Was it important, do you think, to you and to the other
- 30 women when electing Dr Kartinyeri as spokesperson that
- 31 she had been involved in studies at the South Australian
- 32 Museum.
- 33 A. Yes.
- 34 Q. I think you also discussed on that weekend when Cheryl
- 35 Saunders came, or at least she came the day after, I
- 36 understand, on the Monday, did you discuss with the
- 37 other women the reasons why you as a group of
- 38 Ngarrindjeri women were opposing the bridge.

- 1 A. Can you repeat that?
2 Q. Sorry.
3 A. Can you repeat that?
4 Q. Yes. When you talked to the other women before
5 Professor Saunders came, did you talk to those women
6 about why you were opposing the bridge.
7 A. When you say `When you spoke to the women', what are you
8 referring to?
9 Q. I mean when you all - I'm assuming that you were all
10 talking amongst yourselves from time to time during the
11 day.
12 A. And would we be - could you repeat your question?
13 Q. When you were talking to the other women on the Sunday
14 before Professor Saunders came, did you talk to them
15 about why you, as a group, were opposing the bridge.
16 A. Well, we discussed those issues, why we were opposing
17 the bridge.
18 Q. Why were you proposing opposing the bridge.
19 A. Because of the women's business and the bones that are
20 buried there, the dead that are on Hindmarsh Island.
21 For progress to go ahead, those bones would have to be
22 dug up and removed from their resting place, desecration
23 of our burial sites.
24 Q. Was there any issue discussed which related to the
25 Murray Mouth and the flow of the Coorong.
26 A. Well, that was all taken into consideration.
27 Q. In what way.
28 A. The Murray Mouth in itself, the way that it was
29 destroyed by white man when they went into the mouth to
30 make it wider, they destroyed the natural flow of the
31 mouth, and today you have four-wheel drives which are
32 floating around in the waters down there, other vehicles
33 that the waters flood, and so the Coorong in itself, the
34 whole flow of the Coorong, is no longer like it used to
35 be many, many years ago.
36 Q. What was it about the bridge that was going to make that
37 worse.
38 A. Well, if the bridge goes across, you will put tourism on

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 the map. Tourism is the thing that will destroy
2 Hindmarsh Island of the Ngarrindjeri culture, and the
3 significance, the sacredness of that island.
- 4 Q. In other words, it was felt that the bridge going ahead
5 would upset the environment and desecrate the sacredness
6 of Hindmarsh Island where a lot of the old people were
7 buried.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. As well as the babies that were buried there.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. That it would disturb the flow of the water.
- 12 A. Well, they have already done that.
- 13 COMSR
- 14 Q. I'm not quite clear what mean by that. Are you saying
15 it's too late to do anything about that now.
- 16 A. What I'm saying is that the waters are already
17 destroyed, the flow of the waters from the Coorong after
18 the Murray Mouth, so by putting a bridge across there,
19 it's not going to destroy that water any more, but
20 you're going to build-up, as I said before, tourism, and
21 you can't tell me that that island isn't going to be
22 turned into a tourist resort. I mean a lot of land down
23 there now, nothing belongs to Ngarrindjeri people on
24 that island except the bones that are there, the things
25 that we care about, and the whole cultural significance
26 of Hindmarsh Island is what we care about.
- 27 MS SIMPSON: There are two matters which I would like
28 to raise before lunchtime. The first one is the release
29 of Dorothy Wilson's statement which Mr Meyer was asking
30 for but secondly, before you adjourn, Mrs Brodie would
31 like the opportunity of reading a poem of her sister
32 Leila. If we could deal with those two matters it would
33 take to lunchtime.
- 34 COMSR: Any idea how long you're likely to be?
- 35 MS SIMPSON: About another half an hour.
- 36 COMSR: I don't know how many other counsel wish
37 to question the witness.
- 38 MR ABBOTT: I do. I should be some time. I mean

- 1 there is an enormous number of matters to cover. I
2 regret that I have a meeting at 5 o'clock.
- 3 COMSR: Is there anyone else.
- 4 MR SYKES: I would like to ask questions of the
5 witness. My cross-examination wouldn't take long.
- 6 COMSR: I only want persons who the witness's
7 evidence directly concerns, and to the extent that it
8 directly concerns it.
- 9 MS PYKE: I will, in due course, have some
10 questions.
- 11 MR KENNY: I may have a few, but it will depend on
12 on other questions on the way.
- 13 MR WARDLE: I might too.
- 14 MR MEYER: Ditto.
- 15 COMSR: Yes, well, subject to what I've said,
16 that the questions are restricted to matters which
17 directly concern the persons that counsel represent.
- 18 MS SIMPSON: Is it convenient, then, to deal with the
19 release of some of the statements as they may be
20 relevant to the cross-examination?
- 21 COMSR: Yes.
- 22 MS SIMPSON: That could be dealt with immediately.
- 23 COMSR: You're taking about Dorothy Wilson's
24 statement?
- 25 MR MEYER: I made an application for Dorothy
26 Wilson's statement, and it's obviously become more
27 relevant as time goes on, and in particular in relation
28 to the cross-examination of this witness.
- 29 COMSR: Of course, at the time certain parts of
30 that was suppressed it was very early in the hearing,
31 and it wasn't clear at that stage how much of the
32 contents of it had already been the subject of a fair
33 amount of public divulgence.
- 34 WITNESS: Madam Commissioner, can I just say I
35 really don't want to discuss Dorothy Wilson's statement?
- 36 COMSR: I'm not asking you to.
- 37 WITNESS: I do know that there was a little
38 section where I was involved with her there at Graham's

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 Castle. That's the only part that I want to discuss. I
2 don't want to discuss any more issues.

3 COMSR: I'm not asking you to discuss it at all.
4 What I've been -

5 WITNESS: Or to speak on it here.

6 COMSR: I don't want you to. I've been asked to
7 release portions which have been suppressed. Up to
8 date, I've suppressed them on the basis that it was
9 early in the piece, I didn't know what matters had been
10 publicised and to what extent they had be publicised; I
11 wasn't aware what the state of the confidentiality of
12 that material was, but it's become apparent to me, as
13 the hearing has proceeded, that the confidentiality of
14 what took place at the meetings between the women has
15 been well and truly lost, and that that information had
16 been divulged before this commission ever started, it's
17 here in most respects. There is not much that this
18 commission can do to restore the confidentiality of
19 something once it's been lost. I've gone through the
20 statement two or three times to see that I wasn't
21 overlooking something that was still in the realm of
22 being confidential, but I'm satisfied now that all of
23 that material that was suppressed has been the subject
24 of quite widespread public divulgence, and that it won't
25 be breaching the confidentiality of any of that
26 information if I release it at this stage.

27 Accordingly, I lift the suppression order, so that
28 counsel can have access to that material.

29 MS SIMPSON: If there are a number of minutes
30 remaining, Mrs Brodie would just like to read a poem of
31 her late sister, Leila Rankine.

32 XN

33 Q. Can you read the poem.

34 A. It may help you to understand what the Coorong and the
35 surrounding areas really mean to to the Ngarrindjeri
36 people. It's called 'The Coorong'. Land of my father's
37 people, place of my ancestors past, never will I forget
38 you, for you are dear to my heart. I've climbed your

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 golden sand dunes and walked through your native scrub,
2 swum in your sea green waters, watched the birds in
3 their evening flight. Oh how my heart is longing to
4 hear the song of the surf, from the mighty Southern
5 Ocean whose shores I often trod. The many lovely wild
6 flowers whose seeds are scattered by the winds, like a
7 cloak of many colours grow there within your folds. The
8 midden heaps around me, the bleached bones on the shore,
9 are fragments of a lifetime which I yearn to know once
10 more. Through the wind and sand around me at night by
11 the campfire bright, with the blue smoke wafting upwards
12 I recall my ancestors' life. Oh spirit of the long ago
13 and guardian of the past, as I stand beside your waters,
14 my soul knows peace at last. Written by Leila D
15 Rankine.

16 COMSR: Thank you. Perhaps whilst we are on the
17 question of suppression orders, having heard Mrs Brodie,
18 it's apparent to me, as far as Exhibit 37 is concerned,
19 that there can be nothing in the way of confidentiality
20 about that information now, so I propose to lift that
21 suppression order on that also.

22 ADJOURNED 12.59 P.M.

23 RESUMING 2.02 P.M.

24 XN

25 Q. Before lunch we were talking about the meeting or
26 meetings at Graham's Castle which occurred prior to
27 professor Cheryl Saunders arriving, and then while she
28 was there. You were telling the Commissioner about some
29 of the issues that the women discussed which were
30 important to let Professor Saunders know about, and we
31 have covered some of them. You mentioned about the
32 pressure that it was thought that tourism would bring to
33 that environment. Do you remember saying that.

34 A. Yes.

35 Q. In particular, was it the case that the women discussed
36 the pressure that would be brought to bear by the
37 building of the bridge on the estuary system which are
38 the wetlands and including the wading bird population.

1 Were any of those topics discussed by the women.

2 A. No.

3 Q. It was a discussion, was it, that was more the
4 environment generally.

5 A. It was more to do with the sacredness of Hindmarsh
6 Island.

7 Q. For the reasons you explained this morning.

8 A. The cultural issues.

9 Q. The Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee, in
10 particular Victor Wilson, who was the chairperson at the
11 time - you know Victor Wilson.

12 A. I do.

13 Q. He wrote, in October 1993, to Minister Tickner that the
14 Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee was
15 'Concerned about the impact that the bridge will have on
16 other Aboriginal sites on Hindmarsh Island, and its
17 effect on the ecology of the region that is a wetland
18 habitat for migatory birds, and is near the northern end
19 of the Coorong which is sacred to our people'. Did the
20 women discuss anything of that nature on the weekend
21 before Cheryl Saunders came.

22 A. No.

23 Q. Were either of those matters matters that your sister
24 Leila discussed with you when telling you about women's
25 business.

26 A. What Leila told me about the women's business, it
27 involved the whole of the area of Hindmarsh Island and
28 around it.

29 Q. She didn't specifically mention any impact on the
30 wetlands.

31 A. No.

32 Q. Or any impact on the bird population.

33 A. That wasn't -

34 Q. Her concern.

35 A. That wasn't her concern at that time.

36 Q. I think one of the Friends of Goolwa and Kumarangk is a
37 man called Richard Owen, is that right.

38 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. I think you know Richard.
2 A. Yes, I know Richard.
3 Q. How long have you known him.
4 A. I met Richard at one meeting, at the barbecue at
5 Graham's Castle, and I also met him over at the Mouth
6 House.
7 Q. When was that that you met him at the Mouth House.
8 A. I'm just trying to recall, and I think it was the day
9 before the barbecue.
10 Q. By 'the barbecue', are you referring to the last meeting
11 at Graham's Castle.
12 A. The one at Graham's Castle. That was the only one I
13 ever attended.
14 Q. Now at any of the meetings of the Friends of Goolwa and
15 Kumarangk, did anybody speak to the group, that is when
16 it was combined with the Ngarrindjeri Action Committee
17 meetings, did anybody speak about the importance of
18 preserving the estuary system and the wetlands and the
19 wading bird population.
20 A. No.
21 Q. Richard Owen never mentioned that.
22 A. No.
23 Q. That in no way, as far as you know, forms any part of
24 secret women's business, no secret attached to that.
25 A. No.
26 Q. When Professor Saunders was at Graham's Castle there
27 were, I think, some of the men from the Aboriginal
28 Heritage Committee present.
29 A. There were.
30 Q. Who were they.
31 A. There was George Trevorrow, Doug Milera, those two.
32 Q. When the women were having the meetings, where were
33 they.
34 A. They were at Graham's Castle, in the meeting room.
35 Q. With the women.
36 A. Inside. Can you repeat that?
37 Q. When the women were having their meetings at Graham's
38 Castle, where were Mr Milera and Mr Trevorrow.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. I don't know. They weren't with the women because it
2 was a women's meeting.
- 3 Q. Was there any reason for them not being there.
- 4 A. We met them, I think it was down by the ferry, I'm not
5 sure, down by the ferry, and we went across, they showed
6 us.
- 7 Q. But during the time that you were meeting with Cheryl
8 Saunders, they were present at Graham's Castle.
- 9 A. No, not to my knowledge.
- 10 Q. You didn't ever see them outside.
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Were you present when Professor Saunders spoke to Dr
13 Kartinyeri at any time.
- 14 A. In reference to -?
- 15 Q. At that time.
- 16 A. In Graham's Castle I was.
- 17 Q. Did you hear Professor Saunders saying to Dr Kartinyeri
18 from time to time that there wasn't enough evidence,
19 that they needed more.
- 20 A. She did say she wanted more, that what we had given may
21 not be enough, but we, the women, didn't make any
22 decision, we left it up to Dr Doreen Kartinyeri to
23 decide whatever she felt was right to give Professor
24 Saunders.
- 25 CONTINUED

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. You mention that although Dr Kartinyeri touched on some
2 of the women's business, which you have described, there
3 were some things that you understood could not be told
4 at that time to all the women. Is that correct.
5 A. That's correct.
6 Q. You say that it takes spiritual growth for that to take
7 place.
8 A. It does.
9 Q. And the nature of it is, I think you say, that it is
10 personal to women.
11 A. It is.
12 Q. I think you have just mentioned that you went on a tour
13 of the island. At that time, there was Mr Trevorrow and
14 Mr Milera present.
15 A. Yes.
16 Q. What happened on that tour.
17 A. We crossed over, we pulled over to the left of the
18 ferry. At that time, there was a car-load of white men
19 went past and were very abusive. Because Auntie Maggie
20 got out the car, Cheryl Saunders went back and tried to
21 catch the car before it got over the ferry. They were
22 very abusive and once the car - Cheryl spoke to them,
23 they took off. She walked back and we got back into our
24 cars and went further down the road to where George
25 Trevorrow pointed out the sites.
26 Q. What was he pointing out to you.
27 A. The burial sites.
28 Q. Yes, anything else after that.
29 A. Over by the marina.
30 Q. After you had seen those burial sites, what did you do
31 then.
32 A. We went on to the Mouth House.
33 Q. What was the purpose of that.
34 A. The purpose of that visit to there, I believe, was to
35 show Cheryl Saunders the Murray Mouth, the Coorong and
36 its connections with Mundoo Island, where Hindmarsh was,
37 where Mundoo was.
38 Q. Who was pointing that out to her.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. I guess Doreen would have. We weren't all in the car
2 with Cheryl Saunders. We were all in our own vehicles.
- 3 Q. So there were really separate groups of people going
4 about as part of a larger tour, is that right.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Like Cheryl Saunders was with Dr Kartinyeri.
- 7 A. Yes. There were the cars and vehicles for all of the
8 people that were there: four in some, eight in others,
9 six in a mini bus, you know.
- 10 Q. In a convoy.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. When you were at Graham's Castle, did you speak at all
13 to either Maggie Jacobs or Connie Roberts about who had
14 told them the women's business.
- 15 A. No. I wouldn't dare ask them that. I mean, they're
16 elders and I wouldn't approach them and ask them that,
17 because that would be rude on my part.
- 18 Q. You assume though, do you, that it would be handed down
19 from mother or grandmother to them, because of what you
20 know that Leila's told you.
- 21 A. Well, I listened to what my sister said, and I assume
22 that that's the way that it was done.
- 23 Q. Looking at Exhibit 22B, p.25, when you were interviewed
24 by Alison Caldwell on the 7.30 Report, about the middle
25 of the page, Alison asks you `Are you pleased that she'
26 that is your mother `said the things she said to
27 Betty?', and you replied `Yes, I am, and I think that it
28 perhaps might help to put to rest some of the things
29 that are being said about the island'. And you go on to
30 say `She would have been told things by her grandmother,
31 like Lartalare, Rebecca Spender'. Do you remember
32 saying that to Alison.
- 33 A. Yes.
- 34 Q. And where you are reading out from the transcript that
35 Betty Fisher made and presumably had given to Alison
36 Caldwell, you say there, reading from that `See, Betty,
37 like church, we go every time to church by these ideas.
38 These are part of my mother, my granny's stuff, well,

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 she came from the Coorong'. You see that. That was
2 written down, was it, on the paper from which you were
3 reading.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. That, you understood, to be your mother speaking.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. So when she says 'These are part of my mother, my
8 granny's stuff' she is referring to her mother and her
9 grandmother. In other words, your great grandmother, is
10 that right.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Your grandmother and your great grandmother.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Neither of those came from the Coorong.
- 15 A. Neither came from the Coorong, but lived there when they
16 were young and worked there in between the Glanville
17 side, where they lived, and living there, because my
18 great grandfather, George Spender, was born at the
19 Needles at the Coorong.
- 20 Q. But neither of your grandmother or your great
21 grandmother came from the Coorong.
- 22 A. Not -
- 23 Q. They came from Glanville.
- 24 A. They came from Glanville.
- 25 Q. In your statement, Exhibit 292, p.7, you say at the
26 bottom 'We are talking about the old people because it
27 didn't happen in my time or my sister's time so it would
28 have to be the old people. When we talk of culture, we
29 look upon Aboriginal culture as going back, far back,
30 and today re-learning those things. It's centuries old,
31 40,000 years old. I mean, my mother probably could go
32 back as far as her grandmother, but way beyond that,
33 even before white men even put foot in South Australia,
34 that culture existed'. When you refer to your mother's
35 grandmother there, are you referring to Lartalare.
- 36 A. Yes.
- 37 Q. And, again, just to be clear, Lartalare, was not herself
38 from the Coorong, was she.

1 A. That's right.

2 Q. Can you tell the commissioner what is the importance of
3 re-learning a culture, when you say at the bottom of p.7
4 that today we are talking of re-learning those things.

5 Perhaps to help you, over on p.8 you say `It is very
6 important that we come back in touch with that culture'
7 and especially for young people. Can you tell the
8 commissioner what you mean by that.

9 A. To us, we're today living and working amongst our own
10 Aboriginal people, we are even learning ourselves some
11 of the language, some of the customs, and we believe
12 that if our young people was to re-learn their
13 Aboriginal culture it would help them to survive in the
14 society in which they live, where they seem to bring on
15 or get caught up with a lot of social problems. And we
16 believe that bringing back the Aboriginal culture would
17 help them in living a better life and having a better
18 understanding of themselves, because a lot of those
19 young people who are coming back are young people who
20 have been adopted out, fostered out, and are trying to
21 find their Aboriginality within their own Aboriginal
22 community. And so we believe that to re-learn the
23 culture would be a better way of life for them.

24 Q. When you say re-learn the culture, in the main you are
25 talking about people who've never had any opportunity to
26 learn the culture at all, is that right.

27 A. Not to learn the culture at all or haven't learnt it,
28 but to understand that white man took that culture from
29 us in the Protection Board days. We had no rights. And
30 so we have come, only 28 years, 29 years into the
31 future, whereby we can do our own thing, we can go back
32 and learn our culture, where we didn't have those
33 chances before. So this is a learning era for all of
34 us. While we have got our elders there, we respect them
35 and the knowledge that they have got to learn us some
36 things. And even me, at my age, I am still learning as
37 well.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 Q. So it was important at Graham's Castle, where some of
2 the other women informed - in fact, the majority of that
3 group - had not heard of that women's business, it was
4 important for them to hear that there had been women's
5 business on Hindmarsh Island.
- 6 A. Exactly. That was the whole reason for the meeting
7 being held, that the women who came down, the younger
8 women would, in time, get to learn of the women's
9 business, and that was just for Ngarrindjeri women only.
- 10 Q. It is for all Ngarrindjeri women.
- 11 A. For all Ngarrindjeri women.
- 12 Q. In time then it would be appropriate, in your view, that
13 all Ngarrindjeri women who wanted to would have that
14 knowledge.
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 Q. You would see that as a process that would restore some
17 important aspect of Aboriginality to the Aboriginal
18 community generally.
- 19 A. It would restore some of the Aboriginal culture back
20 into the Aboriginal community - the female community.
- 21 Q. You have mentioned in your statement that you attended a
22 reconciliation meeting. I think that is the barbecue
23 you were referring to a moment ago.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. That was in about April 1995, this year.
- 26 A. Yes. Yes, it would be about that.
- 27 Q. At that barbecue, Maggie Jacobs was there.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. This is on p.8 of your statement if you want to look at
30 it.
- 31 A. Yes.
- 32 Q. Dr Doreen Kartinyeri.
- 33 A. Yes.
- 34 Q. And Betty Fisher was there.
- 35 A. Yes.
- 36 Q. I think it was at that meeting that Dr Kartinyeri asked
37 Mrs Dorothy Wilson about whether she had been telling
38 Alan Campbell about the meetings.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. That's correct.
2 Q. Concerning women's business.
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. I think the meeting began with Dr Kartinyeri saying she
5 was not happy.
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Did she say why.
8 A. She said there was a traitor in the room, or someone had
9 been telling things.
10 Q. She mentioned, I think, Mrs Dorothy Wilson.
11 A. Yes.
12 Q. Did she say why she was calling her a traitor.
13 A. She said she had gone and told Alan, Chirpy Campbell,
14 things that were being said at the meetings, the
15 meetings that had been held about the women's business.
16 Q. What did Dorothy Wilson reply.
17 A. Dorothy said that she had told him and that she believed
18 that the truth was not being told, and Doreen asked her
19 to leave.
20 Q. And did she go.
21 A. She got up to go and I grabbed Dorothy's arm, told her
22 to sit down because, I said `We want to hear what you've
23 got to say'. So Dorothy said, you know, that she didn't
24 come down there to be persecuted, that she believed that
25 there was a fabrication of the story, of the women's
26 business, and that she had told Chirpy Campbell. And we
27 then - Doreen asked her to leave the room and we would
28 then make a decision as to what would happen if Dorothy
29 was allowed to stay in the meeting.
30 Q. Did Dr Kartinyeri explain what the problem was with
31 Dorothy mentioning it to Alan Campbell.
32 A. If you are a mature woman and you understand that the
33 meeting was about women's business, that if she had told
34 Chirpy what we were talking about in that meeting, then
35 what more - she knew the secret business, that if it had
36 been divulged in that meeting, what then would Chirpy
37 Campbell know? So we couldn't hold that trust any
38 longer.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 Q. But there had been no secret women's business divulged
2 in the meeting.

3 A. There hadn't been any divulged then, but we looked into
4 the future, and if it is something that she could go and
5 say to Chirpy regarding the women's business on the
6 surface that was said, and that was tip of the iceberg,
7 what more for the rest of the iceberg. It would have
8 broken all secrecy and that's something, as I said, is a
9 secret.

10 Q. Was it personal to women, was it.

11 A. Beg your pardon?

12 Q. Was it personal to women.

13 A. The whole meeting was personal to women.

14 Q. It was confidential in that way, but not secret women's
15 business at that time.

16 A. It wasn't secret women's business, but had we gone into
17 secret women's business, it may have been told. If
18 Chirpy was told the rest, what was at the beginning of
19 the meetings, what more for had we gone through the
20 other.

21 Q. Was it important that the group of women who had met
22 with Cheryl Saunders at Graham's Castle stood firm as a
23 group together. Was that considered important.

24 A. We stood firm as a group together until this part broke.
25 Dorothy herself even said that, you know, she was
26 willing to learn about it, to be involved with it. I
27 mean, that's fair enough, but I wouldn't even talk to my
28 brother, who was older than I am, about this stuff. So
29 when you tell a man those things that have been said in
30 the meeting then the trust is broken.

31 Q. It is a private matter, is that what you are saying.

32 A. It is, a very private matter.

33 Q. I think when you were on the tour of the island, when
34 Professor Saunders was there and Dr Fergie and all the
35 women, and indeed I think Mr George Trevorrow and Mr
36 Douglas Milera, there was an occasion during which you
37 all held hands and sang a hymn, is that right.

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

- 1 A. I wasn't in that group. I was back further in the Mouth
2 House. I didn't go out to that group.
- 3 Q. Was it only some women.
- 4 A. Some women went out.
- 5 Q. Did you know that they did that. Did you see them doing
6 that.
- 7 A. Yes, I saw it. I had asthma at that time so I was
8 sitting inside. I didn't go out.
- 9 Q. I think the women held hands in a circle with Professor
10 Saunders, is that right.
- 11 A. They did. They sat down there with her.
- 12 Q. And Mrs Maggie Jacobs led a hymn.
- 13 A. I don't know. I wasn't out there.
- 14 Q. You weren't there.
- 15 A. As I said, I sat in the Mouth House.
- 16 Q. Was there anything, as far as you know, significant in
17 the fact that they were all in a circle.
- 18 A. Well, I don't think there is anything significant. I
19 think just the fact that they were there and that it was
20 a good feeling to see that happen.
- 21 Q. Nothing that your sister Leila told you, for instance,
22 indicates that there is a significance about the circle
23 itself.
- 24 CONTINUED

1 A. No.

2 Q. Coming back then to the meeting at which Dorothy was
3 asked to leave, Dorothy, I think, explained that she had
4 told Alan Campbell because she wasn't sure whether it
5 was the truth or whether it was a fabrication; is that
6 what she did.

7 A. Dorothy said that she wanted the truth; she didn't know
8 whether it was true or not and she wanted the truth.
9 And Doreen said to me, you know, she couldn't divulge
10 the other, she wasn't going to speak to Dorothy because
11 of her speaking to Chirpy Campbell - and Chirpy was a
12 person we didn't respect anyway. I only respected him
13 because of his parents, who were beautiful people.

14 Q. I think you have mentioned it and certainly Mr Tom
15 Trevorrow mentioned it in his evidence that he had known
16 of secret women's beliefs for Ngarrindjeri women for a
17 long time.

18 A. I think we went over that earlier, yes.

19 Q. So, in what you are saying, it was known that men did
20 know of women's beliefs.

21 A. I feel that we have already discussed that. It's been
22 said many times over about men, you know, with the
23 women's business. I mean -

24 Q. You are agreeing with me.

25 A. There's no two ways about it. Men did not know of
26 women's business and women did not know of men's
27 business. You didn't know what took place. They were
28 secret on both sides and that's - it's the men don't run
29 and tell the women what they're going to do, or the
30 women didn't run and tell the men.

31 Q. So you don't know what it is they know that exists.

32 A. I know it exists. The same in the north, the men know
33 that the women's business exists and the women know the
34 men's business exists. There's no question about it.

35 Q. I think after the meeting wound up, there was a barbecue
36 lunch provided by the The Friends of Goolwa and
37 Kumarangk.

38 A. There was.

- 1 Q. Some of those were present at this meeting as well.
2 A. Some of those.
3 Q. The Friends -
4 A. The Friends of Kumarangk were present, the people - not
5 at the meeting, at the barbecue.
6 Q. At the barbecue, a lady got up to speak and -
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. And you learnt because she was introduced that she was
9 Betty Fisher.
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. I think prior to that, you had heard of Betty Fisher
12 from your friend Gloria Sparrow.
13 A. I did.
14 Q. What did Mrs Sparrow tell you.
15 A. Gloria said 'There's good news'. I said 'What?' Gloria
16 said 'Your mum, Koomi, gave information to that white
17 lady Lewis O'Brien knows, Betty Fisher'. I said 'Oh'.
18 She said 'It's to do with the Hindmarsh Island, with the
19 women's business'. I said 'Well, how do I find out
20 about it?'. She said 'I suppose you could ring Lewis
21 or talk to Lewis about it'.
22 Q. Did Mrs Sparrow tell you how she knew about it.
23 A. Lewis mentioned it to me she worked at the Kura Yerlo
24 Largs Bay Aboriginal Community Centre.
25 Q. She'd learnt from Lewis O'Brien that he had taken Betty
26 Fisher's material to the ALRM.
27 A. That is what I was led to believe.
28 Q. That is what Gloria told you.
29 A. Yes.
30 Q. I think you learnt about that prior to this barbecue
31 lunch in April 1995.
32 A. Yes.
33 Q. That is why you're interested in meeting Betty Fisher.
34 A. That's why I was interested in the person's name who I
35 got introduced.
36 Q. What did you do when she finished speaking.
37 A. When she walked away, I walked up and tapped her on the
38 shoulder and I said 'Hi, I'm Koomi's daughter Veronica',

1 and she was really pleased.

2 Q. What did she say.

3 A. She said 'I'm so pleased to meet you'. And I said 'I
4 believe you did an interview with my mum', and she said
5 'Yes'. I said 'I would like to see some of that stuff',
6 and she said 'By all means, I would love you to have a
7 look at some of it'. Then, I just said to Betty 'I will
8 contact you when, you know, I want to have a look at
9 it'. I didn't make a date with her there or anything, I
10 just left it and walked up and had my lunch.

11 Q. Did Betty Fisher tell you that she promised your mother
12 and Gladys Elphick that she would give the information
13 to you.

14 A. Betty said that the information - not Gladys, because
15 Gladys came from Point Pearce, she was Narrunga. Betty
16 was interested in what my mother had given her, that mum
17 wanted her, if ever she got to meet me, to hand some of
18 the stuff to me that she had given Betty. She knew that
19 Betty would keep it. I mean -

20 Q. Did you know whether your mother had told Betty Fisher
21 that she had daughters.

22 A. No, I don't know that. She may have. I mean, from the
23 audio tape that was played, I picked up on there that a
24 voice from my mother, the child that my mother spoke to
25 as being my daughter. And so Betty would have, may have
26 picked it up, I don't know. Mum did have two daughters.

27 Q. At that time that you were speaking to Betty, you knew
28 that Lewis O'Brien had taken the material to the ALRM.
29 Did you speak to Betty about that.

30 A. Not at the barbecue, no. It was a time to, you know,
31 enjoy yourself and I didn't want to get bogged down with
32 that kind of stuff there then.

33 Q. Did you ask Betty later for the material from your
34 mother.

35 A. It was some time after that barbecue that I rang Betty
36 and I said 'I would like to come down and see you', and
37 she said 'Yes', and 'That would be fine'. And I said
38 'That stuff of mum's', I said 'I would like to get a

- 1 copy of the letter'. She said `Ring the ALRM, they may
2 be able to give a copy to you'.
- 3 Q. You said `a copy of the letter'. What did you mean by
4 that.
- 5 A. Well, she said `the notes', so.
- 6 Q. Did she tell you that she had a notebook and a tape.
- 7 A. Well, she said `the notebook'. I don't know about the
8 tape, but she did say `the notebook'.
- 9 Q. So, she said for you to ring the ALRM. Did you do that.
- 10 A. Yes, I did, I rang up.
- 11 Q. Whom did you speak to.
- 12 A. Sandra Saunders.
- 13 Q. What did she say.
- 14 A. Sandra said `Yes, the stuff is here. I could get a copy
15 of this, the notes', and I said `I would like to read
16 them, being Rebecca Wilson's daughter'. I said `I
17 don't like the stuff circulating around and here am I,
18 her only living daughter, don't know what is in it or
19 what is going on'. I said `I'm hearing all of this
20 stuff about my mother, so I would like to have some
21 information on it too'.
- 22 Q. Did you tell Sandra Saunders that you knew about the
23 women's business from your sister Leila.
- 24 A. No, I didn't.
- 25 Q. Did you tell that to Betty Fisher.
- 26 A. I told Betty that I knew of the women's business. I
27 said - and I did say to her that some of the stuff that
28 was in that transcript was some stuff that my sister
29 told me.
- 30 Q. I think you have said that it's your opinion that your
31 mother wouldn't have told Betty everything.
- 32 A. Exactly.
- 33 Q. Why do you think that.
- 34 A. I say that because if people knew my mother really well,
35 I mean, she did interviews with Dr Faye Gale there along
36 with other Ngarrindjeri women in the University,
37 Adelaide University, and I know the old people's way and
38 mum would have kept to them: That you tell white men so

- 1 much and that's it, the rest you keep. Because that's
2 sacred business to Aboriginal people. You don't divulge
3 it. It's for us. And mum wouldn't have released the
4 secret sacred scuff. What Betty had, Betty would have
5 been pleased to get those as she was an amateur
6 historian and that would have been, in her day and time,
7 a lot of information and something that was big for her.
8 But mum kept things - I mean, mum lived at Raukkan all
9 her married life, so she didn't divulge the stuff there,
10 she kept it; as you know now, that she gave it to her
11 eldest daughter.
- 12 Q. When you talk about Aboriginal people not divulging all
13 of their knowledge to white people, you are not talking
14 there from your own experience, you are talking from
15 what you know from other Aboriginal people.
- 16 A. I'm talking from what I've been brought up.
- 17 Q. By whom.
- 18 A. To me by my mother in the past, my grandmother, what
19 other old Aboriginal people might have input in the
20 books and things. Well, that wasn't of my time.
- 21 Q. But, so I'm clear, I think you told the Commissioner
22 when you were growing up that you were not interested in
23 the culture.
- 24 A. Well, I wasn't - I had a different lifestyle.
- 25 Q. That is right, isn't it.
- 26 A. That was another generation before me. They didn't have
27 much education. But, my time, I had - my generation
28 gave me the opportunity to come away to learn what the
29 city and white men was all about, what white living was
30 all about. And so I did that, where my sister stayed on
31 the mission. She lived there until it was time for her
32 to move into the city when her children were all born
33 and growing up.
- 34 Q. You didn't ever get a copy of the material from the
35 ALRM.
- 36 A. I didn't get a copy from them, no.
- 37 Q. I think you were at a meeting at the Nunga's Club at
38 Murray Bridge at a time when the television crews were

1 attending.

2 A. Yes, I was.

3 Q. And Sandra Saunders was there.

4 A. Sandra was there and I asked her if she'd brought any of
5 the stuff with her and she said 'I have a copy in the
6 car'. That day, there was many Ngarrindjeri people
7 there and it was a big meeting and I was moving in and
8 out. And at the end of the day I thought 'I must get a
9 copy from Sandra', and so I walked out and hopped in the
10 car that I went up to the meeting in and I didn't pick
11 it up. I don't put the blame on anyone at that time for
12 not getting the stuff. But I rang Betty and, of course,
13 I waited a few weeks and I rang Betty and said 'Bet, I
14 haven't got a copy of the stuff', and she said 'I'll get
15 you one'.

16 Q. Did she do that.

17 A. She sent me a copy.

18 Q. What did she send you.

19 A. A copy of the stuff that I read on the 7.30 Report.

20 Q. That is the transcript of her notes.

21 A. That was some of the stuff that mum had told her.

22 Q. Did she also send you a letter relating astrology to the
23 women's business.

24 A. This was women's business all over the world. It was
25 stuff that she had written down. As you know, Betty is
26 involved with astrology, so that was just on women's
27 business all over the world what happens.

28 Q. But it was linking in, I think, with the Hindmarsh
29 Island women's business.

30 A. It wasn't linking in, but in the past in Aboriginal
31 culture, Aboriginal people did live by astrology.

32 Q. So, it does link in then with Hindmarsh Island.

33 A. It does link in with some of the Hindmarsh Island stuff.

34 Q. Do you have then a copy of the material and the letter.

35 A. I have a copy of that in my home somewhere. But like I
36 say, I was given short notice to hunt it up. And I have
37 many, many papers, many boxes of stuff, and I read
38 through as much as I could and in such a short time and

1 I could not find it.

2 Q. Does that apply both to the letter and to the pages of
3 transcript from the notebook.

4 A. Well, I would have had them here if I could find them.

5 Q. So, you didn't find them.

6 A. I would have brought them in if I could find them.

7 Q. Betty had told you of the content of her notebook.

8 A. Betty has not told me of the contents of that notebook.

9 It seems to be a burning question, the notebook.

10 Q. As far as you understand, you have said that the typed
11 transcript came from her notebook; is that right.

12 A. That's what Betty told me. She typed it from there so
13 that it could be used for the 7.30 Report.

14 Q. On the last topic, could you explain to the Commissioner
15 why you decided to come and give evidence before the
16 Commission.

17 A. Yes. I decided to come forward because I was sick and
18 tired of the personalising of Aboriginal women's lives,
19 of Aboriginal people who are dead and buried, of all the
20 rubbish that has gone on here. It was unfair to some of
21 those women that they take what was going outside from
22 here, and our culture in particular being searched,
23 researched by this, by this Commission. That it belongs
24 to us. It should stay with us. It's our own cultural
25 values are being, and our integrity was being questioned
26 here. And if we as true Ngarrindjeri and Aboriginal
27 people believe that our culture must go on and it must
28 live, we have had to fight for what is right and keep
29 these things. And I felt white men had no right to come
30 in and question like they did. Years ago had they done
31 that, what would have happened? When they were in the
32 tribal living, they would have speared them. They gave
33 a lot in the past. They gave a lot of stuff in the
34 past, in the books and the Museum, in the libraries and
35 wherever it is contains that stuff, that's why today
36 commonsense prevails, that it was kept as a secret and
37 that is where it should stay.

38 Q. When you are talking about things that should be kept

6303

CJ 66K

V.P. BRODIE XN (MRS SIMPSON)

1 secret, you are not referring to any of the matters that
2 have been touched on in this Commission relating to
3 women's business.
4 A. I'm not referring to any of that, I'm referring to the
5 secret women's business of Hindmarsh Island.
6 ADJOURNED 2.46 P.M.

- 1 RESUMING 2.55 P.M.
- 2 MS PYKE: There is something that I'm concerned
3 about that I wish to raise. You might recall that we
4 handed up to you a sealed envelope with certain
5 documents.
- 6 COMSR: That's right.
- 7 MS PYKE: We have some concerns, and I suppose I
8 just seek to have clarified that that confidentiality
9 has been maintained.
- 10 COMSR: It's locked away, I can assure you.
- 11 MS PYKE: And that in particular - I don't wish to
12 be rude - counsel assisting has not had access to it.
- 13 COMSR: Nobody has seen it but myself.
- 14 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR ABBOTT
- 15 Q. You gave evidence that on 23 April 1995 there was what
16 you call, what you describe in your statement as the
17 reconciliation meeting. Do you know the one that I'm
18 talking about.
- 19 A. The one at Graham's Castle, is that the one that you're
20 referring to?
- 21 Q. The reconciliation meeting at Graham's Castle, the one
22 that you spoke to Dorrie Wilson at.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. You said that Doreen - this is the effect of what your
25 evidence is, the effect of it was that there was an
26 accusation made by Doreen Kartinyeri against Dorrie
27 Wilson, that Dorrie Wilson had been leaking information
28 to Chirpy Campbell, do you remember that.
- 29 A. That's correct.
- 30 Q. You said, I think this is a fair summary, that really
31 Doreen wasn't saying that she had actually leaked any
32 information, but she was worried that she might do it
33 because of her relationship with Chirpy, is that what
34 you were getting at.
- 35 A. That's not what I said.
- 36 Q. Well, you tell me, what's the accusation.
- 37 A. No, you tell me what I said.
- 38 Q. No, you tell me. I wasn't there. (NOT ANSWERED)

1 COMSR

2 Q. Mr Abbott doesn't answer questions, he asks them.

3 A. Doreen said that Dorothy had leaked information to
4 Chirpy Campbell. She was asked and she admitted it.

5 XXN

6 Q. Any mention made of faxes.

7 A. Such as in?

8 Q. Just any mention made of faxes in connection with the
9 allegation about Dorrie leaking information.

10 A. No fax, just the fact that she had leaked information.

11 Q. You see, we have had some evidence of this meeting, and
12 that in fact the allegation that was made was that faxes
13 had been sent, unauthorised faxes, by Dorrie Wilson.

14 A. I did not see any fax.

15 Q. Did you hear of any.

16 A. No, I didn't hear any faxes.

17 Q. You did not hear that allegation at all.

18 A. No.

19 Q. That was not made, from your recollection, by Doreen.

20 A. Not at that meeting.

21 Q. The information that Doreen was talking about, as you
22 understood it, was the information that had been
23 imparted to the other Ngarrindjeri women on 19 June at
24 Graham's Castle.

25 A. I assumed that that would be the information that was
26 given to Chirpy.

27 Q. Doreen was pretty concerned about it, wasn't she.

28 A. She was.

29 Q. You've told us what that information was that Doreen
30 gave the other women on Sunday 19 June, haven't you.

31 A. I did.

32 Q. You've told us that basically that information was that
33 the whole area of the lower lakes resembled women's
34 reproductive organs.

35 A. There was nothing that wasn't said before.

36 Q. I know that, you've made that clear, but that was the
37 sort of information that you understood Dorrie Wilson
38 was accused of having leaked to Chirpy Campbell.

1 A. That's right.

2 Q. Doreen was very upset about that, wasn't she, at the
3 meeting.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. I suppose you were pretty upset too.

6 A. We weren't upset about the fact that that was told to
7 Chirpy, it was who told it and that that woman was
8 regarded as a Ngarrindjeri woman in our meetings, and
9 that the stuff that we was learning of and would learn
10 of in the near future, well, would have been for her
11 benefit.

12 Q. So it was a pretty important matter.

13 A. It was important.

14 Q. When you found that Doreen Kartinyeri was leaking that
15 information and more to the media, did you get upset.

16 A. Beg your pardon?

17 Q. When you learned that Doreen Kartinyeri was leaking this
18 information and more to the media, I suppose you got
19 pretty upset about that too.

20 A. I didn't get upset about it, because we gave Doreen the
21 permission to speak whenever.

22 Q. Did you get upset at all.

23 A. No, not when Doreen divulged anything.

24 Q. Because what, Doreen can say what she likes to whom.

25 A. She is Dr Doreen Kartinyeri.

26 Q. We know that, but is this your view; that Doreen
27 Kartinyeri can tell who she likes when she likes about
28 any aspect of women's business, and you won't be upset
29 about it.

30 A. No.

31 Q. That's your view.

32 A. Because we regard Doreen, and I regard Doreen, as the
33 person that would do that.

34 Q. So you know, don't you, that Doreen has told the media
35 on more than one occasion that the women's business that
36 concerns Hindmarsh Island, is that it, and the general
37 area, the contours, mirror the shape of female
38 reproductive organs. Doreen said that to the media on

- 1 more than one occasion.
- 2 A. I've read that Doreen has said that.
- 3 Q. Does that concern you.
- 4 A. But what relevance has that to what I'm here for?
- 5 Q. Nothing at all to what you're here for, but it's got a
- 6 lot of relevance.
- 7 A. Then I don't want to hear you.
- 8 Q. It's got a lot of relevance to what the Ngarrindjeri
- 9 women were told on the night of Sunday 19 June, because
- 10 that's exactly what they were told, isn't it.
- 11 A. Told what?
- 12 Q. Just that, namely that the shape of this area mirrors
- 13 women's reproductive organs.
- 14 A. She didn't say `mirrors'.
- 15 Q. But that's the effect of it. That's the effect of it,
- 16 isn't it.
- 17 A. She said - yes.
- 18 Q. Does it concern you that in a meeting that was supposed
- 19 to be private and confidential to Ngarrindjeri women on
- 20 the evening of 19 June 1994, Doreen Kartinyeri
- 21 subsequently told the world at large. Does that concern
- 22 you.
- 23 A. Did she?
- 24 Q. Does that concern you.
- 25 A. Did she tell the world at large at that time?
- 26 Q. Yes.
- 27 A. Who did she tell?
- 28 Q. Numerous reporter, Ray Martin.
- 29 A. On that night?
- 30 Q. No, later on.
- 31 A. I don't know anything of her interview with Ray Martin.
- 32 No, I'm a Ngarrindjeri woman and when I'm not involved
- 33 with the Hindmarsh Island stuff, I keep to myself.
- 34 Q. I just want to know whether it concerns you. I invite
- 35 you to assume that Doreen Kartinyeri -
- 36 A. If I was concerned, I would have taken it much further
- 37 than this with Doreen, if I was concerned.
- 38 Q. We can work on the basis, then, you're not concerned

1 about Doreen telling the world at large what the secret
2 women's business was so far as Doreen is concerned.

3 A. You do not understand that we gave her permission, she
4 is our spokesperson, so therefore I don't wish to answer
5 any more about my feelings of the stuff that Doreen has
6 spoken about, to the media or to whatever, because she
7 is our spokesperson.

8 COMSR

9 Q. Just so that I'm clear, as far as you're concerned, she
10 has authority to say what she feels is appropriate
11 whenever she feels and to whomever she considers it
12 appropriate.

13 A. To whom she considers are the right people to tell.

14 XXN

15 Q. I now want to ask you some questions about the women's
16 business that Doreen told the women on the night of 19
17 June 1994. It is clear from the questions Mrs Simpson
18 asked you that what the Ngarrindjeri women were told,
19 and what Professor Saunders was told, at least in your
20 hearing, was not the women's business that you claimed
21 to have knowledge of from your sister.

22 A. I do not know what Doreen had told Dr Professor
23 Saunders, because we gave her permission to speak to Dr
24 Saunders outside of the meeting that we held together
25 there at Graham's Castle.

26 Q. Well, put aside Professor Saunders. On the occasion of
27 19 June when you were present, and Doreen Kartinyeri
28 imparted to the Ngarrindjeri women then present, of
29 which you were one, what Doreen Kartinyeri was
30 describing as the secret women's business, that was not
31 the secret women's business which you claimed to have
32 knowledge of from your sister Leila, is it.

33 A. That's right.

34 Q. I want to ask you about that secret women's business
35 that you claim to have knowledge of, because you've told
36 us something of it, just so we can assess it against the
37 background of what Doreen has claimed at least publicly,
38 and on some occasions privately, as being the secret

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

- 1 sacred women's business. You only had one discussion
2 with your sister before she died about this topic.
- 3 A. That's correct.
- 4 Q. That occurred when you were in the same ward. You were
5 hospitalised in a bed suffering from an asthma attack,
6 is that right.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. So that's the occasion we're talking about on which your
9 sister chose to impart to you some of what she knew, or
10 perhaps all of what she knew about secret sacred women's
11 business and Hindmarsh Island.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. It is clear, is it not, that the discussion that you
14 claim your sister had with you is a discussion of
15 practices that women used to carry out on Hindmarsh
16 Island.
- 17 A. Well, I believe that's what women's business is all
18 about.
- 19 Q. Please, not what you believe, I'm not asking you about
20 your beliefs.
- 21 A. I cannot divulge that part of it.
- 22 COMSR
- 23 Q. No-one is asking you to divulge anything -
- 24 A. I will not speak on that.
- 25 Q. - more than you have, but what Mr Abbott is doing is
26 just trying to make it clear that that is the topic of
27 the discussion you had with your sister.
- 28 A. That's the discussion that Leila and I had together.
- 29 XXN
- 30 Q. Exactly, it was the practices that Leila told you had
31 occurred in the past on Hindmarsh Island.
- 32 A. Yes.
- 33 Q. Did she say that they had occurred anywhere else, or was
34 it only -
- 35 A. It wasn't relevant to anywhere else. We weren't
36 speaking of any other place -
- 37 Q. Well, did she say it occurred on the mainland.
- 38 A. - it occurred on Hindmarsh Island.

- 1 Q. Did she say that it occurred on the mainland.
2 A. No.
3 Q. Or Mundoo.
4 A. No.
5 Q. Or any other island.
6 A. No.
7 Q. So Leila told you of what you regard as secret practices
8 which she told you occurred only on Hindmarsh Island.
9 A. Yes.
10 Q. You know what a Dreaming is.
11 A. I know. I've heard of the Dreaming.
12 Q. Was the way in which Leila imparted this information
13 about these practices by way of a Dreaming story.
14 A. No.
15 Q. So it definitely wasn't a Dreaming story, was it.
16 A. No.
17 Q. The practices that she described involved only women.
18 A. Only women.
19 Q. Only taking place on Hindmarsh Island.
20 A. Yes.
21 Q. Always in the absence of men.
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. What she told you as being the secret sacred women's
24 business that was related to Hindmarsh Island was, as
25 you understood it, practices which had ceased many, many
26 years ago.
27 A. Yes.
28 Q. In fact, I think you were of the view that from what she
29 told you, they were practices which had ceased perhaps a
30 couple of hundred years ago.
31 A. Yes.
32 Q. So they were not within anyone's actual living memory.
33 A. Before white man put foot on Hindmarsh Island.
34 Q. Is this the situation; that Leila, having told you of
35 these very old practices which she said had occurred on
36 Hindmarsh Island, it's the detail of what those
37 practices were that you can't tell us.
38 A. That's right.

- 1 Q. Did she say whether they related to any particular part
2 of the year.
- 3 A. No, she didn't.
- 4 Q. Has anyone else ever told you that Ngarrindjeri women
5 went to Hindmarsh Island to perform certain practices.
- 6 A. No, apart from Doreen Kartinyeri.
- 7 Q. She hasn't told you that.
- 8 A. Doreen said that they practised women's business on
9 Hindmarsh Island. Not before Leila told me, no, I
10 hadn't heard it before.
- 11 Q. Since then, only Doreen Kartinyeri. She is the only
12 one.
- 13 A. Is she?
- 14 Q. She is the only one who has told you, isn't she.
- 15 A. Doreen hasn't told me of any practices on Hindmarsh
16 Island -
- 17 Q. I know she hasn't told you of the practices.
- 18 A. - of the women's business.
- 19 Q. She has told you that she knew of the existence of them.
- 20 A. She didn't say 'practices', she said she knew of the
21 women's business of Hindmarsh Island.
- 22 COMSR
- 23 Q. Just so that I'm clear, but she didn't detail what it
24 was.
- 25 A. She didn't detail anything, no.
- 26 XXN
- 27 Q. So the fact of the matter is only Leila has told you of
28 the existence, some hundreds of years ago, of practices
29 performed by women on Hindmarsh Island, only Leila.
- 30 A. Madam Commissioner can note that I refuse to answer any
31 more of Mr Abbott's questions on that area, because it
32 has been said and I have made that statement that Leila
33 was the only one who told me.
- 34 COMSR: I think what the witness is saying is
35 she has answered it already.
- 36 MR ABBOTT: I just wanted to make sure it wasn't
37 just then, but ever since, but I will take that as an
38 answer before or since.

1 XXN

2 Q. In relation to these practices that Leila told you
3 about, was the topic of aborting babies mentioned.

4 A. Leila mentioned it.

5 Q. In conjunction with practices.

6 A. In passing.

7 Q. Was it the abortion of only babies suspected of being
8 the product of relationships with white or partly white
9 people.

10 A. It wasn't because of the relationship, it was a part of
11 the Aboriginal history of Hindmarsh, about the raping of
12 the Aboriginal women by white men, and that those
13 fetuses were aborted.

14 COMSR

15 Q. I want to make it clear to the witness if she feels that
16 we're getting into an area of confidentiality, you will
17 tell me.

18 A. I will, yes. Its going over old ground that we have
19 done.

20 Q. I appreciate that that's your reason. (NOT ANSWERED)

21 XXN

22 Q. So Leila told you that Ngarrindjeri women used to go to
23 Hindmarsh Island for the purpose of aborting themselves,
24 or having others assist in the aborting of fetuses.

25 A. Yes.

26 Q. That's something that she put in the context of having
27 happened hundreds of years ago.

28 A. Hundreds of years ago, two hundred years ago maybe, when
29 Hindmarsh Island belonged to the Ngarrindjeri people.

30 Q. One of the other aspects of the practices that she spoke
31 about was something connected with the preparation for
32 womanhood. Do you remember telling us about that topic.

33 A. She said that it was for the preparation of womanhood.

34 Q. So she told you of a practice where Ngarrindjeri women
35 used to go to Hindmarsh Island, and only Hindmarsh
36 Island, in preparation to becoming a woman. That's
37 right.

38 A. I refuse to answer, we have been over this.

1 COMSR

2 Q. I know we have been over it, but does that mean you have
3 already answered it and the answer is yes.

4 A. Yes, I have already answered it.

5 COMSR: I think what the witness is saying is
6 that we have covered the ground already.

7 MR ABBOTT: It is important that I -

8 COMSR: Establish just what has been said.

9 MR ABBOTT: Just what it is that we need to respond
10 to, so that I can take some instructions.

11 WITNESS: Before Mr Abbott speaks, I would like to
12 say that when he speaks of practices and stuff, I will
13 not be divulging any of that information because -

14 COMSR: He hasn't asked that.

15 WITNESS: It is heading that way and I will refuse
16 to answer.

17 MR ABBOTT: I won't be, because the witness will
18 refuse to answer, and she has made it quite clear that
19 she will not be answering it.

20 COMSR: In any event, if we got that far so that
21 we were talking about anything that divulged any details
22 of secret women's business, clearly we would have to go
23 into private session which would exclude you, Mr Abbott.

24 XXN

25 Q. You told us, in giving your evidence, that you knew from
26 what - I'm not sure if it was from what Leila told you
27 or just generally, that is why I am asking you the
28 question - that Hindmarsh Island was also sacred to
29 secret men's business.

30 A. We all knew that.

31 Q. Sorry.

32 A. We knew that.

33 Q. Did Leila tell you that.

34 A. Yes, Leila told me that, but I knew before, as I
35 explained in an earlier session.

36 Q. So you are telling us, as a representative of
37 Ngarrindjeri women, that Hindmarsh Island was sacred
38 because it had secret women's practices conducted on it,

1 and it had secret men's practices also conducted on it.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. But on different sides, I think you said.

4 A. Yes, on a different side.

5 Q. Which side was the men's side.

6 A. I wasn't there, I couldn't tell you.

7 Q. I am just wondering if you have been told.

8 A. Sorry, Mr Abbott, I wasn't there, I couldn't tell you.

9 COMSR

10 Q. I think it was your understanding -

11 A. It was my understanding. It could be on four sides of

12 the island. Who knows? They may have taken a turn

13 around.

14 XXN

15 Q. The other aspect was that you told us that the water

16 or the waters were sacred.

17 A. I did say that.

18 Q. Why. Why were they sacred.

19 A. They were mentioned to me and they were also mentioned

20 in the transcript that was read on the 7.30 Report.

21 They are a life force -

22 Q. That's why they are sacred.

23 A. To the island.

24 Q. That's why they are sacred.

25 A. That's why they're sacred.

26 Q. No other reason.

27 A. I wouldn't divulge that anyway.

28 Q. You are not claiming any other reason.

29 A. Beg your pardon?

30 Q. You are not claiming any other reason, are you.

31 A. I didn't say that.

32 Q. Well, are you.

33 A. Am I?

34 Q. I am asking you are you claiming any other reason.

35 A. I said I would not divulge any - there are other

36 reasons, but I will not be divulging that.

37 Q. So it is not just the reason that they were a life force

38 that the waters were sacred.

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. There is other reasons which you are not going to tell
3 us.
- 4 A. No, that's right.
- 5 Q. Are these other reasons - well, could you just tell us
6 why is it that you can tell us one of the reasons why
7 the waters are sacred but not others.
- 8 A. Do you respect Aboriginal culture at all?
- 9 MR ABBOTT: I ask the witness answer the question.
- 10 A. It is a vital question and -
- 11 COMSR
- 12 Q. Just a moment, are you able to answer that question.
- 13 A. No, I won't answer it. I mean, I gave the bit of the
14 life force around the island, Hindmarsh Island, but the
15 waters, no, I won't go into that.
- 16 XXN
- 17 Q. I am wondering why you gave us one of the reasons why
18 the waters were sacred, but you won't give us the
19 others. Why can you give us the one. What permission -
- 20 A. Because that's involved with the secret women's
21 business.
- 22 Q. I know, but doesn't the fact -
- 23 A. I'm sorry, I cannot divulge and I will not answer.
- 24 Q. Doesn't the fact that the waters are a life force to
25 women result in you divulging secret women's business
26 that Leila told you.
- 27 A. I'm sorry, I cannot speak on that.
- 28 COMSR
- 29 Q. I don't think Mr Abbott is trying to extract any more
30 information, but what he is putting to you is this: how
31 are you able to tell us about one reason why the waters
32 are sacred, why can you divulge that, and yet not be
33 able to tell us of any other reason.
- 34 A. Because, commissioner, the story with the waters of
35 things that took place, that I cannot divulge, that
36 carries on from why the waters are a life force to the
37 Ngarrindjeri women and the people.

1 XXN

2 Q. So you can tell us the waters are sacred because the
3 water is a life force, and that is not a secret sacred
4 matter.

5 A. Don't you respect Aboriginal culture?

6 Q. Mrs Brodie, I do. I am just trying to establish the
7 extent to which you are able to tell us or not tell us
8 about Aboriginal culture.

9 A. I will not divulge the secrets that the waters hold, and
10 that's as far as I will answer that.

11 Q. I am not asking that. That is not my question.

12 A. I'm sorry, that is what you are getting at and I refuse
13 to answer.

14 COMSR

15 Q. I think you are looking ahead one question. I think you
16 are thinking 'If I answer this, then the next question
17 is going to lead - '

18 A. That's what it is going to lead into. I'm sorry.

19 XXN

20 Q. Can you tell us -

21 A. I am not going to divulge why the waters are - I told
22 you they were a life force, and I'm not going to go on
23 any further.

24 Q. My question is, given that you can tell us that much,
25 does that mean that the statement that you've made that
26 the waters are a life force to Ngarrindjeri women is not
27 secret sacred information and never has been.

28 A. Well, it is not secret to say that it's a life force to
29 the Ngarrindjeri women, but to go into it and find out
30 why would be divulging the secret - a part of the
31 secret, and I don't wish to do that.

32 Q. Because, quite clearly, you are able to tell anyone who
33 asks that the waters around the island are a spiritual
34 life force, aren't you.

35 A. Yes.

36 Q. There is nothing secret or sacred about that claim.

37 A. No, no.

38 Q. Never has been. (NOT ANSWERED)

1 Q. Never has been.

2 A. Hasn't it?

3 Q. I am asking you, there never has been.

4 A. I said that it was a part of the secret women's
5 business, so it would have been and it was.

6 Q. Did Leila give you permission to divulge that portion of
7 the secret women's business that she told you.

8 A. Leila told me that, if ever I spoke about it, I could
9 speak on whichever I felt was right. The secret stuff
10 was for my daughters and for Aboriginal - for the
11 Ngarrindjeri women who wanted, deep down, to learn it.
12 And if there are women, Ngarrindjeri women, who don't
13 want to learn it, then they don't have to.

14 COMSR

15 Q. Can I take it from this that if you have told us about
16 it, then you don't consider that it is secret.

17 A. A secret any more. It would be the same if it was
18 spoken about at Graham's Castle, it would have got back
19 to Chirpy Campbell, and it wouldn't have been a secret -
20 women's secret any more. So we would have lost another
21 part of our culture, another part of our Aboriginal
22 women's culture.

23 XXN

24 Q. Part of these women's practices conducted only on
25 Hindmarsh Island, which fall within the category of the
26 secret sacred women's business, concerned women being
27 informed as to who they could or couldn't marry, didn't
28 it.

29 A. I'm not divulging that.

30 Q. You are not. That's part of the secret sacred -

31 A. As I said earlier, women were prepared for womanhood,
32 and marriage, and what took place there was told to me,
33 but I am not divulging it, I'm sorry.

34 Q. But didn't it relate to topics like who you could or
35 couldn't marry.

36 A. I refuse to answer.

37 Q. Do you. That's part of the secret sacred practices, is
38 it.

1 A. I refuse to answer.

2 Q. It is on p.11 of your statement.

3 A. Is it?

4 COMSR

5 Q. I understood that as far as you were concerned, when I

6 asked was there anything in your statement that could

7 not be heard publicly, you weren't asking for a private

8 hearing in respect of any of that. (NOT ANSWERED)

9 XXN

10 Q. `Betty Fisher was right when she said the women's

11 business related to topics such as who you could and

12 couldn't marry'. You just told me you can't reveal that

13 because it is secret sacred women's business.

14 A. That was history of the Ngarrindjeri nation, that you

15 could marry only within the Ngarrindjeri nation and not

16 outside of it. These Ngarrindjeri women all sitting

17 here all know that.

18 Q. Excuse me, you just told me -

19 A. I know you were getting at the other stuff.

20 COMSR

21 Q. Will you listen to Mr Abbott's question, and we will see

22 where it is going.

23 XXN

24 Q. You just told me that part of the information you

25 couldn't reveal relating to the secret practices. The

26 women's secret practices conducted only on Hindmarsh

27 Island as to whether or not they related to who the

28 women could or couldn't marry, you told me that.

29 A. There was -

30 Q. You refused to answer that question, remember.

31 A. There were two situations of the Ngarrindjeri nation:

32 Who you could marry, who you couldn't. The other thing,

33 preparing a woman for marriage that was involved with

34 the secret women's business, that I cannot reveal. The

35 Ngarrindjeri, yes, they believed that you couldn't marry

36 outside. They told you to marry. It would keep the

37 bloodline running.

38 Q. That's the secret sacred women's business that relates

1 to that topic, is it.

2 A. No. I didn't say that.

3 Q. You see, you have spoken of these practices -

4 COMSR: If we are going to talk about, as I have
5 said before, anything which the witness claims is secret
6 and sacred, then I would take that at face value and
7 hear the evidence in closed session.

8 XXN

9 Q. But there is nothing in your statement, is there, that
10 requires a closed session.

11 A. There isn't anything in my statement for a closed
12 session.

13 Q. Why wouldn't you answer my question before when I asked
14 you -

15 A. Because you were -

16 Q. Excuse me, whether the topic of who a Ngarrindjeri woman
17 could or couldn't marry was part of the secret women's
18 practices conducted on Hindmarsh Island.

19 A. You were relating to women's business on Hindmarsh
20 Island, and I had also mentioned that - in here that it
21 prepared them for marriage, who they could marry and
22 not. I was talking about the history of the
23 Ngarrindjeri nation, the marriage lines that you know
24 who and not to marry.

25 Q. Your statement says 'Betty Fisher was right when she
26 said the women's business related to topics such as who
27 you could and couldn't marry'. You are clearly -

28 A. There is other things to that.

29 Q. You are clearly inviting the reader -

30 A. There are other things to that.

31 Q. I will finish my question. If you just listen. You are
32 clearly inviting the reader to accept that Betty Fisher
33 is right in claiming that secret women's business
34 related to Hindmarsh Island involved topics such as who
35 a woman could and couldn't marry, aren't you.

36 A. I said yes in my statement, but the practices, I can't
37 tell you that. That's what you want to know.

38 Q. No, it is not.

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

- 1 A. And I cannot divulge that, and I'm not going to. You
2 want to know that, what took place, that those women
3 were told who they could marry and who they couldn't.
- 4 Q. No, I don't want to know, because I suggest to you you
5 made it up.
- 6 A. No, I didn't. I didn't.
- 7 COMSR: Just a moment. The women in the rear
8 would you mind being quiet.
- 9 WITNESS: If I get that kind of thing from Mr
10 Abbott, I will refuse to go on, to carry on. I'm sorry.
- 11 COMSR
- 12 Q. I think Mr Abbott has made it clear that he is not going
13 to seek details of it. I had understood, when I asked
14 if you wanted this evidence taken in a confidential
15 session, that you had told counsel assisting that you
16 were quite happy for it to be in a public hearing, and I
17 have accepted that. So that if it is in your statement,
18 I understand that, to that extent at least, you don't
19 consider that it reveals any specifics of any secret
20 women's business.
- 21 A. I don't see that a closed session would have, you know,
22 made any difference. I mean, there are people here who
23 believe in the secret women's business.
- 24 Q. It could be a closed session for women only.
- 25 A. I wouldn't even divulge it then. I mean, I said to my
26 sister on her death bed that I would not reveal that,
27 and I think that it is very rude of the commission to
28 expect me to reveal what my sister had conveyed to me
29 from my mother. I mean, it is a cultural thing.
- 30 Q. You are not being asked to reveal the details of it.
- 31 A. No, but I am saying, you know, it is a cultural thing
32 and I know what Mr Abbott is getting at.
- 33 XXN
- 34 Q. Have you heard of any Aboriginal legend covering the
35 Lower Murray area, that area of the map on the wall
36 there, as being a mother figure.
- 37 A. As being a mother figure?
- 38 Q. Yes.

- 1 A. That area?
2 Q. Yes.
3 A. No.
4 Q. Never heard of that.
5 A. It could have been mentioned as part of where the women
6 did their secret business as the mother area.
7 Q. You have never heard of it.
8 A. I mean, many things were said. You don't expect me to
9 remember everything in detail.
10 Q. No, I am just wondering whether you ever heard of any
11 Aboriginal legend which covers this area as being a
12 mother figure.
13 A. I haven't heard of a legend, no.
14 Q. A Dreaming story, a story, an account, a claim.
15 A. I do know of a Dreaming story of Hindmarsh Island.
16 Q. Is that the one you heard from your sister, or is this
17 another Dreaming story.
18 A. It is one I heard from my sister.
19 Q. Have you heard a Dreaming story of Hindmarsh Island from
20 anyone else.
21 A. No.
22 Q. I thought you told me it wasn't a Dreaming story that
23 you heard from your sister.
24 A. I didn't say that.
25 Q. Not only did she tell you about practices that occurred
26 between women only on Hindmarsh Island, but she also
27 told you of a Dreaming story, did she.
28 A. She did.
29 Q. Did the Dreaming story that she told you in any way
30 involve a claim or a story that the area was like a
31 mother figure.
32 A. No, she didn't.
33 Q. No Dreaming story or account or claim that the Murray
34 Mouth was the vagina, Hindmarsh Island was the womb,
35 Mundoo Island the egg.
36 A. That was said to me.
37 Q. By Leila.
38 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. As part of her Dreaming story.
2 A. As part of the secret women's business.
3 COMSR
4 Q. Why is it no longer secret now.
5 A. Beg your pardon?
6 Q. It is no longer secret now.
7 A. It is no longer secret now, but the deep secret women's
8 business is what you are after and you are not going to
9 get, I'm sorry.
10 XXN
11 Q. I assure you I am not after it.
12 A. I am sorry.
13 Q. My submission will be that it doesn't exist.
14 A. I beg your pardon? I beg your pardon?
15 Q. You understand what I have read out.
16 A. I understand what you read out.
17 Q. Do you know where it came from.
18 A. It came from the old Ngarrindjeri women that were there
19 before white man ever put foot on Hindmarsh Island. Can
20 you understand Aboriginal culture?
21 Q. But it was handed down -
22 A. I have asked you that many times.
23 Q. It was handed down to you by your sister Leila.
24 A. And, therefore, I shouldn't be questioned in a hearing
25 like this what my sister gave to me.
26 Q. In fact, this Dreaming story that your sister told you
27 was of the Lower Murray area, including Hindmarsh Island
28 being a mother figure, with the Murray Mouth as the
29 vagina, the Hindmarsh Island as the womb, Mundoo
30 Island the egg, the rivers and the lakes -
31 OBJECTION Ms Pyke objects.
32 MS PYKE: She distinctly said it wasn't put to
33 her as a mother figure, and it is quite different,
34 female anatomy doesn't necessarily mean a mother figure.
35 MR ABBOTT: I accept that.
36 COMSR: Where is this quote coming from?
37 MR ABBOTT: Rocky Marshall's letter to the editor.

- 1 XXN
2 A. That's a white woman's version of it.
3 Q. It is one that you said your sister had passed on.
4 A. It was a white woman's version, but when it was told to
5 me it was told by an Aboriginal woman.
6 Q. Does it make any difference.
7 A. A big difference.
8 Q. Are the versions the same.
9 A. It makes a big difference when it is told to you by your
10 own, because it is told in a much more sensitive manner.
11 Q. Did she tell you any other Dreaming stories.
12 A. If you was able to get hold of the ABC tapes - video
13 tapes, you would know that my sister told Dreaming
14 stories on the ABC.
15 Q. What Dreaming stories did she tell on the ABC.
16 A. All I'm going to answer: that's for you to find out, is
17 that she told stories.
18 Q. They wouldn't be secret.
19 A. On the ABC?
20 Q. If she told them on the ABC.
21 A. Of course they're not secret. You asked me if she told
22 any more Dreaming stories. Where are you coming from?
23 Q. To you, when you are sitting alongside her hospital bed.
24 A. No, that's not what you said. You just asked me if she
25 told me any other Dreaming stories.
26 Q. You are quite right. I must confine my questions more
27 appropriately.
28 CONTINUED

- 1 A. Please do.
- 2 Q. When you were in the next bed or in the same ward in the
3 hospital, did she tell you any other dreaming stories.
- 4 A. No, she didn't.
- 5 Q. This is the only one she told you that was related to
6 Hindmarsh Island.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. When you heard Doreen Kartinyeri make a similar claim to
9 the women on 19 June 1994, did you say anything to
10 Doreen about having heard that story before.
- 11 A. I said to Doreen that I knew of the secret women's
12 business.
- 13 Q. You were referring to what Doreen had just told the
14 women.
- 15 A. No, I wasn't.
- 16 Q. What, something else.
- 17 A. I was referring to what Leila told me. I have said this
18 before -
- 19 Q. Part of what -
- 20 A. Which I wish to reiterate.
- 21 Q. Part of what Leila told you as being this secret sacred
22 women's business in relation to Hindmarsh Island was
23 this dreaming story, wasn't it.
- 24 A. Beg your pardon?
- 25 Q. Part of what Leila told you as being secret sacred
26 women's business relating to Hindmarsh Island was this
27 dreaming story.
- 28 A. No, it didn't - it's a part, the dreaming is part of it.
29 Same as you get with the northern women's dreaming
30 stories which - would you dispute the fact up there that
31 their dreaming is all a myth and a legend, that there is
32 nothing for them there?
- 33 Q. You were prepared to tell the women what you knew about
34 secret sacred women's business.
- 35 A. No, I wasn't. No, I was not.
- 36 Q. This is on 19 June.
- 37 A. No, I wasn't prepared to tell them of the secret sacred
38 stuff.

- 1 Q. Did you suggest to the women that Doreen would be able
2 to tell them.
- 3 A. It wasn't my role to suggest that. Doreen was there
4 doing her part. I just let the women know that I knew
5 of -
- 6 Q. You what -
- 7 A. I just let the women know in the room there that I knew
8 of the secret women's business, that my sister had told
9 me, and I wouldn't divulge any more than that.
- 10 Q. Was Dr Deane Fergie present.
- 11 A. When was this?
- 12 Q. 19 June, the night before Professor Saunders.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. You said to the women `If you want to know all these
15 details about the secret sacred women's business, ask
16 Doreen'. Did you.
- 17 A. Beg your pardon?
- 18 Q. Did you say to the women that Doreen knows all about the
19 secret sacred women's business.
- 20 A. No, I didn't. No, I didn't.
- 21 Q. Did you say to the women `If you want to know about all
22 the details, it's up to Doreen'.
- 23 A. No, I didn't.
- 24 COMSR
- 25 Q. Did you say something.
- 26 A. Doreen was in charge down there and when I said that I
27 knew of the secret women's business, I said `It's up to
28 Doreen to tell you if she wants to'. But I would not
29 divulge it because that takes years of learning.
- 30 Q. That is what you told the women on this occasion.
- 31 A. Yes.
- 32 XXN
- 33 Q. You never heard her divulge the secret sacred business;
34 you told us you never heard her, Doreen, divulge the
35 secret sacred women's business that you know.
- 36 A. It wasn't divulged by me.
- 37 Q. More by Doreen to the women.
- 38 A. More by Doreen?

1 Q. Doreen never told the women about it.

2 A. Doreen said that when the time is right, she would tell
3 the women. That is not something you learn in a day or
4 overnight.

5 COMSR

6 Q. Why do you say that.

7 A. Well, if you learn about Aboriginal culture - as I said,
8 I'm getting on in years and there's things that I still
9 have to learn. And some people may be able to go in and
10 swiftly learn it overnight.

11 Q. About the women's business.

12 A. About the women's business. But when you teach young
13 women about women's business, it can take many years to
14 learn. Because there's a lot of - as I said in my
15 statement, there's a lot of spiritual growth that has to
16 go with it.

17 XXN

18 Q. In relation to this women's business - I don't want to
19 go over old ground - your claim is that it has been
20 handed down on your mother's side by the women. It has
21 to be, by its very nature, doesn't it.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Do you claim that you are - that on your mother's side
24 you are descended from Ngarrindjeri women.

25 A. I am descended from a Kurna woman.

26 Q. You are descended from Rebecca Lartelare, Granny
27 Glanville.

28 A. Yes.

29 Q. She was your great-grandmother.

30 A. Yes.

31 Q. She was entirely Kurna, not Ngarrindjeri.

32 A. Yes.

33 Q. Your grandmother Laura Spender.

34 A. Yes.

35 Q. She also was entirely Kurna.

36 A. Yes.

37 Q. She married a Ngarrindjeri man.

38 A. She did.

- 1 Q. Your mother Rebecca Wilson was Kurna on the mother's
2 side and, therefore, Ngarrindjeri on the father's side.
- 3 A. That's correct.
- 4 Q. You are Ngarrindjeri by virtue of having a Ngarrindjeri
5 father.
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 Q. Do you suggest that there is any room in that genealogy
8 for women's business specific to Ngarrindjeri women to
9 be handed down that line.
- 10 A. Can you repeat that?
- 11 Q. Yes. What you have just told us about is a Kurna line
12 of women.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Where does Ngarrindjeri women's business come into the
15 Kurna line.
- 16 A. Did you understand what I spoke about earlier when I
17 said about things being handed down on the Ngarrindjeri
18 women's side? Did you understand that?
- 19 Q. Yes, I did. I'm putting to you -
- 20 A. I don't want to go over old ground.
- 21 Q. You don't have a Ngarrindjeri women's side is what I'm
22 putting to you.
- 23 A. It has been said that it's handed down to Ngarrindjeri
24 women only when they know the time is right.
- 25 Q. My question is -
- 26 A. It doesn't have to be.
- 27 Q. My question to you is: You don't have a Ngarrindjeri
28 women's side.
- 29 A. Should I?
- 30 Q. Well, on your -
- 31 A. I don't - the matrilineal side's on the Ngarrindjeri
32 side and I have matrilineal on the mother's side.
- 33 Q. She was Kurna.
- 34 A. Which is Kurna, but I was born Ngarrindjeri.
- 35 Q. I could understand it if you said you were the recipient
36 of Kurna women's business.
- 37 A. I am trying to say that I'm not Kurna, I'm Ngarrindjeri.
- 38 Q. I'm saying that you are both.

- 1 A. Thank you.
2 Q. As you say -
3 A. Thank you very much.
4 Q. As you claim, do you not, you claim to be both.
5 A. I am both, yes.
6 Q. You are Ngarrindjeri on your father's side and Kurna on
7 your mother's side.
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. That is what you claim.
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. Where does the Ngarrindjeri women's business come into
12 in when -
13 A. That is irrelevant.
14 Q. On the female side.
15 A. That is irrelevant to what you are speaking about.
16 Q. That is exclusively Kurna.
17 A. I refuse to answer the question. That is all on how
18 would the Ngarrindjeri women's business be handed down,
19 so I refuse to answer any more of that rubbish. But
20 you're just -
21 Q. I know how Ngarrindjeri is handed down, it is handed
22 down from one Ngarrindjeri to another.
23 A. Why ask me?
24 Q. You don't have any Ngarrindjeri women.
25 A. Haven't we? In -
26 Q. Which of your ancestors -
27 COMSR
28 Q. I think Mr Abbott means in your family, being your
29 mother, grandmother and great-grandmother. I think that
30 is being put to you.
31 A. Yes.
32 XXN
33 Q. Which one of those do you claim was a Ngarrindjeri
34 woman.
35 A. In my family?
36 Q. Yes.
37 A. All my daughters. They are of me.
38 Q. In your ancestry.

- 1 A. My father. Father, grandfather, great-grandfather,
2 great-grandmother. You saw Bessy Wilson, Dan Wilson,
3 they were Ngarrindjeris.
- 4 Q. You have claimed to be not just the recipient of
5 Ngarrindjeri secret women's business, but also Kurna
6 secret women's business, haven't you.
- 7 A. Did I say Kurna secret women's business?
- 8 Q. I'm asking you.
- 9 A. No, I did not say that.
- 10 Q. What about the Glanville project.
- 11 A. What about the Grenville project? This is irrelevant to
12 the Hindmarsh Island secret women's business, and I
13 refuse to answer.
- 14 Q. I'll move on to another topic if that is the response.
15 You say in your statement that Mundoo is the death
16 island. Where did you ever learn that.
- 17 A. Beg your pardon?
- 18 Q. Mundoo is the death island.
- 19 A. Mundoo was the death island.
- 20 Q. Was, yes. Where did you learn that from.
- 21 A. When I was a kid down the Coorong with my grandparents
22 and my parents.
- 23 Q. They told you that.
- 24 A. They mentioned it.
- 25 Q. That Hindmarsh Island was the life island.
- 26 A. I didn't say Hindmarsh Island was the life island.
- 27 Q. I'm asking you was that said.
- 28 A. No, that wasn't said.
- 29 Q. You see, well, was there any claim made of somewhere
30 being life and somewhere being death to you when you
31 were young.
- 32 A. No.
- 33 Q. The claim of Ngarrindjeri women going to Hindmarsh
34 Island to abort foetuses, did you first hear of that
35 from your sister Leila.
- 36 A. When I heard this, this was before Leila ever said
37 anything to me. There was the history of our
38 Ngarrindjeri women being raped down at Hindmarsh Island

1 by white men.

2 Q. Raped on Hindmarsh Island.

3 A. Goolwa. Goolwa. There was a big camp there and women
4 were raped and they would go across to Hindmarsh Island
5 and abort the babies.

6 Q. Who told you that.

7 A. I read it.

8 Q. Where.

9 A. I read of it.

10 Q. Where.

11 A. Years ago. Don't ask me where, what book I read it out
12 of.

13 COMSR

14 Q. So that wasn't anything that was secret.

15 A. It wasn't the secret sacred women's business.

16 XXN

17 Q. Did you read anything else about Hindmarsh Island in the
18 book.

19 A. It related to the history.

20 Q. Did you read anything else about Hindmarsh Island and
21 its connection with Ngarrindjeri culture in this book.

22 A. I didn't read. I knew from what was said that Hindmarsh
23 Island belonged to the Ngarrindjeri people.

24 Q. Please, the book that you read that you cannot remember
25 the name of, you told us that it contained the -

26 A. I've read many books over the years on Aboriginal
27 history.

28 Q. I'm not pursuing that issue. I'm asking you whether the
29 book, the book that contained the claim that
30 Ngarrindjeri -

31 A. The book was stated in Aboriginal history about the
32 Coorong and about Hindmarsh Island and Goolwa. And a
33 big camp was there and Amelia Park and Aboriginal women
34 were raped and went across to the island to abort the
35 babies because of the shame of being raped by white men.

36 COMSR

37 Q. What Mr Abbott was saying is that was not the only thing
38 that was in the book.

- 1 A. There was lots of other Aboriginal history in there.
2 These were just bits and pieces.
3 XXN
4 Q. Anything else related to Hindmarsh Island.
5 A. No, nothing else related to Hindmarsh.
6 Q. You may have answered this already. You said that the
7 old people looked upon the waters around Hindmarsh
8 Island as a spiritual life force that was part of the
9 secret sacred business that you learnt from your sister.
10 Do you remember telling us about that.
11 A. Mr Abbott, you are not listening, are you. I'm sorry, I
12 said that before. The life force around the island -
13 and I didn't mention the old people. I wasn't saying
14 that. I refuse to answer any more on that one.
15 Q. Well, your statement at p.7 does, four lines from the
16 bottom.
17 A. I said the waters are very spiritual.
18 Q. You said `The old people looked upon the waters as a
19 spiritual life force'. What `old people' are you
20 talking about.
21 A. That would have been the old people before white man put
22 foot on Hindmarsh Island.
23 Q. Male and female.
24 A. Female.
25 Q. What, male and female.
26 A. Female.
27 Q. Only female.
28 A. As stated in the transcript read on the 7.30 Report,
29 that is the waters around the island in relation to the
30 women's business were a life support for -
31 Q. It's just that you haven't claimed any gender
32 singularity with reference -
33 A. Should I be?
34 Q. With reference to this claim that the waters were
35 considered a spiritual life force. You have just
36 referred to the old people.
37 OBJECTION Miss Pyke objects.
38 MS PYKE: That should be read in context with `The

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

1 water between Goolwa and Hindmarsh Island and the waters
2 that surround the island are sacred and the women, the
3 old people, looked upon the waters as a spiritual life
4 force'. I think it should be read in context.

5 XXN

6 Q. The next sentence we are talking about the 'old people'.

7 It says: 'It didn't happen in my time or my sister's
8 time, so it would have to be the old people'. Are you
9 inferring we should read that in respect or with
10 reference to the old people.

11 A. I say that you should read it with respect and not
12 question the old people.

13 COMSR

14 Q. When you say 'old people' which old people are you
15 talking about.

16 A. When I am talking about 'old people', I am talking about
17 not like white people and saying the elderly, I'm
18 talking about the old people that lived well before my
19 mother's time.

20 XXN

21 Q. Exactly. Both male and female.

22 A. I'm saying old people. I can't determine that that was
23 male or female. I'm saying the old people that I put
24 there.

25 COMSR: I think that is as far as you can take
26 it.

27 MR ABBOTT: That is all I want to take it. That is
28 the only reason I asked the question.

29 WITNESS: Can I have a break?

30 ADJOURNED 3.50 P.M.

31 RESUMING 3.58 P.M.

32 XXN

33 Q. In April 1995, you first met Betty Fisher.

34 A. Beg your pardon?

35 Q. In April 1995, you first met Betty Fisher, did you not.

36 A. Is that the barbecue?

37 Q. Yes. That is the day you are talking about.

38 A. Yes.

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

- 1 Q. Do you claim that Betty Fisher said to you that she had
2 promised your mother and Gladys Elphick that she, Betty
3 Fisher, would give information to you. Is that what she
4 said to you.
- 5 A. Betty did not mention Gladys Elphick. Gladys Elphick has
6 nothing to do with me, where I come from, she's another
7 line, the Narrunga.
- 8 Q. Did Betty Fisher say to you 'I promised Koomi and Gladys
9 that I would give the information to you'.
- 10 A. No, she did not.
- 11 Q. What is it doing in your statement at p.10.
- 12 A. She said 'I have stuff written of your mother's, Koomi's
13 and Gladys' -
- 14 Q. But -
- 15 A. If you listen and let me finish.
- 16 Q. Look at p.10 of your statement -
- 17 A. Please let me finish.
- 18 Q. P.10 of your -
- 19 A. Fine. I refuse to answer. I refuse to carry on.
- 20 COMSR: Providing that is response to your
21 question.
- 22 MR ABBOTT: It might be quicker to let her answer.
- 23 A. It may be what Betty Fisher said. She had information
24 that was given to her by Gladys and Koomi, she said, and
25 she approached them, particularly Koomi - but you don't
26 remember these things when you put them in there. There
27 have been many days of me doing my statement here and
28 going over things of what Betty said with my mother.
- 29 XXN
- 30 Q. When you decided to give evidence and presented yourself
31 to the Royal Commission for the first time, there was,
32 immediately following, a meeting you had with Doreen
33 Kartinyeri and Sandra Saunders, wasn't there.
- 34 A. No, it wasn't. I beg your pardon. I'll have to call
35 you a liar. It was not.
- 36 Q. Did you discuss -
- 37 A. No, I did not discuss this with anyone. I'm sorry, but
38 you're speaking out of line.

- 1 Q. Did you discuss your decision to come to the Royal
2 Commission with Doreen Kartinyeri.
3 A. No, I've not spoken to Doreen for some time.
4 Q. Did you discuss - when you say you haven't spoken to her
5 for some time, you never discussed your decision to come
6 into the Royal Commission.
7 A. No, I didn't.
8 Q. And the same goes for Sandra Saunders, you never raised
9 that topic with her.
10 A. No, I did not raise it with Sandra.
11 Q. You never discussed in her presence about coming into
12 the Royal Commission.
13 A. I mentioned to Sandra that I was coming in and I said 'I
14 want to speak to Andrea Simpson', and Sandra didn't push
15 it any more. She said 'I'll leave it, it's up to you',
16 and that is it.
17 Q. Did you ask on that occasion, when you mentioned it with
18 Sandra Saunders, whether she would be good enough to
19 give you the copy of the transcript for which you had
20 been asking for some time.
21 A. No, I didn't.
22 Q. Have you asked her again for the transcript.
23 A. No, I haven't.
24 Q. Why not.
25 A. It's not of any use to me now. Not now. I did not want
26 it.
27 Q. When you were -
28 A. I have a copy at home that I can hunt through and find.
29 Q. You haven't been able to hunt through and find it for
30 the purpose of preparing your statement for the Royal
31 Commission, have you.
32 A. I haven't been able to find it. I was only asked about
33 it a couple of nights ago.
34 Q. Have you asked Sandra Saunders for a copy of the
35 material to assist you.
36 A. No, I haven't.
37 Q. This is preparing your statement.
38 A. Did I ask anyone for it? Betty Fisher?

- 1 Q. Have you asked her.
2 A. No, I haven't.
3 Q. Why not.
4 A. Because I thought I could find the one that I had at
5 home.
6 Q. What, you didn't find the one you have at home.
7 A. I did not ring her. It was only late last night. I
8 didn't ring her and worry her at that time. She's an
9 elderly person and I didn't want her to be rushing
10 around and -
11 Q. Betty Fisher did tell you that she had promised Koomi
12 and Gladys that she would give the information to you.
13 A. She said she promised -
14 Q. She spoke to Gladys and Koomi, had an interview with
15 them.
16 A. `Koomi, I promise to', and I said in here that she spoke
17 to Gladys and Koomi and she said to me that Koomi had
18 asked her to pass the information on to me because Koomi
19 knew that she hadn't told Betty everything, but she told
20 her the tip of the iceberg.
21 Q. So, Betty Fisher, when you first met her, was pleased to
22 meet you because at last she had found the person that
23 Koomi had spoken of as being the person to hand on the
24 information to.
25 A. I don't know if Koomi spoke to her of me. She may have.
26 Q. That's what you are saying.
27 A. She may have told Betty that she had two daughters:
28 Leila and Veronica.
29 Q. That is what - that is the impression that Betty Fisher
30 certainly gave to you, wasn't it.
31 A. Yes.
32 CONTINUED

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

- 1 Q. That took place in April 1995, and despite the fact that
2 she told you she had promised Koomi that she would give
3 the information to you, Betty Fisher didn't give you the
4 information, did she.
- 5 A. Well, at the time when - and I think that you would have
6 to be a very either special kind of person or an
7 understanding person, that when the problems arose about
8 the Hindmarsh Island business, the women's business,
9 Betty, with what she had, took it to the person who she
10 knew could help her get it to whoever that information
11 could get -
- 12 Q. Lewis O'Brien, you're talking about, a man.
- 13 A. I'm speaking about Lewis O'Brien.
- 14 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. Because she knew Lewis, she did not know anyone else -
- 16 Q. No.
- 17 A. - out of the two people who she had interviewed their
18 families.
- 19 Q. Has Betty told you about handing the stuff over to Lewis
20 O'Brien.
- 21 A. I got told that she handed it to Lewis.
- 22 Q. By whom.
- 23 A. You heard here this morning.
- 24 Q. I didn't hear.
- 25 A. Andrea spoke of it.
- 26 Q. I didn't hear. Gloria Sparrow told you.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 Q. You see, we know that Betty Fisher - if what you've said
29 is correct - in April 1995, was telling you of the
30 promise that she had made to Koomi to hand the
31 information over to you and your sister, or something
32 like that. Were you upset when you found out that in
33 June or May, rather - sorry, in June, in June 1995, she
34 hadn't handed it over to you, but she had handed it over
35 to Lewis O'Brien who handed it over to ALRM.
- 36 A. Betty didn't know me at that time to hand it to me.
- 37 Q. But she knew you in April 1995.
- 38 A. She handed it to - because of the other person who was

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

1 there, she did not know where I lived, and she gave me
2 her number, I didn't give her her mine or my address, I
3 just said 'I'll get it touch with you Betty'. She
4 handed it to Lewis. If she handed it to Lewis, that's
5 fine by me because I wouldn't have got to hear of it if
6 Lewis hadn't mentioned it to one of the workers in the
7 centre where Lewis worked.

8 COMSR

9 Q. Does that mean that Mrs Fisher, as far as you're aware,
10 hadn't made any enquiries as to how she might contact
11 you since she was given the information in 1967.

12 A. But I can't see how Betty would have wanted to have any
13 or make any enquiries as to where I was when she didn't
14 even know me. I mean I didn't even know Betty existed.

15 XXN

16 Q. How did she know to write to you.

17 A. Beg your pardon? It was after we got to meet that Betty
18 wrote to me.

19 Q. I'm talking of that occasion, I'm talking about April
20 1995 when you met.

21 A. That was at the barbecue.

22 Q. She didn't know to send you the book and the transcript,
23 but she knew to write to you on astrology and women's
24 business.

25 A. I rang Betty after I got to the city after a while and
26 gave her my address.

27 Q. When.

28 A. When I got back.

29 Q. What month was that.

30 A. It was much later than April.

31 Q. When.

32 A. Glory, it would have been a couple of months later.

33 Q. June.

34 A. It could have been June, it could have been after that.

35 Q. I want to ask you just a few questions about the 7.30
36 Report. We have a transcription of it. You might care
37 to look at the exhibit.

38 A. Didn't I already look at that?

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

- 1 Q. Yes, I want to ask you a couple of questions about it,
2 Exhibit 22B. You were given, by Alison Caldwell, a
3 number of pages of what was said to be a typed
4 transcription of what was in Betty Fisher's notebook,
5 weren't you.
6 A. I believed that to be, yes.
7 Q. There were, I think, four or five pages.
8 A. I recall only one or two pages I was holding.
9 Q. I tell you that it's clearly visible that you're holding
10 four pages.
11 A. Well, like I just looked at it. I didn't hold all of
12 them.
13 Q. Yes, you did, we can see you on the television.
14 A. I'd rather you put it on and look at it.
15 Q. Do you know what you read or read out.
16 A. I read out the stuff that Betty had apparently taken
17 from her notebook and put on to the transcript.
18 Q. Did you read all the pages that were in your hands.
19 A. I read through very quick. They only showed me the
20 parts they wanted me to read.
21 Q. How did they show you that, did they have them marked?
22 A. Beg your pardon?
23 Q. Did they have the parts marked.
24 A. No, they weren't marked, they just pointed to the
25 section and then said `You read this part here' and they
26 marked it and then -
27 COMSR
28 Q. Who are the `they' you're talking about.
29 A. Beg your pardon?
30 Q. Who are the `they' that you're talking about.
31 A. Alison Caldwell
32 XXN
33 Q. And the cameramen.
34 A. Beg your pardon?
35 Q. There were cameramen there, two.
36 A. They would have had to to film it, hey?
37 COMSR.
38 Q. Just so that I'm clear about this, it was Alison

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

1 Caldwell and the cameraman.

2 A. Alison Caldwell. The cameraman didn't tell me what to
3 read, it was Alison, and Betty.

4 XXN

5 Q. Could you look at p.20. Do you see the bit `VB reading
6 from typed notes'.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. I suggest you started off by reading out `Once we lose
9 that, it's all gone down there on Hindmarsh Island'. Do
10 you remember reading that.

11 A. I remember reading it.

12 Q. You were reading out what was in this typed transcript.

13 A. That's correct.

14 MR ABBOTT: There are some alterations I would
15 suggest making to this, but I don't think now is the
16 time to do it, but there are some important alterations
17 in the commission copy of the transcript.

18 XXN

19 Q. Do you remember in that slab that's on p.20 which starts
20 `Once', the transcript says `One', but I tell you it
21 should be `Once' `We lose that all, it's all gone,
22 finish, so we go to the island and we know', and then
23 your voice trails off. Do you remember that that's the
24 end of the first page, and you then turned the page
25 over, turned over to p.2.

26 A. I cannot recall that.

27 Q. You claim, in your statement, that the transcript said,
28 and I quote your words from p.11 of your statement, the
29 transcript said `About the waters and the sacredness of
30 them, that you don't put nothing over the top of that
31 water or the spirits will leave'. Where does that occur
32 in your rendition.

33 A. I beg your pardon?

34 Q. Is that a reference to p.23. Are you intending to refer
35 to this at p.23.

36 A. Page 23 of what?

37 Q. Of Exhibit 22B. Halfway down the page you are quoted as
38 saying `You see mum says here that they have to see that

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

1 the waters keep coming and they don't stop'. Do you see
2 that.

3 A. Yes, I see it.

4 Q. Next there is a reference then to the barrages, and you
5 go to on say 'The barrages should never have been there,
6 shouldn't have been built, you know, it stops the water
7 altogether'. Is that what you were meaning to convey
8 was in your mother's or what was said to be your
9 mother's transcript when, in your statement, at p.11,
10 you use this phrase; you see in the transcript it said
11 'About the waters and the sacredness of them, that you
12 don't put nothing over the top of that water or the
13 spirits will leave, so if that happens, Ngarrindjeri
14 women will become sick'. You see I'm suggesting to you
15 that other than that rather elliptical reference on
16 p.23, there is nothing in the transcript that you read
17 out that would come close to what you claim in your
18 statement was in the transcript. That's my point.

19 A. I see. Well, in reference to the transcript - this
20 here, transcript (INDICATES).

21 Q. Yes, the transcript.

22 A. Where she says about the waters around the island, you
23 know, it says 'Mum says here that they have to see that
24 the waters keep coming and they don't stop, and that
25 there are and there was, and they were'. It seems like
26 there is a misprint, a typewritten mistake in here, so
27 how can he say that this was what was actually said?
28 But referring back to p.11, as I said, Betty said it
29 came from her transcript, the typed transcript came from
30 her notebook, and that my mother told her and said
31 'Well, Betty' - she said mother told her and I said 'Oh
32 well', I accepted the fact that Betty, as an historian,
33 interviewed my mother. Getting down to the water, mum -
34 and I mean I know my mother, I knew my mother well -
35 that she would have said, she said 'Anything goes
36 across', that she told Betty 'Over the sacredness of the
37 waters, anything on the top, the spirits will leave',
38 and that's referring to -

1 Q. In your statement where you say - you see in that
2 transcript it said about the waters and the sacredness
3 of them.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. `That you don't put nothing over the top of that water
6 or the spirits will leave, so if that happens,
7 Ngarrindjeri women will become sick and the whole thing
8 about Hindmarsh Island and the islands next to it is,
9 that is what protects us from any harm coming to those
10 islands'. Do you agree that that may be a mistake on
11 your part, and it may never feature in the transcripts
12 that you read out.

13 A. A mistake?

14 Q. Yes.

15 A. On my part?

16 Q. Yes.

17 A. Of reading the transcript.

18 OBJECTION Ms Pyke objects.

19 MS PYKE: Mr Abbott, I think, is misleading in the
20 way that he is questioning her. The witness didn't
21 purport to read out the entire transcript that is being
22 suggested by Mr Abbott, so I really think in fairness to
23 this witness -

24 MR ABBOTT: I'm trying to ask one question where
25 normally I would be asking several.

26 MS PYKE: I think it's misleading.

27 MR ABBOTT: If Ms Pyke thinks it's misleading she
28 has probably got an arguable case.

29 XXN

30 Q. I'm asking you can we take it that if it's not in the
31 transcript that you read out, then that's more likely to
32 be a more reliable indicator of what was in the
33 transcripts than what's in your statement.

34 A. Yes. Can you repeat that?

35 Q. In your statement, you've endeavoured to remember what
36 was in the transcripts, right.

37 A. Correct.

38 Q. On the footage on the television station, we have what

- 1 was actually in the transcripts, because you read out
2 from the transcripts. That's right.
- 3 A. That's right.
- 4 Q. If there is a difference between the two, it's more
5 likely that what is on the television is right and what
6 is in your statement is wrong.
- 7 A. I'm not saying that my statement is wrong.
- 8 Q. But it might be incorrect.
- 9 A. If you don't see or if I hadn't videoed that 7.30
10 Report, then I would have no recollection of what was
11 specifically said, and you're asking me to specifically
12 state what was in that transcript in reference to what's
13 in my statement.
- 14 Q. I'm not. All I'm suggesting to you is that you made
15 your best attempt.
- 16 A. I made my best attempt to remember it.
- 17 Q. And you got it wrong.
- 18 A. I don't think I got it wrong.
- 19 Q. Tell me, do you remember, towards the end of the
20 discussion that took place between you and Betty Fisher,
21 there was discussion about no-one speaking until the
22 Tickner inquiry came up.
- 23 A. Beg your pardon?
- 24 Q. Do you remember you, Betty Fisher, Maggie Jacobs and
25 Alison Caldwell talking about no-one giving any more
26 interviews or speaking anywhere until the Tickner
27 inquiry came along.
- 28 A. I don't recall that, I can't recall anything like that
29 being said.
- 30 Q. You heard Betty Fisher whisper to you and Maggie Jacobs
31 and say `Now listen, kids, the Tickner inquiry is coming
32 up', you said `Yeah', and Betty Fisher said `And we
33 aren't going to speak to anyone until that is finished',
34 and Alison Caldwell is saying `Well, I'd appreciate
35 that'.
- 36 A. You're appalling. That's my niece, and there would be
37 no need for Betty to whisper.
- 38 Q. It depends. Anyway, do you agree that that's what

- 1 happened.
- 2 A. No, I don't agree.
- 3 Q. We'll play that part.
- 4 A. You can -
- 5 Q. It's right at the end.
- 6 A. - because I don't recall that. As I said before -
- 7 COMSR: It's at the very end.
- 8 A. I would suspect, Madam Commissioner, that this bit is
- 9 what was taped, but was never on the 7.30 Report.
- 10 CONTINUED

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

1 XXN

2 Q. For obvious reasons.

3 A. So, therefore, if it wasn't there, then how could we say
4 it? If the cameras were still around then, it might
5 have been passing conversation, but I don't recall
6 having said that.

7 COMSR: Ladies, it is going to be hard enough to
8 hear this section of the evidence without having to hear
9 over your voices.

10 VIDEO PLAYED

11 XXN

12 Q. Did you hear that. I don't know whether you did or not.

13 A. No, I didn't hear that.

14 Q. We may have to turn it up.

15 VIDEO PLAYED

16 Q. This is Betty Fisher speaking.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. That was you saying `Lewis goes on and on'.

19 A. I cannot hear it clearly.

20 Q. Perhaps we can play it so at least some of us can hear
21 it, and I ask counsel assisting to confirm that what is
22 in the transcript is, in fact, reflected -

23 A. Can I have a break?

24 COMSR

25 Q. Right this minute.

26 A. When he finishes.

27 VIDEO PLAYED

28 Q. Did you hear that.

29 A. I did.

30 Q. Do you remember it now.

31 A. I remember it now.

32 Q. Did you ask Betty Fisher why she was suggesting to you
33 and Maggie Jacobs that, with the Tickner inquiry coming
34 up, no-one was going to speak to anyone until it was
35 finished.

36 OBJECTION Mr Kenny objects.

37 MR KENNY: The inference is quite clearly,
38 listening to Alison Caldwell's comments, the fact that

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

1 they were talking about 'The Post' magazine. It is not
2 that they won't talk to anyone.

3 MR ABBOTT: The witness can answer it.

4 MR KENNY: You are misrepresenting it.

5 MR ABBOTT: I have put exactly what is there.

6 XXN

7 Q. Did you take any further part in that discussion.

8 A. I cannot recall that.

9 Q. Did you ask what Betty Fisher was speaking about.

10 A. I can't recall that, because that day I was very tired
11 and this interview was sprung on me out of the blue, and
12 so my concentration that day wasn't in full force, and
13 when the interview was over I was speaking - my niece
14 was there, her children were there, and we were talking
15 and moving around. If I did say anything, I cannot
16 recall that.

17 COMSR

18 Q. You want a few minutes break, do you.

19 A. Is it okay?

20 Q. If we have to, we will do it. You want a break, do you.

21 A. Yes, please.

22 ADJOURNED 4.27 P.M.

23 RESUMING 4.31 P.M.

24 MRS SIMPSON: Before Mr Abbott goes on, Mrs Brodie has
25 indicated she doesn't feel well enough to continue this
26 afternoon.

27 MR ABBOTT: I was prepared to finish my
28 cross-examination now, in the expectation that in
29 another half an hour she could escape this commission
30 altogether.

31 WITNESS: I do have a bad liver and I've been
32 sitting all day, and the pain is there so I don't want
33 to prolong that pain. It could put me in hospital. I
34 would prefer now, and if you desire to call me back,
35 then -

36 COMSR: Could I get some indication of how much
37 longer counsel will be?

V.P. BRODIE XXN (MR ABBOTT)

- 1 MR ABBOTT: I formally indicate I have no further
2 questions, given this witness's condition.
- 3 MR SYKES: Ten minutes.
- 4 MR MEYER: Ten to fifteen, at the most.
- 5 MR KENNY: Ten minutes.
- 6 MS PYKE: About fifteen or thereabouts.
- 7 MR WARDLE: Yes, the same.
- 8 COMSR: So what are we looking at?
- 9 MR WARDLE: Perhaps two hours all told.
- 10 COMSR: All of that adds up to considerably
11 less, but I agree with the final outlook. Of course, I
12 have trouble with the time sequence, too. Tomorrow we
13 cannot continue in any case. I presume you would prefer
14 to rest tomorrow?
- 15 WITNESS: Yes.
- 16 COMSR: What about Friday morning?
- 17 WITNESS: I do have an appointment with the Kaurna
18 Plains School on Friday morning. The afternoon will be
19 free.
- 20 COMSR: We certainly cannot go beyond that.
- 21 WITNESS: This is a pre-booked thing and I cannot
22 break it.
- 23 COMSR: If we can resume at 2 o'clock on Friday
24 afternoon then, with the understanding that we just have
25 to complete the evidence at that time. We will have no
26 alternative.
- 27 MR SYKES: I may not be able to be here. I have
28 some court appearances at 2 o'clock, but I will make
29 arrangements with other counsel.
- 30 COMSR: There is not much I can do to
31 accommodate you in the circumstances.
- 32 MR MEYER: I might be able to speak with Mr Sykes
33 tomorrow. We will be together, I presume, at some stage
34 of the day.
- 35 COMSR: As far as you are concerned then, Mrs
36 Brodie, you will be released until 2 o'clock on Friday.
- 37 WITNESS STANDS DOWN
- 38 ADJOURNED 4.43 P.M. TO THURSDAY, 16 NOVEMBER 1995 AT 11 A.M.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 COMSR STEVENS

2

3 HINDMARSH ISLAND BRIDGE ROYAL COMMISSION

4

5 THURSDAY, 16 NOVEMBER 1995

6

7 RESUMING 11.05 A.M. AT CAMP COORONG

8 MR SMITH: I would like to open by commending the
9 Trevorrows for their hospitality and the arrangements
10 that have been made today on behalf of the commission.

11 MR SMITH CALLS

12 GEORGE TREVORROW SWORN

13 EXAMINATION BY MR SMITH

14 Q. Mr Trevorrow, I think you were born at Point McLeay, is
15 that so.

16 A. Yes, that's right.

17 Q. I think during the relevant times that the Hindmarsh
18 Island Bridge has been the subject of dispute, you have,
19 in general terms, been a member of the Lower Murray
20 Aboriginal Heritage Committee, is that right.

21 A. Yes, that's right.

22 Q. In connection with the dispute and in connection with
23 the inquiry, you have provided a statement to the
24 commission of your evidence in the matter, is that
25 right.

26 A. Yes, I have.

27 Q. Looking at the statement produced to you now, would you
28 acknowledge that as the statement which you have
29 prepared with the help of your legal advisers and signed
30 and proffered to the commission as a statement of your
31 evidence.

32 A. Yes.

33 EXHIBIT 294 Statement of George Trevorrow tendered
34 by Mr Smith. Admitted.

35 Q. You have a copy of that with you.

36 A. Yes.

37 Q. If you feel any discomfort such that it disrupts your
38 concentration you will let us know, won't you.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. I will.

2 Q. Your statement, first of all, touches upon your
3 ancestors, as it were. Can I ask you some general
4 questions about that. First of all, your father I think
5 was Joseph Trevorrow, and your mother, Thora Lampard.
6 Is that correct.

7 A. That's right.

8 Q. Was your father a Ngarrindjeri man.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Where did he grow up.

11 A. Along the Coorong area, Salt Creek, throughout the
12 Coorong.

13 Q. Salt Creek being not far from here.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. We're at Camp Coorong at the moment, which is about 10
16 kilometres from Meningie, is it not.

17 A. Yes, that's right.

18 Q. Where is Salt Creek in relation to Meningie.

19 A. About 60 K south-east.

20 Q. Your mother, Thora Lampard, from where did she come.

21 A. In the Kingston area.

22 Q. You say she was a Ngarrindjeri lady, is that correct.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. The history of your father's work, I think you have set
25 forth in your statement. He worked as a fisherman and a
26 rabbit shooter, is that right.

27 A. Rabbit catcher - trapper.

28 Q. Rabbit trapper and casual work generally.

29 A. Yes.

30 Q. So where did you grow up then.

31 A. In many camps along the Coorong. Mainly at the Three
32 Mile Camp, I suppose most of our years, which is three
33 miles out of Meningie, and different other camps along
34 the length of the Coorong.

35 Q. Was that a matter of choice rather than living on the
36 mission as Point McLeay.

37 A. In regards to living on the mission that was a choice
38 that my parents took. The other choice was you could

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 not live in town in those days because it was against
2 the law.

3 Q. You were at the Three Mile Camp, as you say in your
4 statement, until you were about 13 or 14 years of age.

5 A. Yes, could have been older.

6 Q. Three Mile Camp was just that, a camp, wasn't it, rather
7 than a housing estate of any sort. Is that right.

8 A. That's right.

9 Q. At p.2 of your statement you make the point that you
10 lived in fairly frugal circumstances, if you like, at
11 Three Mile Camp.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And existed almost off the land, as it were, is that
14 right.

15 A. That's right, yes.

16 Q. There was no sewage, electricity, or any amenities such
17 as that. (NOT ANSWERED)

18 Q. The Three Mile Camp was one big camp, I think, where you
19 all lived together in a community.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. You make the point that as a child you spent a lot of
22 time sitting and listening to the older people talking
23 about culture and traditions.

24 A. That's right.

25 Q. First of all, can you tell us how old you are now, if
26 you don't mind.

27 A. 46, I think. I remember they gave us dates back in them
28 days. A lot of things got mixed up.

29 Q. So you were born then in what year.

30 A. 51.

31 Q. The sort of things that you heard the older people
32 talking about, can you give us a bit of a summary of
33 those.

34 A. Most of the things that we were allowed to hear them
35 talk about was related to the land, stories of land
36 forms, how they were created and mainly relating to the
37 land, how to look after it. Sometimes they would be
38 touching on the spiritual side of things. If it wasn't

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 too important, they would allow us to listen at times.

2 If it was too important, we wasn't allowed to.

3 Q. The times when you heard these things spoken of by the
4 older people in your community, you were a young boy,
5 were you.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. By the time you started appreciating the things that
8 were being said, I take it you were in your what - what
9 sort of age were you.

10 A. You start appreciating things from a very young age
11 because it is part of your teaching. It is similar to
12 going to school, I suppose, and learning your tables,
13 you got to know them.

14 Q. Looking back on it now, was the culture, as it was
15 spoken of back then when you were a young boy at Three
16 Mile Camp, gradually being lost as time passed.

17 A. Well, parts of it was being lost in the sense because
18 you were not allowed to talk about it outside of your
19 own group. The old people was always afraid that they
20 would get into trouble. At school you'd get into a lot
21 of trouble speaking your language, and so the old people
22 started cutting back on the language and dances and so
23 forth, because it was getting us into too much trouble.

24 Q. You gave us some examples at p.3 of your statement.
25 First of all, spiritual things such as stories about the
26 Mingka bird, would you tell us a little bit about that.

27 A. The Mingka bird - I put this in as an example for the
28 commissioner and the people to get a bit of an
29 understanding of the spirituality of the people. The
30 Mingka bird was a death bird that only came to visit the
31 camps in time of death of one of the family members and
32 so forth. And, in particular, I mention here that one
33 night we were sitting in the home trying to do our
34 homework with a dripping light, and our father asked us
35 outside and made us go outside and listen to the noise
36 of this bird and to explain to us why - what it was, why
37 it was there, and what we would expect to hear after
38 that.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. The Willie Wagtail was in the same sense spoken of.
2 A. The Willie Wagtail spoke to the people. There is many
3 birds and animals like that and, as Ngarrindjeri people
4 living in the bush, we relied very heavily on those
5 natural things around us to give us our messages.
6 Q. Was the life you were leading then as a young boy at the
7 Three Mile Camp a mixture of old and present, if you
8 like. You were hearing about the culture of the
9 Ngarrindjeri, but were you living a traditional life in
10 any sense.
11 A. No. Unfortunately, you couldn't live the full
12 traditional life, but the stories still had to be told.
13 Q. Were many people in the camp dependent on welfare.
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. You also make a point at p.3 of your statement about
16 burials and information that you were given as a young
17 man about that. Do you want to say something about
18 that, what you were told about burials and respect and
19 that sort of thing.
20 A. Yes. The respect that you must have during them times
21 and for those people, that they became just as important
22 to you dead as they were alive; positioning of how they
23 would have to be buried, and in recent years and
24 sometimes at funerals there is a big rumble because
25 sometimes the person might have the body around the
26 wrong way, and the old people look at us and we have to
27 go and fix it very quickly to make sure the head is
28 pointed in the right direction.
29 Q. I think as you grew up and got older you took more of an
30 interest in your culture, is that correct.
31 A. Yes.
32 Q. And sought out older people for more and more
33 information.
34 A. Yes.
35 Q. The way in which you gathered this information was you
36 had to be careful, I think, didn't you.
37 A. You had to listen.
38 Q. In a respectful way.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. And you did that.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Were there situations where some people were told
5 matters relating to cultural beliefs and other people
6 not.
- 7 A. Yes, that happened quite a bit sometimes. I could give
8 an example on that. Tom Trevorrow is my younger
9 brother, but one time he told me a story that I never
10 knew, that an Elder had told him in regards to the Seven
11 Sisters Dreaming and the dance that was associated with
12 that, but I never knew that until he told me.
- 13 Q. That's a Western Desert Dreaming.
- 14 A. No, Ngarrindjeri Dreaming.
- 15 Q. It has been said to be, has it not, a Desert Dreaming.
- 16 A. They have a Dreaming as well. It is a different story
17 to ours.
- 18 Q. Is it.
- 19 A. It is one that goes across the country.
- 20 Q. From whom did you learn that.
- 21 A. From my brother, Tom.
- 22 Q. When was that.
- 23 A. That was years ago, about ten years ago, I think he told
24 me it then.
- 25 Q. Do you know anything about how Tom found out about Seven
26 Sisters Dreaming.
- 27 A. Because one of the Elders told him.
- 28 Q. Who was that.
- 29 A. I can't tell you that.
- 30 Q. Because you don't know, or are you reluctant to tell us.
- 31 A. No, I won't tell you. I know who it is, but I don't
32 want to talk about him.
- 33 Q. I don't want to inquire into the content of it, but do
34 you say even telling the source of the Dreaming, that
35 is, the Elder who told Tom -
- 36 A. Yes, I can't tell you that person.
- 37 Q. Because you don't know.
- 38 A. No, I do know.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. Why can't you tell us.

2 A. Out of respect for him.

3 COMSR

4 Q. Is this somebody who is deceased, is it.

5 A. Yes.

6 XN

7 Q. Looking at p.5 of your statement, you say in about the
8 third paragraph 'I was taught by the Elders that the
9 waters of the Coorong and Lower River Murray were very
10 special places and that this specialness was for a
11 number of reasons. One was that this was the meeting
12 place of the fresh water and the salt water' and
13 therefore it had 'a special spiritual significance to us
14 as Ngarrindjeri people'. Was that something that you
15 learnt about recently, that is, in the last few years,
16 or -

17 A. No, that is something I've always known.

18 Q. Looking at Exhibit 234, which is a report called 'A
19 Voice in all Places', it is a document prepared
20 apparently in August 1992 by Dr Dermott Smythe, and it
21 is to do with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander
22 interests in Australia's coastal zone. Do you recognise
23 that document as a document you have received here at
24 Camp Coorong.

25 A. I recognise the document and the person's name, yes. As
26 per content, it is another document.

27 Q. I will ask you a couple of questions about the content.
28 The report deals with, as it indicates, Australia's
29 coastal zones, including the Coorong. Did you have a
30 hand by providing information to the author of this
31 document, or his agents, about the Coorong for this in
32 August 1992 or thereabouts.

33 A. I don't recall, but I remember the person and talking to
34 him.

35 Q. There is a section, section 6, which deals with South
36 Australia and, in particular, the Coorong area of South
37 Australia, and some information is provided in the
38 document about, for instance, the Ngurunderi Dreaming

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 and the significance of the Coorong. Did Camp Coorong
2 and the Trevorrows have some input into this.

3 A. I can't recall. We did talk to him for a bit, the
4 person, yes.

5 Q. I think you provided a copy of this document or extracts
6 from it to Dr Neale Draper, did you not.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Did you know that he passed that onto Mr Jacobs QC when
9 Mr Jacobs was making his report to the government.

10 A. No, I didn't.

11 Q. Bearing all that in mind, was that the time - that is,
12 in August 1992 - when you became very conscious of the
13 importance of, as it were, the meeting of the waters,
14 the Murray meeting the sea.

15 A. No.

16 Q. No.

17 A. No.

18 Q. That's a view you've held for a long time, that that's
19 important to the Aboriginal people.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. On p.5 of your statement, can I take you to the last
22 paragraph which commences on line 117 there, where you
23 say 'I was told other things about Hindmarsh Island,
24 Mundoo Island and the Murray Mouth and how they connect
25 with other areas of the landscape. These beliefs extend
26 to other areas outside the Ngarrindjeri nation and it is
27 not for me to talk about them'. You go on to make the
28 point that 'There is also secret Ngarrindjeri men's
29 business and men's places that I know about that I was
30 told by my Elders'.

31 A. Yes.

32 Q. Can you tell us, and I don't want any detail because the
33 commissioner doesn't want to prise any detail out of you
34 about this, but the men's business and the men's places,
35 where are they generally.

36 A. They are located in different places throughout the
37 Ngarrindjeri lands, but - yes.

38 Q. Hindmarsh Island and Mundoo Island included.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. No, you are asking me now something where you are asking
2 me to say where it is, and I can't tell you that.
- 3 Q. In the context of this dispute over the construction of
4 the Hindmarsh Island Bridge, assertions have been made
5 by your committee, and I think you personally, that
6 Hindmarsh Island is a sacred place.
- 7 A. That's a woman's place.
- 8 Q. The men's business and the men's places do not relate
9 then to Hindmarsh Island, is that the case.
- 10 A. Yes, in that sense.
- 11 COMSR
- 12 Q. I don't know in what sense you mean.
- 13 A. In the woman's business sense.
- 14 Q. So, insofar as Hindmarsh Island relates to women's
15 business, it doesn't relate to men's business, but that
16 doesn't rule out, as I understand what you are saying,
17 the possibility that men's business exists there too.
- 18 A. Could quite possibly exist there too.
- 19 XN
- 20 Q. So Hindmarsh Island is a place that relates to women's
21 business.
- 22 A. Woman's.
- 23 Q. And men's business could possibly be there too, is that
24 what you are saying.
- 25 A. In the area.
- 26 Q. By 'in the area' can we talk about the island, is there
27 men's business on the island itself too.
- 28 A. Not to my knowledge.
- 29 Q. But there is men's business in the area.
- 30 A. In the area.
- 31 Q. The wider area.
- 32 A. Yes.
- 33 Q. You know, therefore, from what you have said, the fact
34 that there is women's business on Hindmarsh Island. Is
35 that what you say.
- 36 A. Yes.
- 37 Q. Who knew about that, or who knows about that.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. I imagine there would be quite a few people that know
2 about that.
- 3 Q. How do they come to know that.
- 4 A. They've been told through the stories. The same as
5 we've been told over the years.
- 6 Q. I don't want you to name names, but can you give us an
7 idea the people who know. Can you characterise the
8 people. By that, I mean, are they somehow chosen, and
9 on what basis are they chosen to know. So it is the
10 people who know about the fact of women's business on
11 Hindmarsh Island.
- 12 A. I think I've already explained that earlier in my
13 statement in regards to who the Elders were speaking to
14 and at what time and place.
- 15 Q. Is it a matter of, to some degree, chance.
- 16 A. It could very well be under chance at times, considering
17 the people, the movement at the time.
- 18 Q. What other criteria is there. It couldn't be just sheer
19 accident, could it, that you pick up the information.
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. It must be something else.
- 22 A. It depended on you personally, I think, a lot.
- 23 Q. What sort of qualities do you have to have to be the
24 recipient of this information.
- 25 A. You'd have to be a trusting sensible sort of person to
26 receive any information like that.
- 27 Q. And have some interest in the culture.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. So the people who know about the fact of there being
30 women's business are people who are, in that sense,
31 worthy of holding the information; that is, trusting,
32 have an interest in the culture. What about age and
33 family connections and that sort of thing, does that
34 play a part.
- 35 A. Sometimes. But sometimes age doesn't. It doesn't
36 matter sometimes what age.
- 37 Q. It has been said in this commission that some business
38 will not be related to young people, that you have to

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 earn it with years of experience, is that so.
- 2 A. Well, it is a growing culture. You learn as you go
- 3 along.
- 4 Q. So it is by word of mouth, and I'm talking now about the
- 5 women's business on Hindmarsh Island, some people like
- 6 yourself learnt about it.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. At what age were you when you learnt about the fact that
- 9 there was women's business on Hindmarsh Island.
- 10 A. I learnt the fact of men's and women's business probably
- 11 when I was about 15, 16, I suppose.
- 12 Q. 15 or 16.
- 13 A. Something like that.
- 14 Q. From an Elder it was.
- 15 A. From Elders, yes.
- 16 Q. You know that other men know about the fact of women's
- 17 business on Hindmarsh Island.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Did that mean that there was some prohibitions in place
- 20 in terms of what you did when you went to the island,
- 21 for instance.
- 22 A. What do you mean?
- 23 Q. If, for example, there was a women's ceremony - I am
- 24 just saying this by way of example - in a particular
- 25 place, would you stay away from that place if you were a
- 26 man.
- 27 A. You wouldn't go near it, no.
- 28 Q. That's an example I've given you. So can I return to my
- 29 question, which is: Were there prohibitions on you as a
- 30 man. You know, there is women's business in existence
- 31 on Hindmarsh Island, so what did that mean to you as a
- 32 man in terms of going to the island, for instance.
- 33 A. You knew you didn't go on there if there was times of
- 34 their business taking place. You would stay away from
- 35 it.
- 36 COMSR
- 37 Q. I have heard that it is a fairly long time since there
- 38 have been any Aboriginal people, Ngarrindjeri people,

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 actually living on the island. So what actual
2 experience have you had of avoiding going on the island
3 at certain times because there's women's business going
4 on there.
- 5 A. No personal experience, no, because I'm too young,
6 because those things were cut out from our culture a
7 long time ago, but orally the story must go on.
- 8 Q. I see, so this is -
- 9 A. And the places remain the places.
- 10 Q. So we are harking back, as it were, to some former time.
- 11 A. Well, in a sense, yes, but the places remain the same
12 you see.
- 13 XN
- 14 Q. I have been putting these questions to you on the basis
15 that you would modify your behaviour when you went to
16 Hindmarsh Island, but we are really talking about 200
17 years ago or more, aren't we.
- 18 A. No, we're not.
- 19 Q. In what sense then is there some present practice in
20 relation to women's business on Hindmarsh Island.
- 21 A. I don't know of any present practice, but in our life
22 the place still remains the same. If you go onto the
23 place we know it's important.
- 24 Q. How do you know it's important.
- 25 A. Because it has been taught to us.
- 26 Q. When you go to the island now, even now, in what way do
27 you modify your behaviour.
- 28 A. It's the way you hold yourself. You feel it when you go
29 onto any places like that. If you go onto any other
30 special places there is a difference in the areas.
- 31 CONTINUED

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. It is not a question of avoiding going to a place, is it
2 then.
- 3 A. No, it is not avoiding it.
- 4 Q. It is just a feeling you get when you are there.
- 5 A. Yes, you know.
- 6 Q. This is information, that is, that Hindmarsh Island is a
7 woman's place, that you have known about for a long
8 time, you say that.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. You know the stories relating to Hindmarsh Island and
11 have known them for many years.
- 12 A. No, not the stories, not the stories. The land area.
- 13 COMSR
- 14 Q. I want to make sure I am following what you are saying.
15 You have known for a long time that there is a land area
16 that has got to do with women's business.
- 17 A. With women's business, yes.
- 18 XN
- 19 Q. But you haven't heard the reasons why.
- 20 A. No, I don't know the reasons.
- 21 Q. Is this necessarily secret. The women's business that
22 is on Hindmarsh Island, is it secret only in the sense
23 that it is just nothing to do with men and it is not
24 told to men, or is it secret in the sense that it is
25 taboo. By that I mean, it is dangerous knowledge that
26 men just cannot have.
- 27 A. Look, we are just not allowed to hold that information.
28 It is not for us. We are men. It is not for us to know
29 that business, what goes on.
- 30 Q. I take it that you have read in recent years the Berndt
31 book, 'A World That Was', have you.
- 32 A. I have seen bits and pieces of it, yes.
- 33 Q. It is a book which chronicles in detail your culture,
34 the Ngarrindjeri culture, doesn't it.
- 35 A. Yes.
- 36 Q. It does detail throughout its pages matters that are to
37 do essentially with women, menstruation, birthing,
38 abortions, material like that, does it not, the book.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. Yes, I would imagine so.
- 2 Q. Pardon.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Is that the sort of material you mean when you are
5 talking about women's business.
- 6 A. It could be that and beyond. I have no pleasure in
7 reading those type of things in anybody's book.
- 8 Q. You have no pleasure in doing it.
- 9 A. I have no pleasure in reading those things, because it
10 is woman's business.
- 11 Q. You say in relation to that question there are things
12 like birth, menstruation, abortion and beyond that. You
13 say there are things beyond that relating to women's
14 business.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. What things beyond that.
- 17 A. I would have to be a woman to know that.
- 18 Q. How do you know they exist at all.
- 19 A. Because the people say there is women's business.
- 20 Q. What, beyond what is in the Berndt book.
- 21 A. I don't know whether it is beyond what is in the Berndt
22 book. I mean, there is more to it than that, I know it
23 couldn't be just that. But, like I said, those sort of
24 things disturb me to see them written up in any form
25 where they are talking about women's business and that
26 could mean any woman. It doesn't matter whether they
27 are black or white. To see it all written up like that
28 in that sense is disturbing to me, personally.
- 29 Q. Isn't there some beneficial side to it, though, in the
30 sense that it has the advantage of preserving your
31 culture, to chronicle it like the Berndts have done.
- 32 A. What do you mean, on the open market, making money?
33 Talking about our woman's business?
- 34 Q. I don't mean it like that actually.
- 35 A. That's how I see it, you know. It is like any woman in
36 general, I don't want to see about their business,
37 that's private.
- 38 Q. My question really goes back to then, in part at least,

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 that's what you mean by this women's business, something
2 that is essentially to do with women.

3 A. It is to do with women. It is no part of mine.

4 Q. You say at the very last sentence on p.5 'I know that
5 this information is not in the public arena and I cannot
6 talk about it.' You say as a man that you don't know
7 any detail about this information, don't you. That's
8 your position, the women's information.

9 MR TILMOUTH: That's about men's business.

10 MR SMITH: Yes, it is too.

11 MR TILMOUTH: Line 22.

12 XN

13 Q. And the men's business we have already established is
14 business to do with, not so much Hindmarsh Island, but
15 the surrounding areas.

16 A. The Ngarrindjeri lands, yes.

17 Q. The Ngarrindjeri lands generally.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. At p.6 onward, you give us a little bit of a picture of
20 your work and education history. Can I just ask you
21 about that. When you first started working here at Camp
22 Coorong for the company, which is the Ngarrindjeri Land
23 and Progress Association, is that right.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. When was that, when did you first start setting up and
26 working here at Camp Coorong.

27 A. About ten years ago.

28 Q. About 1984/1985.

29 A. Yes, about 1985 I think I moved out here.

30 Q. We see around you the product of all the work you and
31 your brother have done.

32 A. Yes.

33 Q. Has that been a full-time job for you since then.

34 A. Yes, very full.

35 Q. I think your brother, Tom, was a ranger here at the
36 Coorong for sometime.

37 A. Yes.

38 Q. As well as working here, is that right.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. That's right, we seconded him from National Parks to
2 come and help us out.
- 3 Q. You went to primary school, until grade 7.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And did you have any secondary schooling after that.
- 6 A. No, very little.
- 7 Q. The work you have done to equip yourself to take the
8 tours that you take out from Camp Coorong here you have
9 done studies yourself, is that right.
- 10 A. I have done some studies, but the major part of what we
11 do here comes from that here, all the people themselves.
- 12 Q. From your history of association with your Elders.
- 13 A. That's right.
- 14 Q. The information you have been given by your Elders, have
15 you recorded that from time to time in case you forget
16 it or in case you, dare say it, get run over by a bus.
- 17 A. I have tried, but I find it very, very difficult to do
18 that, because it is an oral history and I prefer to wait
19 for the other young people to be ready to be told those
20 stories.
- 21 Q. In gathering information to help you operate this
22 establishment here at Camp Coorong, have you had
23 recourse to the literature about the Ngarrindjeri
24 people.
- 25 A. Have I -
- 26 Q. The literature, the books that are written about your
27 race, we have covered the Berndt and Berndt book, but
28 others, there are many other works, aren't there.
- 29 A. Yes.
- 30 Q. Taplin, Tindale, Meyer, Jenkin, people like that.
- 31 A. You don't get much time to look at them.
- 32 Q. But that literature would help you, would it not, with
33 the work you do here.
- 34 A. In some of it I would imagine so, yes.
- 35 Q. Do you draw on that at all or any parts of it.
- 36 A. Not much, no. Being on the land here we would rather
37 relate our own stuff as we are walking on the grounds
38 where we were told this. And it is better for the

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 people that we are talking to relate it from our own
2 experience, rather than from somebody who has written
3 too much in a book.
- 4 Q. At p.7 onward, you tell us about the back injuries that
5 you have had trouble with since 1981.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And you have had something like, what, this is the third
8 laminectomy, is it, that you have had.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Going back to p.7, you say 'I first injured my back in
11 1981.'
- 12 A. 1984.
- 13 Q. 1984.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. So we should correct your statement there.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 COMSR: Do you want me to correct that on the
18 actual exhibit?
- 19 MR SMITH: Yes, could you. It should read 'I first
20 injured my back in 1984.'
- 21 MR TILMOUTH: And also at line 32.
- 22 XN
- 23 Q. And 'I had my first operation, a laminectomy, in about
24 1984', also.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 MR SMITH: If you could correct that too, that is
27 line 32.
- 28 XN
- 29 Q. At p.8, you give some detail about Camp Coorong and the
30 operation you and your family and your brother and his
31 family run here. And you make the point that your
32 duties include co-ordinating and managing, management of
33 the centre, including talking to guests about
34 Ngarrindjeri culture. We have been through that, but we
35 are there talking, aren't we, about the culture of the
36 Ngarrindjeri people, as you have learnt it from the
37 Elders, prior to European invasion.
- 38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. And as it is passed down.

2 A. As it is passed down.

3 Q. I take it from your answers to my questions earlier that
4 you - do you or do you not disapprove of the Berndt
5 work.

6 A. Any, it is not just Berndt. I think there is a need for
7 some things like that to happen, but to me personally I
8 say that it worries me to see some of the intimate
9 details put on the open - to the open public.

10 Q. On the public record.

11 A. Yes, I feel that it is too intimate. It is like getting
12 any woman or man and picking on them personally and
13 putting their whole life on the open market. I don't
14 fancy that that much, but that's my personal thoughts on
15 it.

16 COMSR

17 Q. Is it possible the younger members of the Ngarrindjeri
18 community might have a different attitude towards it
19 than you do.

20 A. They may have a different attitude and believe, when it
21 changes, they may have. I am probably talking in the
22 old way there, that I would rather them learn the
23 stories from the people rather than out of a book that
24 was written by, you know, someone else. That is just
25 something that I - it worries me sometimes, that's all.

26 XN

27 Q. Aren't you concerned, though, as the years go by, that
28 as less and less people are interested in - of your
29 people take an interest in the culture, it may be lost.

30 A. Yes, it is a major concern of mine and I know of a lot
31 of people, but it's the way that it is presented that
32 still worries us. It is getting away from, you know,
33 thousands and thousands of years of one way of doing
34 things and trying to change it, into this (INDICATES).

35 Q. And you know, for instance, do you not, that Albert
36 Karloan, Pinkie Mack and the other informants to the
37 Berndts were very concerned that their culture would be
38 lost.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And so they recounted everything they could. There was
3 some debate about it, whether it was everything or not,
4 but they recounted their culture to Catherine and Ronald
5 Berndt for saving for the Ngarrindjeri people.

6 A. I am afraid that I believe honestly that, if those old
7 people were living today and seen what conditions we are
8 in and what is happening with the culture, they would
9 have no hesitation about never speaking again.

10 Q. Why do you say that. Because things are worse now than
11 they were then.

12 A. Yes, people make a mockery of our culture and of our
13 spiritual beliefs. Therefore them old people, if they
14 were alive today and saw this happening, they would not
15 talk any more.

16 Q. Although things were much worse for Aboriginal people in
17 the 1930s and 40s than they are now, surely.

18 A. Not the way - we have moved too fast.

19 Q. Is your objection really, to documenting your culture,
20 that it gives white people too much access to your
21 culture and beliefs.

22 A. No, it is not to do totally with white people.

23 Q. What is it to do with then.

24 A. It is to do with young Ngarrindjeri people who are not
25 supposed to know about something first. It is supposed
26 to be told in time when they are ready to be told, not
27 to go and pick up a book and find something they
28 shouldn't even be seeing. That annoys me.

29 Q. Why shouldn't they be seeing it, the young people.

30 A. Because they may not be ready yet for some of the
31 information that they are seeing in these documents.

32 Q. But isn't it the case that the - say it is to do with
33 secret ceremonies and that sort of thing, they no longer
34 take place, do they.

35 A. But the story still goes on. It doesn't matter what you
36 people do to us, you can do everything you want, those
37 stories will live on and they will be told.

38 Q. But the practices have stopped, haven't they.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. The practices may have stopped, but the stories will go
2 on for ever.

3 Q. I want to ask you some questions about the Coorong
4 Consultative Committee and you yourself talk about that
5 topic, at p.12. You say 'In 1989, I became a member of
6 the Coorong Consultative Committee.' Do you see there,
7 on p.12.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. I am skipping ahead a little bit, but the minutes of the
10 committee show that you were appointed a member, on 5
11 May 1986.

12 A. 1986?

13 Q. That is Exhibit 184.

14 MR SMITH: I am at p.12 of the statement, but I am
15 really not following closely the statement, at this
16 stage.

17 XN

18 Q. Do you accept that you were indeed made or appointed a
19 member, on 5 May 1986.

20 A. I have no argument with that. I say in about 1989. The
21 appointment may have taken place earlier.

22 Q. So you don't have any trouble with that, the minutes
23 show that and you would accept that you were made a
24 member, in May 1986.

25 A. That could have been.

26 Q. The Coorong Consultative Committee was just what it
27 sounds like, a body of people with an interest in the
28 Coorong and a knowledge about the Coorong and the
29 environment of the Coorong, that looked at the
30 management of the Coorong and anything that might have
31 affected the environment, is that right.

32 A. Yes.

33 Q. Including development applications.

34 A. Yes, a whole range of things.

35 Q. As a matter of course, for minutes for meetings that you
36 didn't attend, the records appear to show that you were
37 sent minutes here at Camp Coorong, would you agree with
38 that.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. I think the first mention of you specifically, apart
3 from your membership, was on 9 February 1987, you were
4 included in a field trip to the Murray Mouth. Perhaps I
5 will remind you about that. You were recorded as
6 present in the minute 'Mr G. Trevorrow'. 'Members went
7 on a field trip to the Murray Mouth and inspected the
8 shack area and surrounds on the Coorong Peninsula and
9 near the mouth. This was followed by a meeting under
10 the verandah of one of the shacks.' At 8.7 of the
11 minutes relating to that occasion under the heading
12 'Removal of Aboriginal Remains: George Trevorrow, on
13 behalf of the Aboriginal community, expressed concern
14 about the removal of Aboriginal remains from parks and
15 reserves. George Trevorrow then moved that this
16 committee write direct to the Minister asking him if he
17 is aware that this is happening and that this committee
18 wishes to see that the National Parks and Wildlife
19 service policy on this matter is strictly endorsed.
20 Seconded by Mike Jolly and carried.' You agree with
21 that, do you.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Now that I have jogged your memory.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Occasionally you sent your brother along to be proxy for
26 you.

27 A. Yes, occasionally.

28 Q. I think you did that on 11 May 1987. The minutes show
29 that. You accept that.

30 A. Yes.

31 Q. In 1988, the minutes show that there were four
32 Aboriginal rangers employed in the Coorong area and they
33 were under the direction of the committee, or it was
34 really the National Parks and Wildlife.

35 A. No, National Parks, yes.

36 Q. But that's the position, do you agree with that.

37 A. Yes.

38 Q. In the early part of 1989, Henry Rankine joined the

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 committee, did he not, from Point McLeay.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. On 6 February 1989, in Exhibit 184, the minutes show
4 that 'The committee considered and expressed concerns
5 regarding the impact on the area of a marina
6 development. That the project be delayed until the
7 supplementary development plan was approved.' Do you
8 remember that, in February 1989, the minutes at least,
9 because I don't think you were there, at this particular
10 meeting, the minutes recorded some development taking
11 place, some tourism development taking place on
12 Hindmarsh Island. Narnu Bay. Does that ring a bell.

13 A. No.

14 Q. I will show it to you. I produce to you Exhibit 184,
15 and I am showing you a minute of 6 February 1989, item
16 3. And I think we can call that Mike Jolly's
17 development, Narnu Bay. And I think that also involved
18 the Chapmans' marina development. Do you acknowledge
19 that that was on the books, as it were, of the Coorong
20 Consultative Committee, as early as February 1989 and
21 came to your attention, because you got the minutes.

22 A. No, I don't recall seeing them, the minutes, no.

23 Q. But the minutes were sent to you here at Camp Coorong.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. When you weren't in attendance at the meetings, weren't
26 they.

27 A. Yes.

28 Q. And when you were, the minutes were sent on later,
29 weren't they.

30 A. Yes, normally they would always come.

31 Q. I want to show you another minute, but I will locate it
32 for you. I am showing you now, still Exhibit 184, and
33 it is a minute of the consultative committee meeting, of
34 13 March 1989. You were not present, but I suggest to
35 you that you received the minutes which show, at item
36 5.3, two developments proposed for Hindmarsh Island,
37 being Mike Jolly's development, at Narnu Bay, and the
38 Chapmans' development, at the marina. Would you look at

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 that item, now before you. Do you see that.
- 2 A. Yes, I can see it.
- 3 COMSR
- 4 Q. Do you mean you can't read it. You don't have your
- 5 glasses.
- 6 A. No, but lately with my back, I can't focus.
- 7 COMSR: Mr Trevorrow is having a bit of
- 8 difficulty actually reading it.
- 9 XN
- 10 Q. Do you want me to read it to you.
- 11 A. No, I'm okay.
- 12 Q. Do you accept that you would have received a copy of the
- 13 minutes of that meeting, as a member of the committee.
- 14 A. I wouldn't doubt the fact that they may have sent it
- 15 here to Camp Coorong.
- 16 Q. To be fair to you, I think the minute goes on to, in
- 17 summary, say 'Consideration was given to the impact of
- 18 increased population on the island.' This is where the
- 19 yellow sticker is. 'Consideration was given to the
- 20 impact of increased population on the island. A
- 21 suggestion was made that the committee make a submission
- 22 to the supplementary development plan.' That was the
- 23 position of the committee, wasn't it.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Those two developments were under consideration by the
- 26 committee which you were on, at that stage, weren't
- 27 they.
- 28 A. As this says, definitely, yes.
- 29 Q. It is certainly your position that, as at 1989 and
- 30 indeed before that, you knew of the existence of women's
- 31 business on Hindmarsh Island.
- 32 A. Yes.
- 33 Q. You say you did.
- 34 A. Yes.
- 35 Q. Don't you.
- 36 A. Yes.
- 37 Q. And men's business.
- 38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. In areas surrounding it.
2 A. Yes.
3 Q. Or areas -
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. Nearby or whatever in the Ngarrindjeri lands.
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Did you then speak up in any way about the fact that
8 this was - when these developments were coming before
9 the committee on which you were a member, that these
10 matters concerned you.
11 A. I'm not sure whether I was at this meeting.
12 Q. No, you weren't at that meeting, the records show that.
13 Let me go on a bit further. I will take the exhibit
14 back, because I will direct you to it. On 3 July - and,
15 again, I don't think you were at this meeting - but I
16 suggest you were sent the minutes, and I will take you
17 to them, in a minute. I refer you to a committee
18 meeting, held on 3 July 1989, at Noonameena.
19 A. Yes.
20 CONTINUED

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. That's nearby here, is it.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. You were in apology, but item 3 of the minute reads,
5 quite briefly `Hindmarsh Island Developments - There are
6 two plans proposed at present, one has a bridge option,
7 one does not. The Goolwa Council must decide which
8 option it will choose. No comment can be made by this
9 committee until the plan is released'. Did that come to
10 your attention then in about July of 1989, that there
11 was a bridge proposed for Hindmarsh Island.

12 A. No, I never got the minutes on that.

13 Q. Never got the minutes.

14 A. I may have got them, but I never looked at them.

15 Q. Do you say that you had no idea in July of 1989, or soon
16 thereafter, that a bridge was part of one of the
17 developments.

18 A. Not at that time, no.

19 Q. Are you sure about that.

20 A. It was somewhere around the time, but I'm not sure when.

21 Q. I take you to the next one. Again, the minutes show you
22 are not at this meeting, and show that the meeting was
23 on 4 September 1989 at Noonameena again. You were not
24 at the meeting, but I suggest you were sent the minutes
25 which record, in item 7.1 `Hindmarsh Island Developments
26 - at present, the Hindmarsh Island developments are not
27 part of the Coorong Consultative Committee's concerns.
28 If these developments do occur, however, the increased
29 people pressure is likely to move southward and
30 eventually affect the Coorong, involving this committee.
31 In order to cope with anticipated changes, there is a
32 need to plan ahead and make some decisions now'. On
33 that occasion, Mr Jolly also reported on the bridge
34 option and the pressure for a bridge. Do you remember
35 that being a subject of the deliberations of this
36 committee on 4 September 1989.

37 A. No, I don't.

38 Q. You accept, however, that you got sent the minutes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. I accept the minutes may have come here, yes.
- 2 Q. In 1990, the chairman's report records that for the year
3 1989, out of five committee meetings, you didn't attend
4 any.
- 5 A. That would be right.
- 6 Q. And Henry Rankine, though a member of the committee,
7 similarly didn't attend any. Nought out of five you
8 both scored. Why was that, if you were a member of the
9 committee and you were being sent minutes and you live
10 here on the Coorong, as it were.
- 11 A. I was going to let you finish all your minutes first
12 before I told you my feelings about the committee.
- 13 Q. I will finish them and you can do it then, if you like.
- 14 A. Okay.
- 15 Q. On 19 March 1990, there was both a general meeting and
16 an ordinary meeting of the committee, and you are
17 recorded as present and so is Henry Rankine. Can I show
18 you that minute because you were there.
- 19 A. Right.
- 20 Q. You accept you were at that meeting then.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And Henry Rankine was there too. Can I take you item
23 4.2, because I don't want to go through every item.
24 `Ranger Tom Trevorrow on 12 months leave without pay'.
- 25 COMSR: What is the question, he wasn't there?
- 26 MR SMITH: Yes.
- 27 XN
- 28 Q. I am just referring to item 4.2. You see there the
29 committee have noted that your brother Tom is on twelve
30 months leave without pay.
- 31 A. Yes.
- 32 Q. Does that jog your memory about that meeting at all.
- 33 A. No.
- 34 Q. It doesn't matter, I will go on. Looking at item 4.11,
35 you see there `George Trevorrow expressed concern that
36 Osprey Tours are using Aboriginal Dreamtime character to
37 promote tours which may be visiting Aboriginal sites
38 without permission'. Do you have that.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And that's true. You raised that, did you.

3 A. I believe so.

4 Q. Go to item 5.3. Would you read item 5.3 to us.

5 A. `Hindmarsh Island Development - Mike jolly advised that
6 there will be an approval for the marina and bridge for
7 Hindmarsh Island by the end of the month. Finance is
8 yet to be resolved. Approvals for the project will be
9 given by Cabinet. Environmental impact studies have
10 been prepared'.

11 Q. You remember that being announced by Mr Jolly to the
12 committee members, that the bridge to Hindmarsh Island
13 was going to be approved by the end of the month.

14 A. No, I don't recall that, no.

15 Q. Surely you must have. You were there, weren't you.

16 A. Yes, I was there.

17 Q. And a bridge to Hindmarsh Island, you would have
18 regarded as a great desecration of Hindmarsh Island,
19 wouldn't you.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. How could that slip past you.

22 A. I'm not sure.

23 Q. Isn't it the case that the bridge wasn't a great concern
24 of yours then, was it.

25 A. No, it has always been a concern.

26 Q. Was it.

27 A. Yes.

28 Q. Why didn't you speak up at this meeting.

29 A. I don't know why that's like that.

30 Q. Or, for instance, at least take your concerns about the
31 impact of the bridge on what you knew about the island
32 to the Aboriginal Heritage Branch.

33 A. I may not have been to many meetings on this, but I
34 don't remember it.

35 Q. At this time, you were on the Lower Murray Aboriginal
36 Heritage Committee, weren't you.

37 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. So you were on the Coorong Consultative Committee, you
2 were on the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. You were at this meeting where warning was given that
5 approval was going to take place within a month for a
6 bridge.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And you didn't do anything about it.

9 A. Not then, no.

10 Q. Not then.

11 A. No.

12 COMSR

13 Q. Does that mean that you did something somewhere else.

14 A. Yes, at a later stage.

15 XN

16 Q. Indeed, did you come to know that approval was granted
17 about a month later by the Aboriginal Heritage Branch.

18 A. I come to know, yes.

19 Q. Looking at document 19 in Exhibit is 97, the DOSSA
20 documents, that is a letter from the Aboriginal Heritage
21 Branch to the developer, Binalong, of 12 April 1990,
22 and, amongst other things, the letter asserts that there
23 are no Aboriginal sites of archaeological or
24 anthropological significance which will be affected by
25 the development as detailed in the draft EIS. What do
26 you say about that assertion there.

27 A. This here?

28 Q. Yes.

29 A. Unfortunately, in this period of time we had a lot of
30 these sorts of things happening throughout the lands,
31 not only in our land, where we had a person here from
32 another Aboriginal group altogether who signed these
33 documents to people without full knowledge of the
34 Ngarrindjeri people. The people roasted this man about
35 that.

36 Q. You know, of course, that the Aboriginal Heritage
37 Branch, as at this time, had already caused an

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 anthropological survey to be done of the island by Rod
2 Lucas.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Had caused two archaeological surveys to be done by
5 Vanessa Edmonds, and you knew about all those - both
6 those surveys, didn't you.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Because those people contacted you, didn't they.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. So, bearing in mind what you have told us, and bearing
11 in mind what you know about what was happening on the
12 Coorong Consultative Committee, why didn't you speak
13 out.

14 A. I suppose - we will go back, if you want me to, to the
15 Coorong Consultative Committee.

16 Q. I will just finish the committees and then you can say
17 what you have to say about that. Can you answer that
18 question for the moment. Putting aside what feelings
19 you had about the committee, et cetera, bearing in mind
20 what you knew was going on with the developments on
21 Hindmarsh Island through your membership of the Coorong
22 Consultative Committee, and bearing in mind what you
23 knew about the importance or about the significance of
24 the island culturally, why didn't you speak up in March
25 1990, also bearing in mind the fact that there had been
26 no less than three surveys done of the island, two
27 archaeological and one anthropological, that you had
28 concern with. Why didn't you speak out.

29 A. Why didn't I speak up? Because we were waiting on the
30 1990 report to be fulfilled inasmuch as it is stated to
31 us.

32 Q. So you decided to wait, did you.

33 A. As per the 1990 archaeological report by Rod Lucas.

34 Q. What about when you knew in March of 1990, having been
35 told by Mr Jolly, that approval was a month away.

36 A. Nothing was sure at that time as far as we were
37 concerned.

38 Q. I will not go back to the minutes in detail any more,

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 but the minutes of the Coorong Consultative Committee
2 show that in 1990 you attended one meeting and that was
3 the meeting of 19 March 1990, where the bridge approval
4 was predicted.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. You attended no other meetings of the five meetings of
7 that year. Do you agree with that.
- 8 A. Yes, as the record states.
- 9 Q. In 1991, despite the fact that you still held membership
10 on the committee, you went to no meetings at all.
- 11 A. That would be right.
- 12 Q. And on 20 July 1992, Mr Jolly reported to the committee
13 that he had done what the committee asked him, that is,
14 contact you and Henry Rankine to inform you and Henry
15 Rankine that your continued active membership was
16 important. Do you agree that Mr Jolly pursued you and
17 tried to urge you to attend more meetings.
- 18 A. I believe there was people from the committee that asked
19 us to attend more meetings.
- 20 Q. Was that Mike Jolly.
- 21 A. He could have been one, but there were a few people from
22 the committee.
- 23 Q. The minutes for 1993 show that you were present on 2
24 July 1993. There was a meeting here at Camp Coorong and
25 you explained to the committee that South Australia and
26 the Coorong were being presented in America and that you
27 were getting a big response, is that right.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. Item 5.8 shows that the committee recommended at that
30 time that the bridge not be built, and you claimed and
31 put on record that there was a lack of consultation with
32 Aboriginal people.
- 33 A. Yes.
- 34 Q. That was your position in July 1993.
- 35 A. Yes.
- 36 COMSR
- 37 Q. Have you answered that.
- 38 A. Yes, that was my position. It still is.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 XN

2 Q. Looking at Exhibit 55B concerning a national wildlife
3 area in Virginia in America, an article headed 'Visit
4 Scenic Chincoteague, Virginia' that's a document you are
5 familiar with, isn't it.

6 A. Yes, it is.

7 Q. Why are you familiar with that document.

8 A. I was shown this here by a couple of people from
9 Hindmarsh Island.

10 Q. What, one of the Friends - a couple of people out of the
11 Friends of Goolwa and Kumarangk perhaps.

12 A. I don't really know whether they were members of the
13 Friends of Kumarangk.

14 Q. Who were they.

15 A. Neville and Jan - I can't think of their last name.

16 Q. Thomas.

17 A. Thomas, that's it.

18 Q. When was that that they showed you that.

19 A. I'm not sure the time they showed me. It was a fair
20 while back.

21 Q. Was that what you are referring to here in July 1993,
22 the American -

23 A. No.

24 Q. No.

25 A. No.

26 Q. Why did they show you that, what was the discussion that
27 focused on -

28 A. The discussion that came out of Chincoteague was the
29 fact that how good that island had been set up in
30 comparison to Hindmarsh Island, how good that could
31 become, I suppose.

32 Q. Could you give us an idea of when you saw that document
33 and had this conversation with the Thomases.

34 A. I can't think of the date, but they came here one day to
35 have a talk about this place and to tell us about it.

36 Q. Did you have some ideas of your own along the lines of
37 the setup of Chincoteague Island in Virginia for
38 Hindmarsh Island.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. After seeing this, I thought it was a good idea and it
2 would be in everybody's interest if it could be set up
3 as good as apparently this one is.
- 4 Q. Turning the entire island into a national park.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And that sort of thing.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. With Aboriginal people playing a big part in what
9 happened on the island.
- 10 A. Playing some positive part.
- 11 Q. Looking at Exhibit 55B, did you happen to circulate that
12 copy amongst other members of say, for instance, the
13 Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee.
- 14 A. No, I didn't circulate it.
- 15 Q. If there is a suggestion by one of the witnesses in this
16 commission that she got it from the Mileras - what I am
17 suggesting is perhaps that you might have given a copy
18 of this to the Mileras.
- 19 A. I think when Jan and Neville was talking about this,
20 they talked to quite a few people about it, you know. I
21 don't know if copies were being given.
- 22 Q. Jan and Neville Thomas were opponents of the bridge,
23 weren't they.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. No doubt about that.
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 Q. You don't know if they were formal members, but they
28 were certainly friends with the Friends of Goolwa and
29 Kumarangk.
- 30 A. Yes.
- 31 Q. Richard Owen, for instance.
- 32 A. Yes.
- 33 Q. Isn't it the case that these people like the Thomases
34 and Richard Owen were very much your Allies when all the
35 protest started for the bridge. Isn't that the case.
- 36 A. Yes.
- 37 Q. You were natural Allies, weren't you.
- 38 A. What?

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. You were natural in the sense that you all had a
2 vigorous interest in stopping the construction of the
3 bridge.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Was this document given to you to encourage you -
6 offered to you in the context of a conversation which
7 was encouraging you to be interested in stopping the
8 bridge.

9 A. No. That was given to me as a matter of interest on
10 what could happen in an area like that. I actually went
11 on to try and find out more information on that, and a
12 while ago I was in Tasmania, where I actually met the
13 man who operates and runs - the American National Parks
14 bloke who runs that whole place. The funny thing he
15 told me was the worse thing they ever done was put a
16 bridge on it, at that time when I met him down there.

17 Q. When was that.

18 A. That was only last year, beginning of the year.

19 Q. These views you had about the way in which the island
20 should be used and the Coorong, you've had these for a
21 long time, have you, for many years.

22 A. Yes. Over many years you start to form views after you
23 see so much destruction of the area.

24 Q. Did you take the view that on the Coorong Consultative
25 Committee and the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage
26 Committee, you were, in effect, a representative of the
27 Ngarrindjeri people.

28 A. No, I had trouble with the Coorong Consultative
29 Committee as being a true representative of the
30 Ngarrindjeri people. I think there is too many
31 committees that are around where Ngarrindjeri people are
32 more token people on committees rather than being true
33 voices for the people. There were instances within the
34 consultative committee where things were put forward for
35 the Ngarrindjeri people. They were never taken note of.
36 That was the trouble we had with the committee. At the
37 present time, we have a problem with four-wheel driving,
38 but the chairman of the committee is also the chairman

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 of the Four-Wheel Drive Association of South Australia.
2 We have Winchester United gun people in there. We have
3 all these important people. And where are you when
4 there's a dozen or so important people making decisions
5 as an Aboriginal person? So we felt very lost in that
6 environment with them.
- 7 Q. Are you currently a member of the Coorong Consultative
8 Committee.
- 9 A. I think so, yes.
- 10 Q. Why don't you resign.
- 11 A. I thought that after so many meetings, if I kept missing
12 them, they'd just take me off it.
- 13 Q. When Mike Jolly rang you up - do you agree he rang you
14 up and he said 'It's important that you keep coming to
15 the meetings'.
- 16 A. Like I said, several people rang me up from the
17 committee in regards to keeping on attending, but I
18 didn't feel strong enough about that in regards to my
19 position on the committee.
- 20 Q. Mr Jolly told the committee, according to the minutes,
21 that you gave a positive response to his request, that
22 you'd come more often to meetings.
- 23 A. I said I'd try to come more often - I said to the people
24 who called me.
- 25 Q. Despite what you felt about the committee.
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 COMSR
- 28 Q. I am not quite clear. What committees were you on at
29 that time that were involved in some way in the
30 development of Hindmarsh Island.
- 31 A. There was only the Coorong Consultative Committee, which
32 is the one he's talking about; and the Aboriginal
33 Heritage Committee. That would have been the only two
34 committees that I would have had anything to do with, I
35 would imagine.
- 36 Q. What about the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage
37 Committee.
- 38 A. Yes, the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 XN

2 Q. Looking at Exhibit 284, the press clippings relating to
3 the Mt Barker Summit and the quarry at the Mt Barker
4 Summit, I don't ask you to read those, but I refer you
5 to the second document, which is a copy of the
6 'Advertiser' of 1 December 1987, which is headlined
7 'Desecration claim on quarry graves'. Have you got
8 that.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. There is a photograph of you there, is there not.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And with Mrs Arora Moore-Kropinyeri, and your
13 sister-in-law Ellen Trevorrow.

14 A. No.

15 Q. Sorry, I have made a mistake there. We have got a
16 photograph of Aboriginal Elder, Daisy Rankine.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And you are next to her with your sister-in-law on your
19 left, or on the right of the picture, Ellen Trevorrow.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Daisy Rankine is a relative of yours, isn't she.

22 A. Yes, through marriage.

23 Q. She is the mother of your wife, is she.

24 A. Mother of my sister-in-law.

25 Q. She is an elderly Ngarrindjeri lady.

26 A. Yes.

27 Q. You were there speaking out in respect of what you
28 claimed to be a desecration of Aboriginal grave sites at
29 a quarry about 20 kilometres east of Mt Barker.

30 That's right.

31 A. Yes.

32 CONTINUED

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. Could you tell the Commissioner how is it Mrs Rankine
2 became involved in that, Mrs Daisy Rankine. How did she
3 become involved in speaking out against this.
- 4 A. Because I told her about the site and what they were
5 doing there.
- 6 Q. You told her that this was an important Aboriginal site
7 in the sense that it was a grave and it shouldn't be
8 desecrated.
- 9 A. I didn't have to tell her that.
- 10 Q. She knew that.
- 11 A. She could see it there.
- 12 Q. I take it that there was no difficulties for Mrs Rankine
13 and indeed your sister-in-law, Ellen Trevorrow, coming
14 forward, speaking out, being photographed, being put in
15 The Advertiser.
- 16 A. No, there wasn't.
- 17 Q. And this was even before the days of your membership of
18 the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. You were just a member of the Coorong Consultative
21 Committee, weren't you.
- 22 A. I am, yes.
- 23 Q. Turning to the next article, I think it concerns the
24 telecommunication towers on the Mount Barker Summit, and
25 that is in May 1988. There is an article about that,
26 headed 'Telecom Denies Gift Attempt to Influence
27 Aborigines'.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. You were involved in the disputation about the use of
30 the Summit for Telecom towers, weren't you.
- 31 A. When?
- 32 Q. In 1988.
- 33 A. In 1988?
- 34 Q. Yes, you were involved in that, weren't you.
- 35 A. I think a bus load of us went up one evening and just
36 sat for a while up there, but there was another group of
37 people that was involved in that one.
- 38 Q. Turning to the last article, the very last page, which

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 is two pages, I think, of 23 July 1988, 'Fight for the
2 Summit', have you got that.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Going to the second page, and I will probably need to
5 look over your shoulder for this, I am referring to the
6 second page, just adjacent to a black picture, which
7 didn't copy very well and comes out as a black square,
8 but it says 'The Tendi spokespeople of which include
9 Chris Koolmatie, George Trevorrow and Victor Wilson,
10 all descendants or closely related to the original Mount
11 Barker people, has decided to oppose Telecom's plans to
12 extend the tower.'
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Is that a correct report, that the Tendi, including
15 yourself and Victor Wilson, amongst other people, were
16 opposing the towers on the Summit at Mount Barker.
- 17 A. Yes, I believe that was the Tendi stand, at the time,
18 yes.
- 19 Q. That was July 1988.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Do you agree this was in about July 1988.
- 22 A. I'm not sure of the date.
- 23 Q. That is the date of the paper.
- 24 A. Is it?
- 25 Q. Yes.
- 26 A. I just don't see that on there.
- 27 Q. Have a look on the front sheet, there is a note to that
28 effect.
- 29 A. No.
- 30 Q. So I am suggesting to you that this all occurred in
31 about July 1988.
- 32 A. I can't see it.
- 33 Q. Is it correct that you are a direct descendant of the
34 people of the Mount Barker Summit area.
- 35 A. No, that wasn't worded properly there (INDICATES).
- 36 Q. Is that the reporter's fault, is it.
- 37 A. I would imagine so.
- 38 Q. It is simply not correct, isn't that the position. That

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 you are not directly descended from the people of the
2 Mount Barker Summit area.

3 A. It is hard to say.

4 Q. Who said that to the reporter then.

5 A. I don't know who said that.

6 Q. Can I take you to another matter where you came out in
7 opposition to a development. And can I take you to
8 Exhibit 172. I show you Exhibit 172, now before you. I
9 will look at that with you. That is an agenda of the
10 Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee and the first
11 item on the agenda is 'Highways Department proposal to
12 build bridge on three Aboriginal sites at Tailem Bend
13 and Wellington', and the second item on the agenda is -

14 A. 'Bridge'.

15 Q. Yes, 'Developers propose to build on Aboriginal sites at
16 Granite Island, Jervis Bay, Hindmarsh Island and
17 Kangaroo Island', and there are other items there, but
18 can I ask you about Tailem Bend, first of all, and the
19 minute is dated, I think it is dated up the top with
20 some handwriting, in 1990.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. About September 1990, would you agree with that, that
23 these items were on the agenda at about this time.

24 A. I would imagine so, yes.

25 Q. Did you at that meeting raise, for instance, your
26 opposition to the bridge, or the Hindmarsh Island
27 development. Do you know if the committee in 1990 came
28 out in opposition to the construction of the bridge at
29 Hindmarsh Island.

30 A. I don't think it was in this - in this one (INDICATES).

31 Q. It just mentions Hindmarsh Island, doesn't it, without
32 reference to the bridge, but you knew there was a bridge
33 proposed in that Hindmarsh Island development, didn't
34 you.

35 A. Yes.

36 Q. Because it had been mentioned, or you were at a meeting
37 in March 1990.

38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. Where approval was foreshadowed in a month's time.
2 A. Yes.
3 Q. And approval had been granted. You came to know that,
4 didn't you, you said.
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. As at the time of this meeting in September or
7 thereabouts of 1990, did you know then that approval had
8 been granted to the construction of a bridge at
9 Hindmarsh Island.
10 A. No.
11 Q. You didn't take Mr Jolly at his word at the meeting
12 then.
13 A. No, we didn't take anybody at their word, because the
14 consultations had never happened with us, so we truly
15 thought that there would never be a bridge until the
16 consultations took place.
17 Q. But you must have been, Mr Jolly had foreshadowed
18 approval in a month. You didn't do anything about it
19 personally, did you.
20 A. No.
21 Q. And, so far as you were concerned, the matter was
22 proceeding. That is, the preparations were being made
23 for the construction of the bridge by September.
24 A. No, I believed preparations were being made for the
25 consultation process to take place. That was my
26 understanding.
27 Q. On what basis did you believe that.
28 A. After the meeting, the Rod Lucas meeting.
29 Q. Were there any signs of any consultation meetings.
30 A. Apparently that's what he said he was doing. He was
31 doing a job for the people and he would go back and tell
32 them what the people said and then further meetings
33 would take place.
34 Q. I will take you to Rod Lucas's report in a minute, but
35 Rod Lucas's report says that you, amongst other things,
36 that the Tendi were going to meet about the development
37 on Hindmarsh Island and come up with an opinion about
38 it.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. No, he was going to cause the meeting to happen between
2 the people and the company.
- 3 Q. So it is Mr Lucas's was going to do something, was he.
- 4 A. That's my understanding, yes.
- 5 Q. Nothing happened. Didn't that alarm you.
- 6 A. It did, yes.
- 7 Q. What did you do about it.
- 8 A. I don't know whether we went to Aboriginal Affairs or
9 somebody.
- 10 Q. I suggest, in 1990, you didn't do that, go to Aboriginal
11 Affairs, or anything like that. What do you say about
12 that.
- 13 A. No, I don't know.
- 14 Q. Isn't the truth of the position that, at that point in
15 time, you weren't much concerned about the Hindmarsh
16 Island development. Not sufficiently concerned to
17 oppose it. Isn't that the truthful position.
- 18 A. No, in the sense we had been doing a lot of work, at
19 that stage, with a lot of people and everybody -
20 everything was going by the consultation process. And
21 we thought this bridge will never happen until the
22 process takes place. After all, it is not our - it
23 wasn't our act, or -
- 24 Q. The Mount Barker Summit matter.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. And the Mount Barker grave desecration matter, you
27 didn't wait for any consultation process to take place
28 before you came out prominently, did you.
- 29 A. What do you mean?
- 30 Q. I am saying to you, you voiced your objection to the
31 Mount Barker Telecom towers development in the media
32 and, positively, you voiced your objection to the
33 desecration of the grave site in the quarry 20
34 kilometres east of Mount Barker. You did that
35 aggressively and positively, didn't you.
- 36 A. Yes.
- 37 Q. Without any process of consultation going on. I am
38 asking you, you agree with that, those two propositions.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. Yes, in a sense.

2 Q. In a sense.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. My question is therefore in relation to the construction
5 of the bridge at Hindmarsh Island, particularly in the
6 middle of 1990 and getting down onward from mid 1990,
7 you didn't do any such thing.

8 A. Because we never believed there would be a bridge.

9 Q. Can I take you to Tailem Bend, that was another
10 development, if you like, the construction of the road
11 from Tailem Bend to Wellington.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Where you and the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage
14 Committee intervened, didn't you.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. You had negotiations with the Highways Department and
17 negotiated some resolution of the fear that the road was
18 going to interfere with some sacred sites.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. That's the case, isn't it.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. You took the case to the Department, didn't you, the
23 Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. You didn't wait for consultation processes or meetings
26 or such things. You went straight to the Department
27 with your objection, didn't you.

28 A. Yes.

29 Q. With the help of Steve Hemming.

30 A. No.

31 Q. Weren't the museum involved in this, in some way.

32 A. I can't remember any involvement there with them.

33 Q. Didn't Mr Hemming and to some extent Mr Clarke from the
34 museum help you identify the sites and help you with
35 your negotiations with the Highways Department.

36 A. I can't remember that, no.

37 Q. Looking at the Lucas report, Exhibit 15, now before you,
38 I am producing to you now Exhibit 15, which is the

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 report of the anthropologist, Mr Lucas, which is dated
2 1990, but we know it was very early in 1990, January or
3 thereabouts.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. You were consulted in relation to this report, weren't
6 you, by Mr Lucas, is that right.

7 A. Yes, I was told of this meeting.

8 Q. You were told - you were contacted, weren't you, by Mr
9 Lucas, who told you what he was up to, as it were.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Doing an anthropological survey of the island.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And you knew, I suggest, that it was in the context of
14 developments on Hindmarsh Island, including a bridge.

15 A. No, of a development.

16 Q. Sorry.

17 A. Of a development.

18 Q. What did you understand to be -

19 A. What I understood from this here (INDICATES) was they
20 were asking us to consider a development on Hindmarsh
21 Island.

22 Q. What did you understand was encompassed in the
23 development.

24 A. A marina.

25 Q. Anything else.

26 A. No, nothing else.

27 Q. What, do you say you didn't know there was a bridge
28 involved.

29 A. I didn't know there was a bridge involved.

30 Q. Do I need to take you back through the Coorong
31 Consultative Committee meetings.

32 A. No, you need not do that, because this was the type of
33 thing we were waiting for and actually, when we saw
34 this, that there was no bridge involved, we thought that
35 was good.

36 Q. I am suggesting to you that, at the time that Mr Lucas
37 was doing his anthropological survey, you knew that, as
38 part of the development on Hindmarsh Island, a bridge

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 was proposed, didn't you.

2 A. He came across to do this report (INDICATES), to talk
3 about this report with the people. There was no bridge
4 at all talked about there.

5 Q. No, I put aside for a minute what Mr Lucas may or may
6 not have spoken about, but you knew, by early 1990, by
7 January 1990, did you not, that a bridge was proposed.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. In one of the developments on Hindmarsh Island.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Can I take you to item no.5 `Community Consultation'.
12 Anthropologists in this case don't either date their
13 reports or number their pages, so you will have to find
14 5.5, heading `Community Consultation'. It is about
15 two-thirds of the way through the report. Have you got
16 that, have you.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. 5.1, amongst other things, reads `Three Aboriginal
19 organisations have expressed a particular interest in
20 issues relating to development on Hindmarsh Island.
21 They are Raukkan Community Council, the Ngarrindjeri
22 Tendi and the Ngarrindjeri Lands and Progress
23 Association.' You are involved in two of those bodies,
24 aren't you, the Tendi and the progress association.

25 A. Yes, I was.

26 Q. Were you the chairman of the Tendi, at the time.

27 A. No, I wasn't.

28 Q. All three were contacted in the course of this
29 consultancy. So far as you were concerned, that's true,
30 you were contacted, weren't you.

31 A. Yes.

32 Q. You and your brother, Tom.

33 A. Yes.

34 Q. See the last paragraph under para.5.1 is `A special
35 meeting of the Tendi, Ngarrindjeri Tendi was convened by
36 Tom Trevorrow, who also represented the Ngarrindjeri
37 Lands and Progress Association, to discuss Hindmarsh
38 Island. This meeting was held at Kalparin Farm, on 26

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 January 1990.'

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Were you at that meeting.

4 A. No, unfortunately not.

5 Q. But can you tell us whether you expressed, through your
6 brother, any concerns about Hindmarsh Island and the
7 developments that this anthropologist was reporting in
8 respect of.

9 A. He went to the meeting, he knew what it was on about.

10 Q. Going over to 5.3, which is a summary of s.5, have you
11 got that, it starts 'Heritage is political', have you
12 got that. At 5.3, the summary of s.5. I will take you,
13 in fairness to what you have been saying, to the third
14 last paragraph. 'The Ngarrindjeri Tendi requested that
15 any potential developer pursue full and direct
16 consultation with the relevant representative bodies.
17 They expressed dissatisfaction with having to deal with
18 third parties such as the Aboriginal Heritage Branch or
19 consultants. They wished to deal personally with a
20 representative of all companies involved in any
21 development proposal.' That was your view, was it.

22 A. That was the view we took, yes.

23 Q. Now the next paragraph 'The Tendi wishes to convene a
24 meeting of all those people they believe have a
25 traditional interest in Hindmarsh Island. The purpose
26 of the meeting will be to elicit opinions on the
27 proposed development and to make a decision on what they
28 think should be done. The Tendi would like this to be
29 followed by a meeting on Hindmarsh Island to discuss
30 relevant issues with the developers.'

31 A. Yes.

32 Q. Do you see that.

33 A. Yes, I see that.

34 Q. Did you do that. Did the Tendi do that.

35 A. I don't believe it happened, because what happened out
36 of this meeting is that Lucas was going to organise the
37 meetings to happen. That was his message to take back
38 to his company.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. But that doesn't read like that.
2 A. I know how it reads. It says 'Tendi'.
3 Q. Why do you put it on Mr Lucas. I mean, you were a
4 member of -
5 A. Because that was what was stated quite clearly and
6 everybody understood it as such.
7 Q. Would the Tendi respond to him calling a meeting, would
8 it.
9 A. He was to make this meeting happen.
10 Q. Why would that be necessary, why couldn't you call the
11 meeting. It appears to indicate the Tendi wishes, you
12 wished to convene a meeting.
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. Of all the people with a traditional interest in the
15 island.
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. How would Mr Lucas know who to contact.
18 A. He was told which groups to contact.
19 Q. By whom.
20 A. By the Tendi in this document. If you have a look at
21 it. We told him.
22 Q. I have read this document word for word. There is no
23 suggestion that he was told who the traditional owners
24 were and that he was told that he had to organise a
25 meeting.
26 A. Yes.
27 Q. Because the way that reads is an obligation on the
28 Tendi.
29 A. The way it reads here (INDICATES), yes. It is not the
30 way it happened.
31 Q. So the Tendi just did nothing, is that the position.
32 A. Yes, we couldn't do anything.
33 Q. You couldn't do anything, at the time.
34 A. At the time, yes.
35 Q. Why not.
36 A. We weren't going to force a meeting on the people that
37 we wanted to meet.
38 Q. But you had the prospect of a development on Hindmarsh

6392

KC 67D

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Island.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And a bridge on the horizon, and you just sat and did
4 nothing.

5 A. Yes.

6 ADJOURNED 1 P.M.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 RESUMING 2.00 P.M.

2 Q. I emphasize again, if you feel uncomfortable, speak out.

3 A. Yes, I will.

4 Q. Looking at part of the news clippings, Exhibit 284, I
5 think you have in front of you a page of the
6 `Advertiser' dated - can you give us the date off that,
7 please.

8 A. 12th of the 8th, 88.

9 Q. I will check that to make sure it is right. It is 12
10 May 1988, p.9 of the `Advertiser'. It is headed
11 `Building union bans on Mt Barker Summit' and a
12 photograph of a man with a caption `Ben Carslake'
13 underneath it. Can you tell us, looking at that
14 photograph, is that the same union man who was involved
15 in the protests for the bridge at Hindmarsh Island.
16 There was a David Thomason from the CFMEU and another
17 man from the CFMEU named Ben Carslake. Do you recognise
18 that man as one of the unionists who took part in the
19 protests on the bridge at Hindmarsh Island.

20 A. Yes, I think I seen this man before. It might have been
21 once.

22 Q. That man joined the protest with the Aboriginal people,
23 such as yourself, in respect of the summit at Mt Barker,
24 didn't he. The union supported the Aboriginal
25 opposition to the Telecom towers, didn't they.

26 A. Yes, they did.

27 Q. Mr Carslake, in particular, was prominent.

28 A. Yes.

29 Q. And the same Mr Carslake who was a prominent protester
30 against the Hindmarsh Island Bridge.

31 A. Yes.

32 Q. Looking at the Rod Lucas report, Exhibit 15, I just want
33 to ask you one question about the conclusions, item 6.
34 You see there Mr Lucas, in para.4, concluded `There is
35 no extant mythology which specifies mythological sites
36 on Hindmarsh Island'.

37 A. I see this.

38 Q. You would disagree with that, wouldn't you.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Because you make it clear in your statement that there
3 are sites on Hindmarsh Island, do you not.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Did you take objection to that conclusion in the report
6 when it came to your notice.

7 A. Well, I do now, yes. Even the word 'mythology' to me is
8 not right within our culture. 'Myth' to me reminds me
9 of fairy tales, and that's not what we're talking about.

10 COMSR

11 Q. What is the distinction that you are making. You say
12 that -

13 A. Whenever I see it written within the Aboriginal culture
14 about myths and mythology, my mind associates that with
15 fables or that type of situation. I don't look at it
16 that way. They're more real to us. They're our belief.
17 They are not mythology.

18 XN

19 Q. Mr Lucas claims to have, shall I use the word
20 'consulted' with you, being a member of one of the three
21 communities that he consulted with. Did you convey to
22 him what you have conveyed to us today about the
23 significance of the island and the surrounds of the
24 island in your view.

25 A. No, I can't remember the circumstances in which I even
26 talked to him exactly. As you know, I wasn't at this
27 meeting and I can't remember when I spoke to him, but
28 the report has come to the attention later.

29 Q. You see there in the paragraph above that conclusion
30 about mythology there is 'Traditional owners of
31 Hindmarsh Island have not been identified in the course
32 of this consultancy. Aboriginal representative bodies
33 such as the Ngarrindjeri Tendi reserve the right to
34 conduct such a process of identification'.

35 A. Yes.

36 Q. That touches on the question I asked you earlier,
37 doesn't it, that the ball would appear to have been left
38 in your court by Mr Lucas. Would you agree with that.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. No, I don't agree with that.

2 Q. Can you tell us when you knew Mr Lucas was doing an
3 anthropological survey of the island, why you didn't
4 convey to him at least as much as you've conveyed to us
5 today.

6 A. I've been trying to tell you right from the start, I
7 guess, that when he had this first meeting with the
8 Ngarrindjeri people we always believed that there was a
9 meeting to be created with the people who wanted this,
10 and so we could discuss that with the appropriate
11 Ngarrindjeri people from the areas.

12 Q. And still by March of 1990 you were told the bridge was
13 going to go ahead, when you were on the Coorong
14 Consultative Committee, and no meeting had taken place,
15 had it.

16 A. No.

17 Q. And you had just let things sit the way they were.

18 A. Yes, like probably a dozen and one other things.

19 Q. Your brother suggested to us in evidence that the
20 meeting didn't take place because no-one provided funds
21 and expenses to gather people into the meeting.

22 A. Yes, like I suggest, that was part of the problem of
23 this report.

24 Q. Which was it. Was it Mr Lucas' obligation to do that,
25 or was it a problem of funds, or was it a mixture of
26 both.

27 A. Under normal circumstances when we work with people like
28 that, the normal thing is to have preliminary discussion
29 with them, they go back to the developers, or whoever
30 they are working for, and if we want a meeting with
31 them, they create a meeting to happen. If that means
32 petrol and that to get to the meeting, then it happens.

33 Q. I want to take you now to the Vanessa Edmonds reports
34 quickly. Vanessa Edmonds carried out an archaeological
35 survey in 1988, and then another one at about the same
36 time in 1989-90. She delivered her report to various
37 people on about 23 January 1990. You deal with that, I

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 think, at p.11 of your statement, don't you. Is that
2 right, the Vanessa Edmonds report, p.11.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. It's the case, isn't it, that you received a copy of the
5 second report of Vanessa Edmonds on or about 23 January
6 1990. I might be able to help you with this.
- 7 A. Yes, you better.
- 8 Q. Looking at a copy of Exhibit 178, document No.29, which
9 is a letter from Vanessa Edmonds to Mr Chapman of
10 Binalong Pty Ltd dated 23 January 1990, in the second
11 paragraph of that letter, Vanessa Edmonds says there
12 'There are four other copies. One has been sent to
13 Neale Draper, Aboriginal Heritage Branch; another to
14 Point McLeay Community Council; one to Mr George
15 Trevorrow at the Ngarrindjeri Lands and Progress
16 Association, Camp Coorong; and I have kept a copy for my
17 own records'. Would you accept then that at or about 23
18 January 1990 you received a copy of Vanessa Edmonds'
19 second report.
- 20 A. No, I've never seen this report. This one.
- 21 Q. Not the letter.
- 22 A. No, the report.
- 23 Q. I will show you the report, because Vanessa Edmonds
24 claims to have sent it to you.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. Looking at Exhibit 14, the Vanessa Edmonds report of
27 1990, I suggest you received a copy of that here at Camp
28 Coorong.
- 29 A. You can suggest that, but it's whether I've seen it or
30 not is the other thing.
- 31 Q. Have a look and tell us.
- 32 A. No, I don't recall seeing this one.
- 33 Q. Half the report deals with the bridge, doesn't it.
- 34 A. I don't know.
- 35 Q. It deals with sites on the Goolwa side and about the
36 landing area of the bridge as it was then proposed. I
37 take you to p.15 of the report, about halfway through.
- 38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. `Proposed bridge' do you see that. Then the balance of
2 the report goes on to deal with the bridge, doesn't it.
- 3 A. Yes, it does.
- 4 Q. You say you have never seen this report until now.
- 5 A. Yes, I say I have never seen this one until now.
- 6 Q. Until this moment.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. So is it the case that you had no idea that Vanessa
9 Edmonds was doing a survey which, in part, related to
10 sites in the bridge corridor. Do you say that, do you.
11 When she was doing it in early 1990 and late 1989, you
12 had no idea that she was doing that work.
- 13 A. No, the first I knew is when she was doing some work
14 there.
- 15 Q. But in respect of her second report which was published
16 in January 1990, were you aware in January 1990 and
17 perhaps earlier in December 1989, that she was
18 conducting a survey which, in part, involved a survey of
19 sites affected by the bridge corridor on both sides of
20 the channel.
- 21 A. No, I don't remember this report at all.
- 22 Q. No, putting the report aside, do you remember that
23 Vanessa Edmonds was conducting a survey in late December
24 1989 and January 1990 to do, amongst other things, with
25 sites affected by the bridge alignment on both sides of
26 the channel. Did you know that.
- 27 A. I knew she was doing archaeological work there, but -
- 28 Q. Relating to a bridge.
- 29 A. Not relating to a bridge.
- 30 Q. Isn't it the case that Vanessa Edmonds spoke to you
31 about, for instance, Amelia Park, where the bridge
32 alignment with Crystal Street was going to land at
33 Amelia Park.
- 34 A. No, she spoke about that later on.
- 35 Q. I'm suggesting to you that she poke about it to you at
36 the time she was doing the survey in January 1990.
- 37 A. We spoke about sites within the marina area.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. Did you not have a conversation with Vanessa Edmonds
2 about Amelia Park in January 1990.
- 3 A. No, I think it was later.
- 4 Q. How much later.
- 5 A. A fair bit later, when she done her third report.
- 6 Q. She did a third report.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Are you sure about that.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Did you get a copy of the third report.
- 11 A. No, she was doing a third - or there was a job that she
12 was doing on the third time over there, and that related
13 to that area.
- 14 Q. She came back in 1994, and went around speaking to a lot
15 of people, didn't she.
- 16 A. Yes, that's when she done a quick survey around the
17 place.
- 18 Q. I don't think she did any archaeological work on that
19 occasion though, did she. She came back to sort of help
20 the Chapmans find out what was happening, isn't that the
21 case.
- 22 A. I thought it was in regards to the archaeology, because
23 that's what we talked about.
- 24 Q. Can I tell you what Vanessa Edmonds says in her
25 evidence. Vanessa Edmonds says at p.4,075 - you haven't
26 got that there, I will just read it to you - about line
27 15 `But what I probably did was probably rang George
28 Trevorrow at some time and told him of the burial and,
29 you know, the recommendations and that. That would have
30 been prior to this report being completed'. Certainly
31 she only says `probably', but does that prod your memory
32 at all.
- 33 A. We talked a lot about skeletal remains in regards to
34 being inside the marina development area and where in
35 actual fact one was taken and put in what they call a
36 green belt or something to that effect.
- 37 Q. You agree in your statement that she talked to you.
- 38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. When she was doing this survey.
2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Didn't she also talk to you about her recommendations
4 that the bridge alignment be changed from Crystal Street
5 to Brooking Street because of Amelia Park.
6 A. No, I don't remember that at all.
- 7 Q. At p.4,077, the question was 'In any event, as you have
8 said, or have you said, you did speak with George
9 Trevorrow, did you not'. Answer 'I mean, we didn't
10 discuss - I don't remember him every - that should be
11 "ever" - 'discussing the bridge approach in any great
12 detail. I probably mentioned that that's what I'd done,
13 that I had a look at the mainland, at the bridge
14 approach, and I had found a site along there and
15 recommended that the bridge approach be shifted to the
16 existing alignment with the ferry to avoid that
17 particular site'. Question 'This is Amelia Park we're
18 talking about'. Answer 'Yes'. Again, although it is
19 couched in terms of a probability only, what do you say
20 about that.
21 A. I still say I can't remember discussing a bridge
22 approach with only sites in general.
- 23 Q. You agree that you spoke with Vanessa Edmonds about
24 these skeletal remains that were found in the marina.
25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. She asserts, on the basis of a probability only, that
27 she spoke to you about the bridge alignment in
28 conjunction with that conversation about the skeletal
29 remains. What do you say about that.
30 A. No.
- 31 Q. Did you go back with Vanessa Edmonds at a later time to
32 sites near the wharf at Goolwa, and locate evidence of
33 some middens there.
34 A. I recall going there once. It might have been during a
35 survey for Telecom, I think, Strathalbyn to Goolwa fibre
36 line. Is that what you are talking about?
37 Q. No. I'm talking about the other side of Brooking
38 Street, the southern side of Brooking Street towards the

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 railway station and down to the wharves, in that area.
- 2 A. I think we went there that time we was doing the optical
3 fibre line.
- 4 Q. Did you have something to do with the negotiations to do
5 with the Telecom optical fibre cable, did you.
- 6 A. Yes, from Strathalbyn to Goolwa.
- 7 Q. We are not talking about the one across the river here,
8 are we.
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. That was in 1994, wasn't it, that one.
- 11 A. It was one from Strathalbyn to Goolwa I'm talking about.
- 12 Q. Just before I leave Vanessa Edmonds, you mentioned that
13 there was another occasion when she came back, and she
14 has already told us that was on 23 and 24 May 1994, and
15 that's what you termed the third survey, isn't it. That
16 you thought she did some sort of survey on that
17 occasion.
- 18 A. Yes, I spoke to her on the phone in regards to that.
- 19 Q. When you spoke on the phone with Vanessa Edmonds, did
20 she raise with you the fact that she had already - that
21 Neale Draper was conducting a survey of the island at
22 considerable expense and that she herself had already
23 done two such surveys.
- 24 A. No. She spoke to me about her coming over, and she
25 wanted to talk to me and the others about going over
26 there, and that Neale was over there doing a survey.
- 27 Q. Did she not mention, for instance, that she thought it
28 anomalous that Neale Draper had his wife as a field
29 assistant.
- 30 A. I think she did mention something about the wife.
- 31 Q. Did she complain about the fact to you that she had
32 learnt that some considerable cost was being expended on
33 this new survey that Neale Draper was doing. Did she
34 mention that topic.
- 35 A. I don't remember her talking about it.
- 36 Q. But you remember her complaining about the use of a wife
37 as a field assistant.
- 38 A. She spoke about that fact, I think.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. Did she raise with you the question of her consulting
2 with the communities and a criticism that she hadn't
3 done so, or something like that.
- 4 A. No, I can't recall that. We talked a lot.
- 5 Q. Did she not say that she had been told not to consult in
6 detail with the communities because it was being done by
7 the anthropologist.
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. You don't remember that.
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Did you tell her - that is, in May 1994 - that you were
12 under the impression that Lindy Warrell would be doing
13 an anthropological report.
- 14 A. Yes, I did.
- 15 Q. Why were you under that impression.
- 16 A. It was through a telephone call from Lindy Warrell, and
17 I had the impression that she might be doing some work
18 there.
- 19 Q. When was this telephone call.
- 20 A. I have no idea when that call was.
- 21 Q. The conversation with Vanessa Edmonds we know was in
22 May.
- 23 A. It was just before that. It would have been somewhere
24 just before that, I would imagine, because I told her to
25 talk to the women.
- 26 Q. Was this weeks before.
- 27 A. I'm not sure. It wouldn't have been very long before
28 that.
- 29 Q. Vanessa Edmonds says that you told her that you'd had a
30 chat with Lindy Warrell on the assumption that she was
31 going ahead with the report, and that you had told her
32 to get in touch with Doreen Kartinyeri and Val Power.
- 33 A. That's what I told her, 'Speak to them women'.
- 34 Q. Do you agree that you did that then. You had spoken to
35 Lindy Warrell and you had recommended that Lindy Warrell
36 get in touch with Doreen Kartinyeri and Val Power.
- 37 A. Yes.
- 38 Q. You told Vanessa Edmonds that on the telephone.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. Yes, I believe so.
- 2 Q. You told Vanessa Edmonds that on the telephone in late
3 May 1994, about 23 May, according to her.
- 4 A. Right.
- 5 Q. Sorry, it is 24 May. Can you tell us, just thinking
6 back now, when was it that you had this telephone
7 conversation with Lindy Warrell.
- 8 A. I can't remember when the call came. It was before that
9 - the call with Vanessa.
- 10 Q. We know Lindy Warrell came here to Camp Coorong.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. On the weekend of, I think, 26 March. It was, in fact,
13 on 26 March 1994.
- 14 A. I believe so, yes.
- 15 Q. And you weren't here at the time, were you.
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. Did your brother Tom tell you about that visit.
- 18 A. He may have, but not in particular.
- 19 CONTINUED

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. Did he mention to you that Lindy Warrell had called on
2 him and left her card here, at Camp Coorong.
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. On what basis then were you telephoning Lindy Warrell.
- 5 A. I never telephoned Lindy Warrell.
- 6 Q. You said you had, you agreed with me that you had told
7 Vanessa Edmonds that you had a chat with Lindy Warrell.
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And recommended that she get in touch with Doreen
10 Kartinyeri and Val Power.
- 11 A. Yes, Val Power was the woman's issues officer in DOSAA,
12 I believe.
- 13 Q. Within DOSAA.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Let's get it straight, you told Vanessa Edmonds, on 24
16 May 1994, when she had a conversation with you, that you
17 had had a chat with Lindy, Lindy Warrell. That you
18 thought she was going ahead with a report and that you
19 told her to get in touch with Doreen Kartinyeri and Val
20 Power.
- 21 A. What report are you talking about?
- 22 Q. A report, an anthropological report.
- 23 A. Who?
- 24 Q. Lindy Warrell.
- 25 A. No, she never talked about a report at all. I said she
26 telephoned.
- 27 Q. Can I go back to scratch then.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. Did you have a conversation with the anthropologist, Dr
30 Lindy Warrell.
- 31 A. Yes.
- 32 Q. Was it on the telephone.
- 33 A. On the telephone.
- 34 Q. You were here at Camp Coorong when you spoke to her.
- 35 A. Yes.
- 36 Q. What was the content of that telephone conversation.
- 37 A. It was something to do that she was coming down this
38 way. She was apparently out of the area, at that time,

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 and she was working on something to do with women's
2 issues. And, when she talked like that, I said to get
3 in touch with either Val or Doreen.
- 4 Q. She rang here to Camp Coorong.
5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And she spoke to you.
7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Was she booking in, was she, in effect.
9 A. No, she wasn't booking in, at that time, no.
- 10 Q. Why did she ring.
11 A. I'm not sure. It was just who to get in touch with when
12 she got down here, to talk to.
- 13 Q. She rang out of the blue, spoke to you.
14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Tell us what the conversation was. I am trying to make
16 some sense of the fact that this lady rang you, out of
17 the blue. For what purpose did she ring you.
18 A. To tell you the truth, I'm not sure myself now what the
19 hell she rang for.
- 20 COMSR
- 21 Q. What did she say when she rang.
22 A. She introduced herself and said that she was working
23 outside - up in the northern regions or something and
24 that she was coming down here and she wanted to talk to
25 someone about - I don't know what it was about. And I
26 told her 'Look, if you want to talk to somebody, if you
27 are working in the area of women's issues, talk to the
28 women's issue officer, who is Val Power, who is in
29 DOSAA.' And that was sort of the extent of it.
- 30 XN
- 31 Q. She came here and stayed on the 26th.
32 A. Yes, I believe she did, yes.
- 33 Q. I suggest perhaps then it was a telephone call that
34 preceded that to book herself in here, for instance, to
35 make some contact with people down here.
36 A. No, I'm not sure, no.
- 37 Q. You referred her to Doreen Kartinyeri and Val Power.
38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. In connection then with the Hindmarsh Island business,
2 was it.
- 3 A. No, it was women's issues or something.
- 4 Q. Why were you referring her to Doreen Kartinyeri and Val
5 Power.
- 6 A. Because I am not a woman.
- 7 Q. What women's issues were being discussed between you and
8 Lindy Warrell.
- 9 A. There was none, that's why I didn't want to talk. I
10 told her to go to the women's issues officer.
- 11 Q. Was she talking to you about women's issues perhaps down
12 in this area, is that what you were given to understand.
- 13 A. No, she said she was working on women's issues and that
14 she was coming down this way and she was working with
15 Aboriginal women. And I said `Well, if you are working
16 with Aboriginal women and you want to talk to Aboriginal
17 people, talk to those people.' They were the closest
18 point to contact in Adelaide.
- 19 Q. You were aware then that Lindy Warrell came down and
20 stayed here.
- 21 A. Yes, I understand that now, yes.
- 22 Q. There was a big meeting of Aboriginal people here on the
23 following Monday, the reconciliation meeting, wasn't
24 there.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. Did your brother, Tom, or perhaps Ellen Trevorrow convey
27 to you that Lindy Warrell had been here on the 26th.
- 28 A. They may have.
- 29 Q. And that she left a card.
- 30 A. No, in the hustle and bustle of the preparation for the
31 reconciliation meeting, you know, this place is going
32 one day to the next flat out. We don't always get time
33 to sit down and talk about who may have been in on the
34 weekend and what they done on the weekends and whether
35 they left cards or not. It is just too much.
- 36 Q. This is a significant event.
- 37 A. Yes, so I understand.
- 38 Q. That's what I am suggesting to you. Did your brother or

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 perhaps your sister-in-law, Ellen Trevorrow, say to you
2 that Lindy Warrell had said to them words to the effect
3 'Don't forget the women's business.'
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. Anything like that.
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. Or words like 'It would be nice if there was some
8 women's issues in connection with Hindmarsh Island.'
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Nothing like that said.
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Of course, your position was that there clearly were.
- 13 A. There were, yes.
- 14 Q. Women's issues involved, weren't there.
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Isn't it the case that Lindy Warrell was ringing about
17 just that when you referred her to Doreen Kartinyeri and
18 Val Power, women's issues to do with Hindmarsh Island.
- 19 A. No, not to do with Hindmarsh Island. She said she had
20 been working with the women up there and she wanted to
21 see women here.
- 22 Q. Can you suggest to me why an anthropologist working in
23 this State and working in particular in the northern
24 areas of the State on women's issues would ring down to
25 Camp Coorong to you, George Trevorrow, about women's
26 issues.
- 27 A. I have no idea, unless it was in relation to her coming
28 down here on the later stage, I don't know.
- 29 Q. You went to a public meeting at the Centenary Hall in
30 Goolwa, on 8 October 1993, didn't you.
- 31 A. Yes.
- 32 Q. You went in company with Henry Rankine.
- 33 A. That's right.
- 34 Q. Prior to that, there was a meeting at Camp Coorong, was
35 there not, here. Before the public meeting there was a
36 meeting of Aboriginal people, including yourself, here
37 at Camp Coorong, is that right. About September or
38 October of 1993.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. There could have been. We have meetings all the time.
- 2 Q. Can you tell me, what was it that led up to you going to
- 3 the public meeting with Henry Rankine in Goolwa, on 8
- 4 October 1993.
- 5 A. Why did I go there?
- 6 Q. Yes, what provoked you, who invited you, what happened.
- 7 A. There was a lady from the conservation movement. There
- 8 was pamphlets that were going around about the meeting.
- 9 And asked would we like to come and talk at that
- 10 meeting.
- 11 Q. I want to show you this what we have been calling a
- 12 flyer for a public meeting at Centenary Hall, Cadell
- 13 Street, Goolwa, on Friday, 8 October 1993. Would you
- 14 have a look at that. Looking at that, that's the
- 15 meeting that we are talking about, that you and Henry
- 16 Rankine attended, is that right.
- 17 A. Yes, I believe that is the meeting, yes.
- 18 Q. Therefore, that was an advertising flyer that presumably
- 19 was produced before the meeting.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. So that positive arrangements had been made for a
- 22 representative of the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage
- 23 Committee to be on the stage as one of the speakers for
- 24 that meeting.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. Positive arguments had been made well before - not well
- 27 before, but before 8 October, hadn't they.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. Who were they made by.
- 30 A. Like I said, it was a lady who said she was from the
- 31 conservation meeting.
- 32 Q. Conservation council of South Australia.
- 33 A. Movement or council or something, yes.
- 34 Q. What was her name.
- 35 A. I can't recall her name. It was Sally or something. We
- 36 just had contact on the phone.
- 37 Q. Did she come here, did she.
- 38 A. No, she didn't come here.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. To speak to you.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What, she recruited you on the telephone, did she.

4 A. Yes, we had several conversations over the phone whether
5 someone could make it over to this meeting.

6 Q. You and Henry Rankine went to the meeting.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Did you, prior to the meeting, do a walk around the
9 island or the Goolwa foreshore.

10 A. No, I don't think, because I think we went over that
11 evening.

12 Q. Mr Rankine told us that he walked around, went across on
13 the ferry and walked around the foreshore with a group
14 of white people.

15 A. That sounds like Henry. He always gets to places a lot
16 earlier than me.

17 Q. What about you, were you there.

18 A. No, I came along later in the evening I think in that
19 meeting.

20 Q. A witness gave evidence that he saw you and Henry
21 Rankine walking up and down the foreshore on the Goolwa
22 side in the vicinity of the bridge alignment sometime
23 prior to the week of 8 October.

24 A. I don't recall that at all.

25 Q. Do you say it didn't happen or could it have happened.

26 A. I don't think that happened. Not Henry and I I don't
27 think.

28 Q. It would make a bit of sense, wouldn't it, you were
29 going along to the meeting, which was relating to the
30 bridge, and you were having a look around to prepare
31 yourself for the meeting.

32 A. No.

33 Q. You spoke to that meeting of people, didn't you.

34 A. Yes.

35 Q. We have got a tape recording of that. You spoke first
36 and I think Henry Rankine - not first of all the people,
37 but before Henry Rankine and then you answered some
38 questions, didn't you.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. You said, amongst other things 'We have not been
3 consulted at all.'

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Is that true.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. What did you mean by that then.

8 A. I suppose I am meaning what I have been trying to tell
9 you all the way through, that through every job that was
10 ever done there was consultation and, on this one, there
11 had been no consultation.

12 Q. Consultation in the sense of what.

13 A. Of sitting down -

14 Q. A series of sit down meetings with people.

15 A. Meeting with the people who the development belongs to.

16 Q. Despite the fact that, in the course of the morning or
17 the previous evidence you have given, you had repeated
18 notices of the fact that a bridge was going to be
19 constructed at Goolwa, didn't you.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. You did nothing about it waiting for this consultation
22 process to take place.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. In effect, you let approvals, a number of approvals in
25 respect to the bridge go past, didn't you.

26 A. What do you mean?

27 Q. There was an approval in April 1990, for instance, that
28 occurred.

29 A. Those, yes.

30 Q. That occurred following Mr Jolly's prediction that it
31 was going to happen.

32 A. Everybody predicts. There was a lot of people
33 predicting, I suppose, that there would be. There was
34 lots and lots of people predicting that there wouldn't
35 be. And, as I said all along, we still never considered
36 that whatever would happen until the consultation
37 process had happened.

38 Q. No consultation in your view took place at all.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 A. No.

2 Q. You only came out in opposition to the bridge formally
3 in October 1993.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Still with no consultation having occurred.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. What took you so long.

8 A. We never believed it would happen.

9 Q. But what took you so long to get on the stage of a
10 public meeting and voice your protest.

11 A. Because, at that point in time, it was looking like
12 there was not going to be any consultation but still
13 going to be development there.

14 Q. That must have been surely the case in March/April of
15 1990.

16 A. No, I have been on cases where it is right up to the day
17 where you go in and work on it.

18 Q. You just crossed your fingers about it, did you.

19 A. No, it is not crossing fingers. You don't open your big
20 mouth until there is problems and they are right there.
21 We are always in the hope that things don't happen
22 sometimes.

23 Q. As at 8 October 1993, you had not breathed a word to
24 anybody about the existence of women's business on
25 Hindmarsh Island, had you.

26 A. No, I didn't.

27 Q. No-one in the Aboriginal Affairs Department, the
28 Heritage Branch.

29 A. No.

30 Q. Not to Rod Lucas.

31 A. No.

32 Q. Not to Vanessa Edmonds.

33 A. I might have said something to Vanessa Edmonds about
34 something there, yes.

35 Q. About women's business.

36 A. No, that it was an important place.

37 Q. Vanessa Edmonds says in her evidence that she asked you
38 about sites and the only site you indicated to her was

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 one already registered at the very end of the island, is
2 that the case.
- 3 A. I talked to her about the importance to the Ngarrindjeri
4 people of the island.
- 5 Q. That is at the very southern end of the island -
- 6 A. No, the whole island.
- 7 Q. As a registered site.
- 8 A. And the waters surrounding the island.
- 9 Q. You said that to Vanessa Edmonds.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Did you.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. You have seen her report.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. There is not a mention of that in her report, is there.
- 16 A. It was said.
- 17 Q. Who else did you mention that to, the waters and the
18 sacredness of the waters.
- 19 A. I mentioned it to a reconciliation council that was
20 here.
- 21 Q. The reconciliation council.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. When is this.
- 24 A. You gave me the date just now, the one on the letter
25 there.
- 26 Q. At the reconciliation meeting here.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 Q. You addressed this reconciliation meeting here at Camp
29 Coorong about the bridge, didn't you, in October 1993.
- 30 A. Yes.
- 31 Q. You had already been approached to give a speech, or go
32 on the stage at Goolwa, hadn't you, so you decided to
33 come out in objection, is that right.
- 34 A. Yes.
- 35 Q. You told all the people, the Aboriginal people who
36 gathered here, including Dorothy Wilson, about the
37 bridge down at Hindmarsh Island, is that right.
- 38 A. What meeting is this?

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. In October of 1993, before you went down to Goolwa,
2 there was a meeting here at Camp Coorong of Aboriginal
3 people, wasn't there.
- 4 A. Yes, there has been a lot of meetings. I just can't
5 remember that one.
- 6 Q. I am just asking to you focus on the October 1993, just
7 before you went down to Goolwa.
- 8 A. I can't remember which one you are talking about.
- 9 Q. Henry Rankine suggests there was a meeting here. Would
10 you agree with me.
- 11 A. There may have been.
- 12 Q. And so does Dorothy Wilson. And you spoke to the
13 meeting about the bridge down at Hindmarsh Island. And
14 let me see if this refreshes your memory. You told the
15 gathering here, according to Dorothy Wilson, that there
16 was to be another bridge built around the Murray Mouth
17 to link up with the South East road.
- 18 A. Another bridge built?
- 19 Q. Yes.
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Did you not convey to the Aboriginal people here, at
22 least, that there was a fear that this would be, the
23 Hindmarsh Island bridge, would be the first of another,
24 of two bridges. The second one to link the island on
25 the other end to the mainland to link up with the main
26 South East road.
- 27 A. No, there was no such talk about another bridge. My
28 fear, at the time, what I said, if that's right, is that
29 one bridge would link the island. And my understanding,
30 from what people said that use the causeway, the
31 barrages that come through to Pelican Point.
- 32 Q. You did say that then at this meeting.
- 33 A. If that meeting was, yes.
- 34 Q. On what basis did you say that, that was just a fear you
35 had.
- 36 A. It was a fear that I had.
- 37 Q. That you had in your breast, was it.
- 38 A. Yes, and it is still a fear. And I think people might

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 start seeing the warrant of that fear somewhere down the
2 track, if that is not right.

3 Q. Were you trying to conjure up some support in amongst
4 the Aboriginal people in your objection to the bridge,
5 were you.

6 A. No, I didn't have to conjure up any support, it was
7 there.

8 Q. Was that suggested to you by anybody else, this notion
9 of yet another bridge.

10 A. No, there was no -

11 Q. Linking the southern end of the island with the mainland
12 and connecting with the South East road.

13 A. No, there has never been any talk about another bridge.

14 Q. Except by you.

15 A. No, that's what I am saying, I am talking about the
16 barrages.

17 Q. Do you not agree then that you suggested, at some stage
18 or other, that you told people of your fear that there
19 was to be another bridge built around the Murray Mouth
20 to link up with the South East road.

21 A. I am trying to tell him that I have never mentioned
22 anything about another bridge. My fear is, was and
23 still is, that once the one bridge came, the causeway
24 would be the connector between the land zone and it is
25 still a fear. That's what I am trying to tell you.

26 COMSR

27 Q. You are saying that people would get to Hindmarsh Island
28 via the bridge and then they would use the causeways to
29 get over to Pelican Point, is that it.

30 A. Yes, why build a bridge to a little island like that?

31 It just makes no sense to me. Unless it is going to be
32 for more purpose other than servicing a little island.

33 And I still have worries about that. Because what will
34 happen to the northern Coorong?

35 XN

36 Q. I am really putting to you what Dorothy Wilson has said.
37 She says that `In mid October, there was a meeting of
38 Ngarrindjeri people at Camp Coorong, where we were

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 talking about establishing the Tendi again', is that
2 correct.

3 A. Yes, that could be right.

4 MR SMITH: That is on p.7 of Dorothy Wilson's
5 statement, Exhibit 34.

6 XN

7 Q. 'The meeting was called to discuss many things,
8 including the Tendi.' Do you agree with that.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. 'We talked about Mabo land claims and other land use
11 issues.' Could that be right.

12 A. It could be.

13 Q. Pardon.

14 A. It could be.

15 Q. Could be.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. 'At this meeting', according to Dorothy, 'George
18 Trevorrow told us about the fight to stop the bridge.'

19 A. Yes, that could be right.

20 Q. That could be right.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. You were about to join the fight, weren't you.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. 'He told us the Chapmans were carting away truck loads.
25 of Aboriginal bones from the island.' Did you tell the
26 meeting that.

27 A. No, not truck loads of Aboriginal bones, that would be
28 quite a bit of an exaggeration.

29 Q. But anything like that.

30 A. I said there has been a lot of talk about skeletal
31 remains of the old people being taken out of the sites
32 over there.

33 Q. When you were saying that, did you blame the Chapmans
34 for that to this meeting.

35 A. The marina development.

36 Q. You conveyed to the meeting that people had been saying
37 that a taxi driver in Goolwa had said that he had a boot
38 load of bones. Another word was used, but I won't use

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 it.

2 A. Yes, that could be.

3 Q. But Aboriginal bones. A taxi driver in Goolwa had a
4 boot load of Aboriginal bones.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Was that discussed at this meeting.

7 A. I think it may have been discussed.

8 Q. According to Dorothy, you said that to this meeting,
9 that there were sacred burial places all around the
10 island.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Do you agree with that.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Do you agree with me that however you only pointed out
15 one burial site to Vanessa Edmonds, when she was doing
16 her second survey.

17 A. No.

18 Q. She says that she asked you and you indicated the one
19 site that was already registered right on the southern
20 tip of Hindmarsh Island.

21 A. It may have been the only one that we talked about,
22 because that was the one that had to be pulled up,
23 because of the significance, it had to be taken out and
24 put in another spot.

25 Q. Dorothy further says that you said at this meeting there
26 would be another bridge built around the Murray Mouth to
27 link up with the South East road.

28 A. I thought I already explained that.

29 Q. You have already explained that.

30 A. Yes.

31 Q. But now I am reading to you in the context of what
32 Dorothy alleges happened, Dorothy Wilson. Did you say
33 anything like that.

34 A. No, I never said nothing about another bridge. Isn't
35 that clear yet?

36 Q. Did you mean something to do with the barrages, perhaps.
37 Could you explain that again.

38 A. I thought I explained it about three times now.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. I was distracted, could you explain that again.
2 A. I said before my fear was that, if the bridge went on,
3 that the barrages would be used then to get people right
4 through to the northern Coorong region back to Pelican
5 Point.
6 Q. Therefore used as a bridge, if you like, to get back to
7 the mainland.
8 A. What?
9 Q. You are suggesting, are you, that people could traverse
10 the whole island, connect up with the mainland again at
11 Pelican Point.
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. Via the barrages.
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. That's tantamount, isn't it, to suggesting to this
16 Aboriginal group that was meeting here that that was the
17 ultimate plan. That is, to connect the Coorong to the
18 southern tip of the island so that people could travel
19 right the length of the island across to the mainland
20 again. Is that what you suggested to them.
21 A. I thought that's what I have been saying all along.
22 CONTINUED

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. And you suggested that because that was your fear.

2 A. Yes, and which I state it still is.

3 Q. It was a fear, wasn't it, that you had never expressed
4 on the Coorong Consultative Committee, had you.

5 A. No.

6 Q. It was a fear you'd never expressed to Rod Lucas when he
7 was doing his anthropological survey.

8 A. No.

9 Q. It was a fear you never expressed to Vanessa Edmonds,
10 had you.

11 A. No.

12 Q. Is it the case then, as Dorothy said here in her
13 statement at p.7, para.2.5, that this stirred everyone
14 up at the meeting.

15 A. No.

16 MR MEYER: That answer wasn't clear. He nodded his
17 head and said no.

18 COMSR

19 Q. Is that yes or no.

20 A. No, I didn't.

21 XN

22 Q. What was the reaction then of the meeting to what you
23 said then about the Hindmarsh Island Bridge.

24 A. The people didn't like the idea.

25 Q. So they endorsed you going along to the town hall
26 addressing the meeting, did they.

27 A. They endorsed me by attending. That's why the people
28 came together in the first place. That was endorsement
29 enough for me for their being against that sort of
30 bridge.

31 Q. You told us you thought this bridge was never going to
32 go ahead so, therefore, you didn't react to the numerous
33 notices you got about the bridge, did you.

34 A. Yes.

35 Q. So what provoked this sudden vigorous protest by you.

36 A. I wouldn't call it a sudden vigorous protest to speak at
37 a public meeting.

38 Q. You'd never done anything like that before. You had

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 never addressed the Aboriginal people like that before
2 about your fears, had you.

3 A. We've been talking about that all the time. It was the
4 biggest thing going amongst Aboriginal communities.

5 Q. Did you feel convinced by October of 1993 then that this
6 bridge was going to proceed, did you, if you didn't do
7 something.

8 A. Yes, I felt that way, getting to that point in time, I
9 guess, that it was getting very close to something
10 happening.

11 Q. What was the event or events that made you think that,
12 as opposed to thinking it earlier when all sorts of
13 things were happening and all sorts of approvals were
14 being granted.

15 A. I don't know. I guess it was with the continuous
16 buildups of those type of things, that's why.

17 Q. You went to the public meeting, and you claim there that
18 you have not been consulted at all.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What do you think your role was on the Coorong
21 Consultative Committee.

22 A. I was an Aboriginal token.

23 Q. You didn't think for a minute that your purpose on the
24 committee, you and Henry Rankine, were so Aboriginal
25 people from this area could have a role in being
26 consulted with developments that were occurring around
27 the place.

28 A. That's supposed to be the purpose of that position.

29 Q. There was, I suggest to you, no basis for thinking that
30 you were a man of straw, because you had successfully
31 protested against the Telecom tower, the construction of
32 the Mt Barker site, the burial bone incident near the Mt
33 Barker summit, the Tailem Bend freeway, hadn't you. You
34 had successfully made your point on behalf of the
35 Aboriginal people of this area in respect of those
36 matters, hadn't you.

37 A. Yes. The difference in those matters were those three
38 that you mentioned were actually in - almost in

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 progress. This other one hadn't become in progress.

2 Q. They had core tested the river bed for the sinking of
3 the pylons, hadn't they.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. They had got within a whisker of starting the
6 construction of the bridge.

7 A. That's right.

8 Q. They had got all their approvals through. So what do
9 you mean by your last answer.

10 A. It's what I mean all along with different problems like
11 this. For example, in Meningie once with our local
12 caravan park, there was a development going to go on
13 there. They wanted to build a new caravan park and they
14 started there, and we didn't say anything about it
15 because we thought they wasn't going to touch our site,
16 but until they went in and that and physically started
17 digging, we didn't say anything, so we went in there.
18 The suggestion was that I collect up a few of my boys
19 and walk along by the dozer with a bag and pick up the
20 bones and put them somewhere else. So after many
21 meetings and consultations with the local council, we
22 managed to sit down then, talk it over, we brought in
23 the Elders and the people from around the different
24 communities, and now everybody wins. The burial mound
25 is still there. It's the only - the last burial mound
26 within the township of Meningie. The rest have been
27 bulldozed. It is a lovely shelter now for a beautiful
28 little caravan park. So it shows with consultation that
29 things can work out sometimes.

30 Q. At the public meeting, you are also recorded as saying
31 that it blows your mind that people can want to do that,
32 that is, put a bridge up. Is that the way you felt
33 about it.

34 A. Yes.

35 Q. `And we have not been approached by anyone' you are
36 heard saying.

37 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. How can you say that in the light of what has happened
2 on the committee, the anthropologists -
- 3 A. The anthropologists -
- 4 Q. And the archaeologist.
- 5 A. I told you he never said anything about a bridge.
- 6 Q. It is not quite true to say 'We've never been approached
7 by anybody about the bridge', is it. You were giving a
8 public gathering there at centenary hall the impression
9 that it was only recently that you'd learnt about this
10 bridge.
- 11 A. No, I said we have never been consulted on a bridge.
- 12 Q. 'We have not been approached by anyone'. That's not
13 quite true, is it.
- 14 A. We had Rod Lucas there. Like, I said, he still never
15 mentioned a bridge.
- 16 Q. Do you remember a question which you referred to Henry
17 Rankine about whether or not there were any sites in the
18 bridge corridor that might interfere with the progress
19 of construction. Do you remember that.
- 20 A. I'm not sure.
- 21 Q. And Henry Rankine said he didn't know of any, but if we
22 look around we are certain to find some, words to that
23 effect.
- 24 A. I can't recall him saying that.
- 25 Q. You can't recall him saying that.
- 26 A. No.
- 27 Q. What followed then was you and your committee, the Lower
28 Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee, joined the protest
29 against the construction of the bridge. That's right,
30 isn't it.
- 31 A. We protested.
- 32 Q. You hadn't had any profile at all up until now, had you.
33 Up until October 1993. You hadn't joined the Friends of
34 Goolwa and Kumarangk.
- 35 A. No, we hadn't made any definite moves at that stage.
- 36 Q. You and Doug Milera and people like that on the
37 committee just, in effect, went to all the meetings, all

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 the protests, and, in effect, stopped construction work
2 in October, didn't you.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And protested in May of the following year in 1994, is
5 that right.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. In December 1993 you attended before Mr Jacobs QC,
8 didn't you, with Doug Milera.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. That's right, isn't it.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Was that in January of 1994.

13 A. I am just looking at my dates. I'm not sure of the
14 date. December 1993, I thought.

15 Q. I think Mr Jacobs QC was appointed to prepare his report
16 just before Christmas in December of 1993.

17 A. Yes, maybe just after.

18 Q. He probably saw you in January the following year. Is

19 Mr Jacobs correct when he said you told him that the
20 area in which the bridge was to be built, the Goolwa
21 foreshore and the island, had spiritual significance to
22 Aboriginal people.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. That the bridge would change the visual and physical
25 character of the location by linking it to the mainland.

26 Did you say that to him.

27 A. Yes.

28 Q. And the character of the island as an island would be
29 lost by reason of its linkage to the mainland. Did you
30 tell him that.

31 A. Yes.

32 Q. Did you say that there were site works associated with
33 the construction of the bridge which were likely to
34 intrude into Aboriginal sites of archaeological
35 significance.

36 A. Yes.

37 Q. You got that from Vanessa Edmonds' report, did you.

38 A. No.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. You didn't convey to Mr Jacobs that there was women's
2 business associated with the island, did you.

3 A. No.

4 Q. Why didn't you convey to Mr Jacobs at least what you
5 have told us here today about the island.

6 A. Well, I thought the Act would hold itself up, the
7 Aboriginal Heritage Act. There was no need to speak
8 about business if you don't have to. I thought the Act
9 would be upheld. Samuel Jacobs was supposed to be a
10 very important figure in this whole business. I thought
11 if we could make him understand that, that his report
12 might say no, his advice might be no.

13 Q. Did Mr Jacobs say to you that there was nothing in the
14 documentation that he had from the government records
15 that even hinted at the island having spiritual
16 significance until you'd mentioned it to him.

17 A. I don't remember that, but that could be so. We talked
18 a lot.

19 Q. Wasn't his question to you and Doug Milera 'Why hasn't
20 this been mentioned before? It is not in the
21 correspondence, anything about the island having
22 spiritual significance'. Didn't he say something to
23 that effect to you.

24 A. He very well could have.

25 Q. Because that's a fact, isn't it.

26 A. And I would have told him the same thing that I'm
27 telling you, that we will leave them right up until a
28 point where, you know, there is no return, and then you
29 try and halt it. Because you never believe these things
30 are going to happen until, you know, it's there. We
31 don't want it to happen.

32 Q. Is that your reason for not offering to Mr Jacobs that
33 Hindmarsh Island was a place that related to women's
34 business.

35 A. Yes. I thought him knowing about the spirituality of
36 the area would be quite enough, added together with all
37 of the sites - all the Aboriginal sites on the island, I
38 thought it would be enough. Apparently not.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. How did you know that connecting the island to the
2 mainland by a bridge, that is, the linking of the island
3 to the mainland by a bridge, was somehow offensive to
4 its significance as being a place of women's business.
5 A. I think it is just common sense.
6 Q. But you didn't know anything about the content of the
7 women's business.
8 A. No, I still don't know any of the content.
9 Q. It may be that a bridge to the island from the mainland
10 would have no effect on -
11 A. It is still going through our waters.
12 Q. I beg your pardon.
13 A. It is still going through the waters.
14 Q. You don't say the waters is the women's business, do
15 you.
16 A. I'm saying the importance of the waters.
17 Q. The importance of the waters is something to do with
18 women's business, is it.
19 A. It very well could be, but it is important to the
20 Ngarrindjeri culture because of the meeting of the
21 waters. I didn't want to say this, but the place of the
22 waters relates to what we call - the Ngarrindjeri people
23 call Ngatji, which is each clan group's symbolic totem,
24 so to speak. Those places like that is where these
25 things breed, where they live, where they feed, all
26 those things. You upset the totem area, you are
27 upsetting everybody. But I don't expect you would
28 understand that, the Ngarrindjeri Ngatji.
29 Q. Let me put a suggestion to you: what you are talking
30 about is a disturbance to the environment. Is that
31 right.
32 A. No, more than that. To what those Ngatji are to the
33 people. They are not just animals and fish and snakes
34 and things to us. They are real. They are more like
35 people. Spiritual.
36 Q. So it is really nothing to do with women's business, is
37 it.
38 A. It is combined with all those things.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. But -

2 A. You can't get it.

3 Q. You make an attempt to convey it to us, please.

4 A. I have no -

5 Q. You were saying that the island is significant because
6 it is a place of women's business, and that a bridge
7 linking the mainland to this place of women's business
8 would be a desecration. That's what you're saying, is
9 it.

10 A. Yes, there is no way -

11 Q. And you don't know, do you, by necessity, a jot about
12 what the women's business is, do you.

13 A. (WITNESS SHAKES HEAD)

14 Q. So you cannot tell us, can you, in what way a bridge
15 would affect that spirituality of the island, which is
16 women's business, can you.

17 A. No, I have no way in the world of trying to explain that
18 to you. I never come here to talk about the women's
19 business on that site.

20 Q. You are not in a position to talk to us about it, are
21 you.

22 A. Because I can't, I'm a man.

23 Q. That's right. So your objection to the bridge really
24 comes down to an environmental objection, isn't it.

25 A. No, a spiritual.

26 Q. A bridge is going to -

27 A. Spiritual.

28 Q. Pardon?

29 A. A spiritual.

30 Q. Is there some other spiritual aspect to the island which
31 would be affected by a bridge, is there, not women's
32 business.

33 A. I just finished talking to you about it, Ngatji related.

34 Q. I want to put a label on it so we can understand it. Is
35 it the case that what you are talking about - that is,
36 that a bridge cannot go to the island - is to do with
37 some other spirituality of the island, not women's
38 business.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. I'm talking about my business.
- 2 Q. Can you tell us as much as you can about that.
- 3 A. I said it just now, N-G-A-T-J-I.
- 4 Q. Which is what you are talking about, is a question of
5 protecting the environment from a lot of people coming
6 to the island and ruining it. That's what it is, isn't
7 it.
- 8 A. You interpret it as environment, I don't. We have
9 different interpretations it seems. We cannot, as
10 Aboriginal people, separate environment and culture.
11 They go hand-in-hand.
- 12 Q. In this sense, that you are at one with the conservation
13 movement, aren't you, who were interested in stopping
14 the bridge to protect the birds, the wetlands, the
15 natural habitat that's provided for bird life on the
16 island.
- 17 A. I doubt very much whether they would know much about
18 Ngarrindjeri Ngatjis. They wouldn't know nothing.
- 19 Q. That's much the same sort of argument though, isn't it.
- 20 A. No, nowhere near it.
- 21 Q. You want to protect the environment.
- 22 A. Nowhere near it.
- 23 Q. The Ngatjis, that is the bird symbols and totems for the
24 clans and people, are in fact the wildlife, aren't they.
- 25 A. As you view them, yes.
- 26 Q. Why are they different from -
- 27 A. Because - no, I can't talk to you about that. It is
28 plain to see you would never understand that anyway.
- 29 Q. I am suggesting to you that your objection to the
30 bridge, in the end, boils down to really protecting the
31 island from too many people coming onto it and the
32 degradations that that would lead to in terms of
33 wildlife, plants and that sort of thing. That's what it
34 is about, isn't it.
- 35 A. Well, that's what you are calling it.
- 36 Q. You say it is more than that, do you.
- 37 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. Looking at Exhibit 197, the DOSSA documents, a letter
2 from the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage Committee to
3 Mr Tickner in October 1993, Victor Wilson, the
4 Chairperson of the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage
5 Committee, says, amongst other things 'In addition, we
6 are concerned about the impact that the bridge will have
7 on other Aboriginal sites on Hindmarsh Island and its
8 effect on the ecology of the region, which is a wetland
9 habitat for migratory birds, and is near the northern
10 end of the Coorong which is sacred to our people'. So
11 that's the position, isn't it really. It does merge
12 into, doesn't it, matters of ecology and conservation.

13 A. No.

14 Q. Did you say no.

15 A. No.

16 Q. That's from your committee.

17 A. Your interpretation and our interpretation is quite
18 different.

19 Q. What do you mean when your committee writes -

20 A. We are trying to tell somebody something without telling
21 them something. That's why the 'sacred' is on the end
22 of it, if you notice it there.

23 Q. Pardon.

24 A. You notice on the end there that the northern end is
25 sacred to our people, that's why it is there, because it
26 is difficult to explain.

27 Q. I am only asking you questions. If you feel that I am a
28 bit cynical, I am sorry. I am not trying to deny that
29 the island has spiritual significance to you. I am just
30 trying to get you to articulate how you describe that
31 significance and how -

32 A. It is very difficult.

33 Q. How it is different from women's business.

34 A. It is very very difficult to identify that. It is like
35 trying to communicate here on certain aspects of
36 sacredness. People call it sacred, some call it
37 spiritual. The spiritual significance, it is harder
38 trying to put it in a letter to a non-Aboriginal person,

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 and that's why you find the letters are written that
2 way, with the hope that someone will take notice and
3 care for something that they may understand. We can't
4 write in our Aboriginal way and expect people to
5 understand what we say. All we can do is tap as close
6 to the - as close as we possibly can to an area that
7 affects non-Aboriginal people and that they understand.
- 8 MR SMITH: I will go to the Mouth House and put
9 Dorothy Wilson's position and that will be it.
- 10 COMSR: Mr Trevorrow needs a break. How much
11 longer do you think you are likely to be?
- 12 MR SMITH: Half an hour.
- 13 COMSR: Then we have other counsel. We will
14 take a break now in any case.
- 15 ADJOURNED 3.25 P.M.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 RESUMING 3.40 P.M.

2 Q. At some stage, did you ask Dr Draper if there was
3 facility under the Aboriginal Heritage Act to register
4 sites which were underwater.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. What was that in connection with.

7 A. That was in connection to mainly what I was talking
8 about to you before, today.

9 Q. Which was.

10 A. The waters.

11 Q. The sacredness of the waters.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And whether you could register, what, all the waterways,
14 if you like, around the island.

15 A. Register the water and maybe what was under the water
16 and did our Act allow for that.

17 Q. Can I take you to my last topic, the Mouth House
18 meeting. This was 9 May 1994, wasn't it, that there was
19 a gathering on the island of Aboriginal people, which
20 was a prelude to a protest, wasn't it.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. At which finally I think the Minister did intervene and
23 made a temporary declaration stopping the bridge.

24 A. That's right.

25 Q. But, on 9 May, there was a gathering of women, at The
26 Pines, and then there was a gathering of people then
27 later in the Mouth House overlooking the mouth of the
28 Murray from the Hindmarsh Island site, is that right.

29 A. Yes, there was a meeting of the women on the 8th, I
30 think it was, and then the women met again on the 9th.

31 Q. Can you tell us how it was that Doreen Kartinyeri became
32 involved.

33 A. I don't know actually, but I had a call from Victor
34 Wilson saying that Doreen had called him and that she
35 wanted to get the women together to speak, so they could
36 speak together and so we arranged a meeting for them on
37 Hindmarsh Island, at Camp Ngarrindjeri.

38 Q. Some of the men from the Lower Murray Aboriginal

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Heritage Committee were in attendance, not at the
2 ladies' meeting, but -
3 A. On the island.
4 Q. On the island.
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. You and your wife, Shirley.
7 A. Yes, we were there.
8 Q. Can I take you directly to the events that occurred in
9 the Mouth House cottage on the afternoon of that 9 May.
10 Were you staying there, or were you staying nearby. Can
11 you tell us what your situation was, on 9 May.
12 A. On 8 May, we stayed at another place on the island not
13 too far away from where the meeting took place and then,
14 on 9 May, we attended had the meeting at the house.
15 Q. What was the purpose of the meeting at the house.
16 A. The purpose of the meeting was for our committee to get
17 legal advice as to where we were actually standing, at
18 that time, in regards to the Act, both State and
19 Federally.
20 Q. So the ALRM had been acting for you since October of the
21 previous year, hadn't they.
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. It was arranged for Tim Wooley to come down to the
24 island too.
25 A. Yes, so he could give us legal advice there.
26 Q. I think he told you that there was another matter that
27 was being discussed, quite apart from the Hindmarsh
28 Island bridge.
29 A. Yes.
30 Q. And that's your memory, too, is it.
31 A. Yes, one of the concerns was the protest.
32 Q. Could you tell us what happened then. You and your
33 wife, Shirley, were at the Mouth House, is that right.
34 A. Yes, we drove down to the Mouth House from where we were
35 staying.
36 Q. Was this in the afternoon are we talking about.
37 A. I don't know, somewhere in the mid day, I think,
38 somewhere around there.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. Tell us what happened. People came to the Mouth House.
2 A. Yes.
3 Q. Who was there.
4 A. There was quite a few women there sort of coming and
5 going and we had a bit of a talk to Tim, Mr Wooley, in
6 regards to what I have already said, you know, the legal
7 advice. And, at some stage, some women came over from
8 Camp Ngarrindjeri and came in there.
9 Q. Do you remember Dorothy Wilson being one of the women.
10 A. Actually I don't remember her being there, but I
11 understand people said she was there.
12 Q. They had with them a letter, I think, is that right.
13 A. Yes, apparently they came over, they had a letter.
14 Q. The men that were there were yourself, who else.
15 A. Victor Wilson, Doug Milera, and Tim Wooley from Legal
16 Rights. That's as far as I can remember of the men.
17 Q. And the women arrived with a letter.
18 A. Yes.
19 Q. You saw that letter, did you.
20 A. No, I saw it, but not -
21 Q. Someone had hold of a letter, but you didn't get a close
22 look at it.
23 A. No.
24 Q. Is that the position.
25 A. Yes.
26 Q. What happened.
27 A. I think they talked to Tim about it, Tim Wooley, because
28 it was in regards to the bridge and all that business
29 and Tim advised them that, if they wanted, you know, to
30 stop the bridge, they would have to supply more
31 information to Tickner than what they had there.
32 Q. You heard him say that, did you.
33 A. Yes.
34 Q. You were in that living area in the Mouth House.
35 A. Yes, we were in the kitchen/dining, whatever it is, yes.
36 Q. So he said that the letter didn't have enough, didn't
37 have sufficient information to stop the bridge.
38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. Was that the gist of his words.

2 A. For Tickner to intervene, there wasn't enough in that
3 letter.

4 Q. What then happened.

5 A. I think it was round about then a couple of us had a
6 talk to the people on where we were, you know, where we
7 were at at that point, as men working in that area on
8 the sites, and giving them the run down as to where we
9 were and what we were up to and that we were at the end
10 of our line as far as the Act was concerned and it was
11 then up to the women, if they had any business that they
12 wanted to put to Tickner, that was up to them, from that
13 point on.

14 Q. You knew, however, that the women had been discussing
15 women's business in The Pines.

16 A. That was my understanding. That's why we arranged the
17 meeting for them to discuss their business.

18 Q. You knew already, didn't you, by 9 May, that
19 archaeological sites and material that you had provided
20 wasn't going to be enough to stop the bridge, didn't
21 you.

22 A. Yes, I did, yes.

23 Q. And Tim Wooley just confirmed that, didn't he.

24 A. Yes, he confirmed our beliefs I suppose, what we
25 thought.

26 Q. Did you know, for instance, that ATSIC had conveyed just
27 that information to DOSAA. That is, that archaeological
28 material wouldn't be enough, that there had to be
29 matters of cultural significance in order for the
30 Minister to intervene.

31 A. Yes, I think I knew something like that before.

32 Q. Who told you that.

33 A. I don't know whether one of the members -

34 Q. That that was ATSIC's advice, if you like.

35 A. I am not sure whether it was one of the other members or
36 not.

37 Q. In any event, Tim Wooley looked at the letter and said
38 that wasn't enough. What then happened.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 A. I think Doug and myself and probably Victor had a talk
2 to the people, like I said, the women that was there,
3 and told them what had been happening and where we were
4 at, as far as we were concerned and as far as legally we
5 were concerned, because Tim Wooley had advised that.
6 Then I showed them the area where they were and the area
7 what I was concerned about off a photo in that dining
8 room. And I told them what I felt was the importance
9 and showed them the area. I talked to them about the
10 southern Coorong region, how over the years I had seen
11 that degraded by people and everything else get sort
12 of got stuffed up. And I explained that the northern
13 end would follow, you know, very quickly, if things
14 happened.
- 15 Q. Tim Wooley had said there wasn't enough in the letter
16 and you came forward, did you, and just spoke to all the
17 people that were in that living room.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. There was an aerial photograph behind the lounge,
20 against the wall, up on the wall, over the lounge.
- 21 A. Over the table.
- 22 Q. Over the table.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 MR SMITH: Perhaps we could just make it clear.
25 Could the witness be shown the plan, which is one of the
26 early exhibits and the aerial photograph, no.1.
- 27 XN
- 28 Q. Looking at Exhibit 27, which is a neat plan of the Mouth
29 House, there is a spot marked `photo 1', near the table
30 there. Would you confirm that that is the aerial
31 photograph you are talking about.
- 32 A. Where is it?
- 33 Q. Don't mark it.
- 34 A. No, I am saying, where is it?
- 35 Q. I will show you. There (INDICATES), there is `photo 1',
36 table there (INDICATES), and that's looking out through
37 the sliding doors (INDICATES).
- 38 A. Yes, here (INDICATES).

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 Q. So that is the photo.

2 A. The photo, yes.

3 MR SMITH: The witness indicates, looking at the
4 living room, the part of the plan which records `photo
5 1' near the table.

6 This is the best we can do down here for you.

7 COMSR: What is the name of that exhibit?

8 MR SMITH: That is Exhibit 27.

9 XN

10 Q. Looking at photograph 1, produced to you from Exhibit
11 28, we haven't brought the aerial photograph down but,
12 as best you can, does that look a bit like the - it is a
13 photograph of the Murray Mouth, but it is black and
14 white, can you tell whether that is close to it.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. I think that photograph is actually in the foyer here at
17 Camp Coorong, isn't it.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Could you tell us what you said to the ladies or what
20 you said to all the people at the meeting and what you
21 did when you were saying it. You were standing up, I
22 take it, near the photograph.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. So take it slowly and tell us what was said and what you
25 did.

26 A. I told them, like I said before, I told them where we
27 were at, you know, legally as the lawyer had just told
28 us.

29 Q. You have to tell us what was said. Where you were at is
30 a bit of the summary, isn't it.

31 A. I thought I said it.

32 Q. Can you say it again for us. What did you actually say.

33 A. That the men had been working, you know, on that
34 business within the Act, the Aboriginal Heritage Act,
35 that we had come to the end of the line with the Act.
36 We couldn't do anything from that point on. We knew the
37 women had met to talk about business, so we said, from
38 that point on, it was up to them, what they done. And I

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 pointed at the aerial photograph with my walking stick
2 and showed them exactly where they are located, you
3 know, where they are sitting, because sometimes people
4 get mixed up with those things. And I said `You are
5 here. This is the northern end', and I pointed it out.
6 `The northern end of the Coorong and that's the southern
7 end, where we were coming down.' And I explained to
8 them how degraded the southern end was and my fear
9 what would happen to the northern end, the same sort of
10 trouble. And, after that, I had to go outside then to
11 see the police.
- 12 Q. You left, what, did you deliberately leave then, did
13 you.
- 14 A. No, the police were outside to see us.
- 15 Q. You were pointing out the location of the Mouth House,
16 were you, on the aerial map.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. `You're here', sort of thing.
- 19 A. `You're here', sort of thing.
- 20 Q. And you were saying that, if the bridge goes - what,
21 there is all sorts of problems down at the southern end
22 of the Coorong.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. And, if the bridge goes in, the same problems will occur
25 at the northern end.
- 26 A. On the northern end.
- 27 Q. Is that what you said, was it.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. Did you say anything more than that.
- 30 A. Mind you, I don't think. Just my concern about that
31 area.
- 32 Q. And left, did you.
- 33 A. Went outside.
- 34 COMSR
- 35 Q. When you say you went outside, were you the only one who
36 went outside, at that time.
- 37 A. No, actually Mr Milera and Mr Wilson came out as well to
38 see the police and we were joined by Mr Wooley.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

1 XN

2 Q. You were pointing at the aerial photograph with your
3 walking stick.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. It is the one you have got with you now.

6 A. Yes, this is the one.

7 Q. Would you show it to the Commissioner. It has got an
8 interesting design of a snake crawling up, is that
9 right.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. So you pointed at the map with that.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. The aerial photograph.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Indicating the Mouth House, is that right.

16 A. Looking at the Mouth House and the southern and northern
17 areas, how they are divided.

18 Q. Did you say at that time or at any time whilst you were
19 there talking to them 'It's obvious, isn't it?'

20 A. I said 'It's obvious that we have to protect it now',
21 because of what I explained about the southern end, the
22 damage.

23 Q. I am rather putting just this one phrase or sentence
24 'It's obvious, isn't it?' That you pointed to the map
25 and said 'It's obvious, isn't it?'

26 A. No, 'Its obvious that we have got to protect it from no
27 more.'

28 Q. Dorothy Wilson says that it was Vic Wilson who pointed
29 to the aerial photograph.

30 A. No, I don't remember Victor pointing to it. I remember
31 Victor speaking to the ladies.

32 Q. Vic was there, of course, wasn't he.

33 A. He was there.

34 Q. Was Vic the chairperson of the Lower Murray Aboriginal
35 Heritage Committee.

36 A. He was.

37 Q. At that time.

38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. So he did at some stage speak to the ladies, did he.
2 A. Yes.
3 Q. In your presence sense.
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. What did he say.
6 A. I think he just reiterated what I said about in regards
7 to where we were at within the Act, that was all.
8 Q. Did he say, for instance, to the ladies 'Look at that
9 map up there.'
10 A. No.
11 Q. Did Doug Milera speak during this time.
12 A. Yes, it was like just a three way talk explaining a
13 little bit about that where we were.
14 Q. Did Doug Milera say to the people there looking at the
15 map 'It's women's business. Look at the map, what does
16 it remind you of?'
17 A. No.
18 Q. Did anyone say anything like that 'Look at the map, what
19 does it remind you of?'
20 A. No, not at all.
21 Q. Were the words 'women's business' used by anyone.
22 A. Not whilst talking about that photo.
23 Q. Did somebody say of the photograph in your presence at
24 this gathering in the Mouth House 'Look, it's in the
25 shape of woman's privates.'
26 A. No.
27 Q. Or words to that effect.
28 A. No, that would never be normally said.
29 Q. Did Doreen say, looking at the aerial photograph in the
30 presence of yourself 'Of course, oh, yes, now I can see
31 it.'
32 A. No, not at all.
33 Q. 'Yes, it's true', did she say something like that.
34 A. No.
35 Q. Or perhaps she said 'Yes, it's true', to your comment
36 that we have got to stop the northern end of the island
37 deteriorating like the southern end.
38 A. No, I don't recall that.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. Did Doreen get all excited during this meeting.
2 A. No.
3 Q. In your presence.
4 A. No.
5 Q. Isn't it the case that you know now that the shape of
6 the island and its neighbouring islands and the way in
7 which the Murray Mouth and the waters flow down to the
8 Murray Mouth is of significance to Ngarrindjeri women.
9 A. We know partly now in a sense because of what I spoke to
10 you about early this morning. That's why I don't like
11 documentation in a nonAboriginal way. That's what I
12 mean about things getting lose. That was exactly what I
13 was trying to mention this morning my concern sometimes
14 for important stories and things to be published in
15 documents that are for sale all over the place and that
16 anybody can get their hands on, because of exactly that
17 sort of thing. There would have been things people
18 should never know about that until nonAboriginal people
19 got hold of that and stuck it all over the papers and
20 everything else.
21 Q. But Veronica Brodie tells us that that's not secret, the
22 fact that the landscape is evocative of women's
23 reproductive organs.
24 A. Yes, but you don't go and put it up in the public eye
25 and say look at this thing. This is a bit disgusting.
26 Q. And that's your objection to it, isn't it.
27 A. That's my objection to it, yes.
28 Q. It is really a matter that should be private, but not
29 secret. It is not secret, is it.
30 A. You can look at that in two ways if you want to.
31 COMSR
32 Q. You think it is offensive for that type of material to
33 be made so public, do you.
34 A. It is very offensive. And what this bloke here is
35 saying just now about the woman's private things, that
36 is very offensive and I don't like that at all. It is a
37 terrible thing to talk about that like that in this
38 sense.

G. TREVORROW XN (MR SMITH)
XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. The letter that was produced to Tim Wooley that he
2 looked at and said it wasn't sufficient to cause the
3 Minister to intervene, was that handed back to somebody,
4 in your presence.
5 A. Yes, Eileen McHughes, I think.
6 Q. Did you see what happened to that letter, after that was
7 handed back.
8 A. The last time I remember seeing the letter was I think
9 Patty Kropinyeri had the letter on the table when we
10 went through the door.
11 Q. Was she writing some more material on to the letter.
12 A. Not at that time, I don't remember, no.
13 Q. Do you know, from some other source, whether that letter
14 was added to, in the Mouth House, on that day.
15 A. No, I am not sure. I had other things on my mind that
16 day, serious things that was concerned with the police.
17 We had been down there on a protest just shortly before,
18 six of us. I think there was about 30 policemen and all
19 their dogs down there ready to take us away. So the
20 concern was with the women, children, all those people
21 that were down there. That's why the police was an
22 important matter to go and attend to.
23 MR SMITH: I have no other questions. I just may
24 have one question right at the end.
25 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR MEYER
26 Q. How long have you known Mr Hemming.
27 A. Mr Hemming, 10 or 12 years, I suppose.
28 Q. Have you discussed the issue of Hindmarsh Island bridge
29 with him.
30 A. I'm not sure. We have had lots and lots of discussions
31 over the years, so I would imagine we have talked a
32 little bit about that.
33 Q. Has he made any suggestions to you about steps you could
34 take in relation to the Hindmarsh Island bridge.
35 A. No.
36 Q. You were, in 1989 and 1990, the chairman of the
37 Ngarrindjeri Lands and Progress Association.
38 A. That's right.

6439

KC 67H

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. How long were you the chairman.
- 2 A. I am still the chairman.
- 3 Q. Still chairman.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 CONTINUED

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. Tom, your brother, gave us some evidence about meetings
2 of the Lands and Progress Association. He tells us that
3 there have always been women on the committee of that
4 body.
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Is that right.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. He tells us that you run meetings in a proper fashion,
9 i.e., you have correspondence received, and you keep
10 minutes, and you do things like that.
- 11 A. Fairly formal, as much as we can, yes.
- 12 Q. And that you record the receipt of reports like the
13 Edmonds report that was done, and it is available for
14 everybody on the committee to read, is that right.
- 15 A. They were, yes.
- 16 Q. The reality of the situation is, as I understand it from
17 Tom's evidence, that the reports and various things like
18 that that are sent down to the association are tabled,
19 and that anybody on the committee who wants to read them
20 can read them. Is that right.
- 21 A. That's right.
- 22 Q. That includes the women as well as the men.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Mr Smith has asked you a number of questions about this
25 meeting of the Tendi following the Lucas report. You
26 recollect receiving the Lucas report, don't you.
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 Q. Tom has said that there wasn't a meeting after the
29 receipt of the report because you didn't have the funds
30 to get the people together, is that right.
- 31 A. That's partly so, yes. Mainly so.
- 32 Q. Who would you have got the funds from to get the meeting
33 together.
- 34 A. Normally from the company involved.
- 35 Q. Did you ever write to the company involved and ask them
36 for the funds.
- 37 A. No.
- 38 Q. Did you ever ring them up and ask them for the funds.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. Did you ever say to Mr Hemming 'We have received this
3 report and it suggests that we are going to have a
4 meeting of the Tendis. Can you organise some funds?'
- 5 A. No, not that I recall.
- 6 Q. Did you ever say to David Rathman or anybody in DOSSA
7 'It has been suggested that we should have this meeting,
8 but we need some funds to have a meeting'. Did you ever
9 ask them for funds.
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Did you ring up Matt Rigney at ATSIC and ask him if you
12 could have some funds.
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. You managed to get funds to attend meetings at the Mouth
15 House and attend meetings at Graham's Castle and do
16 things like that. How was that arranged.
- 17 A. Well, that being later on down the track, we had already
18 done a few jobs in between there and we had managed to
19 raise a few dollars for that to happen.
- 20 Q. Didn't you just ask Matt Rigney to organise a bus or ask
21 the Nungas Club to organise a bus.
- 22 A. We asked the Nungas Club here and in Adelaide, I would
23 imagine.
- 24 Q. Why didn't you ask the Nungas Club for a bus so that you
25 could transport people for a meeting of the Tendi.
- 26 A. We didn't have any money at that time.
- 27 Q. The Nungas Club didn't have any money.
- 28 A. But we had to put money in the petrol tank. We had to
29 put tucker on the table.
- 30 Q. So the only thing that stopped consultation was the cost
31 of putting petrol in a bus that you could have got from
32 the Nungas Club.
- 33 A. No, it was the organisation - of organising the people
34 to meet together.
- 35 Q. Who was going to organise that.
- 36 A. Like I told you, we thought Mr Lucas was going to do
37 that.
- 38 Q. Has anybody, other than somebody within the Aboriginal

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 community, organised a meeting of the Tendi ever.
2 A. Not that I could recall.
3 Q. Meetings of the Tendi are called by Aboriginal people,
4 aren't they.
5 A. Normally.
6 Q. Always, isn't it.
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. By the way, is Mr Doug Milera present in this room
9 today.
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. Is he here now.
12 A. Yes.
13 Q. Which one is he.
14 A. Just back there.
15 Q. Beg your pardon.
16 A. Back there.
17 Q. Which one. `Back there', there is a lot of people back
18 there, that doesn't identify him for me. Can you do it
19 in rows.
20 A. Next to Tom.
21 Q. Is Sarah Milera here today.
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. Where is she.
24 A. Next to him.
25 Q. I only asked that because we have never met. Veronica
26 Brodie gave evidence yesterday. Do you know Veronica.
27 A. Yes, I know Veronica.
28 Q. She gave evidence that she read some material from a
29 notebook prepared by a woman called Betty Fisher. Do
30 you know Betty Fisher.
31 A. No, I don't.
32 Q. She read from this notebook which Betty Fisher had
33 previously said in this Royal Commission was secret,
34 couldn't talk about it, and when Mr Smith asked Veronica
35 about that, she said that it was public and always had
36 been public, that there was no secrecy about reading
37 that information on the television, because if there had
38 been she wouldn't have read it. Do you understand that.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

1 A. It's a bit much.

2 Q. I will have another go. Veronica said 'I wouldn't have
3 read that stuff on the television if it had been
4 secret'. She says 'I'm very careful about what's secret
5 and I won't tell you things that are secret' and, in
6 fact, yesterday she did refuse to answer questions. But
7 she said 'Those aspects of women's business are public'.
8 Okay.

9 A. Well, what aspects?

10 Q. That's what I am coming to.

11 A. Sorry.

12 Q. The aspects that she says are public is that Hindmarsh
13 Island and its surrounds represents a woman's
14 reproductive organs. She says that's public information
15 and, as far as she is concerned, has been public
16 information for a long time. As far as you are
17 concerned, is that right.

18 A. No. As far as I'm concerned personally, no.

19 Q. When did you find out.

20 A. About what?

21 Q. That Hindmarsh Island and its surrounds looked like a
22 woman's reproductive organs. When did you find that
23 out.

24 A. I didn't know that until it came in the 'Advertiser'.

25 Q. Did you know at the time of the Mouth House meeting.

26 A. I'm not sure whether that was before or after.

27 Q. Don't worry about whether it was before or after the
28 'Advertiser'. At the time that you met at the Mouth
29 House that Mr Smith has been talking about, did you know
30 it then.

31 A. I think I did, yes.

32 Q. In fact, you did, because you'd talked with Victor about
33 it, hadn't you.

34 A. We had discussed the area.

35 Q. You'd discussed the fact that you say it represented a
36 woman's reproductive organs. You'd discussed that with
37 Victor, hadn't you.

38 A. No.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. I put to you that you'd discussed that with Victor at a
2 time before the Mouth House meeting.
- 3 A. We talked about the island in general.
- 4 Q. I am putting to you very specifically -
- 5 A. Yes, do that.
- 6 Q. I am saying to you very specifically that you had
7 discussed the fact that Hindmarsh Island and its
8 surrounds looked like a woman's reproductive organs.
- 9 A. We said it was a place of women's business.
- 10 Q. Are you denying that you specifically discussed with
11 Victor Wilson in the weeks before the Mouth House
12 meeting that it looked like a woman's reproductive
13 organs. Do you deny that.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. At that time, did you know that suggestion.
- 16 A. What suggestion?
- 17 Q. That it looked like a woman's reproductive organs.
- 18 A. I don't understand the question.
- 19 Q. During 1994, did you know that.
- 20 A. In 1994?
- 21 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. Yes, after that.
- 23 Q. In April 1994. It hadn't been in the paper in April
24 1994. In April 1994 did you know that.
- 25 A. No, not the way it came out, no.
- 26 Q. Even though Veronica says it was public knowledge, you
27 didn't know that.
- 28 A. No.
- 29 Q. You made reference to this question of the meeting of
30 the waters.
- 31 A. Yes.
- 32 Q. When did you find out about that.
- 33 A. That's been knowledge of ours for as long as I can
34 remember. Important -
- 35 Q. So that's your knowledge.
- 36 A. Yes. Important areas.
- 37 Q. That has got nothing to do with women's business, has
38 it.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 A. Not in the sense you are putting it, no.
2 Q. In fact, Tom has told us that's important to everybody.
3 A. It is, yes.
4 Q. It has no connection with what this Royal Commission is
5 about, i.e., the notion of it being some sort of secret
6 women's business.
7 A. No.
8 Q. You have made reference to the Ngarrindjeri Action
9 Group, that's a group of women.
10 A. That's a group of people, as I understand.
11 Q. Men and women.
12 A. Men and women, yes.
13 Q. That involves people from - Ngarrindjeri people.
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. And it involves people who are in that group which is
16 known as the Friends of Goolwa and Kumarangk.
17 A. I'm not sure about that.
18 Q. Have you ever been to any NAG meetings.
19 A. I think I've been to one.
20 Q. Whereabouts.
21 A. Murray Bridge, I think.
22 Q. Murray Bridge.
23 A. Yes.
24 Q. What about Rocky Marshall's place.
25 A. No.
26 Q. You were in Goolwa, weren't you, when Professor Saunders
27 was there.
28 A. That's right.
29 Q. On the afternoon of the Monday, you and Doug showed
30 Professor Saunders and the ladies around Hindmarsh
31 Island, didn't you.
32 A. Yes.
33 Q. You've got that afternoon fixed in your mind.
34 A. Yes.
35 Q. How many days prior to that had you been at Goolwa.
36 A. I'm not sure. I think I went over that day.
37 Q. Were you there the day before.
38 A. I don't think so.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. The day before there had been a meeting at Graham's
2 Castle, hadn't there, with the women.
- 3 A. I understand - I thought it was the day when Professor
4 Saunders was there.
- 5 Q. I will give you the sequence of events as we know it.
6 As we understand it, there was a meeting of people at
7 Rocky Marshall's place on the Sunday.
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 Q. Whether it be late morning or during the afternoon, I
10 don't know. After that there was a meeting on Sunday
11 night at Graham's Castle between the whole group of
12 women with Doreen Kartinyeri, at which Deane Fergie
13 turned up.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Deane Fergie had also been to Rocky Marshall's. Then
16 the next morning, Monday morning, Professor Saunders
17 turned up and there was a meeting in the morning with
18 the whole group of women with Professor Saunders.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Then in the afternoon the trip around the island with
21 you and Dougie. Got that sequence.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Did your wife go to the meeting that took place with
24 Professor Saunders.
- 25 A. I can't remember whether she was there or not, to tell
26 you the truth.
- 27 Q. Does that mean you then can't help me with whether she
28 was there the night before.
- 29 A. That's right.
- 30 Q. Did you and your wife go over to Goolwa together for
31 that series of meetings, or did you go separately.
- 32 A. No, if we had have went - if both of us was there we
33 would have went together. It would have been much
34 easier for travelling. I just can't recall if she was
35 there or not for that meeting.
- 36 Q. Did you see the letter that Rocky Marshall wrote to the
37 newspaper.
- 38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. There was a meeting at Rocky Marshall's place on the
2 Sunday in which Doreen Kartinyeri gave Rocky Marshall a
3 dressing down for sending that letter. Have you heard
4 about that.
- 5 A. Apparently so, yes.
- 6 Q. Were you at that meeting.
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. You said that you had been told by people that bones had
9 been removed from the marina. Who were the people who
10 told you.
- 11 A. I don't know. It was just different people over on the
12 - at Goolwa.
- 13 Q. What were their names.
- 14 A. I think Doug told me that people had told him, and some
15 of our other members.
- 16 Q. Did any white people tell you that bones had been
17 removed.
- 18 A. No, I don't think so.
- 19 Q. Did Richard Owen, for example, tell you that.
- 20 A. Not that I can remember with Richard, no.
- 21 Q. Mr Tuckwell.
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. In your statement - have you got your statement.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Would you go to p.19, second paragraph. That paragraph
26 reads `When it became clear that the bridge was going to
27 go ahead, we, as the Lower Murray Aboriginal Heritage
28 Committee, had to do something about it'. I put to you
29 that it had become clear to you a long time before the
30 meeting with DOSSA on 15 April - if you turn to the
31 previous page, which is what this item is talking about
32 - that the bridge was going to go ahead.
- 33 A. Well, it looked that way, yes.
- 34 Q. And had looked that way for a long time, hadn't it.
- 35 A. Well, it had looked that way for a long time.
- 36 Q. So if the suggestion is that it wasn't until 15 April
37 that it was clear to you that the bridge was going to go
38 ahead, that would be wrong.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 A. Could I get your point again, please?
- 2 Q. If it was suggested that you were saying that you didn't
3 think it was until that DOSAA meeting that it was clear
4 that the bridge was going to go ahead, that would be
5 wrong, wouldn't it.
- 6 A. No, I was getting worried at that time.
- 7 Q. But you were worried a long time before then. You were
8 worried back, at least, the previous October.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Did you know about the existence of women's business the
11 previous October.
- 12 A. Not in the sense that is now known.
- 13 Q. Did you know about it at all.
- 14 A. Only in the sense that the island and its name meant
15 something to women as far as we knew that area.
- 16 Q. But nothing else.
- 17 A. No, not the detail.
- 18 Q. When did you find out that Hindmarsh Island was
19 important to women.
- 20 A. That's for a long time.
- 21 Q. When.
- 22 A. A matter of years now, I guess.
- 23 Q. How did you find out.
- 24 A. That was - I think the name spells it out for us all
25 every time. Every time we speak it, it tells us what it
26 means.
- 27 Q. So you found out through the name.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. I presume you are referring to the name `Kumarangk'.
- 30 A. Yes.
- 31 Q. How long had you known of the name `Kumarangk' for
32 Hindmarsh Island.
- 33 A. A fair while. When we first went over there, I guess.
- 34 Q. How long is that. How long is a fair while: Six
35 months, one year, ten years.
- 36 A. Four or five years.
- 37 Q. Four or five years.
- 38 A. Something like that.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. So you had known for at least four or five years, is
2 that right.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 COMSR
- 5 Q. The reason you had known is because of the name
6 `Kumarangk'.
- 7 A. Partly, in a sense, the name, yes.
- 8 XXN
- 9 Q. So you knew in 1990.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And you knew in 1990 that it was an important place for
12 women, is that right.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Did you tell Mr Jacobs that the island was an important
15 place for women.
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. Why not.
- 18 A. Didn't feel there was a need to. We thought with the
19 number of sites that were there - the number of sites
20 that were being found and letting them know about the
21 spirituality of the area would be enough.
- 22 Q. You thought Mr Jacobs was a pretty important fellow,
23 didn't you.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. In fact, you knew he was an ex-judge.
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 Q. You have read about him in the newspaper.
- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 Q. Did you know that he was the man that did the Royal
30 Commission for the State Bank.
- 31 A. No, I didn't.
- 32 Q. But you knew that he was an important man to be talking
33 to.
- 34 A. Yes.
- 35 Q. He was about the most important bloke that had come up,
36 hadn't he, in the process of this bridge matter. Is
37 that right.
- 38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. Things were really getting serious by the time you met
2 with him.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. But you still didn't tell him.
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. Weren't you taking a huge risk. He is the most
7 important fellow so far and you still risk not telling
8 him.
- 9 A. It's not our business - it wasn't our business to do
10 that. It was the - it had to be the women -
- 11 Q. By the time you got to April, you were willing to say to
12 Neale Draper that the women want to talk to Neale about
13 women's business, weren't you.
- 14 A. Not to Neale. We told Neale that we needed to get a
15 woman in so the women could talk.
- 16 Q. That's what I mean. By the time you get to April, you
17 say to a man, Neale Draper 'We got to get a woman to
18 talk to you because this island is important'. Is that
19 right.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Draper wasn't anywhere near as important in the scheme
22 of things, was he, as Sam Jacobs.
- 23 A. No, you're right.
- 24 Q. Why didn't you say to Mr Jacobs 'We have got to get a
25 woman in here to talk to you'.
- 26 A. Because at that stage we had no pressure from women to
27 do anything.
- 28 Q. Can I put to you that at that stage the notion of
29 women's business hadn't even arisen.
- 30 A. No, it most certainly had.
- 31 Q. I am putting to you very specifically that the idea of
32 women's business had never entered your head at the time
33 when you spoke with Mr Jacobs.
- 34 A. It certainly had.
- 35 Q. I am putting to you that the notion of women's business
36 had arisen by the time you talked to Draper, and that's
37 why you thought that you could talk to Draper about it.
- 38 A. No. I knew about it before then.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

1 Q. What had changed between when you saw Mr Jacobs and when
2 you told Dr Draper. What had changed.

3 A. Unexpected change in the circumstances because, as
4 things were drawing closer, more pressure came to bear
5 from the women, that we were the committee, we were the
6 elected people, we had to do something.

7 Q. But we have already got past things drawing close. We
8 have had an actual start made to the bridge back the
9 previous October, hadn't we.

10 A. Yes, I suppose.

11 Q. So it has gone past drawing close. You were there,
12 weren't you.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. That's why I'm putting to you that your explanation that
15 things were drawing close just isn't right, and the fact
16 is that you hadn't thought of women's business. You
17 didn't know about it, in your mind, until April.

18 A. No, that's not right.

19 Q. You were invited to the meeting in October 1993 at
20 Goolwa, that you went to with Henry, by Margaret
21 Bolster.

22 A. No, that wasn't the name.

23 Q. Do you know Margaret Bolster.

24 A. I have met her, yes.

25 Q. She was the lady who chaired the meeting.

26 A. Yes.

27 Q. Did she tell you that in 1989 the Conservation Council
28 had said that the development was a very good one.

29 A. No, she hadn't told me that.

30 Q. Did she tell you that the Conservation Council, in 1989,
31 hadn't opposed the construction of a bridge.

32 A. No. I've never had a chance to speak very long with
33 Margaret Bolster at all. Only at meetings like that,
34 where we met briefly.

35 Q. Your brother Tom told us, in relation to how one would
36 go about consulting with the Ngarrindjeri community,
37 that if you wanted to know whether you could do
38 something by way of a development or a building or

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

1 something like that, that the appropriate way to go
2 about it would be to ask the chairman of the Raukkan
3 Community Council, and send the information to him, and
4 ask the Chairman of the Ngarrindjeri Lands and Progress
5 Association, i.e. you, and ask the Heritage Committee,
6 send them the information, and that they would be able
7 to then tell you, or tell the person who was making the
8 application, who the appropriate persons were to talk
9 to. Does that sound right to you.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And he went on to say that he would expect that those
12 persons would go and talk to the people that they
13 thought were the relevant people to talk to, and then
14 come back and give the answer. Is that how you expected
15 it to happen.

16 A. It was expected that the member would talk to the
17 community in which they live to let them inform the
18 community, and people expressing an interest then would
19 come forward.

20 Q. This is what I put to Tom, so that I don't misrepresent
21 it to you `If the government wanted to' - would it help
22 if I brought it over and showed it to you, or read it to
23 you.

24 A. Yes, bring it over.

25 Q. This is p.6,116, starting at line 24 `If the government
26 wanted to - let us say the planning people had some new
27 proposal and they wanted to find out whether that
28 proposal, of whatever nature, was acceptable to your
29 people, then what you would say is the people that the
30 government should send the papers off to would be, at
31 least, Doug, Victor, George and Henry'. Doug was
32 Secretary of the Heritage Committee.

33 A. Yes, that's the people at the time.

34 Q. They're the right people.

35 A. At the time, yes.

36 Q. Tom said `Yes, yes, I suppose. Those four would spread
37 it out around their community and come back with the
38 answer, yes'. Do you agree with that.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. `The next step I think is somewhat obvious. I can't
3 make you read something, can I' and he said `That's
4 right' or words to that effect. And he said it depends
5 on how busy you are. Is that right.

6 A. That's true.

7 Q. That's in fact what happened, isn't it, in this
8 instance. What happened in this instance with this
9 Hindmarsh Island Bridge proposal was the papers were
10 sent to the various organisations, weren't they.

11 A. What papers are you talking about?

12 Q. I am talking about the Edmonds report, the Lucas report
13 and the environmental impact study on the bridge.

14 A. The Lucas report. I have never seen the Edmonds report
15 until today.

16 CONTINUED

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)

- 1 Q. May that be because of a problem at this end, because
2 all the papers demonstrate that it was sent here.
- 3 A. Like I said before, I have hunted high and low to see if
4 I could ever find that one and I can't. I found the
5 other one, but I can't find that one, so I don't know.
- 6 Q. Just in case I am mixed up in one of these matters
7 again, if we organise to send the papers to the chairman
8 of the Raukkan Council and the chairman of the
9 Ngarrindjeri Lands and Progress Association and the
10 chairman of the Heritage Committee, we have got it
11 right.
- 12 A. We would hope that would be right.
- 13 Q. Those chairpersons will then organise to talk to the
14 relevant persons and come back and report.
- 15 A. That's right, yes, that's correct, yes.
- 16 Q. And that would be what you would expect to happen.
- 17 A. Yes, remembering that this is solely dependent upon the
18 peoples there.
- 19 Q. It depends then on what the people report back to you,
20 doesn't it.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. I got very confused with your answers in relation to
23 Lindy Warrell. You talked with Vanessa Edmonds, in
24 about May 1994.
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 Q. In May 1994, you said to Vanessa that you thought that
27 Lindy was doing an anthropological report, that's right,
28 isn't it.
- 29 A. I thought she might be, yes.
- 30 Q. I think you told Vanessa that you had said to Lindy that
31 she ought to talk to Doreen, is that right.
- 32 A. Val Power or Doreen Kartinyeri.
- 33 Q. With both of them.
- 34 A. Yes, or either one. I didn't care which one she spoke
35 to.
- 36 COMSR
- 37 Q. Either of them.
- 38 A. Either of them, yes.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR MEYER)
(MR STRATFORD)

1 XXN

2 Q. And you don't know whether she talked to either of them.

3 A. No, I don't know.

4 Q. Do you talk with Victor often.

5 A. Fairly often.

6 Q. Both of you have been in leading roles in your
7 respective communities for quite a few years now.

8 A. Yes, we have done three years on regional council.

9 Q. Ever since you have been developing and working here at
10 Camp Coorong, Victor has been in Murray Bridge.

11 A. Yes, that's right.

12 Q. And Victor has been in a fairly leading position in
13 Murray Bridge.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And you and he have talked to each other.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Often.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. You know pretty well what Victor is up to and Victor
20 knows pretty well what you are up to.

21 A. Yes, most time I would say that.

22 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR STRATFORD

23 Q. I just want to ask you a couple of questions in relation
24 to the sequence of events in the latter part of the
25 meeting at the Mouth House, on 9 May 1994.

26 A. Yes.

27 Q. And I want to ask you about events after the letter was
28 shown to Mr Wooley.

29 A. Yes.

30 Q. Do you remember referring to that in your evidence
31 earlier.

32 A. Yes.

33 Q. After the letter was shown to Mr Wooley, did you hear
34 him say something to this effect, that there wasn't
35 enough information contained in the letter for Mr
36 Tickner to hang his hat on. Do you remember Mr Wooley
37 saying anything like that.

38 A. Yes.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR STRATFORD)

- 1 Q. After seeing the letter.
- 2 A. It was something like that, that there was not enough
3 there, as I saw it.
- 4 Q. And did he go on and say something like this 'I'm aware
5 that there is other information and that it is a matter
6 for you what information is disclosed.' Did he say
7 something like that.
- 8 A. Yes, I think he did say something like that.
- 9 Q. Was it after those comments were made by Mr Wooley that
10 you pointed with your stick to the aerial photograph.
- 11 A. I believe it was after those comments, I think.
- 12 Q. When you pointed with your stick to the aerial
13 photograph, did you use words something like this 'It's
14 obvious, isn't it?'
- 15 A. That's shortened down, 'It's obvious, isn't it, that
16 this place needs protecting.'
- 17 Q. So, what, you would say 'It's obvious, isn't it?', is an
18 abbreviation of what you said earlier.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. When you pointed to the island, located the position of
21 the Mouth House and the island and fixed the directions
22 north and south for those people in the room.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. You just say 'It's obvious, isn't it?', is an
25 abbreviation of that discussion.
- 26 A. It is, but it is part of what I said, yes.
- 27 Q. You have told us that people referring to women's
28 private parts is a terrible thing, as far as you are
29 concerned, isn't it.
- 30 A. Yes.
- 31 Q. That is, referring to it in public is a terrible thing,
32 as far as you are concerned.
- 33 A. It is sickening to hear that.
- 34 Q. If there had been a reference to women's private parts,
35 at this time, that is, at the time the aerial photograph
36 was being pointed out, do you think you might have
37 remembered that, do you think you might remember that.
- 38 A. It is something I probably never would forget and

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR STRATFORD)
(MR TILMOUTH)

1 probably the person who said it too probably would never
2 forget it.

3 Q. After you had pointed out what you pointed out on the
4 aerial photograph, do you remember if Doug Milera had
5 something to say.

6 A. I believe he said a few words in regards to the legal
7 side.

8 Q. I want to suggest to you that, in fact, Mr Milera had a
9 few words to say and he said something like that 'Yes,
10 this is a very important area', speaking to the area you
11 had pointed to on the photograph. 'It must be
12 protected. We, the men, have tried to get the State
13 Government to stop it. We've taken our application to
14 the Minister. We have picketed. We have done all
15 these things, now it is up to you women to actually
16 protect the site.' First of all, in a general sense, do
17 you remember Mr Milera saying something like that.

18 A. Yes, he said things like that.

19 Q. And did he generally cover the topics that I just
20 mentioned in that extract that I have read out to you.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Was it after Mr Milera spoke that you yourself went
23 outside with others to speak to Sergeant Morrison.

24 A. As far as I know, we had all finished speaking at the
25 time and we went outside.

26 Q. You went out, Mr Milera went out.

27 A. Yes.

28 Q. Mr Wilson went out.

29 A. Yes.

30 Q. And then you were joined by Mr Wooley.

31 A. Mr Wooley.

32 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR TILMOUTH

33 Q. I want to take you back to the questions that were asked
34 of you by Mr Smith in relation to Dr Lucas and join them
35 with what Mr Meyer was just asking you about in terms of
36 the consultation process. And can I ask, first of all,
37 generally what, from your point of view, did you expect
38 by way of consultation from developers after Dr Lucas's

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR TILMOUTH)

1 written report was received.

2 A. Can I give an example of how we normally work? It may
3 be easier. Normally, if someone wants to do a project
4 or a job, No.1 is they will send somebody out to - they
5 will send a message to us, a letter to us, either to the
6 Aboriginal Heritage Committee or DOSAA. They will get
7 in touch with either one of those bodies and say what
8 the project is what they want to do. And then they will
9 send a person down to speak about that project. And
10 normally that's why we say in your minutes that we like
11 to have the boss of the project there, not someone who
12 is messing up what we say third-hand. So we would
13 rather have the bosses of the projects there. And then
14 together they will arrange a meeting, you know, and will
15 sort that out with an archaeologist. If they need an
16 archaeological survey or anthropological survey, they
17 will then go and do that, they will send the right
18 people from that area to go and do that. But
19 consultation means consultation and negotiation. You
20 need to speak to the people who are doing the job, whose
21 job it is.

22 Q. From the Aboriginal point of view, what are the
23 organisations that you would have expected would be
24 involved in that process.

25 A. In regards to this issue?

26 Q. Yes, this issue, at the moment.

27 A. We would have expected that Point McLeay would have been
28 told about it. And I mean the council. I would have
29 expected that this council would be informed and Murray
30 Bridge Lower Murray Nungas Club and the Heritage
31 Committee and then those people would communicate within
32 their communities and get feedback on the project.

33 Q. Feedback to whom.

34 A. So that they can come together with the owners of the
35 project to discuss it, what the people have said.

36 Q. To try and deal with it in one way, if we can, because
37 of the time factor now, when the issues like Mount
38 Barker arose, The Pines issue over the roadways, and the

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR TILMOUTH)

1 other things that have been mentioned, were those
2 processes eventually followed in those cases.

3 A. Yes, those things only occurred when the consultation
4 process broke down. Once it was fixed up, things went
5 on again.

6 Q. I understand that, in each of those cases, the matter
7 was resolved.

8 A. It was.

9 Q. Through the consultation process.

10 A. It was resolved through doing the proper consultation.

11 Q. Was it your expectation, going back to Hindmarsh Island,
12 that any potential developer of any site on the island
13 would consult directly with the relevant Aboriginal
14 representative bodies.

15 A. We expected that we would eventually meet with those
16 people.

17 Q. Can I put it this way, again, to save time: that your
18 understanding was and your expectation was that the
19 recommendations of Dr Lucas would be followed.

20 A. That's what we were waiting for to happen.

21 Q. I want to ask you about another matter, and it is this:
22 You, of course, have your knowledge, that is, your
23 personal knowledge, of the Ngarrindjeri culture,
24 traditions and dreamings and the like.

25 A. Yes.

26 Q. And I think the effect of your evidence is that you have
27 known some material from when you were a child.

28 A. Yes.

29 Q. And you progressively acquired more knowledge, as time
30 went on, you got older, and I gather you were trusted by
31 some of the Elders to give some of the details.

32 A. That's right.

33 Q. Your evidence and your statement is that, in the
34 Ngarrindjeri culture, there is men's business and
35 there's women's business.

36 A. Yes.

37 Q. You have understood that quite some years ago.

38 A. That's right.

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR TILMOUTH)

- 1 Q. And have acquired it progressively from when you were a
2 child.
- 3 A. That's right.
- 4 Q. In relation to the question of men's and women's
5 business, have you understood that there is men's and
6 women's business from some other Aboriginal places, such
7 as the Pitjantjatjara people and so on.
- 8 A. It is a thing that is all over the country. It exists
9 in every group that I know of.
- 10 Q. For how long have you known that there is men's and
11 women's business in other Aboriginal areas.
- 12 A. For many, many years.
- 13 Q. Well before 1993, let us say.
- 14 A. Yes, definitely.
- 15 Q. What is the source of your knowledge on that, is it
16 reading books, is it speaking with other people, how did
17 you come to know about that.
- 18 A. A lot of it is in relationship to other groups. I did
19 some study once, but most of it is personal
20 relationships with other Aboriginal groups.
- 21 Q. Can you just tell the Commissioner about your study.
22 Where did you study.
- 23 A. I done it externally from Meningie. It was an
24 Aboriginal studies project. I didn't want to do it, but
25 I thought it would be better if I had some sort of
26 certificate or paper that could help me in my job, but I
27 ran into lots of problems with that, with the teacher of
28 the course, because the teacher of that course kept
29 sending me documents that he wanted me to do that
30 referred to other Aboriginal groups, in particular
31 Pitjantjatjara people, and I kept writing back to him
32 and saying 'I can't do this. I must do it on my own
33 people.' And so, after a long-running battle of
34 paperwork, he accepted my view and let me do all my
35 projects on the Ngarrindjeri people.
- 36 Q. When did you do that course, what year or years.
- 37 A. That was back in 1982 I think.
- 38 Q. Whereabouts was it, did you have to go to some camp

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR TILMOUTH)

- 1 somewhere.
- 2 A. It was run from Underdale.
- 3 Q. Underdale Campus.
- 4 A. Campus.
- 5 Q. What, that was a TAFE then, was it.
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Did you go down to the campus sometimes for your course.
- 8 A. Not very often, but, yes.
- 9 Q. What was the prime focus of the course. What was it
- 10 called, to begin with.
- 11 A. It was Aboriginal Studies.
- 12 Q. Were the Pitjantjatjara people part of that study.
- 13 A. Yes, they were.
- 14 Q. A small, or -
- 15 A. No, they were a major part.
- 16 Q. A major part.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. During that course, I gather that you had already
- 19 understood that there was a division within any culture
- 20 between men's and women's business.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And that was taught to you as well in 1992, was it.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. One final thing, if I can, just for the record: the
- 25 Commissioner has seen video recordings of the Ngurunderi
- 26 video and the basket weaving video. In the first of
- 27 them, of course, you are shown speaking to people and
- 28 saying certain things, aren't you.
- 29 A. Yes.
- 30 Q. Along with Tom and some other people.
- 31 A. Yes.
- 32 Q. In that first video you are actually showing a couple of
- 33 Aboriginal children where you used to live at the Three
- 34 Mile Camp.
- 35 A. That's right.
- 36 Q. And those children are relatives of yours, are they.
- 37 A. Yes, nephew and niece.
- 38 Q. And that Three Mile Camp is on the road here back

G. TREVORROW XXN (MR TILMOUTH)
REXN (MR SMITH)

1 towards Meningie.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And you can still go there to this very day and see
4 where the concrete floor is that you talk about, there
5 are still some parts of that there, is that right.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And you can go there and see the old wells that talked
8 about which provide the crystal clear water that can be
9 drunk.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And they are still there, aren't they.

12 A. They are still there.

13 Q. Can I put it this way for the record: the things that
14 you have said about that area and about the ecology and
15 the changes over the years, are those things true, what
16 you have said on the video.

17 A. They are very true.

18 RE-EXAMINATION BY MR SMITH

19 Q. Looking at these two documents, now before you, they
20 come from the DOSAA file, Exhibit 197, and they are
21 documents 132 and 132A. That is an account from Camp
22 Coorong for the expenses of Doreen Kartinyeri. It is a
23 Ngarrindjeri Lands and Progress Association account,
24 isn't it.

25 A. Yes.

26 Q. For Doreen Kartinyeri coming to Goolwa, is that right,
27 on 4 May.

28 A. Yes.

29 Q. Can you explain that to the Commissioner. It is
30 presumably DOSAA, that is the Department of Aboriginal
31 Affairs, State Aboriginal Affairs pays the Ngarrindjeri
32 Lands and Progress Association, of which you are the
33 chairman, for the expenses of Doreen Kartinyeri. How
34 does that happen, what is that. Can you explain that to
35 us.

36 A. You would have to ask the Minister how he operates that
37 account, because there has been many jobs that have been
38 passed through DOSAA to us and we pay the people and

G. TREVORROW REXN (MR SMITH)

1 send the accounts to DOSAA.

2 Q. Can I just have that back and just perhaps suggest an
3 explanation. `Women's heritage meeting. Goolwa. 4 May
4 1994. Documentation of women's knowledge of Hindmarsh
5 Island.' Is it the case that Doreen Kartinyeri came
6 down at the request of the Ngarrindjeri Lands and
7 Progress Association, attended a meeting on 4 May,
8 which was to do with women's business, is that right.

9 A. No.

10 Q. What is this, what are these two documents, the cheque
11 for \$680.58 and the invoice for that, what do these two
12 documents mean.

13 A. If you hunted enough there would probably be a lot more
14 of those type of things, because of the way DOSAA were
15 doing things.

16 Q. `Convey informants to site from Port Germein to Goolwa
17 and return.'

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Are we right to read it as it says, that your
20 organisation here brought Doreen Kartinyeri down to a
21 meeting that was about women's business and charged
22 DOSAA for Doreen Kartinyeri's expenses.

23 A. That was the process that was happening. If people were
24 moving or something was happening, DOSAA was short -
25 they can't get things done very quickly and it was a
26 general thing that, through DOSAA, that they would put
27 it through here for us to pay and they would reimburse.
28 That's all it was.

29 Q. So you could apply to DOSAA for funds.

30 A. If we were ever - yes.

31 Q. For that purpose, that's what that indicates.

32 A. No, we couldn't apply.

33 Q. Who.

34 A. We couldn't apply. Someone could apply to DOSAA for
35 funds and DOSAA could very well seek us out and ask us
36 could we do it and they would reimburse us, because
37 there is such a good record with the books here and
38 book-keeping it was done like that quite often.

G. TREVORROW REXN (MR SMITH)

- 1 Q. Can you tell us in respect of this account here, dated 4
2 May, and the payment was by DOSAA, how that came about.
3 Did Doreen herself arrange this, did she.
- 4 A. She must have arranged that with DOSAA and DOSAA would
5 have got in contact with us, I would imagine.
- 6 Q. You paid Doreen and recovered it from DOSAA, is that
7 correct.
- 8 A. And recovered it from DOSAA.
- 9 Q. Can you tell us then - and this is one last topic -
10 Doreen came into this dispute, the Hindmarsh Island
11 bridge dispute, from Port Germein, didn't she.
- 12 A. Apparently so, that's what she told me.
- 13 Q. You know nothing about it.
- 14 A. No, Victor rang me to let me know that she was coming.
- 15 Q. Victor Wilson rang you.
- 16 A. She rang Victor and Victor rang me and we organised the
17 meeting for the women to come together.
- 18 Q. Would that have been in a about April of 1994.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Then she finally came down here, looking at this
21 document, here, on 6 and 7 May.
- 22 A. Yes, that would have been to Goolwa, I would imagine.
- 23 Q. To Goolwa.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 MR MEYER: Mr Tilmouth and I were speaking earlier.
26 I don't know whether it is of any relevance to the time
27 schedules of the Commission, but we were discussing when
28 the tripartite agreement was entered into. I think we
29 can agree that it was on 31 March 1993 that the Minister
30 for Transport and Development entered into what we call
31 the tripartite agreement with the District Council of
32 Port Elliot and Goolwa and Binalong. I don't think we
33 have ever put that in as a fact before anywhere.
- 34 COMSR: All right, that can go on the
35 transcript.
- 36 MR TILMOUTH: Yes, I raised it today. I was surprised
37 that it hadn't.
- 38 COMSR: It hasn't found it way into the record

G. TREVORROW REXN (MR SMITH)

1 yet.
2 MR TILMOUTH: No, Mr Meyer shows me something that is
3 pretty reliable.
4 I think you have received a medical report relating
5 to Mr Robert Day who had the heart attack. He has been
6 readmitted to hospital, if I can record that, and the
7 doctor gave a report this morning that he is unfit.
8 COMSR: Yes, I gathered that he would be, from
9 the nature of his condition.
10 MR TILMOUTH: Yes, he was discharged and he had to go
11 back, so it was quite serious. Mr Kenny saw him last
12 Friday and formed the view that he is even unfit for
13 interview, even less for something like this.
14 COMSR: I hadn't anticipated that he would be.
15 MR TILMOUTH: We kept that open, but his position has
16 worsened and that puts that at an end.
17 NO FURTHER QUESTIONS
18 WITNESS RELEASED
19 COMSR: We are adjourning until 2 o'clock
20 tomorrow back in Adelaide.
21 ADJOURNED 5.05 P.M.

