

Modes of Speciation in Subterranean Diving  
Beetles from a Single Calcrete Aquifer in  
Central Western Australia



*Paroster macrosturtensis* (Dytiscidae)

TESSA BRADFORD

Presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy  
School of Earth and Environmental Sciences  
The University of Adelaide, South Australia

December 2009

This page has been left blank intentionally

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution to Tessa Bradford and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of published work contained within this thesis (as listed below) resides with the copyright holder of this work (Wiley-Blackwell).

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

This study was funded by a University of Adelaide Divisional Scholarship awarded to Tessa Bradford and an ARC Discovery grant (DP0663675) awarded to Associate Professor Steve Cooper and Dr William Humphreys.

Tessa Bradford

### **Published work**

**Bradford T**, Adams M, Humphreys WF, Austin AD, Cooper SJB (2010) DNA barcoding of stygofauna uncovers cryptic amphipod diversity in a calcrete aquifer in Western Australia's arid zone. *Molecular Ecology Resources* **10**, 41–50. doi: 10.1111/j.1755-0998.2009.02706.x

*This thesis is dedicated to my children*

*Nikita and Jack*

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

---

ABSTRACT.....	VII
ACKNOWLEDEMENTS.....	X
CHAPTER I	
General Introduction.....	1
CHAPTER II	
Geology of the Sturt Meadows calcrete deposit.....	13
CHAPTER III	
DNA barcoding of stygofauna uncovers cryptic amphipod diversity in a calcrete aquifer in Western Australia's arid zone.....	23
CHAPTER IV	
Comparative phylogeography of stygobiont amphipods reveals common historical evolutionary processes in stygofauna from a single calcrete aquifer.....	49
CHAPTER V	
Identification of natural predation events in diving beetles (Dytiscidae) from a calcrete aquifer in the arid Yilgarn region of central Western Australia.....	85
CHAPTER VI	
General Discussion.....	113
APPENDIX I	
List of specimens with associated voucher information.....	123
APPENDIX II	
Haplotype and sample locality list for the amphipod phylogeography study in Chapter IV.....	131

APPENDIX III

Allozyme allele frequencies for the amphipod phylogeography study in Chapter  
IV.....139

APPENDIX IV

**Bradford TM**, Adams M, Humphreys WF, Austin AD, Cooper SJB (2009) DNA  
barcoding of stygofauna uncovers cryptic amphipod diversity in a calcrete aquifer in  
Western Australia's arid zone. *Molecular Ecology Resources* (in press).  
doi: 10.1111/j.1755-0998.2009.02706.x.....144

Calcrete aquifers from the Yilgarn region in central Western Australia's arid zone contain a highly diverse range of obligate groundwater invertebrate species (stygofauna), with many endemic to single calcretes. Phylogenetic studies on the diving beetles from the Yilgarn calcretes suggest a scenario of invasion of the subterranean environment by several surface dwelling ancestors during aridification of the region since the Miocene. This system is ideal for examining modes of speciation within a closed calcrete body and in particular the relative roles of allopatric, parapatric and sympatric speciation in the generation of diving beetle (Dytiscidae) species diversity. Previous phylogenetic analyses have identified 13 independent cases of sympatric sister species pairs of large and small diving beetles in separate calcretes, suggesting the potential for their speciation in sympatry as a result of ecological niche partitioning. A single calcrete at Sturt Meadows contains a sympatric sister triplet of large and small diving beetles (*Paroster macrosturtensis*, *P. mesosturtensis*, *P. microsturtensis*), and can be accessed by an extensive grid of mineral exploration bores (3.5km<sup>2</sup>, 115 bores), allowing intensive sampling for population genetic studies and biodiversity assessment. Comparative phylogeographic analyses by others on these *Paroster* beetle species found no evidence for long term allopatric processes operating within the calcrete, although any fragmentation event that could have led to the evolution of the three beetle species may not have persisted post-speciation, and thus would not been seen in their gene genealogies.

The aim of this study was to investigate the possibility that the three beetle species at Sturt Meadows may have evolved by sympatric speciation due to trophic niche partitioning. Two main approaches were used to achieve this aim. First, whether the different beetle species have different trophic niches was determined and, second, whether micro-allopatric processes, such as fragmentation events, may have led to the evolution of the three beetle species was investigated. To detect evidence for such fragmentation events, a comparative phylogeography of chiltoniid amphipods in the Sturt Meadows calcrete was undertaken.

A DNA barcoding framework was established for the macro-invertebrates in the Sturt Meadows calcrete, in order to obtain sequence information on potential prey groups for the diving beetles. A 623-bp fragment of the mitochondrial cytochrome *c* oxidase 1 (*COI*) gene was amplified from stygofauna plus terrestrial organisms that were found in the calcrete. Phylogenetic analyses revealed the existence of 12 divergent monophyletic groups of haplotypes, including three unrelated lineages of chiltoniid amphipod that are

morphologically cryptic. Allozyme analyses on the amphipods showed them to be three species that can be separated at multiple allozyme loci.

Spatial variation in genetic diversity was assessed for the chiltoniid amphipods, enabling a comparative phylogeography of the three species across the bore field. There was no common pattern in the gene trees of the amphipod species, so no evidence for three isolation events in the diversification of the diving beetles at this site. However, high haplotype diversity coupled with low nucleotide diversity, plus signatures of population expansion and isolation by distance in two out of three species, match previous findings for diving beetles at the same site and indicate the potential for micro-allopatric evolutionary processes to have operated within the calcrete. Isolation of populations in pockets of favourable habitat (refugia) within the calcrete followed by expansion events, are proposed as the most likely generator of population genetic diversity, and are thought to be related to water level changes in the aquifer.

Trophic niche partitioning in the sister triplet of large and small *Paroster* diving beetles and their larvae was investigated by molecular amplification of small fragments of the *COI* gene identified by the barcode. Amphipods (Chiltoniidae) and copepods (Harpacticoida, Cyclopoidea) were chosen for the analysis as they were the most abundant potential prey items in the calcrete. There was not complete trophic partitioning in the adult beetles, with all three species feeding on amphipods and copepods. As the trophic analysis was molecular, differences in size of the prey were not tested for. There was some evidence for preferential feeding on particular prey species by the adult beetle species, however, small sample sizes precluded making comparisons between their larvae. It is thought that in the impoverished environment of the aquifer, the adult beetles are scavengers and opportunistic feeders, as well as active predators. Stable isotope analysis confirmed that the three diving beetle species are feeding on similar food items, and indicated a separate source of carbon and nitrogen to the tree roots as the basis of the food web of the calcrete.

In summary, there was no evidence for complete trophic niche partitioning in the adult diving beetles of different sizes that could have led to their speciation in sympatry. Any further investigation of trophic differences needs to concentrate on preferential feeding in the adults, and the trophic niche of the beetle larvae which are active predators. The potential for micro-allopatry in the diversification of the different sized diving beetles at Sturt Meadows has been identified, through congruence in current population genetic patterns for the amphipods and the diving beetles. Stygofauna in the calcrete have high genetic diversity, which is thought to be the result of historical water level fluctuations leading to frequent population bottlenecks, followed by range expansion after aquifer recharge. Identification of



at least 12 macro-invertebrate species in a single calcrete increases the total number of stygobitic and troglobitic species discovered in the Yilgarn, and has enabled estimates to be made of possible numbers of subterranean species in the region still to be discovered.

The presence of large and small dytiscid beetles in multiple calcretes that are sympatric sister species still points to some common ecological niche differentiation within the calcrete environment. It is hypothesized that there could be depth partitioning in the different sized diving beetles related to their oxygen requirements. The population genetic and ecological data generated at Sturt Meadows provide a baseline for the Yilgarn calcretes. Extending such a study to examine spatial and ecological differentiation in sympatric sister species of subterranean diving beetles across multiple calcretes, would be a powerful approach in the investigation of modes of speciation.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

I have been extremely fortunate in the course of my PhD to have the excellent advise, assistance and friendship of so many people, who as well as contributing to this study have made the whole experience incredibly rewarding.

In particular I would like to thank my supervisors Steve Cooper and Andy Austin who have provided just the right level of supervision, by always being available for discussion and applying their rigorous skills in reviewing to any written material provided by me. I am also very grateful to Bill Humphreys who has mentored me throughout this project and shown me how such a broad range of skills and interest can be applied to understanding a natural ecosystem.

This study is all about one site at the Sturt Meadows station in Western Australia and was really made possible by the pastoralists Flora, Peter and Paul Axford, who as well as always making me feel very welcome on my visits, provided valuable local information on the calcrete environment.

I wish to thank all members of the Austin Lab Group (The University of Adelaide) and the Evolutionary Biology Unit (EBU; South Australian Museum) who have provided me with such excellent support and guidance as well as a wonderful work environment. Nick Murphy, Michelle Guzik and Laughlin Farrington; I appreciate your friendship and our discussions have helped shape the project and definitely extended me in my data analyses. To my friends that have helped me through this challenging journey and made it so entertaining, Kym Abrams, Gaynor Dolman, Lizzie Perkins, Luke Price, Julie Hagan, Annabel Smith, Leanne Wheaton, Mark Sstrom, Jaro Guzinski, Judit Voros, Nick Stevens, Christina Adler and Sarah Bray, thank you.

Finally I would like to thank my family, especially my parents John Bradford and Margaret Fox, whose unwavering support has made this whole endeavour possible.

*Acknowledgements specific to the results chapters are as follows:*

## CHAPTER II

I am extremely grateful to John Bradford for his expert analyses of the drill core data from the Anaconda Nickel Technical Report, compilation of the cross section diagram of the Sturt Meadow's calcrete and advice on all aspects of mapping undertaken in the region. Funding for this research was provided by a Divisional Scholarship from the School of Earth and Environmental Sciences at the University awarded to T. Bradford, and an ARC Discovery grant (DP0663675) awarded to Steve Cooper (South Australian Museum, SAM) and Bill Humphreys (Western Australian Museum, WAM).

## CHAPTER III

We gratefully acknowledge the kind hospitality of Flora, Peter and Paul Axford of the Sturt Meadows pastoral property. We thank Chris Watts, Mark Harvey and Mark Stevens for their expert knowledge in macro-invertebrate identifications, Stefano Taiti for information on the isopod fauna and Kathy Saint and Terry Bertozzi for laboratory technical support. This work was made possible by an ARC Discovery grant (DP0663675) to Cooper and Humphreys.

## CHAPTER IV

I wish to thank Mark Adams from the South Australian Museum for undertaking the allozyme electrophoresis, interpreting the results and carrying out analyses for departure from Hardy-Weinberg expectations on the dataset. I would also like to thank Adam Allford (The University of Adelaide) for constructing amphipod traps and field assistance, as well as Lars Krogmann (State Museum of Natural History, Stuttgart) and Greg Collings for assistance in the field. Funding for this research was provided by a Divisional Scholarship from the School of Earth and Environmental Sciences at the University awarded to T. Bradford, and an ARC Discovery grant (DP0663675) awarded to Steve Cooper and Bill Humphreys. Further financial support was provided by the ARC Research Network Working Group "Evolution of short-range endemic taxa associated with troglobitic and groundwater ecosystems", for travel and costs to attend meetings and conferences.

## CHAPTER V

I wish to thank Anita Andrew for carrying out stable isotope analyses (Environmental Isotopes Pty Ltd), Chris Watts (SAM) for discussions on the ecology of the diving beetles, Remko Leys (SAM) for construction of a portable incubator and advice on making haul nets, and Michelle Guzik (The University of Adelaide), Bill Humphreys and Steve Cooper for field assistance. Funding for this research was provided by a Divisional Scholarship from the School of Earth and Environmental Sciences at the University awarded to T. Bradford, and an ARC Discovery grant (DP0663675) awarded to Steve Cooper and Bill Humphreys. Further financial support was provided by the ARC Research Network Working Group “Evolution of short-range endemic taxa associated with troglobitic and groundwater ecosystems”, for travel and costs to attend meetings and conferences.