



THE UNIVERSITY
of ADELAIDE

Ph.D Thesis

Product innovation success in the Australian defence industry – an exploratory study

Gregor Ferguson

Entrepreneurship, Commercialisation and Innovation Centre (ECIC)
Faculty of Engineering, Computer and Mathematical Sciences

NOVEMBER 2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Illustrations	vi
List of Tables	vi
Abstract	vii
Declaration	ix
Dedication	xi
Acknowledgements	xiii
1. Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Preface	1
1.3 Contextual Background	6
1.4 The Defence of Australia	8
1.5 Equipping the ADF	14
1.6 Australia’s Defence Industry	15
1.7 Defence Manufacturing	18
1.8 Defence Acquisition Policy	24
1.9 Sustainment	28
1.10 Science & Technology (S&T)	29
1.11 Why do R&D?	30
1.12 The role of DSTO	32
1.13 Australia’s other defence innovation mechanisms	40
1.14 Conclusion	42
2. Literature Review	45
2.1 Introduction	45
2.2 Categorisation of models	47
2.3 Linear Models	51
2.4 Functional Models	59
2.5 Predictive Models	61
2.6 Innovation and Commercialisation – the literature	62
2.7 A Wider Literature Review	69
2.8 Factors unique to the defence market	82

2.9 The Customer's Role	84
2.10 Structural issues: the National Innovation System	92
2.11 Discussion	94
2.12 Conclusion	95
3. Research Methodology	97
3.1 Introduction	97
3.2 Aim of the Research	97
3.3 Research Paradigm	98
3.4 Research Methodology	99
3.5 Sampling	100
3.6 Data Collection Method	104
3.7 The role of Defence-related R&D	105
3.8 Data Analysis	105
3.9 Linking to the Literature - Independent Variables	106
3.10 Method of Drawing Conclusions and Implications	117
3.11 Confidentiality and Privacy	118
3.12 Conclusion	118
4. Research Findings	119
4.1 Introduction	119
4.2 Data Issues	122
4.3 Analysis - Testing the Hypothesis	155
4.4 Success Factors – Qualitative Analysis	156
4.5 Effects of the Independent Variables	186
4.6 Defence Industry R&D – Case Study & Survey	189
4.7 R&D Data Issues	192
4.8 Industry R&D Survey	193
4.9 Discussion	196
4.10 Conclusion	197
5. Discussion	198
5.1 Introduction	198
5.2 Classification of Factors	200
5.3 Re-Classification and Refinement of Factors	203

5.4 Comparison with Existing Models	207
5.5 The Forces Acting on the Product Innovation process	210
5.6 A Predictive Model for Product Innovation Success	212
5.7 Conclusion	216
6. Conclusions and directions for future research	217
6.1 Introduction	217
6.2 The Research Questions	217
6.3 Innovation Success Factors	217
6.4 A Model for the Product Innovation Process	219
6.5 The role played by industry R&D	220
6.6 Limitations of the research	221
6.7 Limitations of the R&D Survey	222
6.8 Implications for Theory	222
6.9 Implications for Industry Practice	224
6.10 Implications for Defence Policy and Practice	225
6.11 Implications for Defence Policy - DSTO	226
6.12 Directions for future research	227
6.13 Conclusion	228
Appendices	
Appendix 1: Defence Industry R&D Survey	230
Appendix 2: Australian Defence Industry R&D, Innovation and Competitiveness – the R&D Survey Form and responses	246
REFERENCES	252

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

1.1:	The forces shaping Australia’s defence industry	5
1.2:	Mapping Australia’s defence market	23
1.3:	DSTO, Defence and Industry – the overlaps	38
2.1:	The Goldsmith Model	52
2.2:	The Andrew & Sirkin Model	54
2.3:	The AIC Commercialisation progression Model	55
2.4:	The Carnegie Mellon Innovation Transfer Process Model	56
2.5:	The UniQuest Model	57
2.6:	The Stage Gate Process	58
2.7:	Jolly’s Technology Commercialisation Model	58
2.8:	The RPDE Model	59
2.9:	The Rothwell and Zegfeld Model	60
2.10:	The Canadian Functional Model	61
5.1:	Product Innovation Success in the Australian Defence Industry – an Object-Oriented Model	211
6.1:	Product Innovation Success in the Australian Defence Industry – an Object-Oriented Model	219

LIST OF TABLES

1.1:	DMO and Total In-Country Expenditure	21
1.2:	Industry Return on Sales, Assets and Equity	24
1.3:	US, UK and Australian defence R&D 2008-09	36
3.1:	Case Study Projects	103
3.2:	Aggregated Success Factors	110
4.1:	Case Study Introduction	124
4.2:	Case Study Questions and results	125
4.3:	Australia’s Defence Industry – a snapshot	155
4.4:	R&D Investment – by company size	189
4.5:	R&D Investment – comparing success with failure	190
4.6:	R&D Survey - Industry R&D	193
5.1:	Generic Product Innovation Success Factors – a four-way Comparison	207
5.2:	A Rudimentary Predictive Model for Defence Product Innovation Success	213

ABSTRACT

Product innovation success in the Australian defence industry – an exploratory study

The research sought to identify product innovation success factors in the Australian defence industry. It found that innovation outcomes are shaped by the Customer-Active Paradigm (CAP), and therefore the customer's characteristics and behaviours, as well as by the characteristics and behaviours of the innovating defence companies. The conclusion from this research is that pre-conditions for Product Innovation Success do exist in Australia's defence market. These relate to the innovator, the customer and the market itself. The fact of identifying these and ascribing them different levels of importance creates a rudimentary predictive tool for innovators and policy-makers.

DECLARATION

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any other university or other tertiary institution to Gregor Ferguson and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 968.

I also give permission for the digital version of this thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines.

SIGNED:

DATE:.....

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to:

my wife, Sabrina Ferguson

with all my love and grateful thanks for her support

my son, Damien Hunter

with my fondest love and best wishes for his own Ph.D journey

my daughter, Keelie Ferguson, and her partner and children

with my fondest love and best wishes for their life journey

my parents, Angus and Frances Ferguson

with love and grateful thanks for their love, support and example

Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge with immense gratitude the assistance and support, both physical and moral of the following: my supervisors, Drs Vernon Ireland and Barry Elsey of the University of Adelaide's Entrepreneurship, Commercialisation and Innovation Centre (ECIC) at the Faculty of Engineering, Computer and Mathematical Sciences, and Dr Don Sinnott, Adjunct Professor of Radar Systems at the University's School of Electrical and Electronic Engineering; and the Director, Faculty and Staff of the ECIC who have all been unfailingly helpful, patient and supportive and never shrank from their duty to speak home truths when they needed to be heard.

I wish also to acknowledge the considerable debt I owe to Dr Mark Hodge, Chief Executive Officer of the Defence Materials Technology Centre (DMTC), and the organisation's staff and directors for the privilege of being able to spend three months from September to December 2009 as the DMTC's first Research Fellow. This brief but critical interlude made it possible to refine the thrust of this research and then break the back of the data gathering process. Without the support of the DMTC this research could never have been finished in time.

By extension, my very warm thanks are due also to three organisations with a direct stake in the DMTC and in Australian defence innovation outcomes: the Department of Defence's Defence Materiel Organisation (DMO) and Defence Science & Technology Organisation (DSTO) and the Department of Innovation, Industry, Science, Research and Tertiary Education's (DIISRTE) Enterprise Connect organisation, including the Defence Industry Innovation Centre (DIIC) and its first Director, Mr Tony Quick. Their vision in establishing and funding the DMTC demonstrates great commitment to the Australia's security as well as to the welfare of the industry which to a significant extent underpins it. Another organisation to whom I owe a debt is AADI Defence Pty Ltd whose directors and staff provided much-appreciated moral and intellectual support.

The DMO, DSTO and Defence's Rapid Prototyping, Development and Evaluation (RPDE) program were uniformly supportive, as organisations (though limited by policy and security in terms of direct assistance), but certain individuals stand out: Mr Maurice Hermann, Mr Warren Canning, Dr Alan Hinge, Mr Andrew Arnold

and Mr Jimmy Hafesjee of DSTO; Dr Rob Bourke, Mr Bob Wylie (now at ADFA) and Mr Terry Whelan of DMO; and BRIG David Welch of RPDE.

The individuals from the companies who participated in my Case Studies were generous (and in some cases very tolerant) with their time and insight – as many requested anonymity I'm not at liberty to name them publicly, but they provided the essential raw material for my research. I trust they'll judge that the time they gave up to assist me wasn't entirely wasted. The economics consulting firm ACIL Tasman was also very helpful in providing details of Mr Wylie's 2004 defence industry innovation survey and in providing much-appreciated advice.

During the early part of this research a number of senior serving and retired officers from the Australian Defence Force and officials from the Department of Defence, DMO, DSTO were very generous with their time in helping me refine my research directions and establishing priorities: Dr Roger Lough, Dr Ken Anderson, Dr Ian Chessell, Dr Richard Brabin-Smith, Dr Bill Schofield, Dr Don Sinnott, Mr Warren Canning, Dr Roger Creaser, Dr Stephen Gumley, Mr Michael Roche, RADM (Ret'd) Kevin Scarce, LTGEN David Hurley, VADM (Ret'd) David Shackleton, Mr Peter Croser, the late Mr Paul Fisher, Mr David Gaul, Ms Susan Anderson, Mr Martin Jones, Mr Lindsay Pears, and Mr John O'Callaghan.

Within academia two individuals stand out: Dr Andrew Davies and Dr Mark Thomson from the Australian Strategic Policy Institute (ASPI) whose knowledge, experience and insight challenged me constantly and whose support and encouragement spurred me on.

Many others – too many to name - were free with their time, knowledge, insight and advice on an ad hoc basis. I'm happy and humble to acknowledge the generosity of the Australian defence community in general and hope that my research in some way justifies the kindness and faith in me shown by so many people.

During most of the period I was conducting this research I was employed as the Editor of Australian Defence Magazine, published in Sydney by Yaffa Publishing Group. The terms of my appointment as Editor allowed me considerable freedom to pursue my research; in particular, I couldn't have completed this research without the three-month full-time DMTC Fellowship, for which Yaffa Publishing very generously allowed me the time off, and then even more generously took me back! Towards the end of my research I realised I needed more time to devote to my

thesis. Yaffa Publishing agreed to my assuming a new appointment, Editor at Large, which relieved me of the burden of the Editorship and gave me the freedom I needed to complete my research.

I received nothing but support and encouragement from the Yaffa team and I wish humbly and with enormous gratitude to acknowledge the members: Ms Judy Hinz, Mr Peter Masters, Ms Tracy Yaffa, Mr Mike Kerr, Mr David Jones, Ms Katherine Ziesing, Mr Daniel Cotterill, Mr Tom Muir and Mr Julian Kerr.

Towards the end of 2011 I was approached by the Aerospace, Maritime and Defence Foundation of Australia Ltd (AMDA) to fill a new role as Executive Manager, Industry Development. The process of writing this thesis was completed while settling in to my new role and my new employer has been most understanding!

Finally, I owe an enormous debt of gratitude to my wife, Sabrina, for her unwavering faith in me as demonstrated by her patience and willingness to endure lonely evenings and weekends while I've been conducting this research and writing my thesis, and the financial straits which we have encountered from time to time on this long journey. Nobody in my position could have asked for a more loving, caring and supportive wife and partner and she is the one individual without whom this research could never have been completed. I am extraordinarily lucky.

While many people were generous with their insights and advice, I didn't always follow it. For all the support and encouragement I received, this work is mine alone and I take full responsibility for any flaws and errors of omission or commission.